

MINUTES OF THE 242nd STATED MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

6 December 1979

F. Otto Haas, Chairman

Present: F. Otto Haas, Chairman of the Commission
Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Mrs. James C. Crumlish, Jr.
Edward Pinkowski
John Taxin
Val C. Mogensen, Executive Assistant Director of Finance
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission
David Rosenblum, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siamiontkowski, Executive Assistant to the Chairman
Marion M. Carroll, Architectural Historian
Jefferson Moak, Historical Research Technician

Also: David Pudlin, owner of 2129 Cypress Street, and Sam French, Architect,
to request that the Historical Commission historically certify
2129 Cypress Street.
Holly Chamberlain to observe an Historical Commission meeting.

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

The Minutes of the Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 1 November 1979 were approved and directed to be filed.

REPORTS

The Report of the Architectural Committee for 16 November 1979, Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission. With the addition of Janet S. Klein to the list of those present, the Report of the Architectural Committee for 16 November 1979 was approved and directed to be filed with the official copy of the Minutes.

The Report of the Committee on Certification for 16 November 1979, Edward Pinkowski, Chairman.

The Commission members reviewed each of the submissions for certification individually and voted as follows:

1221 and 1223 Locust Street. This request for certification was tabled pending the receipt of a revised nomination form containing additional information.

Sansom Row (3402, 3404, 3406, 3408, 3410, 3412, 3414, 3416, 3418, 3420, 3422, 3424, 3426, 3428, 3430, 3432, 3434 and 3436 Sansom Street). Certification of Sansom Row was approved as recommended by the Committee.

2129 Cypress Street. At its meeting of 16 November 1979 the Committee on Certification reviewed the nomination form for 2129 Cypress Street and recommended that the house not be certified. The Committee agreed that the building possessed little distinction in itself and did not contribute to the quality of the streetscape. The Kahn association alone, in the Committee's opinion, was not strong enough to warrant the building's certification.

David Pudlin, owner of 2129 Cypress Street, and Sam French, an architect, both appeared before the Historical Commission to oppose the Committee's recommendation and to encourage the historical certification of the Cypress Street house. Pudlin expressed to the Commission his desire to have the house certified in recognition of its significant architectural features particularly on the interior. He noted that while the exterior of the house was not unique, the interior possessed some interesting architectural elements.

Sam French elaborated on Kahn's alterations to the interior of 2129 Cypress Street and stressed the importance of the spatial design and detailing. French pointed out that the treatment of the interior elements in this simple rowhouse found a fuller expression in Kahn's more well known works and clearly reflect Kahn's architectural concept.

After a brief discussion of the Commission's authority to certify and control the interiors of buildings, it was agreed to refer the question of the certification of 2129 Cypress Street back to the Committee for reconsideration.

Mr. Pudlin was asked to submit for the Committee's review photographs of the interior of the house showing the execution of Kahn's concepts and the house's unique architectural detailing.

Bergdoll Brewery. The Commission considered each of the five structures included in the Bergdoll Brewery complex and voted to certify each. Mr. Mogensen voted in opposition to the certification of each of the buildings; Mr. Levy opposed the certification of Building 1, the Bottling Plant.

Spring Garden Neighborhood. The Commission acted on the certification of the Spring Garden Civic Association's nominations in accordance with the recommendations of the Committee.

The following buildings were approved for certification:

505-507-509 North Twenty-first Street
632 North Twenty-first Street
2225 Green Street and 2229-2231 Green Street.

The following buildings were rejected:

520, 522, 524, 526 and 528 North Twenty-first Street
602, 604, 606, 608, 610, 612 and 614 North Twenty-first Street
2327, 2329, 2331, 2333 and 2335 Pennsylvania Avenue.

Mr. Mogensen voted in opposition to the certification of 632 North Twenty-first Street. Action on the certification of 624 North Twenty-first Street was tabled pending the receipt of additional information.

2123-2125 Spruce Street. As recommended by the Committee, certification was approved.

3001 Amber Street. The Commission voted against certification of this frame house as recommended by the Committee.

1217 North Fourth Street. This request for certification was tabled pending the receipt of a completed nomination form. The staff will prepare the form for submission at the Committee's next meeting.

Except for its decision to table action on 2129 Cypress Street, the Historical Commission voted in agreement with the recommendations of its Committee on Certification as stated in the report of 16 November 1979. This report was accepted and directed to be filed with the official copy of the Minutes.

At the request of the Vice Chairman, it was agreed that the Historical Commission Minutes be sent to all the Certification Committee members following each Committee meeting.

Report on Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for the month of November, Richard Tyler, Historian. At the request of the Chairman, Mr. Tyler talked specifically about the Naval Home Reuse Study, the present status of the Provident Bank at Sixth and Spring Garden Streets, the Frankford Arsenal redevelopment proposal and the current standing on the John Wanamaker House at 2032 Walnut Street.

6 December 1979

After a brief discussion of these items, the Commission voted to accept Mr. Tyler's Report for November and directed that it be filed with the official copy of the Minutes.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Executive Assistant to the Chairman

PS:mk