

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

12 November 1987

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect, Independence
National Historic Park
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation
Program
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.

Steve Ludwig, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Merrie Winston, Historical Architect
Randy Baron, Preservation Planner
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Steno I

Also: Dan Reyes and David A. Schultz of Schultz Eagan Associates
and George Chou, owner, to resubmit a proposal for
renovations to the building at 158 N. 3rd Street
John Phillips and Kerry Kowalchuk of Treby Howard Phillips
Architects and Tim McCarthy, Jr. of East Penn
Investments to present a proposal for the substantial
rehabilitation of the properties at 913 and 917 Pine
Streets
Matthew Molitch, owner, to present a proposal for the
installation of iron gates along the 6th Street
elevation of the property known as 540 Spruce Street
Lanny Louis Leibowitz, architect, to present a proposal
for the installation of new wood and glass storefronts,
with interior mounted security gates at 248 Market
Street, the SE corner of 3rd & Market Streets
Sandy Ward, RCL, Inc and Kathy Kolbry, owner, to present a
proposal for the demolition of an existing two-story
rear addition at 438 Spruce Street and the construction
of a new two-story addition and rear deck
Hugh Boyd of Dorf Associates to present a proposal for
extensive changes to the plaza of the Bourse Building
located at 21 S. 5th Street.
Herbert Bass, attorney for John Taxin regarding the
proposed demolition of 149 S. Hancock Street
Edward McGoohan, Department of Public Property
MaryLou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation
Coalition of Greater Philadelphia
Roger T. Prichard, Old City Civic Association
Becky Stoloff, Society Hill Civic Association
And others.

ALTERATIONS

158 N. 3rd Street, Dan Reyes and David A. Schultz of Schultz Eagan Architects and George Chou, owner. This project was reviewed initially at the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 9 October 1987. At that time the Committee recommended the following changes to the architects' proposal:

1. the boxed planters on the roof deck should be set back on the roof so that they are not visible from the street;
2. new windows to duplicate the small light industrial sash should be installed; and,
3. the brick directly below windows should not be removed or covered with wood panels.

Drawings were presented that addressed each of these three items:

1. the boxed planters have been set back on the roof below the parapet so as not to be visible from the Street;
2. new steel casement windows manufactured by "Hope's" or their equal are proposed for installation at the second, third and fourth floors; and,
3. the proposed wood panels below the upper floor windows have been eliminated. All existing brickwork to be cleaned and repaired as required.

The Committee unanimously recommends an approval for this project.

913 and 917 Pine Street, Tim McCarthy, Jr., East Penn Investments, John Phillips and Kerry Kowalchuk of Treby Howard Phillips Architects. Mr. Phillips presented drawings and photographs for the substantial rehabilitation of the buildings located at 913 and 917 Pine Street. Mr. Phillips stated that this is a tax act project, but that, neither the Part I or the Part II applications have been submitted to the state and federal preservation offices for review and comment.

The applicants stated that their intention is to install six-over-six light window sash at 913 Pine Street. The windows at 917 will contain one-over-one light sash. The Committee approved the six-over-six light window sash at 913 Pine. If only a select few windows are to be replaced at 917 Pine, they may remain as one-over-one light sash. If, however, all the windows must be replaced they should also contain six-over-six light sash.

Ms. Winston noted that a correction should be made to the drawings to show a standing seam metal roof at 913 and 917 and not a shingle roof.

The Committee unaimously recommended an approval of this project. The Committee advised the applicants that if any changes are

necessary to meet state and federal guidelines, revised drawings must be presented to the Committee for another review.

- 540 Spruce Street, Matthew Molitch, owner. Mr. Molitch appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal which calls for the installation of iron gates, painted black, along the 6th Street elevation of the property known as 540 Spruce Street.

The proposed gates will be attached to an existing brick masonry opening and will operate manually.

The Committee asked if the gates will open out and into the Street. Mr. Molitch responded that the gates will not extend to the street when fully open. There will be sufficient clearance for pedestrians to pass. The Committee also noted that the gates will be able to swing back completely against the brick wall.

The Committee unanimously voted to recommend an approval for this project.

- 248 Market Street, Lanny Louis Leibowitz, architect. Mr. Leibowitz appeared before the Architectural Committee to present plans for the removal of the existing ground floor infill along Market and South 3rd Streets and all fire escape doors. Mr. Leibowitz presented drawings and photographs for this proposal.

The Committee questioned the staff concerning the removal of dormers within the mansard roof structure. Patricia Siemiontkowski stated that approval for removal of the dormer windows was granted in 1977. The Commission subsequently received and reviewed plans for major rehabilitation work for the building in 1978. These plans called for the restoration of the mansard and the replacement of all the dormers previously removed. These plans, however, were never fully executed. Although all window sash on the first, second and third floors were replaced, the proposed reconstruction of the dormer windows on the fourth floors was never undertaken.

The Committee suggested that the staff prepare, for each new application submitted for Committee review, a history of submissions and alterations previously approved by the Commission.

Mr. Leibowitz stated his intention to replace the fire escape doors with new wood one-over-one double hung windows.

The Committee requested detailed shop drawings for the proposed windows and color samples for the storefront. Penelope Batcheler will visit the site to determine whether the entrance at the corner should contain a single leaf door or double doors.

- 438 Spruce Street, Kathy Kolbry, owner and Sandy Ward from RCL, Inc. to present a proposal for the demolition of an existing two-story rear addition and the construction of a new two-story addition and deck at the rear of the subject premises. Ms. Ward presented photographs of the property.

Ms. Ward stated that the color of the new addition will be "Pencrete Champagne." Ms. Ward also stated that she does not plan to remove the party wall, however, if during the work it is discovered that the wall is weak a new party wall will then be constructed.

Penelope Batcheler requested that the plans be amended to show the footprint of the existing rear addition.

The Committee unanimously recommended an approval of this project.

- 21 S. 5th Street, The Philadelphia Bourse, Hugh Boyd, architect of Dorf Associates. Mr. Boyd presented to the Committee his firm's proposal for substantial alterations to the plaza of the Bourse facing 5th Street. The proposed work consists of repaving and the addition of new lighting, a fountain, a kiosk, a statute and flagpoles. Also included in the submission is a proposed reglazing of the first, second and third floor windows, the installation of new fixed-awnings and signage and, the erection of flagpoles at the sidewalk and flags at the second and fourth floor levels of the 5th Street facade. The color of the awnings will be dark green. The construction of a new glass wall behind the entrance columns creating an interior vestibule is also proposed. Mr. Boyd presented diagrams for the Committee's review.

With regard to signage, Mr. Boyd informed the Committee members that tenants will be able to place their logos on the canopies and to use silk-screened or red neon signage in their windows. Mr. Boyd continued that the signage for the main entrance of the Bourse Building will consist of three dimensional letters hung within the space between the columns and the main entrance doors. These letters will be face lit.

Mr. Boyd stated that steel "I" beams are proposed for placement within the vestibule. These will be hung below the ceiling at the entrance to the Bourse. The proposal entails four attachments to the building from which banners will be hung at the second and fourth floors.

The Committee expressed concern over the several items proposed for installation on the plaza. It was the opinion of several members that the proposed treatment presented a cluttered look and detracted from the building's historic appearance.

The Committee reviewed the submission and suggested the following changes:

1. remove the flags at the fourth floor level of the building;
2. remove the steel "I" beams from the entrance vestibule;
3. light the vestibule to reduce visibility of the glass wall, and;
4. restudy the lighting design proposed for the plaza of the Bourse.

The Committee asked that these changes be made and that revised drawings be submitted.

- 149 S. Hancock Street, Herbert Bass, attorney for Albert Taxin, owner of 149 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Bass and Mr. Prichard discussed at length the information and economic data prepared by Growth Properties, Newbold's/ American Capital Group, Redevelopment Authority, and The Old City Civic Association.

Subsequent to this discussion and after examining the above mentioned materials, the Architectural Committee agreed that its members were not competent to adequately evaluate the financial data contained in the various reports and papers submitted. For this reason, no recommendation was made.

The Committee recommended strongly that the Commission consider the formation of a Committee with the expertise to review financial data submitted in conformance with Section 7(f) of the preservation ordinance.

1801 Vine Street, Family Court Building. On 26 August 1987 the Philadelphia Historical Commission reviewed the proposal to install aluminum replacement windows at the subject premises. The Commission requested that a feasibility study analyzing the cost of retrofitting of wooden windows in comparison to installing aluminum windows be submitted by the applicant to the Architectural Review Committee for review. This material was received and distributed to the Committee members for review.

Subsequent to the 12 November meeting, the Committee concurred that a recommendation be deferred until the Committee can schedule a site-visit to the Family Court Building to examine the condition of the existing windows.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Steno I

/mah