

**THE MINUTES OF THE 746TH STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 11 OCTOBER 2024, 9:00 A.M.
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
ZACHARY FRANKEL, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Thomas, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Robert Thomas, AIA (Architectural Historian)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq., Vice Chair (Community Development Corporation)	X		
Kareema Abu Saab (Commerce Department)	X		
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Zachary Frankel (Real Estate Developer)	X		
Thomas Holloman (City Council)	X		
Roy Conard (Department of Public Property)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)	X		
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)		X	
Franz Rabauer	X		
Matthew Treat (Department of Planning and Development)	X		

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
Kristin Hankins, Historic Preservation Planner I
Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
Izzy Korostoff, Community Initiatives Specialist
Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner III
Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

Alison Weiss, SoLo Germantown Civic Association
Aaron Moselle, WHY

Abbey Lewis
Allee Davis
Jake Blumgart
Bruce Bohri, Department of Planning and Development
Dan Macey
Dave Walker
David Brownlee
David Traub, Save Our Sites
Dawud Bey
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance
Henry Felsman
Ian Litwin, City Planning Commission
Jay Farrell
Justin Detwiler
Justin Spivey
Kathy Dowdell
Leah Silverstein
Lee Elsey
Liz Waytkus
Marianne Scott
Matthew McClure, Esq., Ballard Spahr
Milton Lau
Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Sarina Rose
Sherman Aronson
Stephanie Pennypacker, Department of Planning and Development
Steven Peitzman
Suzanna Barucco
Tina Marie Hartnett

SELECTION OF THE NEW CHAIR

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:03:05

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Thomas stated that he would be stepping down as chair of the Historical Commission upon the selection of a new chair. He asked for a nomination for a new chair.

ACTION: Ms. Carney moved to nominate Mr. Frankel as chair. Mr. Lech seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 10 to 0 with two abstentions.

ITEM: Selection of new chair					
MOTION: Select Zachary Frankel as new chair					
MOVED BY: Carney					
SECONDED BY: Lech					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman			X		
Frankel	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)			X		
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	10		2		1

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 745TH STATED MEETING, 13 SEPTEMBER 2024

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:19:36

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Frankel asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any suggested additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 745th Stated Meeting, held 13 September 2024. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to adopt the minutes of the 745th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 13 September 2024. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 745th Stated Meeting of the PHC MOTION: Adopt minutes MOVED BY: Frankel SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Thomas	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 24 SEPTEMBER 2024

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 4124-28 PARKSIDE AVE

Proposal: Construct multi-unit residential building

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Beywatch Property Management LLC

Applicant: Lee Elsey, LC Architecture LLC

History: 1894

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Parkside Historic District, Significant, 12/11/2009

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

BACKGROUND:

This application proposes to construct a three-story building at a property classified as significant in the Parkside Historic District. The new building will be located in the side yard of the lot and stand between five and 10 feet from the historic building. The entrance to the new building will be located at the end of a narrow pathway that runs between the buildings. The existing building was constructed in 1894 and is four stories tall with a prominent porch and features distinctive late-Victorian decorative elements and a mansard roof. The new building will include a stucco and brick front façade with a fiberglass cornice and belt courses. Both side elevations, including the large exposed east elevation will be clad in a combination of Hardie board panels and vinyl siding behind a return of the front façade materials. The new building will stand beside the historic building and will be prominently visible from Parkside Avenue.

The Architectural Committee reviewed and recommended denial of two earlier versions of this project in February and June 2024. Those applications were withdrawn before the Historical

Commission reviewed them.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Construct a new three-story building adjacent to an existing historic building at 4124-28 Parkside Avenue.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - o The proposed vinyl siding and Hardi board cladding materials for the east and west side elevations of the addition do not meet Standard 9. The materials are not compatible with the historic materials or features of the building. The cladding should be replaced with an alternate material that is more appropriate for the district such as brick or stucco.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends approval, provided more appropriate cladding materials are used on the east and west side elevations, pursuant to Standard 9.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial as proposed, but approval provided a brick return of one bay is added to the west side elevation; the scale and proportions of the cornice are adjusted; the parapet is lowered; the vinyl siding is eliminated from the side elevations; and the color of the siding materials is changed to a slightly darker color, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:21:21

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Till presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Lee Elsey represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub of Save Our Sites specified that he was neither for nor against the application and requested further improvements.
- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society commented in opposition to the application. He suggested the proposed building could be larger and more in proportion with the historic building.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The revised application proposes a smaller building with improved materials than earlier iterations and therefore better relates to the historic building.
- The materials and colors proposed for the cladding on the east wall should be reviewed in the field before a final decision is made.
- The windows on east wall should be redesigned to be more in proportion with the windows on the front facade.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The proposed new construction will satisfy Standard 9, provided the east-facade windows are redesigned and the siding color revised and reviewed in the field.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the revised application, provided the east-facade bathroom are smaller, square, punched windows; the east-facade stair windows are larger, punched windows like the bedroom windows; and the siding color is a red-brown brick tone, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9. Mr. Conard seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 4124-28 Parkside Ave MOTION: Approval with conditions MOVED BY: McCoubrey SECONDED BY: Conard					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Thomas	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

OLD BUSINESS

ADDRESS: 1628-36 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Provident Trust Company Building

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Phila. Retail Trust 1998 LP/BRE Hotels Resorts, BRE Quad PA Owner LP

Nominator: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1628-36 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The building was constructed in three phases: the 12-story tower (1928), and two two-story additions (1946, 1987). The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D and E. The nomination argues that the building is Georgian Revival style, satisfying Criteria C and D. Furthermore, the nomination argues that Rankin & Kellogg was a leading Philadelphia architectural firm that designed large commercial and institutional buildings, satisfying Criterion E.

The Historical Commission sent notice letters to the owners of the property announcing the consideration of a designation on 13 June 2024. The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed the nomination at its 17 July 2024 meeting. None of the property owners attended the Committee meeting. Concerned that the property owners were not participating in the review, the Historical Commission continued the matter from its August to its October 2024 meeting and, after some research, sent additional notice letters to potential addresses for the property owners on 16 August 2024, inviting them to participate at the 11 October 2024 meeting of the Historical Commission.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 1628-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1628-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E, with an amended period of significance to end in 1987.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:56:10

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Shachar-Krasnoff presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Hannah Stark of the Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia represented the nomination.
- Attorney Matt McClure represented the Philadelphia Retail Trust 1998, LP.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. McClure explained that his client owns the lower two floors of the building, the commercial space. He stated that his client does not have an objection to the nomination or a destination. He did, however, ask the Historical Commission to confirm that three doorways on the west or 17th Street façade, which were closed up and converted to windows, could be reopened.
 - o Mr. Farnham reported that he had discussed the matter with Mr. McClure and then reviewed historic photographs of the building. He opined that the doorways could be restored to their original condition, and that an application to reopen the doors would be able to be approved at the staff level because the work would be a restoration.
 - o Mr. McClure thanked Mr. Farnham for confirming that the doors could be reopened at some point in the future.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The 12-story tower of 1628-35 Chestnut Street was constructed in 1928 with additions in 1946 and 1987.
- The building exemplifies the Georgian Revival Style
- Prominent architectural firm Rankin & Kellog designed the original building and the 1946 addition.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building exemplifies the Georgian Revival Style, satisfying Criteria C and D.
- Rankin & Kellog, which designed large commercial and institutional buildings, was a leading Philadelphia architecture firm, satisfying Criterion E.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1628-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D and E and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 1628-36 Chestnut St MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, D, and E MOVED BY: Lech SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Thomas	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 700-34 RACE ST

Name of Resource: Roundhouse, Philadelphia Police Headquarters

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: City of Philadelphia

Nominator: Preservation Alliance/Docomomo Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property known as the Roundhouse, the former Philadelphia Police Headquarters at 700-34 Race Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Philadelphia architectural firm Geddes Brecher Qualls & Cunningham (GBQC) and engineer August Komendant designed the Roundhouse in 1959 and its construction was completed in 1962. The building is composed of approximately 1,000 precast concrete units. The nomination argues that the Roundhouse reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style, the Expressionist style, satisfying Criterion for Designation C, and embodies distinguishing characteristics of that style, satisfying Criterion D. The nomination contends that the Roundhouse embodies distinguishing characteristics of an engineering specimen with its architectural precast concrete and state of the art post tensioning, also satisfying Criterion D. The nomination highlights the collaboration

between the prominent Philadelphia architectural firm GBQC, engineer August Komendant, and general contractor Sovereign Construction Company and asserts that they were designers and builders whose work significantly influenced the development of the city, state, and nation, satisfying Criterion E. The nomination claims that the Roundhouse contains elements of design, detail, materials, and craftsmanship that represent significant innovations, satisfying Criterion F. The nomination asserts that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion H, owing to its unique siting and location. Finally, the nomination contends that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion J because it exemplifies the progressive period in Philadelphia under Mayors Clark and Dilworth.

The proposed boundary for the designation includes the northern portion of the site with the building but not the surface parking lot to the south. The boundary also excludes a small parcel at the northwest corner of the site that is owned by the Delaware River Port Authority, not the City of Philadelphia. The nomination identifies the concrete perimeter wall as a non-contributing feature, owing to the expectation that any redevelopment of the site will require its demolition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:04:04

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance request to the Historical Commission.

ACTION: Ms. Carney moved to continue the review of the nomination for 700-34 Race Street for one month to the Historical Commission's November 2024 meeting. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 700-34 Race St MOTION: Continue the review for one month MOVED BY: Carney SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Thomas	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:07:19

ACTION: At 10:11 a.m., Mr. McCoubrey moved to adjourn. Mr. Lech seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adjournment MOTION: Adjourn MOVED BY: McCoubrey SECONDED BY: Lech					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Thomas	X				
Holloman (City Council)	X				
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.