

MINUTES OF THE 403rd STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
13 March 1996

City Council Caucus Room, 401 City Hall
Wayne Spilove, Chairperson

Present

Wayne Spilove, Chairperson
Robert Barnett, Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
David Brownlee, Ph.D., Architectural Historian
Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Department of Commerce
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission
Arlene Matzkin, Historical Architect
Michael Sklaroff, Esq., At-large Member
Scott Wilds, Executive Assistant to the Director, Office of
Housing and Community Development
Stephanie G. Wolf, Ph.D., Historian
Robert Vance, Esq., Chairperson, City Planning Commission

Joshua Grimes, Esq., Law Department

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Jeffrey Barr, Historical Research Technician

Also, with affiliation and/or project

Judith Eden, Center City Residents Association
George Brodie, Center City Residents Association
Ellen Emmons, 258 South 16th Street
John A. Teets, R.A., New Covenant Church
Van Strother, New Covenant Church
Benjamin Ellis, New Covenant Church
Stephan White, R.A., 229 Delancey Street
Christine Jones, 229 Delancey Street
Carl Primavera, Esq., Mesirov, Gelman, Jaffe, Cramer &
Jamieson, 229 Delancey Street
Jane Spivack, 1530 Locust Street
Joyce Haase, 267 Van Pelt Street
Walter Haase, 267 Van Pelt Street
Jeffrey Cohen. Klehr, Harrison, Harvey Branzburg & Ellers, 276
South 20th Street
Martha Kettler, Vitetta Group, Academy of Music
Hyman Myers, Vitetta Group, Academy of Music
Lynn R. Axelroth, Esq., Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll,
Academy of Music
Joanne Phillips. Esq., Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll,
Academy of Music
George Shaeffer, Philadelphia Orchestra, Academy of Music
Peter Miller, R.A., 1801 Pine Street
Bernard Nearey, Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District
Bobbie Burke, Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District

Patrick Amaefuna, Zimmers Associates, 1825 Diamond Street
Susan Sklaroff
Louis Temme, Trinity Memorial Church
Gary Gevurtz, Somnia, 1811 Chestnut Street
Jerry Roller, R.A., 1811 Chestnut Street
Thomas Rogers, 252-254 South 16th Street
Milton Marks, Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia

Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 403rd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 10:05 a.m.

MINUTES of the 402nd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission. Upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the Minutes of the 402nd State Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 14 February 1996, Wayne Spilove, Chairperson.

OLD BUSINESS

Upon the request of the applicants, the Chairman took two matters of old business out of order.

229 Delancey Street

Christine Jones, Applicant
Stephan White, Architect
Carl Primavera, Esq., Counsel

PROPOSAL: Remove non-historic side garden wall; erect new wall with a manually operated wooden gate.

Mr. Tyler reviewed the background of this application. At its meeting of 14 February 1996, the Commission tabled this proposal pending review by the Zoning Board of Adjustment and the Department of Streets of the applicant's request for a variance to park an automobile in the garden and for a curbcut. Although the Zoning Board of Adjustment has denied the variance, the applicant wishes to execute the original proposal to facilitate loading and unloading and access from South American Street to the property. At its meeting of 30 January 1996, the Architectural Committee found that the submission complied with the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation* and recommended its approval.

Carl Primavera, Esq., cited the action of the Zoning Board, and introduced the question and Christine Jones, owner of the property. Mrs. Jones stated that the gate would markedly improve access to the house for maintenance, services and deliveries. Indeed, the narrow front door and hallway prevent bringing some items into portions of the house. Mrs. Jones distributed letters

of support from neighbors and offered photographs of similar gates in Society Hill and Independence National Historical Park.

Upon a motion made by Ms. Matzkin and seconded by Mr. Wilds, the Commission unanimously approved the proposal.

The Academy of Music, 276 South Broad Street

George Schaeffer, Philadelphia Orchestra

Hyman Myers, Architect

Martha Kettler, Architect

Lynn R Axelroth, Esq., Counsel

Joanne Phillips, Esq., Counsel

PROPOSAL: Exterior ramp to comply with American With Disabilities Act

Owing to representation of the Philadelphia Orchestra Association by Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll, Mr. Sklaroff recused himself and left the table.

Ms. Axelroth introduced the issue and reviewed the requirements of the Americans With Disabilities Act. She stated that the proposal complies with that statute and, as the least intrusive design the Orchestra can offer, with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. She noted the request of the Architectural Committee to consider other solutions, e.g., use of the side alley; even with enhancement, she thought this clearly a secondary entrance. Ms. Axelroth mentioned the informal submission of the proposal to the Office of Accessibility Compliance and discussed the alley alternative with that agency; she stated that the Office supported the front entrance approach. She concluded that the preferred design balances the interest of preservation and the disabled.

Mr. Schaeffer described the Association's current development plans for the Academy of Music and the new hall; this includes the refurbishing of the Academy. He reported that Hyman Myers, the architect for this project, had discussed the Architectural Committee's suggestions with a committee of the Association board; the committee gave clear direction to pursue the front entrance. Mr. Schaeffer introduced Mr. Myers.

To clarify the record, Ms. Matzkin noted that the Architectural Committee had not encouraged the continued use of the present disabled entrance which occurs at some distance from Broad Street. Rather the Committee urged a new means of access from the alley but close to the Broad Street facade. She also mentioned a conversation with Robert Thomas, a members of the Accessibility Board, who found an entrance at the front of the alley acceptable.

Mr. Myers addressed the study of optional solutions and the

need to provide access to various parts of the building. He used an interior plan to illustrate his points. A number of questions ensued.

Mr. Brownlee observed that the Commission usually relies on the expertise of its Architectural Committee to evaluate design issues as complex as this and that the present proposal had not come back to the Committee as requested. Ms. Axelroth stated that they did not wish to waste the Committee's time with the same submission; she also said that Debora Russo of the Compliance Office supports the front, not the side, entrance.

Following further discussion, Mr. Tyler returned to Mr. Brownlee's point and urged that the Commission refer the matter back to Committee as determined by the Commission at its December 1995 meeting. Ms. Wolf and Mr. Wilds supported this. Mr. Tyler suggested inviting Ms. Russo and Mr. Thomas to the Committee meeting. Mr. Barnett spoke to the importance of complying with the ADA statute and favored further review by the Committee.

Mr. Brownlee moved the referral of the question back to the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously. Mr. Sklaroff did not participate in the discussion or vote.

Mr. Marks of the Preservation Coalition commended the Commission on its decision, particularly its not casting this matter in terms of historic preservation v. ADA, and recommended that the applicant consult with the State Historic Preservation Officer as provided in the ADA statute.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE REPORT, 27 February 1996, Aflene Matzkin, Chairperson

1608 Walnut Street
Cameron Lacy III, Applicant
PROPOSAL: Banner

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial but with reconsideration upon a reduction in size and approval by other City agencies.

Mr. Sklaroff questioned the Commission's jurisdiction over a banner when a flagpole exists. Mr. Tyler could not answer unless the proposal required a building permit. Mr. Grimes cited the provision in § 14-2007 of the Philadelphia Code concerning change in appearance that could give jurisdiction to the Commission. Ms. Matzkin noted that the applicant had come to the Committee and Commission. Mr. Barnett expressed a concern that applicants not receive the run-around by agencies; the Zoning Board may wish to know the position of the Commission.

Mr. Sklaroff moved that the Commission decline jurisdiction. Mr. Barnett seconded the motion which passed subject to the use of the existing anchors for the flagpole.

258 South 4th Street
Mary Doran, Applicant
PROPOSAL: Garage door

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The applicant seeks approval of the specific design of the garage door in the newer rear portion of the building; this section faces a service alley. The Commission had approved a garage door at this location on 25 January 1996.

Ms. Matzkin moved to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

276 South 20th Street
Sam Olshin, Architect
PROPOSAL: Storefront rehabilitation

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval subject to cost of a cornice with greater definition of planes and depth.

Owing to costs, this submission scales down the proposal approved last month. The present plan reduces the cornice, defers the installation of a new panel under one of the Spruce Street windows, and employs a single leaf, not a double leaf, door.

The cost of the deeper cornice far exceeds the one initially proposed. In view of this, there is no objection to the less detailed cornice.

Ms. Wolf moved to approve the revised proposal as submitted. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1801 Pine Street
Peter Miller, Architect
PROPOSAL: New windows, door and lamps; brownstone repair

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the submission unless historic photographs with evidence to the contrary are found within one week.

The applicant seeks to replace incorrect windows with one over one wooden sash and frames, replace a modern door, install

exterior light fixtures, and repair brownstone. Additional research has not uncovered any historic photographs.

Mr. Brownlee moved to approve the submission. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1917 Spruce Street

Richard Leonard, Owner/Applicant
PROPOSAL: Legalize painting of facade

Architectural Committee Recommendation: a compromise permitting the red paint to remain on all floors of the brick facade; removal of the green paint from the stone trim; examination of the painted step cheek walls to determine material; treatment of the cheek walls accordingly, and use of a darker red in the event of future painting of the brick facade.

The owner painted the first floor of this four story house prior to the designation of the Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District and subsequently painted the upper floors without a permit to match the ground floor. A violation issued. The owner now seeks the legalization of this work.

Bernard Nearey of the Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District urged the rejection of the application and of the Committee's compromise, for approval will diminish the Commission's legal and moral authority. Some discussion ensued concerning the effect of paint removal.

Mr. Barnett spoke in favor of requiring compliance with the historic preservation ordinance and the removal of the paint. Milton Marks of the Preservation Coalition also recommended a denial of the application and the compromise. Ms. Wolfe described the economic and tourism value of well maintained streets; she favored enforcement.

Mr. Brownlee moved to reject the compromise and to request the Department of Licenses and Inspections to enforce the removal of the paint except from the first floor brick surfaces. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

2200-2014 Spruce Street

Trinity Memorial Church
Michael Shade, Architect
PROPOSAL: Reroof side aisles; install new door

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approve the reroofing; reject the glazing of the door.

The applicant seeks to reroof the fire damaged aisle with

EPDM roofing, to recess the door approximately one foot, and to replace the door panels with glass. The architect subsequently withdrew the proposed door treatment.

Mr. Brownlee moved the approval of the roofing. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

2201-2205 Walnut Street and 230 South 22nd Street
Jeffery Hayes, Architect
PROPOSAL: Murals on walls adjoining gasoline service station

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with a review of the more fully developed drawings.

This submission entails the painting of murals with an historic architectural theme on the blank stucco walls overlooking the service station.

Mr. Brownlee moved the approval of the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which the Commission passed with eight votes in favor; Mr. Skarloff abstained.

1825 West Diamond Street
Patrick Amaefuna, Architect
PROPOSAL: Complete restoration

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval with the observation that the Code may require the closer spacing of the baluster of the new railing.

This proposal entails the complete restoration of the house.

Ms. Wolf moved the approval of the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

5500-5506 Germantown Avenue
Larry Field, Applicant
PROPOSAL: Ramp

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

This proposal entails the installation of a ramp to the side of the twentieth century rear addition.

Ms. Wolf moved to approve the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1127 Pine Street
Reed Axelrod, Architect
PROPOSAL: Window and door replacement

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with the observation that the staff should have the authority to approve such submissions to ease the burden on the applicant, the Committee and the Commission.

This applicant proposes to replace windows and doors to match the originals.

Mr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Committee. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

7500 Germantown Avenue
John Teets, Architect
PROPOSAL: Demolition of most of a non-contributing structure and erection of a new church building

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval subject to reconsideration of the height of the steeple. Mr. Teets subsequently submitted several studies of the steeple, resulting in a recommendation of approval as submitted.

Mr. Teets presented his several studies and responded to questions from the Commission.

Ms. Wolf moved to accept the proposal as submitted. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

Fairmount Waterworks Engine House
Claire Donato, Architect, Mark Thompson Associates
PROPOSAL: Glaze porch

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of Option "A" with the heads of the framing to appear approximately three inches below the porch roof to make the glazing read as a box enclosure. The Committee also asked for the use of non-reflective glass if affordable.

Several months ago, the Commission approved in concept the glazing of the middle bays of the porch on the river side of the Engine House for restaurant use. This submission offers the design implementation of that earlier approval. The Committee received three design options and favored "A," for it introduces no strong horizontal lines across the porch.

Mr. Wilds moved to accept the Committee recommendation. Mr.

Brownlee seconded the motion which passed by a vote of eight to one; Mr. Vance voted nay.

1416 West Diamond Street

George Shmidheiser, Senior Architect, Temple University

PROPOSAL: Complete demolition

Owing to the representation of Temple University by Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll, Mr. Sklaroff recused himself and left the table.

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial with the suggestion that the University remove the deteriorated rear ell, and stabilize and seal the main body of the house.

Temple University has owned this property since before 1985, the date of its designation as historic. Owing to a lack of maintenance, water has infiltrated the house, causing the collapse of much of the rear ell's side wall. The Committee observed that the house stands in the middle of a row of five and that its demolition would compromise the other components of the row. The Committee advised the University to remove the rear ell, enclose the back of the building with block, and stabilize and seal the front section.

The Committee also noted that Temple owns other buildings in the West Diamond Street Historic District and reminded the University of its duty to prevent demolition by neglect.

Mr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed with seven affirmative votes. Mr. Barnett abstained. Mr. Sklaroff did not participate in the discussion or vote.

