

**THE MINUTES OF THE 751ST STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 14 MARCH 2025, 9:00 A.M.
ROOM 18-029, 1515 ARCH STREET, WITH REMOTE OPTION ON ZOOM
ZACHARY FRANKEL, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Frankel, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Zachary Frankel, Chair (Real Estate Developer)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq., Vice Chair (Community Development Corporation)		X	
Ibriz Muhammad (Commerce Department)	X		
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Thomas Holloman (City Council)	X		
Kyle O'Connor (Department of Public Property)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)		X	
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)	X		
Franz Rabauer		X	
Robert Thomas, AIA (Architectural Historian)	X		
Labaron Lenard-Palmer (Department of Planning and Development)	X		

The meeting was held in person at 1515 Arch Street, with the option for applicants and the public to participate via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
Kristin Hankins, Historic Preservation Planner II
Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
Izzy Korostoff, Community Initiatives Specialist
Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner III
Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the meeting in person:

Sarina Rose, Post Brothers
Jane Golden, Mural Arts Philadelphia
Lindsey Rosenberg, Mural Arts Philadelphia
Matthew McClure, Esq., Ballard Spahr
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance
Eszter Kutas, Philadelphia Holocaust Remembrance Foundation
Nolbert Brown Jr., CEO of the Cicely Tyson Performing Arts Center

The following persons attended the meeting on Zoom:

Alison Weiss, SoLo Germantown
Aaron Moselle -- WHYY News
Abbey Lewis
Amy Lambert, University City Historical Society
Bishop Linda Joy Calhoun
Bruce Bohri, Department of Planning and Development
David Dean
David Gest, Chestnut Hill Conservancy
David McShane, Mural Arts Philadelphia
David Traub, Save Our Sites
Edward Walker
Jay Farrell
Jeffrey Husak
Joe Bolton
Joe Shimp
Josh Husak
Ke Feng, University of Pennsylvania
Kenny
Kimberly & Derek
Kimberly Haas, Hidden City Philadelphia
Laney Myers
Logan Dry, KCA Design Associates
Lorraine Appelbaum
Meff Musak
Meredith Ferleger, Esq., Dilworth Paxson
Mia Wendler
Michael Ramos
Nicholas Covolus
Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance
Roya Taheri
Soheil Mohajerjasbi
Stephanie Pennypacker
Steven Peitzman
Suzanna Barucco
Timothy Kerner, Center City Residents' Association
Tina Marie Hartnett

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 749TH STATED MEETING, 11 JANUARY 2025

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:10:25

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Frankel asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any suggested additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 749th Stated Meeting, held 11 January 2025. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to adopt the minutes of the 749th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 11 January 2025. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 749th Stated Meeting of the PHC					
MOTION: Adopt minutes					
MOVED BY: Frankel					
SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

ADDRESS: 775 S CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS BLVD

Name of Resource: Piers 38 and 40 South

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Tower Investments, Inc.

Nominator: Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Southwark Municipal Piers 38 and 40, located at 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard, as historic and list the property on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the piers, constructed between 1914 and 1915, satisfy Criteria for Designation A, C, D, H, and J. Under Criteria A and J, the nomination argues that the piers represent the establishment and enlargement of the Port

of Philadelphia as a municipal program to spur commercial activity through the creation of a system of municipal piers along the Delaware River waterfront. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination contends that the piers represent an era of civic architecture inspired by the World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago and possess distinguishing characteristics of the Beaux Arts style of architecture. Under Criterion H, the nomination states that the massive piers form an established and familiar visual feature of the Southwark neighborhood, the City of Philadelphia, and the Delaware River. The staff notes that the nomination would benefit from some editing and fact checking. The staff corrected some obvious errors, for example revising the name of Mayor Blankenburg's director of the Department of Public Works, who was Morris Cooke, not Frederick Winslow Taylor, on page 34. Other errors remain; for example, the statement on page 26 that the Benjamin Franklin Parkway was planned as early as 1906 and the groundbreaking took place in 1917 is incorrect. Planning, in fact, began in the nineteenth century and the official groundbreaking, the demolition of some houses in the boulevard's path, occurred in 1907.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, H, and J.

ACTION: See Below.

ADDRESS: 428-34 N 4TH ST

Name of Resource: National Marine Engineers Beneficial Association Office

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Mark H. Rubin

Nominator: Misha Wyllie

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 428-34 N. 4th Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The two-story commercial building was constructed in 1966-67 to serve as a union hall for the National Marine Engineers Beneficial Association, which owned the property until 1990. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J. The former union hall was constructed amid widespread demolition of the surrounding neighborhood as part of the Callowhill East Redevelopment Project, and thus the nomination argues that it exemplifies the economic and political heritage of the community in the era of urban renewal, meeting Criterion J. Addressing Criterion D, the nomination cites the post-war turn to Modern architecture in the United States and contends that this building reflects the built environment of that era. Finally, the nomination cites Criterion C and describes the subject property as embodying the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style—New Formalism.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 428-34 N. 4th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J.

ACTION: See Below.

ADDRESS: 327 N 34TH ST

Proposal: Legalize windows

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Carmine Zheng

Applicant: Pink Zhao, D & R Company Electric LLC

History: 1907

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Powelton Village Historic District, Contributing, 11/10/2022

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to legalize front windows that were replaced in October 2024 without the Historical Commission's approval, leading to a violation being issued by the Department of Licenses and Inspections. The replacement windows are incompatible with this historic building in style and material.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Legalize front window replacement.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
 - o The wood windows removed included leaded glass windows on the first and second floors. The removal of these distinctive windows does not meet Standard 2.
- *Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
 - o The original windows were replaced with vinyl windows that have interior muntins. The replacements windows do not replicate the historic windows in design, configuration, or material. The design and material of the original windows were a character-defining feature of this building and row; therefore, the new windows do not meet Standard 6.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standards 2 and 6.

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:10:55

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance requests to the Historical Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance provided information regarding the continuance request for 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard.

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to continue the reviews of 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard to the July 2025 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation, 428-34 N. 4th Street to the

May 2025 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation, and 327 N. 34th Street to the May 2025 meeting of the Historical Commission. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Continuances MOTION: Approve continuances MOVED BY: Frankel SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 25 FEBRUARY 2025

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 1631-37 ARCH ST

Proposal: Install mural

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Verizon Communications Inc.

Applicant: Lindsey Rosenberg, Mural Arts Philadelphia

History: 1915; Bell Telephone Building; John Windrim, architect

Individual Designation: 12/12/2008

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes installing a mural on the one-story east façade of the building at 1631-37 Arch Street, historically known as the Bell Telephone Parkway Building. This wall faces the Horwitz-Wasserman Holocaust Memorial Plaza, the site of the first public Holocaust monument (1964) in the United States. The proposed mural would be the nation's first large scale mural dedicated to Holocaust remembrance and education in a public space.

The limestone wall facing Memorial Plaza is not original to the 1915 Bell Telephone Building. Until the early 1960s, the east wall of 1631-37 Arch Street functioned as a party wall. After the adjacent buildings were demolished in the 1960s, the brick party wall was exposed and later finished with limestone panels. The planned mural will be painted on cloth and installed into

recessed panels of the east façade. Prior to this installation, the limestone will be painted with an acrylic primer to prepare for the mural application. After installation, the mural areas will be coated with an acrylic varnish coating.

During the February 2025 Architectural Committee review, Committee members expressed concern about potential moisture trapped between the mural and limestone panels. After the meeting, the applicant provided technical data to supplement their original application. The data indicates that the mural materials will allow water vapor transmission and therefore will not damage the limestone or party wall.

SCOPE OF WORK

- Install a mural on the east façade

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
 - o The alteration of the limestone wall with a mural would not destroy the historic character of the property. The area being impacted is not part of the original design or historic fabric.
- *Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - o If the proposed mural were removed in the future, the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. Any damage to the non-historic wall could be repaired or replaced.
- *Section 6.15.a. of PHC Rules & Regulations:*
 - o *Murals shall not be placed directly upon historic fabric.*
 - o *Murals shall not be placed in a manner that obscures historic fabric.*
 - o *The Philadelphia Historical Commission, its committees, and staff shall not consider a mural's content as part of its review of any application for a building permit, but may consider size, scale, and relationship to the historic context.*

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval, pursuant to Standards 2 and 10, and Section 6.15.a. of the Historical Commission's Rules & Regulations.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standard 10.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:16:40

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Lindsey Rosenberg, Jane Golden, and David McShane of Mural Arts Philadelphia and Eszter Kutas of the Philadelphia Holocaust Remembrance Foundation represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- No public comment.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- A mural in this location is acceptable because the wall surface on which it would be painted is not historic.
- The primary concern for a mural as proposed is the permeability of the paint adhesives. Vapor transmission data provided by the applicant indicate that the paints and coating specified are vapor permeable and will not trap water in between the mural and limestone wall.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The alteration of the limestone wall with a mural would not destroy the historic character of the property. The area being impacted is not part of the original design of the building and is not historic fabric, satisfying Standard 2.
- The mural's paints and coatings technical specifications indicate they have a high vapor transmission rate and will not trap water in the limestone wall and cause deterioration. If the mural is removed in the future, the wall could be returned to its original condition, satisfying Standard 10.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to approve the application, pursuant to Standards 2 and 10 and Section 6.15.a. of the Historical Commission's Rules & Regulations. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1631-37 Arch St MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: Thomas SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 449 LOCUST AVE

Proposal: Rehabilitate designated house and construct addition

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: KJB Solutions, LLC

Applicant: Logan Dry, KCA Design Associates

History: 1861; Edwin T. Chase House

Individual Designation: 12/13/2024

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to convert the Edwin T. Chase House to a multi-unit residential building. The proposal calls for restoration of the primary (east) façade and rehabilitation of the north and south facades of the main block and secondary block located behind. An altered one-story enclosure at the rear of the building will be demolished. Fire escapes on the north and south facades of the main block will be removed. Much of the original fenestration pattern will be restored on the first and second stories of the north and south facades of the main block. The third story of the main block's north and south facades have two small, double arched windows that were partially altered by the construction of the fire escapes. The proposal would restore the top portions of the arched windows but lengthen them by adding lower sashes. An elevator overrun will be removed from the main block. The roof height of the secondary block will be raised to align with the rear addition, diminishing the original difference in height between the main block and the secondary block.

The three-story addition will be clad in cementitious siding with two-over-two windows similar to those in the original building. A hipped roof will cover most of the addition with a flat-roofed hyphen where the addition will adjoin the secondary block of the original building. Juliet balconies with minimal railings will break up the massing of the addition.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Restore/rehabilitate the main block of the original building.
- Raise the roof height of the secondary block of the main building.
- Demolish the altered one-story block at the rear of the original building.
- Construct a three-story rear addition.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
 - o The primary façade of the main block will be restored to its original appearance.
 - o The top sash of the paired, arched windows on the third story of the main block's north and south facades will be restored but lower sash will be added to lengthen these windows.
 - o The roof of the secondary block will be raised to be the same height as the third story of the addition.
 - o An original, altered one-story room at the rear of the house will be demolished.
 - o The addition is shorter than the main block, but its roof is slightly taller than the secondary block of the original building.
- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be*

differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- o The addition allows for retention of the cornice and roof line of the north and south facades of the secondary block.
- o Cladding in cementitious clapboard siding differentiates the addition from the historic structure.
- o The addition is deferential to the historic building and the topography of the site reduces its visual impact.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval, with reconsideration of the lengthening of the third-story arched windows of the main block, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 2 and 9.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, owing the lack of details regarding rehabilitation of the historically designated building, the size of its third-story egress windows, the need for a setback on the addition's north façade, and the design of the addition's fenestration, pursuant to Standards 2 and 9.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 26:24

PRESENTERS:

- Dan Shachar-Krasnoff presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Logan Dry and attorney Meredith Ferleger represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Hanna Stark of the Preservation Alliance commented in support of the application.
- Oscar Beisert asked about the potential inclusion of shutters.
- Michael Ramos commented that the addition is too large.
- David Traub of Save Our Sites commented that the color of the addition could be improved.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The application proposes the restoration of the front and side facades of the building.
- The applicant revised the design of the arched third-story windows on the north and south facades of the main block in keeping with the recommendations of the Architectural Committee.
- The revised addition's design includes a setback on the north facade, darker colored siding to enhance differentiation with the main block, a more unified fenestration pattern, and French doors on the Juliette balconies.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The application proposes the restoration of the three street-visible facades of the designated building, satisfying Standard 2.
- The proposed addition at the rear of the building is compatible in design while being appropriately differentiated, satisfying Standard 9

ACTION: Ms. Carney moved to approve the revised application, with the staff to review details,

pursuant to Standards 2 and 9. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 449 Locust Ave MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: Carney SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 19 FEBRUARY 2025

ADDRESS: 549-51 N 10TH ST

Name of Resource: Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, House and Business

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Shui Guan Li & Zhen Yue Huang

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street, the site of the residence and business of Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation B as delineated in Section 14-1004(1)(b) of the Philadelphia Code; the property “is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation,” the funeral of Abraham Lincoln. Earley was the undertaker for the Philadelphia segment of Lincoln’s funeral, providing a custom hearse to carry the president’s body and overseeing the logistics of the ceremonies. Lincoln’s funeral lasted nearly two weeks in April and May 1865. Lincoln’s body was carried by train from Washington, DC to Springfield, Illinois, where he was interred. The funeral train with Lincoln’s portrait on the engine and remains in a special rail car covered 1,654 miles, passed through 200 cities and towns, and employed nearly 50 locomotives. Millions of Americans viewed and mourned Lincoln along the rail lines, during the many short stops along the way, and during the 12 extended ceremonies in the state capitals and large cities including Philadelphia. The nomination claims that the funeral is not only historically significant as a shared outpouring of the grief over the first assassination of a US president and more broadly over the devastating Civil War that was ending at the time of the

assassination but is also important for its impact on funerary practices in the United States. Noted funeral director and historian of the American funeral industry Todd Van Beck has contended that “the funeral of President Lincoln was so consequential, so massive, so involved, that it changed funeral service in the United States for the next 100 years.” The nomination seeks to demonstrate that the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street, the site of the residence and business of Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, played a fundamental role in the funeral and therefore merits historic designation.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination for 549-51 N. 10th Street demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation B; the property “is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation,” the funeral of Abraham Lincoln.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and B.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:00:43

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Cooperman stated that the Committee on Historic Designation was very enthusiastic about the quality of the nomination and was excited to learn about this important history that is largely unknown. She thanked the staff for writing the nomination. She opined that the nomination makes a strong case for significance beyond Criterion B and reported that the Committee recommended adding Criterion A.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society supported the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property at 549-51 N. 10th Street, the site of the residence and business of Edward S. Earley, undertaker. Earley constructed the building about 1863.
- Earley was the undertaker for the Philadelphia segment of President Abraham Lincoln’s funeral, providing a custom hearse to carry the president’s body and overseeing the logistics of the ceremonies.
- The 1865 funeral of President Lincoln was so consequential that it changed funeral service in the United States for the next 100 years.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The property at 549-51 N. 10th Street is associated with an event of importance to the history of the nation, the funeral of Abraham Lincoln, satisfying Criteria for Designation A and B.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at

549-51 N. 10th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and B and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Lenard-Palmer seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 549-51 N 10TH ST MOTION: Designate MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Lenard-Palmer					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 1520-22 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: S.S. Kresge Store

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: PR Chestnut Associates LP

Nominator: Center City Residents Association

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A two-story commercial building, known as the S.S. Kresge Store, stands on the property. The nomination contends that the S.S. Kresge Store, built in 1934, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. The nomination argues that the property reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, specifically the Art Deco style, satisfying Criteria C and D. The nomination also argues that Silverman & Levy, the architects of the structure, was a firm that significantly influenced the development of the City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed this nomination for the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street at its meeting on 17 April 2024. After that review, the Historical Commission discovered that it had failed to inform the property owner of the restarted review, which had been continued for many months. Therefore, the Historical Commission decided to abandon the ongoing review and start the process over from the beginning with proper notice to the owner. The Committee on Historic Designation will review the nomination today as though the first Committee review had not happened. The Historical Commission is scheduled to review the

nomination on 14 March 2025.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:06:12

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Timothy Kerner of the Center City Residents' Association and Oscar Beisert represented the nomination. Mr. Kerner advocated for the designation and subsequent regulation of the entirety of the property.
- Attorney Michael Phillips and Sarina Rose, Senior Vice President of Development for Post Brothers, represented the property owner. Mr. McClure and Ms. Rose requested that the Historical Commission only designate the two street facades of the building and allow alterations elsewhere on the building with comment-only oversight by the Historical Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub of Save Our Sites supported the designation of the property.
- Suzanna Barucco supported the designation of the entirety of the property.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The character-defining features of the historic building at 1520-22 Chestnut Street are limited to the two primary street facades.
- The rooftop of the building has been modified for parking and connected to an adjacent parking garage.
- The property is zoned CMX-5, which allows a 1200% FAR.
- The property has significant untapped development potential.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The historic facades on Chestnut and Sansom Street embody distinguishing characteristics of the Art Deco architectural style, satisfying Criteria C and D.
- Silverman & Levy, the architectural firm that designed the building, significantly influenced the development of the City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, provided the Historical Commission's review authority over subsequent building permit applications is limited to full jurisdiction at the historic, two-story Chestnut and Sansom Street facades and review-and-comment jurisdiction only for the remainder of the property. Mr. Frankel seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 8 to 1 with 1 abstention.

ITEM: 1520-22 Chestnut St MOTION: Designate, limiting Historical Commission jurisdiction to facades MOVED BY: Lech SECONDED BY: Frankel					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman			X		
Holloman (City Council)		X			
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	8	1	1		3

ADDRESS: 4732-42 N BROAD ST

Name of Resource: Logan Theatre

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Owen Williamson

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street, known as the Logan Theatre, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The two-story structure was built in 1923 for the Stanley Company of America and operated as a movie theater from its opening in 1924 until the property was sold to a church in 1973. The nomination contends that the property meets Criterion for Designation C as a reflection of the neighborhood movie theaters built between 1913 and 1930, many of which employed broadly Neoclassical styles and were intended to stand out from the surrounding environments. The nominator further argues that the theater's architects, Hoffman & Henon, make it worthy of Criterion for Designation E, as the firm gained national recognition for their work and significantly shaped Philadelphia's built environment through their theaters and commissions for Catholic institutions. Finally, the nomination explores the Logan Theatre's role as a fixture in the Logan neighborhood of Philadelphia, asserting that it exemplifies the cultural and social heritage of the community and merits designation under Criterion J.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, E, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, E, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:08:25

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Nolbert Brown Jr. represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub of Save Our Sites commented in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The Logan Theater was built in 1923 for the Stanley Company of America.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Logan Theatre at 4732-42 N. Broad St merits designation under Criterion C as a neighborhood movie theater from a period when many where built and only few remain.
- The property meets Criterion for Designation E as the work of the architecture firm of Hoffman & Henon.
- The property meets Criterion J for its contribution to the cultural, economic, and social heritage of the community.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4732-42 N. Broad St satisfies Criteria for Designation C, E, and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Michel seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 4732-42 N Broad St					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, E, and J					
MOVED BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: Michel					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 3708-12 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Reed-Hubley Residence, Greenfield Intercultural Center

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania

Nominator: Ke-An Chiang, University City Historical Society

Staff Contact: Heather Hendrickson, heather.hendrickson@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Reed-Hubley Residence, built circa 1845, satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J. Under Criterion C, the nomination maintains that the subject property stands as one of the last examples of the small suburban villas once found on Chestnut Street. It exhibits a mixture of romantic architectural styles which were prevalent in the era prior to the 1854 Consolidation Act when the area was known as Blockley Township. Under Criterion J, the nomination argues that the property reflects the evolving history of transportation into the suburban areas outside of central Philadelphia. Also under Criterion J, the nomination argues that as home of the Greenfield Intercultural Center since 1982, the building symbolizes the University of Pennsylvania's evolving approach to fostering diverse student communities on campus.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:15:48

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Hendrickson presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Amy Lambert represented the nomination.
- Ke Feng of the University of Pennsylvania attended the meeting on behalf of the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The Reed-Hubley Residence is currently the oldest building owned by the University of Pennsylvania.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Reed-Hubley Residence satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J for the reasons cited in the nomination.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. O'Connor seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 3708-12 Chestnut St MOTION: Designate, Criteria C and J MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: O'Connor					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 1429 W MAYFIELD ST

Name of Resource: Revell House

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Philadelphia

Nominator: Roya Taheri, Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1429 W. Mayfield Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A. Under Criterion A, the nomination asserts that the house holds significant religious, historical and cultural value, owing to its association with a key moment in the early history of the Bahá'í Faith in the United States. The house is notable for its connection with the Revell family, particularly Mary J. Revell and her daughters, Jessie and Ethel Revell, all influential members of the early Bahá'í community in Philadelphia. It is also historically significant for being one of the locations visited by 'Abdu'l-Bahá during his visit in North America in 1912. The proposed period of significance is 1910-1916, when the Revell family occupied the property.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that 1429 W. Mayfield Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1429 W. Mayfield Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:21:20

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Lorraine Appelbaum and Roya Taheri represented the nominator and property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert spoke in support of the nomination. He complimented the owner and nominator for taking pride in the property through the proposed designation and restoration of the building.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The building along with the rest of the row was constructed between 1888 and 1891.
- The house is notable for its connection with the Revell family, particularly Mary J. Revell and her daughters, Jessie and Ethel Revell, all influential members of the early Bahá'í community in Philadelphia.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building holds significant religious, historical and cultural value, owing to its association with a key moment in the early history of the Bahá'í Faith in the United States, as one of the locations visited by 'Abdu'l-Bahá during his visit in North America in 1912, satisfying Criterion A.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1429 W. Mayfield Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Michele seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1429 W Mayfield St MOTION: Designate MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Michele					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 376 MARTIN ST

Name of Resource: German Evangelical Lutheran Bethanien Burial Ground

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Southeastern Pennsylvania Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church

Nominator: John Manton and Joseph Menkevich

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the burial ground site at 376 Martin Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the burial ground is associated with the lives of persons significant in the past, including Civil War soldiers and German-speaking Lutheran immigrants. Under Criterion I, the nomination contends that the site may be likely to yield information in history. In addition to the burial ground, an 1850 German Lutheran Church stood on the site; it was demolished after Bethany Lutheran Church constructed a new church across the street in 1873. According to the nomination, nearly 1,000 burials were recorded by the turn of the twentieth century. Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the burial ground exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community by its connections through its ministers, trustees and its German-speaking immigrant congregants, who were mill workers and mill owners that contributed to the development of Manayunk and Roxborough, and by the German-American Lutheran veterans interred at the site.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the burial ground at 376 Martin Street satisfies Criteria for Designation I and J, but that the arguments for Criterion A are covered under Criterion J and therefore Criterion A can be omitted.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic

Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the burial ground at 376 Martin Street satisfies Criteria for Designation I and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:26:30

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- Nearly 1,000 burials were recorded by the turn of the twentieth century at this site, including Civil War veterans and German-speaking Lutheran immigrants.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The site may be likely to yield information in history, as a burial ground and the location of an 1850 German Lutheran Church that was demolished after Bethany Lutheran Church constructed a new church across the street in 1873, satisfying Criterion I.
- The burial ground exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community by its connections through its ministers, trustees and its German-speaking immigrant congregants, who were mill workers and mill owners that contributed to the development of Manayunk and Roxborough, and by the German-American Lutheran veterans interred at the site, satisfying Criterion J.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the burial ground at 376 Martin Street satisfies Criteria for Designation I and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 376 Martin St MOTION: Designate MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADDRESS: 820-26 E ALLEGHENY AVE

Name of Resource: Beneficial Savings Fund Society, Kensington Branch

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Majestic Property Management, LLC

Nominator: Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Beneficial Savings Fund Society (BSFS), Kensington Branch, 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the BSFS, Kensington Branch, constructed in 1924 and enlarged in 1934 and 1952, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the building's first two construction campaigns are in the Classical Revival Style and the third campaign is in the Modernist Style. Under Criterion E, the nomination maintains that the firm of Horace Trumbauer, designer of the first two campaigns, was a major force in American architecture from the late 1890's through the early 1950's and promoted the Classical Revival style. Paul Monaghan, designer of the third campaign, created eclectic buildings for Roman Catholic and Roman Catholic-related institutions. The period of significance spans from 1923, when construction began, through 1965 shortly after the last documentary photograph with Mid-Century Modern style signs.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue, the BSFS, Kensington Branch, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 2:30:00

PRESENTERS:

- Daniel Shachar-Krasnoff presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub spoke in favor of the nomination and expressed support for the designation of additional Classical Revival bank buildings.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The first two campaigns of the Beneficial Savings Fund Society, Kensington branch were designed by the firm of Horace Trumbauer in the Classical Revival style.
- The third campaign of the Beneficial Savings Fund Society, Kensington branch was designed by the firm of Paul Monaghan in the Modernist style.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Kensington branch of the Beneficial Savings Fund Society embodies the Classical Revival and Modernist architectural styles, satisfying Criteria C and D.
- The architectural firm of Horace Trumbauer was a major force in American architecture from the late 1890's through the early 1950's and the firm of Paul Monaghan created eclectic buildings for Roman Catholic and Roman Catholic-related institutions, satisfying Criterion E.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D and E and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Michel seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 820-26 E Allegheny Ave					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Lech					
SECONDED BY: Michel					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Lenard-Palmer (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:35:50

ACTION: At 11:52 a.m., Mr. Frankel moved to adjourn. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adjournment					
MOTION: Adjourn					
MOVED BY: Frankel					
SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair					X
Muhammad (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
O'Connor (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey					X
Michel	X				
Rabauer					X
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	10				3

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional

engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;

(f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;

(g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;

(h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;

(i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or

(j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.