

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Arlene Matzkin, Chair
Commission Conference Room
Suite 1301, 1401 Arch Street
28 January 1997

Present

Arlene Matzkin, Chairperson
Tony Atkin
Penelope Batcheler
J. William Cornell
Herbert Levy
Suzanne Pentz

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Laura Spina, Historic Preservation Specialist

Also

Stephen McNeice, Carlson Associates, Inc.
Peter Baker, Carlson Associates, Inc.
Warren Huff, City Planning Commission
Bennur Koksuz, City Planning Commission
Eric Trainer, George Yu Architects
Edward Bell
Ed Bronstein
Stuart Schmidt
Marsha Weinraub
Jerome Donovan
Douglas Cohen, Kitchen Associates
Kevin Meeker, Irish Table
Randy Cotton, Preservation Alliance
Alan Cesnoff, P&A Associates
Peter Shaw, P&A Associates
Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents Association
Sabrina Soong, Soong Associates, Inc.
Craig Hoffman, Nash Apartments
Jeff Harris
Tom Anderson, New Central Baptist Church
Terry Graboyes, Graboyes Commercial Window Company
Anthony Quinn, Graboyes Commercial Window Company
Louise Baumholtz, Towne Real Estate
Tom Callan, 2039 Pine Street

Ms. Matzkin called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

1300-1324 Market Street, Wanamaker Building

May Company, Owner
Mark Coughlin, Architect/Applicant
DATE: 1902-1910
PROPOSAL: Signage, clean base and entrances, paint trim, opaque
film in selected windows

Stephen McNeice explained that the proposal has four parts: repainting trim of the windows the historic green color; cleaning the stone and metal of the entrances of Market and Chestnut Streets; installing metal signs that say "Lord and Taylor" in a script similar to the original Wanamaker signs; installing a dark film on eight (8) windows on Chestnut, Juniper and Thirteenth Streets. The Committee recommends approval of the painting and the cleaning, as long as the contractor uses the gentlest cleaning method possible. For the signage, the Committee expressed concern that the stone columns and pilasters will have more holes and the older holes are highly visible. Mr. McNeice noted that the contractor will patch any holes from previous signage.

The Committee was most concerned about the opaque film in the windows on Chestnut Street. Ms. Matzkin noted that the dark film will not convey a friendly and inviting appearance to pedestrians on Chestnut Street. Mr. McNeice explained that the area behind the windows at the corners of Thirteenth Street and Juniper Street will not be used. The Committee suggested installing display cases like those on Market Street instead of just making the windows dark blanks. Warren Huff of the City Planning Commission noted that the Planning Commission would not look favorably on the film in the windows on Chestnut Street.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the paint, cleaning and signage, with staff to approve a cleaning sample and a patch sample for the existing holes. The Committee recommends denial of the opaque film in the windows on Chestnut, Juniper and Thirteenth Streets.

1901 Vine Street, Free Library of Philadelphia

City of Philadelphia, Owner
Eric Trainer, Architect/Applicant
DATE: c. 1920
PROPOSAL: Balustrade restoration

Eric Trainer described the work for the repair and restoration of the limestone balustrades of the Free Library of Philadelphia. The damage appears most at the balustrade on the second floor balcony of the two end pavilions of the building, 54 balusters in all. The scope of work presented is for these areas; however, when money becomes available all areas of the balustrades will be restored. Mr. Trainer explained that the proposal calls for taking apart the damaged balusters, replacing the corroded iron rods with stainless steel and reassembly. All old bird-deterrent surfacing will be removed and the stone will be cleaned. The Committee discussed the possibility of simply replacing the balusters with new ones. However, the new ones may stand out because of the difficulty of matching the limestone.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the repair and restoration or replacement of the balusters.

326 Spruce Street

Mary Louise Krumrine, Owner

Edward Bell, Architect/Applicant

DATE: 1831-1833

PROPOSAL: Cut new opening in rear porch, install new windows

Edward Bell, architect, described the proposal. On the rear, which is visible, the owner wishes to cut a new, larger opening and install a triple window on the second floor, where a single window exists. Ms. Batcheler explained that the area of the proposed work is an original wood extension of the building. Historical photographs of the property and the insurance survey of 1845 detail this extension which has remained intact since the erection of the building. The history of the rears of these John Haviland-designed rowhouses is as important as the front facades. Other Committee members agreed that the proposal to cut away so much of the original fabric violated the *Standards* of the Secretary of the Interior and would compromise the integrity of the intact rear of the wood extension.

The Committee, with a vote of 4 to 1, voted to recommend denial of the proposal. Mr. Cornell cast the dissenting vote.

602-606 North 22nd Street AKA 2200 Mt. Vernon Street

Stuart Schmidt and Marsh Weinraub, Owners

Edwin Bronstein, Architect/Applicant

DATE: c. 1840

PROPOSAL: New windows, garden wall and gate

Mr. Bronstein described the proposal for this corner rowhouse that now stands alone. The owners wish to remove a rear shed and privy that are deteriorated beyond repair and construct a one-story addition with a garden wall and gate. The new wall and gate will be made of painted steel tubing and perforated panels. Ms. Batcheler asked the architect to document the privy with a drawing and photographs before the demolition for the Historical Commission's records. The owners wish to install air conditioning units on the roof of the rear ell. The Committee asked that the units be placed as far from the street as possible so they are not visible.

The proposal also includes replacing all of the existing sash. The building has two-over-two windows on the front facade, and a combination of six-over-six and one-over-one windows on the side facade, including the ell. The mixture of two-over-two and six-over-six sash is typical of rowhouses of this time period and is noted in insurance surveys for houses on the same block. The owners wish to install only two-over-two sash in the house so that all of the windows have a consistent look. The Committee asked that staff investigate with the architect if the six-over-six sash are original. If they are, then the *Standards* state that the replacement windows match the original. Ms. Batcheler and Ms. Pentz voted for the retention of the mixture of sash types, but the other Committee members voted that all of the

windows could be two-over-two. The Committee noted that the one-over-one sash are not original.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the demolition of the rear shed and privy, with documentation of the privy; approval of the garden wall and gate. The Committee's vote to approve the two-over-two sash was split.

123-125 Chestnut Street AKA 45-55 S. 2nd Street, Corn Exchange Building

Jerome Donovan, Tenant
Sabrina Soong, Architect/Applicant
DATE: c. 1900; 1912 - addition
PROPOSAL: New entrance on 2nd Street facade

Jerome Donovan wishes to open a restaurant in the addition of the Corn Exchange Building, erected in 1912. Peter Shaw, owner of the building, noted that the Committee and Commission approved a previous proposal to cut a door in the same location in September 1989. Mr. Donovan and Sabrina Soong, architect, presented two proposals for a new door on the 2nd Street facade of the building. Currently, the entrance to the space is from a door that leads to a common lobby with elevators to the upper floors. Having the entrance to the restaurant from the lobby poses a security risk for the offices upstairs. The Committee members discussed various locations for the door, but conceded that the middle of the five bays seemed the best solution. The Committee decided that the plan proposed by Ms. Soong with a transom was the more appropriate design. Mr. Donovan will return to Committee with a formal sign proposal.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the proposal submitted by Ms. Soong with a transom window.

1115-1145 Market Street, Reading Terminal Headhouse

Redevelopment Authority, Owner
Douglas Cohen, Architect/Applicant
DATE: 1891-1893
PROPOSAL: Facade alterations, signage

Mr. Cohen submitted a formal proposal for the alterations to the Reading Terminal Headhouse for the Hard Rock Cafe. The suggestions made by the Committee in November appear in the new design. However, the Committee asked that the doors along 12th Street be symmetrically placed within the bays. Mr. Cohen explained that narrow sidelights flanking the two doors to the merchandise area did not allow displays. He asked that the two doors be set to the side of the bays to allow two display cases. The Committee voted to accept the change on the condition that the doors and display cases are on the same plane as all of the doors on the 12th Street facade.

A second change concerns the guitar. The previous

submission included a guitar resting in the niche of the building. The new proposal has the guitar, with fiber-optic-lighted strings, sitting on the edge of the entrance canopy and rotating. William Burke of the Art Commission explained that the Art Commission wanted the sign to sit out at the edge of the canopy so that it was visible from 12th Street as well as Market Street, eliminating the need for additional signage. Some Committee members did not believe that the look of a lighted rotating guitar was appropriate. Mr. Cohen stated that the guitar would rotate very slowly, about one rotation in 30 minutes. Mr. Cohen noted that the guitar will need support at the top and an arm bracket will be attached to the building with a pin to allow rotation. The Committee specified that the bracket be installed in the mortar joints of the brick and asked that he submit a bracket detail to the staff.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of all changes except the rotation of the guitar. The Committee's vote was evenly split, three to three, to allow a rotating guitar.

1529 Spruce Street

Herman Hoffman, Owner

Craig Hoffman, Applicant for signage

Jeff Harris, Tenant/Applicant for mural

DATE: c. 1860

PROPOSAL: Signage, mural

Mr. Baron explained that the building for many years has had a projecting sign band under the first floor windows. The sign band was deteriorated so Craig Hoffman rebuilt it, without a permit. A violation was issued and Mr. Hoffman is presenting the proposal to legalize the work. Separately, the tenant, Jeff Harris, wishes to paint a mural on the building, above and below the sign band. The mural would be a cyclist and real bicycle wheels would be attached over the basement windows like window grates. The brick is already painted but the watertable is not. The Committee voted to recommend approval of the sign band since one has existed in the space for years; however, it voted to recommend denial of the mural. The Committee suggested to Mr. Harris to treat the cyclist as a sign, paint it on a board and attach it to the bottom of the sign band, between the basement windows. Staff will review the sign details for approval. Mr. Burke of the Art Commission noted that since the projection of the sign band is only four inches, the Art Commission will not review the sign.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the sign band and denial of the mural. Mr. Harris may submit a proposal for a sign to hang from the bottom of the sign band to the staff for review.

124 South 18th Street AKA 1801-1803 Sansom Street

Leroy Kean, Owner/Applicant

DATE: 1898

PROPOSAL: Legalize boarded-up shopfront on Sansom Street facade

Mr. Baron explained that a burglar broke into the store by breaking through the window on the Sansom Street facade. The owner of the store, without a permit, boarded up the shopfront with plywood. The Committee discussed options for treatment of the storefront and decided that the plywood should be removed and the glass replaced. If the owner wants added security, interior bars could be installed.

The Committee voted to recommend denial. The Committee recommends approval of interior bars if the owner of the store wants additional security.

2127-2129 Lombard Street, New Central Baptist Church

Thomas Anderson, Contractor/Applicant

DATE: c. 1923

PROPOSAL: Repointing

Thomas Anderson, contractor, described the proposal for spot pointing on all four facades of the church. The Committee noted that the facades have various joints and mortar colors. Mr. Anderson stated that he will color the mortar for specific areas.

The Committee voted to recommend approval with staff to approve pointing samples.

343 South 4th Street

Carol Shloss, Owner

James McGinn, Contractor/Applicant

DATE: c. 1820

PROPOSAL: New asphalt/fiberglass roof

Mr. Baron explained that the roof presently has a black asphalt/fiberglass roof and the contractor wants to install a new grey asphalt/fiberglass shingle roof. The cheeks of the dormer have wood clapboarding which will not be changed.

The Committee voted to recommend approval.

135 South 17th Street AKA 1631-1635 Walnut Street, Latham Hotel

Ocean Properties Corporation, Owner

Terry Graboyes, Contractor/Applicant

DATE: c. 1915

PROPOSAL: New aluminum windows

Terry Graboyes explained that the previous owners of the hotel replaced the original wood sash with aluminum sash in the 1970s. These windows did not have appropriate meeting rails or

details. The proposed sash are also aluminum, but the articulated paning and meeting rails will match the original wood windows. The windows will also have an invisible sound insulator to cut the outside noise.

The Committee voted to recommend approval.

2041 Spruce Street

Florence Hanker, Owner

Louise Baumholtz, Applicant

DATE: c. 1875-1880

PROPOSAL: Replace window grate, alter basement entrance

Ms. Baumholtz explained that during the brownstone repair the basement grate was removed. The owner wishes to make and install a new grate. Pictures show that the grate matched the window grates on 2039 and 2043 Spruce Street. She also explained that a previous owner cut one of the basement windows into a door and installed a wood bulkhead. The proposal includes removing the deteriorated bulkhead and installing wrought iron railing, that matches the railing to the front steps, around the steps to the basement with a swinging gate. The Committee instead suggested installing metal doors that would lie flat and a wrought iron gate that would mimic the grate on the basement window. This plan would restore the look of the facade while still allowing access to the basement. Ms. Baumholtz welcomed the suggestion, noting that it would be cheaper.

The Committee voted to recommend approve the reinstallation of the basement window grate and the installation of flat metal doors to the basement access with a swinging "window" grate above.

2039 Pine Street

Thomas Callan, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1860

PROPOSAL: Cleaning, repointing

The proposal includes cutting away existing mortar and repointing the butter joints which are extremely thin. The Committee was concerned that the joints might be damaged when removing the old mortar. The Committee asked the staff to check a sample of the mortar removal and if the process does not damage any bricks, the Committee recommends approval.

The Committee voted to recommend approval only if staff approves the mortar removal.

Respectfully submitted,

Laura M. Spina

Laura M. Spina

Historic Preservation Specialist