Pennsylvania Barge Club, Boathouse No. 4

Anthony Weber, Architect

PROPOSAL: Remove aluminum siding

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The applicant seeks to remove the aluminum siding from the river side of this boathouse in order to plan the restoration of that facade.

Mr. Vance moved to approve the recommendation of the Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

The Philadelphia Museum of Art
Sandra Horrocks, Applicant
PROPOSAL: Erect temporary tent in east forecourt

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval so long as neither the trees or paving are disturbed.

The Museum proposes to erect a tent in a corner of the east forecourt to provide food service to visitors during the Cezanne exhibition during the summer of 1996.

Mr. Wilds questioned the jurisdiction of the Commission over a temporary tent. Mr. Tyler responded that the Committee had a concern for the preservation of the paving and did not question the tent per se.

Mr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Committee. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which passed with eight affirmative votes. Mr. Wilds abstained.

1811 Chestnut Street
Jerry Roller, Architect
PROPOSAL: Signage

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial

At its meeting of 30 January 1996, the Committee reviewed a proposal to reopen the windows at grade of this building and for the application of plastic signage on the masonry above these windows. The Committee recommended approval of the windows and denial of the signage. The applicant subsequently requested the tabling of the signage question until the Commission meeting of 13 March 1996. At its meeting of 14 February 1996, the Commission approved the reopening of the windows and the tabling of the signage.

On 13 March 1996, Mr. Roller and Gary Gevurtz, the applicant, requested the Commission's approval of the signage proposal. Mr. Roller explained that his client needed the signage as submitted to convey to the public the extent of the retail store, Somnia, at this level.

Ms. Matzkin observed that Urban Outfitters successfully employs signage in the windows at 1801 Walnut Street to establish its identity. Mr. Roller responded that the scale of the occupancy of the two buildings differed. Mr. Gevurtz thought window signage would obscure the wares and activity inside. Mr. Brownlee urged the use of the windows. Ms. Matzkin stated that she would object even to the use of bronze lettering on the masonry base, and Mr. Tyler suggested neon within the windows. Mr. Spilove and Ms. Wolf supported this solution;

however, the applicant thought it unsatisfactory. Mr. Barnett asked if temporary signage could establish Somnia's presence at this location. In this vein, Mr. Tyler proposed a combination of window treatment and a banner. Mr. Barnett recommended a study of optional approaches for consideration at next month's meeting.

Mr. Vance moved the denial of this application. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed with seven affirmative votes. Messrs. Barnett and Sklaroff abstained.

254 South 16th Street

Thomas Rogers, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Legalization of glass and metal canopy

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial, with canopy to be removed and holes in marble patched

The applicant installed a glass and metal canopy over the front door of the property without a permit and now seeks legalization of that work.

Mr. Wilds asked how the Committee would respond to a *de novo* application for this canopy. Ms. Matzkin replied that the Committee would recommend its rejection.

Mr. Rogers asked if he could remove the canopy from 254 South 16th Street and install it at 256 South 16th Street which has new brickwork. Ellen Emmons of 258 South 16th Street spoke against the present application and Mr. Rogers's proposal to relocate it.

Mr. Rogers asked about the relocation of the canopy to 246 South 19th Street and received direction to apply for a building permit which the Committee and Commission would review.

Mr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

For the Committee, Ms. Matzkin urged that Commission's Ad Hoc Committee to Revise the Rules and Regulations act to provide for broader staff review of permit applications. The current level of submissions burdens the Committee unnecessarily; many applications that now come to the Committee and Commission can properly be reviewed by the staff.

The Report on the Activities of the Historical Commission Staff, February 1996, Richard Tyler

Mr. Tyler also reported orally on the progress made in bringing the staff up to its full complement including the Preservation Planner funded by the Department of Streets. In addition, he said that a draft of the section on staff review of the revised rules and regulations was completed; he recommended that the Committee meet to review these and report its findings to the Commission in April.

Certified Local Government Comment on the nomination of the Philadelphia Inquirer Building, 400 North Broad Street, to the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Tyler noted that the National Register nomination submitted follows very closely the one used by the Commission when it designated the property in August 1995. He recommended that the Commission find that the Inquirer Building meets the criteria for entry on the National Register and that it should be listed on the National Register.

Mr. Sklaroff asked what information the Commission had on this nomination. Mr. Tyler responded that we had received the National Register nomination which essentially duplicated the Philadelphia Register form with but modest revisions.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to this effect; Ms. Wolf seconded the motion. The motion passed with eight affirmative votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

The meeting adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Richard Tyler
Historic Preservation Officer