

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

29 September 1988

David Hollenberg, Chairman

- Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence
National Historical Park
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation Program
- Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I
- Also: Bruce Greiff, Martin Dorf and Edward Mills to present a proposal
representing design development for renovations to the Bourse
Building located at 5th & Market Streets.
Helen File to present a proposal for the construction of a
handicap ramp on the south side of the building adjacent to
the 1968 addition to the original meeting house located at
320 Arch Street.
Kenneth Arnold of George E. Patton, Inc. to present a proposal
which calls for the restoration and revitalization of the
Swann Memorial Fountain and its environs.
Paul Vinicoff, Architect, to present a proposal which calls for
the rehabilitation of the front facade of 1916 Delancey
Street.
Vincent Maiello, Architect, to present a proposal for the
complete rehabilitation and reconstruction of the front wall
of the property located at 420 S. Van Pelt Street.
Warren Bradway, applicant, to present a proposal for the
rebuilding of a second-story rear addition to the three-story
back building at 345 S. Camac Street and the construction of a
roof deck railing.
Richard B. Moore, owner, to present a proposal for the
replacement of a brownstone watertable and brownstone
entrance stairs with a brick watertable and brick entrance
stairs.
Philip E. Scott of John Milner Associates, Richard Butcosk,
Peter Moriarity and H. Jack Snyder of Burt Hill Kosar and
Rittleman Associates to present a preliminary proposal for
the unbonded improvements and a final submission for the
bonded improvements to City Hall Annex.
Neil Schlosser, Architect and Carl G. Roberts, Esq., to discuss
the various rehabilitation schemes for 3428-30 Sansom Street.
And others.

ALTERATIONS

THE BOURSE - 21 S. 5th Street
Voorsanger and Mills - Dorf Associates

Messrs. Dorf, Mills and Greiff presented to the Architectural Committee design development drawings for proposed renovations to the Bourse Building at 21 S. 5th Street. A previous submission for renovations to the 5th Street plaza and facade and for alterations to the interior retail space on the main, street and mezzanine levels was reviewed and approved in concept.

Mr. Dorf explained to the Committee that the design concept of the 5th Street plaza remained unchanged but that some modifications were necessary. He pointed out that the proposed squared-off glass retail spaces in the entrance vestibule of the building proved to be impractical and that the design of these spaces has changed to a curved greenhouse that will attach to the building. The Committee acknowledged the construction and maintenance problems of the previously proposed rectangular pavilions and agreed to allow the proposed change in shape. The Committee did request, however, that the small panes of glass in these pavilions and on the remainder of the new construction be replaced with large panes of glass more in keeping with the scale of the building. The Committee also asked that the three story lighted obelisk at the north end of the plaza be moved out and away from the face of the building. Finally, all new metal construction on the plaza should have a dark colored finish.

On the interior the Committee asked that the proposed new stairs down to the basement level follow a circular rather than a spiral form. To further retain the symmetry of the interior space, the Committee asked for the elimination of the angled elements in the floor cut at the top of the stairs. A more appropriate method of treatment in this area was recommended. It was suggested that the architect examine historical precedents and develop a design more in keeping with traditional design in this area.

ARCH STREET MEETING HOUSE - 320 Arch Street
Helen J. File, Applicant

In June of 1988, the Architectural Committee reviewed and approved, in concept, the proposed construction of a handicap ramp on the south side of the meeting house adjacent to the building's 1968 addition. The Committee at that time, requested the submission of detailed drawings and material specifications before a final approval is given.

The final drawings, as presented, call for the construction of a concrete ramp with a railing designed to match an existing iron railing on the property.

The Committee found the design of the proposed ramp to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval subject to one condition. The Committee asked for the construction of a low brick wall with limestone capping to run parallel with the ramp. This wall will rise in front of the concrete ramp and result in a more sympathetic alteration to the structure.

Swann Memorial Fountain - Logan Square
Kenneth Arnold from George Patton, Inc.

Kenneth Arnold appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a submission which calls for the restoration and revitalization of the Swann Memorial Fountain and its environs. A research study undertaken by George E. Patton, Inc. describes each element of the fountain and circle in terms of the historical design intent, changes which have occurred over the past sixty years, existing conditions, as well as existing uses and local concerns. The chief areas of concern addressed in the report include the restoration of the fountain's operation and lighting, improvement of water quality, the feasibility of winter operation of the fountain, improved maintenance of the grounds, restoration of site lighting and improvement of pedestrian access.

The Committee unanimously voted to recommend an approval for this project.

1916 Delancey Street
Paul Vinicoff, Architect

Mr. Vinicoff appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal which calls for the rehabilitation of the front facade of 1916 Delancey Street, a three-story house in the proposed Rittenhouse/Fitler Residential Historic District. The proposed work included the replacement of all window sash, a re-stuccoeing of the front facade and a new brick entrance stair and handrail.

The existing facade has a very rough stucco finish similar to its two neighbors. The architect proposes to re-stucco with a smooth finish and to replace all the small light casement window sash with new larger light sash. The air-conditioning louvers on the front facade are to be removed.

Mr. Vinicoff stated it is his intention to remove a portion of the stucco on the front facade of the building and if the brick is in good condition to repoint instead of restuccoeing.

The Committee recommends an approval of the new stair and rail and a denial of the proposed replacement windows and stucco as proposed. The Committee recommends that the windows be retained or replaced in kind with new metal casements and that the building be restuccoeed with a textured finish to be approved by the staff..

420 S. Van Pelt Street
Vincent Maiello, Architect

Mr. Maiello appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal which calls for the complete rehabilitation of 420 S. Van Pelt Street including the reconstruction of the front wall. A Department of Licenses and Inspections violation has identified the front wall of the existing building as dangerous and in need of replacement. The applicant also wants to build a new entrance and stoop on the side of the property and a new stoop at the front of the property.

The Committee recommends an approval for rebuilding the front wall to match the original as closely as possible. The new brick is to be inspected by the Commission staff for color and size match. The Committee recommends an approval of the new side door and the proposed steps outside the door. In addition, the Committee recommended approval of replacing the deteriorated brownstone front steps with brown tinted cast stone steps. The Committee also recommends the removal of the air-conditioning vents on the side wall of the property and the repointing, rather than stuccoeing, of the side wall. The Committee recommends denial of the applicants proposal for glass block windows on the first floor of the back of the building. The Committee requested revised drawings for the proposed work.

345 S. Camac Street
Warren Bradway, owner

Mr. Bradway appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal which calls for the rebuilding of a second-story rear addition to the third-story back building at 345 S. Camac Street. This addition will be of brick supported on the ground level by two iron columns. Secondly, the applicant proposes building a roof deck railing on the rear three story back building

The Architectural Committee voted to recommend an approval, in concept, of the construction of a railing to enclose the roof deck atop the three-story back building. However, the staff advised the Committee that the proposed railing will sit upon an overhanging portion of an inappropriate and illegally erected cornice. The staff suggested that a building permit for any deck railing not be approved until this cornice is removed and a correct cornice is installed. The applicant claimed that permission to install the new cornice was granted by the Historical Commission in 1984.

The staff reviewed the file and found a permit for roofing but no record evidence indicating an approval of this cornice on the second-story back building. The Committee agreed that because the cornice exceeded the 1984 permit that they would recommend its removal. Mr. Hollenberg agreed to inspect the building prior to the Commission meeting to evaluate the cornice and determine its appropriateness. Moreover, the Committee noted that detailed drawings of the proposed deck railing and additional photographs will be required before any approval for this work can be granted.

406-408 S. 16th Street
Richard B. Moore, owner

Mr. Moore appeared before the Architectural Committee to present an application for the replacement of a brownstone watertable and brownstone entrance stairs with a brick watertable and brick entrance stairs.

The Committee voted to recommend a rejection of the proposed replacement of the brownstone stairs and watertable with brick stairs and watertable. The Committee recommends that the stairs be replicated in cast stone and that the watertable be left alone.

CITY HALL ANNEX - Filbert and Juniper Streets
Philip E. Scott from John Milner Associates

Mr. Scott appeared before the Architectural Committee to present the Preliminary Submission of Historic Unbonded Improvements to City Hall Annex. These unbonded improvements include the rehabilitation of interior wall, floor and ceiling surfaces, and all bronze doors, windows and spandrels in the Juniper and Thirteenth Street lobbies.

The Architectural Committee voted to recommend an approval, in concept, of the preliminary submission of unbonded improvements to City Hall Annex. David Hollenberg abstained from voting on this matter.

Mr. Scott next presented the final submission for bonded improvements. Bonded improvements include exterior masonry cleaning and restoration, terra cotta restoration, window replacement on floor two through twelve, window restoration on all other floors and bronze refinishing.

The Committee voted to recommend an approval for the bonded improvements to City Hall Annex. David Hollenberg abstained from voting on this matter.

3428-30 Sansom Street
Neil Schlosser, Architect and Carl G. Roberts, Esq.

At the request of the Historical Commission, Mr. Schlosser appeared before the Architectural Committee to discuss with the Committee plans filed by his office with the Department of Licenses and Inspections for the rehabilitation of 3428-30 Sansom Street. These plans do not include a basement areaway on Sansom Street.

Mr. Schlosser explained to the Committee that he had revised his plans for 3428-30 Sansom Street, to exclude the proposed areaway, owing to the Architectural Committee's recommendation against approval of the Sansom Street areaway. These revisions were made in order to allow all other aspects of the rehabilitation work to proceed. Mr. Schlosser explained that it was his client's intention, however, to pursue an approval of the areaway.

Mr. Schlosser discussed with the Committee an alternative areaway treatment which would result in a less drastic impact on the facade and streetscape. The Committee, however, reiterated its position that a basement areaway on the facade of 3428-30 Sansom Street is

inappropriate and does not conform with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. The areaway has no basis in history and calls for changing the size and configuration of original masonry openings on a primary elevation of the building. The Committee's recommendation against the approval of an areaway at 3428-30 Sansom Street remains unchanged.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah