

Aug 84
203
No AUG MTG

MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

18 July 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute
of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National Historical
Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Janet Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
William Thompson, Member of the Commission
Bill Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian

Also: James Kise and Peter Garver, Architects, to present plans for the construction
of a new townhouse at 712-714 South Front Street.
Norman Byar, Architect, Clyde Henry and Alice Finny to present plans for the
removal of a one-story building and the erection of a new two-story
brick addition to the Zoar Church at 1204 Melon Street.
Harlan Crider and Kenneth Bergfeld, Architects, to present plans for the
rehabilitaion of 312-314 Race Street.
Neil Schlosser, Architect, to present plans for renovations to 3420-3422
Sansom Street.
David Hollenberg and Terry Garfield of John Milner Associates and Robert
Boucek and Jim Heminowitz of Cope-Linder Associates to present plans
for Phase II of the rehabilitation of the Reading Terminal Headhouse.
Ivan Blitz, Architect to present plans for the rehabilitation of 222-226
Race Street and 223-227 Arch Street.
Lewis Shubin, Bill Nort and Joe Didinger to present plans for the
construction of a new newstand kiosk within the 30th Street Station
main concourse.
Dale Frens of John Milner Associates to present plans for the proposed
relocation of gates from the Philadelphia General Hospital site to
the North Portal of City Hall.
Fred Slifer, Architect, to present plans for the construction of a roof
deck on the St. Joseph's rectory building.
Ed Richards of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority .
Morris Ostroff to present plans, prepared by Hans Egli, for renovations
of the th floor toilet rooms at the Free Library, Main Branch.
Nick DiPiero of the Philadelphia Housing Authority and J.R. South of the
Philadelphia Housing and Development Corporation to discuss with the
Committee corrections to be made at 1830 Girard Avenue as the result
of illegal work.
Jeffrey Hanover of Agoos/Lovera Architects to present plans for the
rehabilitation of 17-23 Bank Street, Lippincott Court.
Robert Manhurst, Owner, to present a sketch for alterations to his
roof at 624 S. American Street.

Phil Furnes of Gray Smith Architects to present plans for the reconstruction of the front facade of 2906 Diamond Street.

Lorna Katz, Architect and Mr. and Mrs. Warren Rohrer, Owners to present plans for alterations to the Violet Oakley House at 627 St. George's Road.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

2403-2405 Waverly Street (rear of the Horn Residence, 2410 Pine Street), James Kruhly, Architect. Members of the Architectural Committee examined a model and reviewed plans for renovations to 2403-2405 Waverly Street. These renovations included the construction of a third floor gambrel roof addition, fenestration changes on the Waverly Street elevation and various alterations to the interior court area. Constructed c. 1930, the building, 2410 Pine Street through to 2403-2405 Waverly Street, served as the home of Joseph Horn, Developer of the Horn and Hardart restaurant chain.

The Committee found the proposed renovations to the Waverly Street section of the Horn residence to be in keeping with the historic character and integrity of the building and voted to recommend an approval, in concept, of the proposed renovations. Some question was raised concerning the existence of a wall along Waverly Street. The Committee members requested that the architect be asked to provide additional data regarding the wall's removal, retention or reconstruction.

Donat Building, 5443-5445 Germantown Avenue, David Karp, Architect. The Committee reviewed the plans, prepared by Mr. Karp, for the rehabilitation of the Donat Building, a pair of nineteenth century houses with twentieth century commercial, ground floor alterations. The members found the proposed renovations to be acceptable and voted to recommend their approval subject to the submission and approval of shutter details. Mrs. Batcheler recommended strongly that the architect have the wood shutters treated with a preservative before painting them to avoid serious deterioration and maintenance problems in the future.

Ft. Mifflin, Storehouse, John Dickey, Architect. The Committee reviewed Mr. Dickey's plans for extensive repairs to the storehouse at Fort Mifflin and voted to recommend their approval. Mr. Dickey abstained.

712 South Front Street, James Kise and Peter Garver, Architects. Mr. Kise presented to the Committee for review plans for the construction of a new, three-and-a-half story townhouse at 712-714 South Front Street. At its meeting of 7 June 1984, the Historical Commission agreed to allow the demolition of the certified building presently standing at 712 South Front Street provided the design of the replacement building complemented the scale, rhythm and character of the South Front Street streetscape. The present house, a small, much altered eighteenth century building, stands two-and-a-half stories tall and adjacent to a 10' wide vacant lot at 714.

The plans, as presented, call for the erection of a three-bay, three-and-a-half story brick townhouse which will occupy the lot at the northwest corner of Front and Kenilworth Streets. The architect elaborated on the design of the new house explaining that sills and lintels will align with those of the existing historic buildings and that the roofline will complement that of the adjoining building at 710. A glazed studio terrace will crown the structure and provide the owner with an exceptional view of the river. Construction materials will blend in scale, color and texture with the historic fabric of the neighborhood.

It was the opinion of the Architectural Committee that the proposed design for the new townhouse enhanced the block and added to the variety of the total streetscape. A final approval of the proposed demolition of the existing building at 712 South Front Street and the construction of the replacement structure is recommended.

Zoar Church, 1204 Melon Street, Norman Byar, Architect, Clyde Henry and Alice Finny of Zoar Church. Mr. Byar presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the removal of a small one-story brick structure at the rear of Zoar Church and the construction of a larger two-story, brick addition to house offices and conference space. Built c. 1883, the Zoar Church possesses a rusticated stone facade on Melon Street pierced with arched openings and topped by a bracketed ornamental cornice. The side and rear of the building have suffered from unsympathetic alterations.

Following some discussion of the proposed addition and alterations to the church, the Committee voted to recommend the approval of the project as submitted.

The King's Inn, 312-314 Race Street, Harlan Crider and Kenneth Bergfeld, Architects. Messrs. Crider and Bergfeld presented to the Committee members their plans for the rehabilitation and conversion of 312-314 Race Street into a 30-room bed and breakfast inn with a restaurant on the ground floor.

The plans, as drawn, call for the rehabilitation of the facade to conform with information contained in an 1878 insurance survey and recorded in a 1937 photograph on file in the Commission office. The Committee found the proposed undertaking to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval. The members suggested that the existing fire escape on the front of the building be retained and restored and used as a second means of egress from the building if allowed by the Fire Department.

3420-3422 Sansom Street, Neil Schlosser, Architect. Mr. Schlosser presented for review plans for the rehabilitation of 3420-3422 Sansom Street including the construction of a new addition to the rear of the buildings. Mr. Schlosser pointed out that his proposed renovations to the buildings conform with the Sansom Row design criteria established by the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. The Sansom Street houses stand as part of a row built between 1869 and 1871.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee voted to recommend its approval. They asked that the architect submit for file a detail of the proposed areaway treatment on the Sansom Street elevation. Subsequent to the meeting, this detail was received.

Reading Terminal Headhouse, 12th and Market Streets, David Hollenberg and Terry Garfield of John Milner Associates and Robert Boucek and Jim Heminowitz of Cope-Linder Associates. Mr. Hollenberg presented to the Committee plans for Phase II of the rehabilitation of the Reading Terminal Headhouse. Construction during this phase will be limited to the public entrance areas directly related to the new commuter rail station at Market and 12th Streets. UMPA has allocated the money necessary to fund this phase of the rehabilitation.

According to Hollenberg, the Reading Company intends to reconstruct as much as possible the original elements of the building while accommodating the needs of a new program. These alterations will include the reconstruction of a granite, brick and cast stone arcade similar to the original, the installation of a new glass and metal canopy over the center two entrance bays along Market Street and the restoration or recreation of significant interior spaces and fabric as part of the public entrance.

The Committee members examined the plans and discussed the project in detail. While they agreed, in concept, to the construction of an entrance canopy along Market Street, they recommended strongly that it extend across all six entrance bays on Market Street instead of only two. A canopy originally designed for the building by the Hewitts extended across the six bays and out to the sidewalk. This feature of the building was never constructed as designed. A shed-type structure was added after the turn-of-the-century instead. It was the opinion of the Committee that a six bay canopy would be more in keeping with the scale and monumentality of the structure. They further agreed to accept no canopy at all on the facade if that were an option.

In all other respects, the Committee found the proposed Phase II undertaking to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval subject to the enlargement of the canopy to cover the full six bays.

222-226 Race Street, Beeman Building, The Blitz Group, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Mr. Blitz presented to the Committee his plans for the conversion of 222-226 Race Street into 33 apartment units and two commercial spaces. Built as a commercial loft structure in 1885, the brick Beeman Building stands four stories tall at the southeast corner of Race and Bread Streets.

The Committee members found the proposed treatment of the front and rear elevations to be acceptable but offered several recommendations regarding the rehabilitation of the Bread Street facade. The members suggested that the architect either restore the altered openings on Bread Street to their original form or retain the enlarged openings as they exist. These could then be filled with glazing in keeping with the character of the Bread Street facade. The Committee also asked that the architect restudy the treatment of the Bread Street fire exit door and transom. Raising the

transom bar to the height of the center rail of the windows on the ground floor and filling the transom area with small light sash would be a more acceptable treatment of the opening than the one proposed. The proposed treatment of these door and window openings requires further investigation and study leading to a revision of the plans. The Committee asked also for the inclusion of a note on the Bread Street elevation drawing stating that all double hung window sash will contain nine over nine lights of glass.

The architect was directed to revise his drawings and resubmit for another review.

223-227 Arch Street, The Blitz Group, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Mr. Blitz presented to the Committee his plans for proposed renovations to the five-story, turn-of-the-century, brick building at 223-227 Arch Street.

The members reviewed the drawings and asked for several changes. The first and fourth floor window sash should be corrected to conform to that shown in the 1976 photograph on file in the Commission office. The Committee further asked that a door transom, similar to the upper portion of the ground floor window transoms, fill the area above the entrance doors. The members requested the retention of the existing historic light fixtures at the entrance and the wall-mounted railings. The later, non-historic railings mounted on the entrance steps should be removed. Any new railings should match the design and character of the original wall hand rails. On the Bread Street elevation, the Committee suggested two ways of treating the over-sized openings. They recommended dropping the sills of the windows, keeping a recess and infilling with either brick or smooth stucco as an indication of the original placement and size of the openings. Taller lights of glass in a six over six pattern could be used to fill a portion of the opening. It was agreed that the Bread Street elevation required further study.

The Committee recommended that the architect revise his drawings and resubmit for another review.

Elson's Newstand, 30th Street Station, Martin Associates Architects. Lewis Shubin, Bill Nort and Joseph Didinger presented to the Committee for review plans for the construction of a new newsstand kiosk within the 30th Street Station main concourse. The Committee found the proposed design of the kiosk to be in keeping with the character of the historic building and voted to recommend its approval.

City Hall Gates, North Portal, John Milner Associates. Dale Frens of John Milner Associates presented to the Committee for review plans for the proposed relocation of gates from the Philadelphia General Hospital site to the North Portal of City Hall. The two pair of gates, modified to fit the existing portal openings, will secure the North Portal during the evening hours. These gates will serve to protect the North Portal area, restored as part of the City tercentenary celebration in 1981, from vandalism.

Following some discussion of the appropriateness of the design, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of the relocation and installation. The more ornate of the two gates is to be installed on the Broad Street end of the portal; the simpler gates on the courtyard. The Committee members recommended strongly that these gates not be used as models for the construction of new gates in the other three portals if such a project were ever contemplated. They further suggested that a plaque, providing information concerning the gates and their placement in the North Portal area, be erected on the site.

321 Willing's Alley, St. Joseph's Rectory, Fred Slifer, Architect. Mr. Slifer of Cope Lippincott Slifer, Architects, presented to the Committee for consideration plans for the construction of a roof deck on the St. Joseph's rectory building. This deck, according to the architect, will not be visible from the street nor from the interior court.

The Committee voted to recommend an approval of this submission.

Free Library, Main Branch, 4th floor restrooms, Hans Egli, Architect. Morris Ostroff appeared before the members of the Architectural Committee to present Mr. Egli's plans for renovations to the 4th floor restrooms at the Free Library on Logan Circle.

The work, as outlined, calls for the removal of a double hung window, located behind an existing parapet, and its replacement with glass block. Interior renovations are also planned. Discussion centered on reglazing the existing double hung sash with translucent glass instead of filling the opening with block. Either treatment would be acceptable. A final approval of this project, as submitted, is recommended.

The Committee then advised Mr. Ostroff that the window sash at the second floor of the library above the front entrance needed reglazing. Many panes have been broken and are in need of replacement.

1830 W. Girard Avenue, Michael DiPiero of the Philadelphia Housing Authority and J. R. Soluth of the Philadelphia Housing and Development Corporation. Messrs. DiPiero and Soluth appeared before the members of the Committee to discuss the illegal work performed by the Housing Authority at 1830 W. Girard Avenue and how to correct it. These alterations included the replacement of original casement and double hung window sash with new aluminum double hung or slider sash.

Following some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend that the Housing Authority be required to remove all aluminum windows and trim and reconstruct the historic fabric. The Committee asked for the replacement of double hung wood windows with a smaller top sash, as originally designed, on the upper two floors and of casement windows at the ground floor and basement story. Replacement of the iron grilles at the basement level will not be required.

17-23 Bank Street, Lippincott Court, Agoos/Lovera, Architects. Jeffrey Hanover of Agoos/Lovera presented to the Committee members for consideration his firm's plans for the rehabilitation of the buildings at 17-23 Bank Street, a series of nineteenth century commercial buildings in the Old City area.

The Committee reviewed the drawings and found the proposed alterations to be acceptable and agreed to recommend their approval subject to one minor revision in the design. The members asked that the architect re-design the entrance doors within the wider two of the three entrance openings to contain operable double doors. The one more narrow entrance may contain a single leaf door provided it is designed to give the appearance of a double door. This can be achieved by running an applied moulding down the center of the door.

Subsequent to the Committee meeting, a revised elevation drawing was submitted and a final approval of this project is recommended.

627 St. George's Road, Lorna Katz, Architect, and Mr. and Mrs. Warren Rohrer, Owners. Ms. Katz presented to the members of the Committee her proposal for the enlargement of windows on the west and east walls of the building at 627 St. George's Road, the home of artist Violet Oakley, and for the glazing of a door opening with a single sheet of glass also on the east elevation.

The Committee, after some consideration, voted to recommend an approval of the proposed changes. Mrs. Batcheler asked the architect to prepare for the Commission's files an overlay of all changes which have occurred to the building over the years. The architect agreed readily to supply the Commission with this additional information.

624 S. American Street, Robert Manhurst, Owner. Mr. Manhurst presented to the members of the Committee a sketch of his proposal to correct inappropriate changes made to the cornice line and gutter of his house at 624 S. American Street, a two-and-a-half story nineteenth century house.

The Committee examined the drawing and voted to recommend an approval of the proposed changes. Mr. Bartley agreed to inspect the cornice, roof and gutter upon completion of the work. If done correctly, the house will then be eligible for receipt of a Certified Restored plaque.

2906 Diamond Street, Gray Smith Architects. Phil Furnes of Gray Smith Architects presented for review plans for the reconstruction of the front facade of 2906 Diamond Street. The original front was removed, without the contractor having applied for and obtained a building permit, and a new inappropriate front erected as part of the City's housing rehabilitation program. Built c. 1865, 2906 Diamond Street stands adjacent to the Henry O. Tanner House, a National Historic Landmark.

The Committee examined the architect's plans for the reconstruction work and voted to recommend an approval subject to a correction of the elevation drawing. The architect was asked to verify the size of the third floor window openings and correct his drawing to conform with his findings. They suggested also the use of a four panel entrance door.

Subsequent to the Committee meeting, a revised elevation drawing was received and a final approval is recommended.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian