

MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

16 May 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National Historical Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Bill Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Bob Jaeger, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian

Also: Sandra Lee, Ray Klumb and Macey Patton of Space Data Group and Rohner Construction to present plans for alterations to 1630 Locust Street.
Randy Henkels, Architect and Harry Furtik, Owner to present plans for the construction of an addition to 243 S. Quince Street and 222 S. Jessup Street.
Bob Cotter, Applicant, to present plans for the construction of rear additions to 1939 and 2043 Mt. Vernon Street.
Benjamin Kalkstein, Owner, to present plans for the construction of an addition to the carriage house at the rear of 53 E. Logan Street.
Paul Harbeson of H2L2 to present plans for the rehabilitation of the Germantown Academy complex for the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf and to present a proposal for the re-roofing of the Chestnut Hill Academy at 500 W. Willow Grove Avenue.
Russell Milnor of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority to present for review rehabilitation specifications and illustrative drawings for 918-920 Spruce Street and 1213-1215 Locust Street.
Tony Thomas Rienzi, Mr. Hildebrand and others to request permission to demolish a portion of the laundry building at Girard College.
Louis Esposito, Owner, to request permission to demolish 712 S. Front Street to construct a new house on the 712 site and its adjoining lot at 714.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

1630 Locust Street, Space Data Group and Rohner Construction. Sandra Lee, Ray Klumb and Macey Patton of Space Data Group and Rohner Construction presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for alterations to the building at 1630 Locust Street, a 1900-1901 townhouse designed by Cope and Stewardson with later additions and alterations.

The proposed work to the exterior of the building, as described, includes the removal of a large storefront window at the corner of 17th and Locust Streets and the restoration of the masonry and two ground floor window openings containing eight over eight light double hung sash. Other alterations to the exterior include the removal of a large ground floor glass store window and filling the area with brick masonry, a twelve over twelve double hung window and a door with transom.

The Committee found the proposed alterations to be acceptable and voted to recommend that the Historical Commission grant an approval of the plans. The Committee did offer one suggestion, however. The members recommended that the corbel between the original building and the addition to the south be removed and that the brick be permitted to *be set's course* continue up the face of the building. *bracket below*

243 S. Quince Street and 222 S. Jessup Street, Randy Henkels, Architect and Harry Furtik, Owner. Mr. Henkels presented to the Architectural Committee plans for the construction of a one and two story addition connecting 243 S. Quince Street with 222 S. Jessup Street and the enlargement of the dormer window on the rear of the Quince Street building. These two early nineteenth century buildings underwent some alteration c. 1925.

The Furtiks, owners of the Quince and Jessup Street buildings, expressed to the Architectural Committee their desire to connect the two buildings and occupy them as a single family dwelling. To do so, they requested their architect, Randy Henkels, to design a one story kitchen wing and a two story addition attached to the rear of the Quince Street building. The kitchen wing acts as the link between the two properties.

The Committee members reviewed the plans submitted by the architect and found the proposed design of the new additions to be sympathetic with the original character of the houses. They did, however, ask that the size of the dormer window on the two story addition be reduced to accommodate a six over six double hung window to align with the windows below. They further recommended that large glass doors be installed on the one story kitchen addition instead of small light sash doors. This latter item, however, is not a requirement.

At this point, Mr. Bartley asked if any visitors in the room wished to make a statement regarding the Furtik's proposal. Stanley Krakower, Esq. asked to be recognized and given an opportunity to make a statement in behalf of a committee of neighbors opposed to the proposed undertaking. Mr. Krakower stated that, in his opinion, new construction could not in any way be compatible with the historic Quince and Jessup Street houses. Although altered in the 1920's, the buildings remained separate houses and did not increase in size. Connecting the buildings, in Mr. Krakower's view, would destroy the historical integrity of the houses and the streetscape. He expressed to the members of the Architectural Committee his clients' hope that the proposed addition to the buildings would not be approved by the Historical Commission.

Ms. Siemiontkowski reported to the Committee that a number of fliers, expressing opposition, were received by the Commission's Chairman. A total of 233 cards were received in the Commission office. Of the 233, 63 came from residents in the Washington Square West community; 170 came from out-of-town. The latter included the Pennsylvania suburbs, New Jersey, Maryland, New York, Florida, Massachusetts and Indiana.

Joanne Weeks, Executive Director of the Washington Square West Project Area Committee (PAC), informed the Architectural Committee of a recent meeting of the PAC Zoning Committee where the Quince and Jessup Street proposal was discussed. At that meeting, a vote was taken on the matter. Ms. Weeks reported a vote of 35 to 32 against the proposed alterations.

A resident of the immediate area requested permission of the Committee to express his views on the matter. His concerns included preservation of the existing streetscape, the loss of light and air to other residents on the street and access in case of fire. The Committee members noted that access in case of fire would not be restricted by the construction of the proposed addition.

Following public comment, the members of the Architectural Committee voted, unanimously, to recommend the approval of the proposed additions and alterations subject to the modification of the dormer window on the two story addition. This recommendation, of course, is subject to the approval of a variance from the Zoning Board of Adjustment.

320 Race Street, John Sawyer, Developer. Mr. Sawyer presented to the Architectural Committee his plans for the rehabilitation of the five story, nineteenth century loft building at 320 Race Street.

The Committee reviewed the plans submitted by Mr. Sawyer and voted to recommend an approval in concept of the proposed project. The members did offer several recommendations to be included and/or addressed in the final submission. The fire escapes and original window sash on the building should be retained and repaired, where possible. The Committee recommended also that the new exterior stairs be constructed of iron, instead of wood, to match the design and character of the existing metal fire escapes. The members agreed in concept to the construction of a roof-top addition. They suggested, however, that the architect consider using a greenhouse-type design with sloped walls and that the structure be set back as far as possible from the cornice line to reduce its visibility from the street.

Mr. Sawyer was directed to revise his drawings and resubmit them to the Committee for another review. The resubmission should include details of the roof-top addition, details of the new metal entrance stair and a detail of the proposed new door on the Race Street elevation.

1939 and 2043 Mt. Vernon Street, Bob Cotter, Applicant. Mr. Cotter presented to the Committee plans for the construction of new additions at the rears of 1939 and 2043 Mt. Vernon Street, two mid-nineteenth century Victorian buildings at the corners of 20th and 21st Streets.

The Committee reviewed the drawings presented and advised Mr. Cotter that no action could be taken at this time. The members directed Mr. Cotter to submit elevation drawings showing the 20th and 21st Street sides of the houses and the relationship of the new construction to the historic houses. The Committee also requested the submission of recent photographs of the buildings.

Action on this submission was tabled pending the receipt and review of the additional drawings and photographs requested by the Committee

- 53 E. Logan Street, Barbara Williams, Architect and Benjamin Kalkstein, Owner. Mr. Kalkstein submitted for the Committee's consideration plans for a proposed new addition to the nineteenth century carriage house at the rear of 53 E. Logan Street. Mr. Kalkstein explained his need to add to the existing building to accommodate his growing family. Ms. Williams, architect for the project, studied various schemes and found the proposed addition to the front of the carriage house to incur the least amount of damage to the original fabric of the structure.

While the Committee found the proposed addition to be acceptable in concept, they agreed to ask for some further study of its design. They suggested strongly the elimination of the pseudo-colonial entrance characterized by columns set upon stone bases and topped with a pedimented overhang. They suggested also that the architect consider using vertical, rather than horizontal, siding in the construction of the addition.

The members suggested that Ms. Williams study more carefully the proposed design of the addition, revise her drawings and resubmit them to the Architectural Committee for another review.

Pennsylvania School for the Deaf (former Germantown Academy), School House Lane and Greene Streets, H2L2, Paul Harbeson, Architect. Mr. Harbeson appeared before the Architectural Committee with representatives of the School for the Deaf to present preliminary plans for the conversion of the Germantown Academy complex for use by the School for the Deaf. Mr. Harbeson explained that Phase I of the rehabilitation program will allow the School for the Deaf to occupy the buildings by September 1984. Phase I will include the rehabilitation of the existing buildings and the restoration of their exterior features as required by the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority's rehabilitation specifications. Phase II will include new construction designed to connect many of the buildings and provide additional classroom and office space for the school.

The Committee, after hearing Mr. Harbeson's description of the project and reviewing preliminary plans, agreed to recommend an approval of Phase I of the project. Final working drawings and details will be required, however, before a final approval can be granted.

Chestnut Hill Academy, 500 W. Willow Graove Avenue, H2L2, Paul Harbeson, Architect. Mr. Harbeson submitted to the Architectural Committee his proposal for the re-roofing of the Chestnut Hill Academy main building designed by the Hewitts in the 1880's. Mr. Harbeson explained his client's intention to replace the main roof using Supradur Rutland Red Supra-Slate, a material which closely resembles the original red Vermont slate used on the roof of the structure in the 1880's. Mr. Harbeson further informed the Committee that the vertical surfaces of the building, where slate had

been replaced previously with an asbestos shingle, will be repaired and painted a red slate color.

If the cost of installing Supra-Slate proves prohibitive, Mr. Harbeson agreed to return to the Committee with substitute materials for the Committee's consideration. Following some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of Chestnut Hill Academy's proposal to replace the roofing of the main building with Supra-Slate and to make necessary repairs to the siding and asbestos shingles.

2906 Diamond Street, Office of Housing and Community Development. Ms. Siemiontkowski advised the Committee of illegal alterations undertaken at 2906 Diamond Street as part of a rehabilitation program administered by the City's Office of Housing and Community Development. These alterations included the removal of the front facade of the house and its replacement with an inappropriate new front wall. The building, 2906 Diamond Street, appears on the Philadelphia Historical Commission list of locally certified buildings and stands next to the Henry O. Tanner House at 2908 Diamond Street. The Tanner House appears on the National Register of Historic Places and has been designated a National Historic Landmark.

Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that as a result of an on site visit to the property and discussions with staff members of the Office of Housing and Community Development, a new facade, in keeping with the historical and architectural character of the Diamond Street cluster, will be erected. The new facade will match the existing front at 2902 Diamond Street which stands, except for a few minor alterations, in its original condition. The Office of Housing and Community Development has hired an architect to prepare a measured elevation drawing of the proposed facade restoration and has directed him to submit his plans to the Committee for review.

The Committee gave its approval in concept to the proposed work as outlined and agreed to review the architect's elevation drawing as soon as it is received by the Commission staff.

918-920 Spruce Street and 1213-1215 Locust Street, Russell Milnor, Architect, Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. Mr. Milnor presented for the Committee's consideration rehabilitation specifications and illustrative drawings for the properties 918-920 Spruce Street and 1213-1215 Locust Street.

The Committee reviewed the specifications and drawings and agreed to recommend their approval in concept. The Committee directed Ms. Siemiontkowski to review, in detail, the specifications relating to the facades of the buildings and to advise Mr. Milnor of any required changes. The Committee further stressed that the Redevelopment Authority should notify all developers who purchase bid packages that any drawings accompanying the rehabilitation specifications for these properties are purely illustrative and do not constitute a required plan or treatment of the buildings.

2106 Green Street, Richard Stewart, Owner. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented to the Architectural Committee for consideration an elevation drawing for the restoration of the facade of 2106 Green Street, a three story 1850's Victorian rowhouse.

The Committee found the proposed restoration program to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval.

Stenton Mansion, John F. Dickey, F.A.I.A. Mr. Dickey presented to the other members of the Architectural Committee plans for the replacement of the porch roof at Stenton Mansion. The proposed work also includes the replacement of paving and curbs that were removed for an archaeological investigation three years ago.

Following some discussion of the proposed work, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of this project. Mr. Dickey abstained from voting.

DEMOLITIONS

Girard College, Bakery Building, Messrs. Rienzi and Hildebrand, Applicants
Mr. Hildebrand reported to the members of the Architectural Committee the College's desire to demolish a two story section of an old bakery building, presently connected to the College's laundry facilities, retain its basement and foundation and construct a new addition. Since the existing floor levels in the bakery building and the newer laundry section do not align, stairs or some other accommodation would be required in order to make the old structure usable. In addition, the building's slate roof and roof rafters have suffered serious deterioration and would prove too costly to repair or replace. In view of the condition of the building and its change in floor levels, the College chose to opt for demolition and new construction. The design and form of the new addition will follow that of the existing laundry building.

Mr. Hildebrand explained to the Committee the College's need to begin work soon in order to provide the facilities required to accommodate the admission of girls to the College for the first time in the school's history. A target date of September 1984 has been set by the College. Since plans of the proposed work were unavailable at the time of the meeting, no action on the proposed request was taken. The members subsequently received plans of the proposed demolition and construction and voted to recommend that the Commission approve the project as submitted. The Committee asked Mr. Hildebrand to forward to the Commission staff for file a one page summary of the history of the bakery building and record photographs of the structure.

712 South Front Street, Louis Esposito, Owner. Mr. Esposito appeared before the Architectural Committee to request permission to demolish the house at 712 S. Front Street, a small, much altered eighteenth century building. Mr. Esposito explained to the Committee his desire to construct a new, contemporary design house on the two adjoining properties at 712 and 714 South Front Street.

Following some discussion of the significance of the house and the Front Street streetscape, the members of the Architectural Committee recommended that Mr. Esposito ask his architect to study the possibility of retaining at least the facade of 712 South Front Street and constructing a new addition on the adjoining lot at 714. Mr. Esposito explained that this might be difficult to accomplish in an acceptable manner since the adjoining lot contained a width of only 10 feet. He agreed, however, to ask his architect to study the possibility of facade retention and to prepare schematic drawings for various design schemes.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian