

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

12 June 1985

David Hollenberg, Chairman

- Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National
Historical Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Terry Koob, Clerk Steno II
- Also: Bart Forman and Joann Wurst to request approval for the installation of a
projecting sign on the facade of 52 S. 2nd Street
James Timberlake, Bob Bayers, Phyllis Ellis and Carl Doebley to present plans
for the rehabilitation and reuse of 51-55 N. 3rd Street
Robert Cotter and Mike Newman to present plans for renovations to 1919 Wallace
Street
Paul Calvert, Architect, to present plans for renovations to 2229-2231 Green
Street
Mark Fox, Architect, to present his proposal for the reconstruction of the
front facade of 724 S. 2nd Street
Margo Heegeman, John Thompson and William Martin to present revised plans for
the construction of a new kiosk at Thirtieth Street Station
Stephen G. Park and Eugenia Warnock to present plans for renovations to the
Reading Terminal at 12th and Market Streets
and others

ALTERATIONS

52 S. 2nd Street, Bart Forman, Applicant. Mr. Forman presented his plan to the Architectural Committee for a sign to be installed on the front facade of 52 S. 2nd Street, a three-story, brick loft building in Old City. This V-shaped, vertical sign will project eleven inches and will be visible from both Chestnut and 2nd Streets. Prior to the Architectural Committee Meeting, this application was reviewed and approved by the Art Commission. The Planning Commission staff in its review of Mr. Forman's application found the design inappropriate. The Planning Commission, however, acts only in an advisory capacity to the Art Commission. The Planning Commission staff, in its letter of 20 March 1985 to the Art Commission, recommended that a flush sign be placed horizontally on the facade at the cornice line of the ground floor storefront. Mr. Forman, in conformance with the Art Commission's requirements, revised the sign by reducing it in size from nine feet to seven feet and by cutting back on illumination.

After considerable discussion, the Architectural Committee decided to take the matter under advisement and render a recommendation following consultation with Art Commission and City Planning Commission staff persons.

Subsequent to the 12 June meeting, the Commission staff consulted with Kathleen McKenna of the Art Commission and Barbara Kaplan of the Planning Commission concerning the need to establish sign review procedures for historic buildings and historic districts particularly in areas of overlapping jurisdiction. In this particular case, the Committee agreed to support the recommendation of the City Planning Commission and require changes to the proposed design to include its horizontal orientation

within the storefront cornice and the elimination of any projection and back-lit illumination.

51-53-55 N. 3rd Street, James Timberlake, Robert Bayers, Phyllis Ellis and Carl Doebley appeared before the Architectural Committee to present plans for the rehabilitation of 51-53-55 N. 3rd Street into fifty-five apartments in the Old City area. The intention of the architect is to restore these three structures to their original appearance. After an examination of the plans, the Committee recommended that the elevation drawings be revised to agree with the insurance surveys on file in the Commission office. In particular, the window sash required correction as did the ground floor storefronts. Ms. Batcheler suggested that instead of eliminating the iron shutters, the architect incorporate them into the plans if they are found not to interfere with the operation of the windows.

The Architectural Committee asked that the revised drawings be submitted to the staff for review and comparison with insurance surveys. Ms. Batcheler requested that copies of photographs taken of the exteriors of these three buildings be filed with the Philadelphia Historical Commission. Since revised drawings have not yet been received, it is recommended that action on this submission be tabled.

1919 Wallace Street, Robert Cotter, Architect. Mr. Cotter presented to the Architectural Committee plans for rehabilitating the property at 1919 Wallace Street. Mr. Cotter plans to restore the structure as closely as possible to its original condition. The Committee reviewed the plans and suggested that the shutter rail be lowered to below the center rail of the window. Mr. Cotter plans to install a door that he believes is an early if not an original door. The transom survives and will remain intact. Storm windows are planned for the interior of the windows. Mr. Cotter also presented plans for a rear, three-story addition to include a garage. The Committee asked that the architect submit drawings for the garage door design before proceeding with its construction.

The Architectural Committee noted that if revised drawings for the shutter rails and a garage door design are submitted and approved prior to the Commission Meeting, a final approval will be recommended.

2229-2231 Green Street, Paul Calvert, Architect. Mr. Calvert presented to the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation of these two properties at 2229-2231 Green Street. Mr. Calvert explained that most of the work will be confined to the side elevation. The only work to the front facade will involve a restoration of the cornice to be modeled after the cornice at 2225 Green Street.

Following some discussion, the Architectural Committee unanimously voted to recommend the approval of the plans to rehabilitate the properties at 2229-2231 Green Street.

724 S. 2nd Street, Mark Fox, Architect. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented a detailed description of the structural condition of the front wall of the building at 724 S. 2nd Street which was in imminent danger of collapsing prior to the approval of a demolition for this wall. Mr. Fox explained that the wall was to be rebuilt and that the original brick was kept to be used in this restoration. Mr. Fox also stated that he measured the wall prior to its demolition. The Committee reviewed the plans presented by Mr. Fox. The Committee suggested that the cornice be simplified and that a minor correction of some wood trim be made.

Subsequent to this meeting, revised drawings were received and found to be acceptable. A final approval of this project is recommended.

Elson's Kiosk, 30th Street Station, Margo Heegeman, William Martin, Stephen Park and Eugenia Warnock presented revised plans for the erection of a kiosk proposed in the 30th Street Station. Ms. Heegeman explained that the major change from the previously approved plan appeared in the protective security gate which will be housed in a side pocket and will wrap around the kiosk at the close of business. This change will provide more retail space and eliminate the need to remove merchandise in order to secure the kiosk. This top hung security gate will be constructed of bronze colored aluminum strips. The Committee thought that the canopy which will hold the gate was too large and asked that it be reduced in size to approximately 15" if structurally feasible. The Committee also requested that the lettering, "Elson's News Stand," should be spaced out more evenly on the canopy.

The Architectural Committee recommended that revised drawings for the canopy and an actual depiction and style of the lettering be submitted and, if approved, they would recommend that the Commission grant its approval.

Reading Terminal, 12th and Market Streets, David Hollenberg, Architect.

Mr. Hollenberg explained that this is the third phase of the rehabilitation of the Reading Terminal at 12th and Market Streets. This phase of the project is to include the restoration of the Headhouse and the remainder of the exterior and ground floor areas. Mr. Hollenberg explained that this work would only include those areas that are owned by the Reading Company and would not include that section which was rehabilitated illegally by SEPTA.

Masonry restoration is proposed for the exterior of the terminal and a modified version of the original cornice will be installed. This new cornice will be simpler in design and will have a two-and-a-half foot projection instead of the original four foot projection. This reduction will allow the cornice installation without the erection of a standing scaffold. Removal of the fire escape is also scheduled.

New wood storefronts with display areas will be constructed on Market Street. The restoration plans also specify that all existing wood windows, frames, sash, sills and interior trim will be retained and restored and the installation of interior storm windows are planned for the second to the ninth floor.

The Committee unanimously recommended that the Commission approve the plans for this phase of the Reading Terminal rehabilitation with the exception of the south west corner of the project. The Committee requested that this area be restudied and that revised construction details be submitted for further review. Mr. Hollenberg abstained from voting on this project.

2006, 2020, 2041 and 2043 Mt. Vernon Street, John Bushnell, Architect. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented Mr. Bushnell's request for an interior work permit for 2006, 2020, 2041 and 2043 Mt. Vernon Street. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that the developer planned to do exterior work as well but that a submission for exterior work will be submitted for review at a later time. The Committee agreed to allow an approval for interior work only since a delay would cause the developer to lose his financing and seriously jeopardize this project.

The Architectural Committee voted unanimously to approve the application for interior work on these structures subject to specific notation that there will be no changes to the exterior elevation including windows and doors.

REVIEW

Doran Residence at Druim Moir, Ueland & Junker, Architects. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented to the Committee, plans for the construction of a garage on the grounds of the Doran Residence at Druim Moir. After considerable discussion and deliberation, the Committee decided that they would voice no objection to this application for new construction.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Koob
Clerk Steno II