

THE MINUTES OF THE 324th STATED MEETING
OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

14 September 1988

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

- Present: Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman
David Brownlee
David Hollenberg
Jason Nathan
William Thompson
Benjamin F. Ellis, Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, Philadelphia City Planning
Commission
John Street, Esq., Councilman, Fifth District
David Wismer, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
- Also: Fred L. Hauim, President, and members of the Tikvoh Chadshuh
Synagogue
Reverend John W. Grant, Sr., Pastor and Parishioners of the
Friendship Baptist Church
Randy Cotton, Donna Harris and A. Robert Jaeger of Philadelphia
Historic Preservation Corporation
Sara Reiter, KKFS
John J. Murphy, Architect
Carl Roberts, Esq.
MaryLou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition
Mary A. Kilroy and Edward T. Cialko from the Redevelopment
Authority
Edna M. Irving, Legal Aide, Councilman Street's Office
And others.

THE MINUTES of the 323rd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 13 July 1988, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman were reviewed and approved by the Commission.

THE MINUTES of the Special Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 28 June 1988, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman, were reviewed and approved by the Commission. At the meeting of 13 July a member of the Commission requested that the minutes of this special meeting be rewritten to include the names of those residents and owners who spoke as well as a fuller description of the opinions offered and the issues raised.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the revised minutes of the Special Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission for filing.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 28 July 1988, David Hollenberg, Chairman.

Mr. Hollenberg reported that twelve projects were reviewed by the Committee. The Committee recommended an approval of the following five projects: 140 S. Broad Street, 1520 Latimer Street, 1328 Pine Street, 221 Chestnut Street and the Frankford Arsenal, Building 15, located at Tacony and Bridge Streets.

The Commission voted to accept the recommendations of the Architectural Committee for the above mentioned projects and approve the proposals as submitted.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the minutes do not accurately reflect the recommendation of the Committee for 315-19 Arch Street and asked that they be corrected. The Committee recommended a conceptual approval, not a final approval, for this submission. Detailed drawings are required before a final approval can be granted.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee for 315-19 Arch Street.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the Committee recommended a rejection of three projects. These included 409 S. 20th Street, 600 Pine Street and 26-30 S. 21st Street.

The Commission voted to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee for the denial of approval of these three projects.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that, subsequent to the Architectural Committee meeting, the proposal for the Cathedral of Sts. Peter and Paul had been approved by the staff of the Commission. Richard Tyler stated that he approved the proposal as originally submitted for the handicapped access ramp on the Race Street side of the Cathedral.

This decision was made after consultation with the only available member of the Architectural Committee and in order to preserve a mature tree on the property.

The Commission voted to approve the staff action concerning the Cathedral.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the Committee recommended tabling the 2224 Green Street submission for the reasons discussed in the Committee report.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee to table the submission for 2224 Green Street.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the Committee recommended an approval which included lowering the elevator vent on the north wall of 240 S. 4th Street and the installation of louvers in the dormer windows. These louvers will be placed behind the existing double hung six-over-six window sash with the glass removed. The proposed treatment of the south wall still remains unresolved.

The Commission voted to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee for 240 S. 4th Street.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 25 August 1988, David Hollenberg, Chairman.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the Architectural Committee reviewed ten projects. The following two projects were approved as submitted: 919 Pine Street and 7500 Germantown Avenue.

The Commission voted to approve this section of the Architectural Committee report.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that a conceptual approval is recommended for 2-16 Vine Street, City Hall Annex - Filbert and Juniper Streets, 114 Kenilworth Street, 413 S. 10th Street and 239 Race Street. Working drawings must be received for review before a final approval is granted.

Mr. Hollenberg asked that the minutes be amended to show that he abstained from voting on the submission for City Hall Annex.

Mr. Hollenberg informed the Commission that the minutes do not accurately reflect the full discussion on 1801 Pine Street. Mr. Hollenberg noted that an addendum had been prepared and circulated for Commission review.

The Commission voted to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee for 1801 Pine Street with the addendum.

Mr. Hollenberg reported that the Committee reviewed the demolition permit application for 26-30 S. 21st Street and recommended that the

applicant be directed to comply with Section 7 (f)(.1) through (.7) of the Preservation Ordinance. Action on the permit application is tabled until the applicant submits the information listed under Section 7 (f).

David Brownlee suggested that this request of the applicant to comply with Section 7 (f)(.1) through (.7) be made in writing with a brief explanation of the provisions requirements.

The Commission unanimously approved the recommendation of the Architectural Committee concerning the 26-30 S. 21st Street demolition permit application.

Mr. Hollenberg next addressed the Family Court Building submission. The Committee voted to recommend an approval for the replacement of the original wood casement window sash on the 18th, 19th and Wood Street elevations of the Family Court Building with aluminum replacement windows to match the configuration of the original design. The Committee agreed that the original window sash on the front facade of the building should be retained and repaired.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that the Historical Commission staff disagrees with the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. A copy of the staff recommendation was distributed to the Commission members and is attached to the official copy of these minutes.

This recommendation asks for the repair and restoration of the Vine Street windows be undertaken immediately and that the work be evaluated by the project architect, the Department of Public Property, the Family Court and the Historical Commission for energy efficiency, quality of work, disruption to building activities and the amount of time required for completion of the job. Based on the results of this evaluation, a determination can then be made concerning the most appropriate treatment of the secondary elevations.

Commissioner Benjamin Ellis of the Department of Public Property expressed his agreement with the staff recommendation.

The Commission voted to accept the recommendation of the Historical Commission staff.

THE REPORT of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 20 May 1988, David Brownlee, Chairman. Mr. Brownlee along with Mr. Baron presented slides and a description of the significance of the Friendship Baptist Church located at 18th and Wharton Streets.

Reverend John W. Grant Sr., addressed the Commission and thanked all the people involved in helping with the designation of the Friendship Baptist Church.

Following Reverend Grant's presentation, the Commission voted to designate the Friendship Baptist Church as an historic building.

Pittsburgh Plate Glass Building - 1027 Arch Street

Mr. Brownlee and Mr. Baron presented slides and discussed the significance of the Pittsburgh Plate Glass Building located at 1027 Arch Street.

The Commission voted to designate the Pittsburgh Plate Glass Building.

Edmund B. Seymour House - 260 W. Johnson Street

Mr. Brownlee presented slides and spoke on the significance of the Edmund B. Seymour House located at 260 W. Johnson Street. Mr. Brownlee stated that this building has been listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

The Commission voted to designated the Edmund B. Seymour House located 260 W. Johnson Street.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Historic Designation of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 14 March 1986, Grace Gary, Chairman.

Jewish Foster Home and Orphanage and Tikvoh Chadshuh Synagogoue
700 E. Church Lane

David Brownlee and Randal Baron presented slides and discussed the significance of the Jewish Foster Home and Orphanage located at 700 E. Church Lane.

Members of the Tikvoh Chadshuh Synagogue questioned the Commission regarding the restrictions which apply to designated properties.

The Commission voted to table the issue of designation of the Jewish Foster Home. It was agreed that Richard Tyler will meet with the congregation to explain the ramifications of designation and to answer questions.

Mr. Brownlee informed the Commission that the Foundation for Architecture will be sponsoring a tour of Eastern State Penitentiary on October 1 and 15, 1988 from 1:00 to 4:00 p.m. Mr. Brownlee stated that the tour is free. However, reservations are needed.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Historic Designation of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 26 July 1988, David Brownlee, Chairman.

Mr. Brownlee explained that this meeting was called to discuss ways to improve the designation process for historic districts.

Mr. Brownlee stated that a four stage procedure was adopted by the Designation Committee for the review of district nominations. These four stages are:

1. Resource Identification
2. Preliminary Resource Definition

3. Final Resource Definition

4. Final Preparation of Inventory

Mr. Brownlee explained each procedure to the Commission in detail. Mr. Brownlee also stated that the Society Hill District is in the middle of stage three and the Spruce Hill District is at stage one.

Barbara Kaplan asked that these procedures be more specific.

Mr. Brownlee stated that he would insert a preamble to the report to clarify the procedures outlined in the report.

Mr. Nathan urged a fuller explanation of the ramifications of historic designation.

The Commission approved the Report of the Designation Committee of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 26 July 1988, David Brownlee, Chairman.

THE REPORT on the Activities of the Philadelphia Historical Commission staff for July - August 1988, Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Report of the staff activities for July - August 1988 for filing.

OLD BUSINESS

3428-30 Sansom Street

Maria Petrillo, counsel for the Commission, reviewed the current status of 3428-30 Sansom Street for the Commission members. Ms. Petrillo's response to Carl Roberts' letter of 14 September 1988 was distributed to the Commission for review at the beginning of today's meeting. Mr. Roberts serves as attorney for the owner of 3428-30 Sansom Street. Before introducing Mr. Roberts, Ms. Petrillo noted the following facts for the Commission's consideration.

1. In a 26 May 1981 memorandum to the Redevelopment Authority Mr. Tyler wrote that "Areaway stairs should not be used."
2. The Historical Commission has no record of receiving the Sansom Street Review Committee Design Criteria dated 22 May 1981.

Ms. Petrillo further informed the Commission that it should exercise its independent authority in this matter.

Carl Roberts addressed the Historical Commission and asked for the Commission's approval of the introduction of a basement areaway on the front elevation of 3428-30 Sansom Street. Mr. Roberts suggested that no feasible alternative existed that would allow for use of the basement and that would meet code requirements.

Mr. Wismer pointed out that plans for the development of the property, without an areaway, were submitted to the Department of Licenses and Inspections for review and that these plans appear to be acceptable. It was noted that another set of plans existed as well.

Owing to the confusion regarding the various proposals for development which have surfaced, the Commission asked that the architect be invited back to the Architectural Committee to explain the various schemes referred to at today's meeting. Since Mr. Roberts indicated that a lease for the basement had already been entered into by the owner and prospective tenant, Ms. Petrillo requested that a copy be submitted for review.

NEW BUSINESS

Demolition of 1736 Diamond Street

Richard Tyler introduced the matter of 1736 Diamond Street to the Commission. This building stands within the Diamond Street Historic District. Owing to serious deterioration, the building was declared dangerous by the Department of Licenses and Inspections and a demolition or repair order issued.

Mary A. Kilroy, representing the Redevelopment Authority, advised the Historical Commission of the Authority's desire to develop a Rock Garden at the corner of 18th and Diamond Streets. The site of 1736 and several adjoining vacant lots would provide the parcel upon which the garden would be developed. Ms. Kilroy presented plans for the garden to the Historical Commission for its review.

Following some discussion, the Commission voted to approve the demolition of 1736 Diamond Street owing to its dangerous condition and the Redevelopment Authority's proposed development of the site as a neighborhood garden.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah