

**THE MINUTES OF THE 402nd STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
14 February 1996**

**City Council Caucus, Room 401 City Hall
Wayne Spilove, Chairperson**

Present

Wayne Spilove, Chairperson
Mary Rita D'Alessandro, Deputy Commissioner, Department of
Licenses and Inspections
David Brownlee
Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Department of Commerce
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Arlene Matzkin
Michael Sklaroff
Scott Wilds, Office of Housing and Community Development
Caroline Wischman

Henry Schwartz, Esq., Law Department

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Jeffrey R. Barr, Historic Preservation Researcher

Also

Bobbye Burke, CCRA
Judith Eden, CCRA
Warren Huff, City Planning Commission
Milton Marks, Preservation Coalition
Patricia Toner, 320 S. American Street
William Toner, 320 S. American Street
Pamela Todd, 309 S. American Street
Yvonne B. Haskins
Frederick Jones, 229 Delancey Street
Stephan White
Rosanne Kozlow, 1219 Locust Street
Harvey Bartle, 318 S. American Street
Anthony Weber, Boathouse #4
Ted Beitchman, Mayor's Office
Carlie Seltzer

Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 402nd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 10:15 A.M.

Mr. Spilove introduced and welcomed several new Commission members, Michael Sklaroff and Caroline Wischman, as well as Deputy Commissioner Mary Rita D'Alessandro, the designee of Robert Barnett, Commissioner of Licenses and Inspections. He

also congratulated those Commission members reappointed by the Mayor.

THE MINUTES of the 401st Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 25 January 1996, Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, were approved by unanimous vote and adopted upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and seconded by Dr. Brownlee.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE REPORT, 30 January 1996, Arlene Matzkin, Chairperson

1909 MT. VERNON STREET

Hamp Young, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Restore Facade

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The applicant seeks to restore this facade with new 2/2 wood windows, double leaf door and masonry cleaning. Details are to be approved by staff.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed by a unanimous vote.

2335 N. BROAD STREET

William Schwartz Esq., Applicant

PROPOSAL: Reroof with grey asphalt shingles

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

The applicant seeks to reroof with grey asphalt shingles.

Dr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed by a unanimous vote.

1719 RITTENHOUSE SQUARE STREET

Carmen La Rosa, Architect

PROPOSAL: Exterior metal stair, deck railing replacement and window alteration.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend tabling of the proposal for a period of up to two months to give the applicant an opportunity to explore the feasibility of an interior means of egress, to obtain zoning for any proposed extension of the footprint, and to review the building codes on the new stair for possible covering and fireproof windows requirements.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to table the proposal for up to two months. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed by

unanimous vote.

126 N. 3RD STREET

David Schultz, Architect

PROPOSAL: Facade Restoration

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend approval of this proposal with staff to check details and materials to be noted on the drawing.

The staff received and approved the revised drawings. Mr. Sklaroff asked if the architect objected to making the change and Mr. Baron explained that examination of an insurance survey obviated the need for any change.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Committee to approve the application. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1835 SPRUCE STREET

Don Friday, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Rebuild cornice, remove permastone from bay.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with staff review of details.

The applicant seeks to restore the front facade, rebuilding the missing cornice to match the one next door, removing the permastone from the bay and repointing.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

127 S. 22ND STREET

Edwin Bronstein, Architect

PROPOSAL: New ground floor windows and bay, flag over door.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee recommended approval of opening up the bay and installing new brown masonry piers and 1/1 windows with equal top and bottom sash. They advised against placing the flag over the door because of the damage to the masonry and the confusion that might be caused at a door that will not be a main entrance.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Committee which was seconded by Mr. Wilds and approved unanimously.

229 DELANCEY STREET

Stephan White Architect, Frederick Jones, Owner

PROPOSAL: Demolish brick rear wall; build new fence and gate

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with manually operated side swinging gate.

Ms. Matzkin explained that this proposal to demolish a 1950s brick wall and install a wood fence with manually operated gate was recommended for approval by the Committee. The Committee members thought that this case mostly involved zoning issues outside the purview of the Commission.

Attorney Yvonne Haskins, representing the Toners who reside directly behind the Delancey Street property, spoke strongly in opposition to approval of the proposal. She said that the Commission should have concern with the overall historic character of the neighborhood which she claimed would suffer from the conversion of this open space to parking. She also said that moving the street lamp would increase danger on the street and that turning into this new parking space would involve driving on the sidewalk of the property across the street. She noted that the Streets Department approval for a curb cut had now been revoked. She said that a curbcut would possibly damage the old brick sewer which was the last of its kind in the area.

Judge Harvey Bartle, a neighbor on American Street, also spoke against the proposal saying that open space is being lost in Society Hill resulting in an inch by inch destruction of its historic character.

Michael Sklaroff asked if the property did not include the sidewalk and curb where the cut would take place. He thought that the issue of the Commission's control of the sidewalk should be determined before rendering a decision on the application.

Richard Tyler explained that this property is in a National Register District but not a Philadelphia Register District, and that the Commission has no jurisdiction over sidewalks and curbs except in a district context. He read from the chain of title for the property which described an early property transaction in which the deed had included several properties and part of Union Street. He explained that as a non-charter street opened by affidavit or easement the sidewalk and street only revert to the adjacent property owners if the City abandons the street.

Stephan White, the architect for the project, said that the deed describes the property line as contiguous with the building line on the American Street side of the building.

Frederick Jones, the owner/applicant for the proposal, explained that he held an open house and had communicated with his neighbors for a long time about this proposal and that he

remained open to suggestions about the design of the project. He invested a great deal in this neighborhood because of his appreciation for the area's historic character. He said that each of these neighbors currently looks out on a 31 car parking lot where they park behind their houses, but that none of them will look out onto his parking area. He, on the other hand, from a house that takes up nearly one quarter of that block looks out his side windows on parking directly across American Street. Using his architect's van and the parking space across the street, Mr. Jones said that he demonstrated that it is possible to turn without using the sidewalk across the street; however, he obtained a letter from the people across the street allowing him to drive on that sidewalk if the need ever arose. He said that he intends only to cut the curb, not remove it, and if the sewer did break he would to pay to repair it.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to table this proposal in order to allow review first by the Zoning Board for a variance. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

254 S. 16TH STREET

Thomas Rogers, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Legalize canopy installed without permit

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial, remove canopy patch holes.

The applicant sent a letter requesting that the matter be tabled one month until the March meeting.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to table consideration of the proposal until March. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

256 S. 16TH STREET

Nathan Hayward III, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Reroof, clad dormer in copper, 4/4 wood dormer windows.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with staff review of details.

The staff has reviewed and approved details.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

STRAWBERRY MANSION BRIDGE

Missy Maxwell, Architect, Hamid Homaei, Engineer

PROPOSAL: Restore railings with height extenders, gooseneck

lights, new structure under sidewalk, Jersey barriers along roadbed.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee recommended approval of the proposal.

Ms. Matzkin said that none of the Committee members liked the Jersey barriers but did not know of alternatives that would meet the requirement to deflect cars. Dr. Brownlee asked if the barriers were not just set on the roadway so that they could be removed upon the development of a better solution.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1811 CHESTNUT STREET

Jerry Roller, Architect

PROPOSAL: Reopen basement windows, install plastic signage over windows.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of windows, denial of signage over the windows.

The staff has reviewed a letter from the architect asking for a tabling of the question of the signage until next month when the owner can appear to appeal to the Commission.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee on the windows and table the signage proposal. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

400 N. BROAD STREET

William Lukens, Architect

PROPOSAL: Install new windows to match originals, remove metal wall at the back of the building.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee Recommended approval of the proposal.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1632,1638 WAVERLY STREET

Elgart Aster, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Legalize replacement windows, wood three pane transom windows.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of replacement windows conditional upon the restoration of the wood three pane

transom windows.

Mr. Wilds asked why we would set a precedent of approving the inappropriate windows. Mr. Tyler read from the Rules and Regulations concerning work undertaken during the transition period between the sending of notice of a hearing for designation and the time of designation. This rule provides that the Commission will take into consideration contracts executed before the transition period in its review. Mr. Baron read the date of June 11 1994 from the receipt for the windows placing the contract before the notice date for the designation hearing. Given this opportunity for this special consideration, Mr Elgart worked with staff to develop a compromise to keep the windows but restore another aspect of the facade.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

BOAT HOUSE # 4

Anthony Weber, Architect

PROPOSAL: Install new metal door in place of wood one.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee Recommended denial of the proposal.

Arlene Matzkin said that a wood door can provide as much security as a metal door given a metal jamb and will not suffer from as many dents and dings. A letter from the architect showed that the wood door would cost more than a metal door. Commission members noted that although the panel pattern was vertical rather than horizontal, the diamond shaped window panes of the proposed replacement door looked closer to the windows on the second floor of the boathouse.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to reject the recommendation of the Committee and approve the metal door. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed by a vote of 8 to 1.

1217-19 LOCUST STREET

Roseanne Kozlow, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Remove stone cladding

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee recommended approval of the proposal.

Randal Baron reported on a site visit to the building which revealed a large arched window taking up most of the facade under the stone veneer. The applicant will draw plans for the treatment of the facade and return to the Commission after removing the stone and investigating the condition underneath.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the removal of the stone veneer on the first floor. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which

passed unanimously.

The Report of the Activities of the Historical Commission Staff
January 1996, Richard Tyler.

Mr. Tyler commended the work of Jeffrey Barr and Randal Baron during this period of reduced staffing.

OLD BUSINESS

Mr. Tyler reported that he had spoken to staff of the University of Pennsylvania regarding the Commission's position at the last meeting that it would prove cost effective to restore the roof of the Music Building now rather than put on a second roof in a few years. They will price the installation of a natural slate roof and report back to the Commission. Mr. Tyler asked for a motion to table a decision on the proposal until we have received information back from the University.

***Mr. Wilds made a motion to table consideration of the roof.
Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which passed unanimously. Dr.
Brownlee recused himself from this vote.***

The meeting adjourned at 12:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Randal Baron