

**THE MINUTES OF THE 715TH STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 11 MARCH 2022, 9:00 A.M.
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
ROBERT THOMAS, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Thomas, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Robert Thomas, AIA, Chair (Architectural Historian)	X		
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Mark Dodds (Department of Planning and Development)	X		
Kelly Edwards, MUP (Real Estate Developer)	X		
Patrick O'Donnell (Department of Public Property)	X		
Sara Lepori (Commerce Department)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
John Mattioni, Esq.	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)	X		
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)	X		
Jessica Sánchez, Esq. (City Council President)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq. (Community Development Corporation)	X		

Owing to public health concerns surrounding the COVID-19 virus, all Commissioners, staff, applicants, and public attendees participated in the meeting remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner II
Meredith Keller, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner II
Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
Megan Cross Schmitt, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

Veronica Britto
Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance
Mary McGettigan
Deborah Gary

P. Justin Detwiler
David Orphanides, Esq.
Ehud Adar
Dane Bombara
Jay Farrell
Kira Strong
Angie Dixon
Hal Schirmer
Matt Funk, DIGroup Architecture
Maura Rossi, BFW Group
Raymond Rola
Donna Rilling
Betsy Ackerman, DIGroup Architecture
David Traub
Steven Peitzman
Deborah Gary
Lisa M. Gambaro
Michael Farinella
George Nopez
Charlotte Raty
J M Duffin
James McKenna
Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown Civic Association
Lynn Williamson
Patrick Grossi, Preservation Alliance
James Campbell
Eric Horowitz
Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects
Colin Rupp, Gnome Architects
Jim Pecora, FLP
Gloria Del Piano
Dennis Carlisle
Meagan Knapp
Tom Familetti
Paul & Julia Pelullo
Michael Clemmons
Oscar Beisert
Cassie O'Connell
Amy Lambert
German Yakubov

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 714TH STATED MEETING, 11 FEBRUARY 2022

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:04:05

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Thomas asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 714th Stated Meeting, held 11 February 2022. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to adopt the minutes of the 714th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 11 February 2022. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 714th Meeting					
MOTION: Adoption of minutes					
Moved BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	13				

CONTINUANCE REQUEST

4200-30 CHESTER AVENUE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Proposed Action: Continuance

Applicant: Michael Mattioni, Esq.

Property Owner: Various

Nominator: University City Historical Society

Number of Properties: 16

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:04:40

RECUSALS:

- Mr. Mattioni recused from the review of the continuance request because his law firm represents a property owner in the proposed historic district.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance request to the Historical Commission and explained that continuance request proposed to shift the date of the Historical Commission's review of the nomination for the 4200-30 Chester Avenue Historic District from its 8 April 2022 meeting to its 13 May 2022 meeting. The requested continuance would not change the 16 March 2022 review by the Committee on Historic Designation.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to continue the review of the 4200-30 Chester Avenue Historic District to the 13 May 2022 meeting of the Historical Commission. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 4200-30 Chester Avenue Historic District					
MOTION: Grant continuance to 13 May 2022 PHC meeting					
MOVED BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DHCD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni				X	
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	12			1	

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 22 FEBRUARY 2022

CONSENT AGENDA

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:07:45

RECUSALS:

- Mr. Thomas recused from the review owing to his firm's involvement as the architect for the 2100 Mt. Vernon Street matter.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Washington asked the Commissioners, staff, and public for comments on the Consent Agenda. None were offered.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

ACTION: Ms. Washington moved to adopt the recommendation of the Architectural Committee for the application for 2100 Mt. Vernon Street. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent, with one recusal.

ITEM: Consent Agenda MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: Washington SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair				X	
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DHCD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	12			1	

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 1513-17 PINE ST

Proposal: Construct five townhouses

Review Requested: Review and Comment

Owner: ZI 1513 Pine LLC

Applicant: Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects

History: Parking lot

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Rittenhouse Fidler Historic District, Non-contributing, 2/8/1995

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to construct five, four-story townhouses with pilot houses and roof decks on a currently vacant lot. The Historical Commission's jurisdiction is limited to review and comment because the lot has been vacant since the designation of the district and is considered an "undeveloped" site. The applicant has submitted two design schemes. The first scheme represents the by-right massing of the new construction as allowed by zoning. The second scheme shows a slightly larger massing where the height of the new construction would align with the cornices of the Pine Street buildings. The new construction would be clad in a brownish-red brick with a cast stone base and detailing and would feature aluminum-clad windows. The townhouses would front onto S. Hicks Street, and the buildings would have garage access on Pine Street.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Construct five, four-story townhouses with roof decks and pilot houses on vacant lot.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - o The proposed new construction would be compatible with the district in size, scale, massing, and materials. The staff notes that the second design scheme in the application, showing the height of the new buildings aligning with the cornices of the buildings along Pine Street, would be more appropriate. The work complies with Standard 9.

STAFF COMMENT: The staff comments that the height of the townhouses should align with cornice line of the Pine Street buildings as proposed in Scheme 2, but that the proposed new construction is otherwise compatible with the Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District in size, scale, massing, and materials.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE COMMENT: The Architectural Committee did not offer a motion but allowed its discussion to stand as its comment.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:09:15

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Keller presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Attorney David Orphanides and architects Gabe Deck and Colin Rupp represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub supported the application.
- Jim Duffin supported the application.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property is considered an undeveloped site and the Historical Commission's jurisdiction is review-and-comment jurisdiction only.
- The Architectural Committee reviewed two design schemes. Both schemes proposed a four-story building; however, one design scheme was significantly lower in height to accommodate the 38-feet by-right height allowed by zoning. The second scheme showed a taller building that aligned with the Pine Street buildings and which would require a zoning variance.
- The Architectural Committee was not unanimous in its comments on the two schemes, but offered the following comments:
 - o The taller height of Scheme 2 may be appropriate and better relate to the Pine Street buildings, but it overwhelms the buildings on Hicks Street. The two or three units adjacent to the Hicks Street properties should be lowered.
 - o The massing, size, scale, and materials are appropriate for the Pine Street frontage and for the Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District.
 - o Certain design elements should be revised, including reducing the parapet, modifying the garage door, and modifying the proportions to better reflect the proportions of the Pine Street buildings.

- The application has been revised to propose one scheme. The revised design maintains the larger height, but better reflects the proportions of the Pine Street buildings by aligning the floor levels and increasing the height of the base. A solid garage door is now proposed along Pine Street, and the cornice of the bay has been modified.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The revised application incorporates many comments offered by the Architectural Committee.
- The proposed new building is appropriate in size, scale, massing, and materials and complies with Standard 9.

ACTION: None.

ADDRESS: 2100 MOUNT VERNON ST

Proposal: Roof deck and access structure

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Marc and Megan Vetri

Applicant: James C. Campbell, Campbell Thomas & Co.

History: 1855; Center entrance and storefront, late 19th century; storefront windows altered

Individual Designation: 2/7/1974

District Designation: Spring Garden Historic District, Contributing, 10/11/2000

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

BACKGROUND:

This application proposes to construct a roof deck and roof access structure with skylight at 2100 Mount Vernon Street. The building was constructed in 1855 with a storefront and center entrance alterations occurring in the late nineteenth century. The building, located at the corner of Mount Vernon Street and N. 21st Street, was individually designated in 1974 and is a contributing building to the Spring Garden Historic District.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Construct roof access structure with skylight.
- Construct new roof deck with railing.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 10: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - o The proposed alterations would not permanently alter the historic character of this building and could be fully reversed in the future; therefore, the application does meet Standard 10.
- *Roofs Guideline | Recommended: Designing rooftop additions, elevator or stair towers, decks or terraces, dormers, or skylights when required by a new or continuing use so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.*

- o The deck and access structure will be inconspicuous from the public right-of-way owing to the proposed setbacks for the deck and access structure; therefore the application meets the Roofs Guideline.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval, with staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 10 and the Roofs Guideline.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend approval, provided a mockup demonstrates that the deck and access structure are inconspicuous from the public right-of-way, pursuant to Standard 10 and the Roofs Guideline.

ACTION: See Consent Agenda.

ADDRESS: 6942 WOODLAND AVE

Proposal: Rehabilitate building; add ramp, stairs, egress stairs, and window wells

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: City of Philadelphia-Free Library

Applicant: Elizabeth Ackerman, DIGroup Architecture

History: 1915; Paschalville Branch of the Free Library; Henry C. Richards, architect

Individual Designation: 6/14/2013

District Designation: Carnegie Libraries Historic District, Contributing, 7/9/2021

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to rehabilitate a Carnegie branch library building, making several alterations, the most significant of which are the additions of a ramp at the front entrance for accessibility and an exterior stairwell for egress from the basement level, and some alterations to basement windows.

The library currently has a ramp that runs along the side and rear of the property and enters the building at a small rear extension. The ramp does not satisfy the safety, security, and programmatic needs of the library or its patrons and must be replaced. This application proposes to remove the ramp and construct a new ramp at the front façade. The current front entrance includes two sets of stairs, one on the exterior and one in the interior vestibule. The proposed ramp would bring visitors to a landing on the exterior at the same level as the main floor in the building. To accommodate the ramp, the main doorway would be altered, reducing the size of the transom and raising the doors up from the historic threshold level to the level of the main interior floor. The limestone and terra cotta door surround would be altered for raised entrance. The interior vestibule floor would be raised to the level of the main floor. The ramp would have granite paving, limestone cladding on the sides, and metal handrails.

For egress from the basement level, an open, exterior stairwell would be added to the side of the building. A basement window would be enlarged for a door. The stairwell's retaining walls would be clad in granite, the steps would be concrete, and the railing would be metal.

To accommodate the installation of the ramp and new mechanical systems, basement windows and window wells would be altered. Some would be infilled with panels, others with louvers.

The application proposes other work as well, all of which can be reviewed by the staff and need not occupy the Historical Commission's time. At the rear, for emergency egress, steps would be installed where the old ramp was removed and a retaining wall and steps from the basement

would be rebuilt. During this work, the rear extension would be reconstructed. The extension's street-facing façade would be retained. All windows would be replaced with appropriate six-over-six, double-hung windows, which would be fixed, not operable. Masonry would be pointed and repaired. Light fixtures would be restored. A book drop would be added. Rear louvers would be replaced. Hardscaping and landscaping would be added at the sides. Planters would be added. A small storage shed would be added at the side. An electrical transformer would be relocated away from the front of the building. Exterior lighting would be installed. A World War I memorial would be rehabilitated.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Replace rear ramp with front ramp.
- Alter front doorway for ramp.
- Add basement egress stairway.
- Alter basement windows and window wells.
- Other work that the staff is reviewing including work to a rear extension, egress stairs, and retaining wall; window replacement; masonry repair; lighting; hardscaping; landscaping; etc.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - o The proposed work is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment, satisfying Standard 9.
- *Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - o The ramp and egress stairwell could be removed in the future and the historic features restored, satisfying Standard 10.
- *Accessibility Guidelines: Recommended: Providing barrier-free access that promotes independence for the disabled person to the highest degree practicable, while preserving significant historic features.*
- *Accessibility Guidelines: Recommended: Designing new or additional means of access that are compatible with the historic building and its setting.*
 - o The ramp will be compatible with the historic building and its setting and will provide dignified, barrier-free, code-compliant access to the main entrance of the public library while preserving significant historic features, satisfying the Accessibility Guidelines.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10 and the Accessibility Guidelines.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial of the ramp as currently proposed.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:28:30

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architects Betsy Ackerman and Matt Funk, Rebuild representative Cassie O'Connell, and Free Library representatives Lynn Williamson and Jim Pecora represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance offered comments on the application.
- Hal Schirmer offered comments on the application.
- Angie Dixon offered comments on the application.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The design team considered several ramp options before selecting the proposed ramp. Among the options, the designers considered a ramp located up against the façade of the building to the right of the entranceway that would enter the projecting entrance pavilion at the side. This option was not selected because it would require many more irreversible alterations to the building including enlarging a small window and altering pilasters and other features for the door and attaching to a highly articulated facade; it would create two entrances, not one, resulting in inequity among visitors, security problems, and staffing difficulties; and it would require moving the internal access to the roof, which is currently provided by a built-in ladder and hatch where the entrance would be located.
- Since the Architectural Committee's review, the applicants have provided additional information requested by the Committee regarding the ramp including information about the ramp configuration preferred by the Committee but rejected by the applicants.
- The design for the preferred ramp has been revised; the face of the ramp has been articulated, as requested by the Architectural Committee.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- Installing an interpretive display about the building's history should be considered as part of the project.
- The replacement windows should be a lighter color, not black as shown in the rendering.
- The proposed work is compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of the property and its environment, satisfying Standard 9.
- The ramp and egress stairwell could be removed in the future and the historic features restored, satisfying Standard 10.
- The ramp will be compatible with the historic building and its setting and will provide dignified, barrier-free, code-compliant access to the main entrance of the public library while preserving significant historic features, satisfying the Accessibility Guidelines.

ACTION: Ms. Carney moved to approve the revised application, provided the window color is appropriate, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10 and the Accessibility Guidelines. Ms. Michel seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 12 to 1.

ITEM: 6942 WOODLAND AVE MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: Carney SECONDED BY: Michel					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey		X			
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	12	1			

OLD BUSINESS

ADDRESS: 138 W WALNUT LN

Name of Resource: John E. Fryer House

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Gloria Del Piano

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane in Germantown as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A because it “is associated with the life of a person significant in the past.” From 1972 to 2003, the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane was the home of Dr. John E. Fryer, a psychiatrist and a national leader in the gay civil rights movement whose advocacy was instrumental in convincing the American Psychiatric Association (APA) to end its classification of homosexuality as a psychiatric disorder in the early 1970s. The classification stamped homosexuals as emotional deviants and lent medical authority to laws that made homosexual acts and even public gatherings of homosexual persons illegal. In 1972, Fryer spoke at the APA's annual convention and objected to the APA's classification of homosexuality as a psychiatric disorder. Fearing retribution for his position, he appeared in disguise as Dr. Anonymous. Fryer's courageous effort to speak out as a homosexual psychiatrist against psychiatry's decision to pathologize homosexuality changed the APA's position, a major shift with ramifications in myriad realms from medicine to the law that marked a key point in the gay civil rights movement. In 1973, the board of the APA voted to remove homosexuality from its list of mental disorders and to urge that “homosexuals be given all protections now guaranteed other citizens.” The members of the APA ratified the decision in 1974. Fryer lived at 138 W. Walnut Lane until his death in 2003.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane satisfies Criterion for Designation A.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E, with a Period of Significance of 1860 to 2003.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:40:45

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Gloria Del Piano, the property owner, participated in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Farnham explained that that Ms. Del Piano, the property owner, would like to have the garage excluded from the designation. He stated that the staff, which nominated the property, does not oppose the revision to the boundary in the nomination to remove the garage for the following reasons:
 - o The Committee recommended that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A for its association with Dr. Fryer and Criterion E because Mantle Fielding renovated the house in the 1890s. The Criteria are satisfied with or without the garage.
 - o The garage sits on land at the rear that was not originally associated with the property but was added to it later.
 - o The garage is not visible from the public right-of-way.
- Ms. Cooperman asked about the history of the garage.
 - o Mr. Farnham responded that he conducted the research for the nomination and found no detailed information about the garage. It was constructed at the very end of the nineteenth century or at the beginning of the twentieth century at the rears of properties on Harvey Street, the street to the south.
 - o Ms. Cooperman stated that, since we do not have any information about the garage to exclude it from the designation, it should be included in the designation as a contributing resource.
 - o Ms. Del Piano stated that she was hoping that it could be excluded because she is planning to subdivide the property and convert the garage to her apartment. She added that she could accept its inclusion in the designation, owing to a lack of information about it.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke supported the nomination.
- Jim Duffin supported the nomination.
- Oscar Beisert supported the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman supported the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- From 1972 to 2003, the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane was the home of Dr. John E. Fryer, a psychiatrist and a national leader in the gay civil rights movement whose

advocacy was instrumental in convincing the American Psychiatric Association to end its classification of homosexuality as a psychiatric disorder in the early 1970s.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A because it “is associated with the life of a person significant in the past,” Dr. John E. Fryer.
- The property satisfies Criterion E because it was remodeled in the Queen Anne style by architect Mantle Fielding in 1893.
- The carriage house or garage should be included in the designation as a contributing resource because no information is available about it that would allow it to be excluded from the designation.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the property at 138 W. Walnut Lane satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E, and the designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with the carriage house included and classified as contributing. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 138 W Walnut Lane					
MOTION: Designate					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	13				

ADDRESS: 919-21 LOMBARD ST

Name of Resource: Smith Whipper Houses

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Hutchinson Properties Partnership LP

Nominator: Donna J. Rilling and Michael Clemmons

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 919-21 Lombard Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property, which encompasses two formerly separate rowhouses constructed circa 1840, is

significant under Criteria for Designation A, B, and J. Under Criteria A and J, the nomination asserts that the property is significant as the former residences of important African American abolitionists, reformers, businessmen, and civic activists Stephen and Harriet Smith and William and Harriet Whipper. Stephen Smith purchased the property at 921 Lombard Street in 1840 from fellow abolitionist Robert Purvis and resided there until his death in 1873; his wife continued to live there until her death in 1880. The Whippers purchased 919 Lombard Street in 1867. The Smiths and the Whippers were central to voluntary organizations focused on the betterment of impoverished Philadelphians, aided freedom seekers, were at the forefront of antislavery efforts, and were key activists of the region's Black community. Under Criterion B, the nomination explains that the Smiths hosted key leaders of the antislavery movement, including John Brown, William Still, Frederick Douglass and Henry Highland Carnet, at their home in March 1858 as part of a fundraising campaign for Brown's Harpers Ferry mission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 919-21 Lombard Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, B, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 919-21 Lombard Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, B, I, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:15:35

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Donna J. Rilling represented the nominator.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Mehley stated the property owner recently contacted staff with information about the reconstruction of building's rear section in 2000. She noted this would be added to the final version of the nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke supported the nomination.
- David Traub supported the nomination.
- Deborah Gary supported the nomination.
- Jim Duffin supported the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The rowhouses at 919 and 921 Lombard Street were the residences of important African American abolitionists, reformers, businessmen, and civic activists Stephen and Harriet Smith and William and Harriet Whipper. Stephen Smith purchased the property at 921 Lombard Street in 1840 from fellow abolitionist Robert Purvis and resided there until his death in 1873; his wife continued to live there until her death in 1880. The Whippers purchased 919 Lombard Street in 1867.
- Although the nomination highlights Stephen Smith's time and residence in Philadelphia, the Historical Commission recognizes he is an important figure in a larger historical context.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Smiths and the Whippers were central to voluntary organizations focused on the betterment of impoverished Philadelphians, aided freedom seekers, were at the forefront of antislavery efforts, and were key activists of the region's Black community, satisfying Criteria A and J.
- The Smiths hosted key leaders of the antislavery movement at their home in March 1858 as part of a fundraising campaign for Brown's Harpers Ferry mission, satisfying Criterion B.
- The property has high archaeological potential and satisfies Criterion I.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the site at 919-21 Lombard Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, B, I and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Michel seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 919-21 LOMBARD ST MOTION: Designate MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Michel?					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	13				

ADDRESS: 838 1/2 N 42ND ST

Proposal: Convert church for multi-family residential use; construct addition

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: German Yakubov

Applicant: Stephen Bachich, Raymond F. Rola Architects

History: 1872; St. Petri Evangelical German Lutheran Church; Emil H.C. Hartmann; Duhring, Okie & Ziegler, architects

Individual Designation: 6/14/2013

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

BACKGROUND:

This application proposes to convert a historic church building located at 838 1/2 N. 42nd Street to a multi-family residential building. Originally known as St. Petri Evangelical German Lutheran

Church, the church was constructed in phases. A chapel building was constructed in 1872 (see Image 1 and 2). The second phase of construction in 1895 (Image 3) added a one-story masonry church building that covered the remainder of the lot. The final phase of church construction in 1906 added an upper section and steeple above the 1895 section. Today, the church complex maintains a high level of architectural integrity.

This application proposes limited exterior interventions as part of the scope for the rehabilitation and conversion work. The most significant change is the addition of a two-story structure on top of the 1872 chapel. The proposed overbuild is a wood frame structure with clapboard type siding and a combination of casement and awning windows.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Convert existing three-story masonry church into a multi-family building with 20 residential units.
- Construct two-story addition over the existing rear one-story area of the building.
- Install new ADA ramp along Parrish Street elevation.
- Restore existing windows and doors. Selective replacement only where necessary.
- Exterior masonry will be cleaned and repaired as needed.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New addition, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spacial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - o Most of the work proposed meets Standard 9.
 - o The proposed two-story addition above the 1872 chapel is not compatible with the historic materials, features, scale, and proportion of the chapel and church and does not meet Standard 9.
- *Standard 10: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - o Most of the work proposed meets Standard 10.
 - o The removal of the full chapel roof and a large section of the chapel's north wall does not meet Standard 10.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standard 9 and 10.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:25:30

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the revised application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Ray Rola and developer German Yakubov represented the revised application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert supported the application.
- Paul Steinke supported the application.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The revised application responds to the Architectural Committee's comments.
- Setting the addition back from the chapel's front elevation is more effective in protecting its historic character and architectural integrity.
- The Commission recognizes the applicant's concerns about the weight of a masonry system above the chapel and that alternate materials, such as metal panels or another lightweight system, could be used as cladding on the addition while distinguishing it from the historic building.
- Although a small apse will need to be removed as part of the project, the Commission understands that this element is not visible from the public right-of-way and is in poor physical condition.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The revised application meets Standards 9 and 10.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the revised design, with the suggestion that an alternate cladding is considered for the addition, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 838 1/2 N. 42nd Street MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: McCoubrey SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni				X	
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	12			1	

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:35:45

ACTION: At 11:38 a.m., Mr. Mattioni moved to adjourn. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adjournment					
MOTION: Adjourned					
MOVED BY: Mattioni					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Dodds (DPD)	X				
Edwards	X				
O'Donnell (DPP)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Washington	X				
Total	13				

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;

- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.