

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

**Robert Thomas, Chair
Commission Offices, One Parkway, 13th Floor, 1515 Arch Street
28 March 2000**

Present

Robert Thomas, AIA, Chair
Penelope Batcheler
Herbert W. Levy, FAIA
Daniel McCoubrey, AIA
Suzanne Pentz

Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Diane M. Hughes, Executive Secretary
Laura M. Spina, Historic Preservation Planner
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Also

Daniel Bontempo, Granary Associates
John J. Lee, Girard College
Dave Lamontagne, Granary Associates
Nan R. Gutterman, Vitetta Group
Richard Koelle, Vitetta Group
Kelly A. Lemon, Vitetta Group
Jirair Youssepian, Vitetta Group
Bob Powers, Powers & Company
Paul Lefkoe, Keystone
Jennifer Parker, Voith & Mactavish Architects
Frederick LaValley, Owner 315 South 12th Street
William Becker, Loews Philadelphia Hotel
Jim McClain, Tri-State Fire Protection
George Guzzie, VLBJR Architects
Charles Evers, Atkin, Olshin, Lawson-Bell Architects
Cynthia Tedeschi, Obermayer, Rebmann et. al.
Reginald DeCarlo, Owner 2106 Shunk Street
Mary DeNadai, John Miller Architects
Tim Sheen
Peter Johnson
Judith Eden, Center City Residents Association
Ed Franz

Herbert Levy, Acting-chair called the meeting to order at 1:35 p.m.

1900-98 Ridge Avenue, aka 3101 South College Avenue, Girard College

Girard College, Owner

Robert O'Connor, Applicant

DATE: 1833-1847

PROPOSAL: Widen gate

The proposal involves widening a gate in the stone wall surrounding Girard College.

The options for the gate as originally proposed were

1. A gate on the west side which the neighbors opposed,
2. A gate on the north side.

Stephen Girard's will, however, prescribed but two openings, one on the south with an iron gate and one on the north with a wooden gate. This precludes a western entrance or a second entrance on the north side.

Nan Gutterman, Richard Koelle, John J. Lee, David Lamontagne, Jirair Youssepian, and Kelly Lemon submitted a revised plan for this proposal.

The new submission includes,

1. During the construction of a new elementary school complex, widen the existing north gate to 32 feet and clean cut the pier;
2. Demolish gatehouse of c. 1920;
3. Erect a temporary chain link gate for a period not to exceed 24 months, and
4. New wood gate with design to come to The Historical Commission for approval.

This proposal does not meet the *Secretary of Interior Standards*.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of stone removal and of the chain- link gate for a period not to exceed 24 months, and to approve in concept the wooden gate.

3700 Spruce Street, University of Pennsylvania

University of Pennsylvania, Owner

Richard Russell, Applicant

DATE: c. 1895

PROPOSAL: Landscape, trash disposal and doorways

This proposal calls for renovations to the Quadrangle and involves three types of work: landscaping and raising of the grade for drainage, three trash disposal areas, and the installation of new courtyard doors based on historic designs. The University is in the processing of restructuring its dormitory system. The Quadrangle will have three college houses, each with its own door and new doors to the courtyard. There are 30 different types of historic doors. To identify the three houses, only four designs of the historic doors will be used. Three original doors remain and these doors will be restored. Three large areaways will be created for trash handling nodes. In addition, some areaways will be changed and some removed to accommodate mechanical louvers of anodized bronze. The balustrade will be restored on the monumental stairs with a black metal safety rail.

The new paving will help alleviate drainage problems. Its design will be similar to the existing one and will include bluestone thresholds at entrances with raised granite curbs. The various college houses will have the following:

1. College house A will have a bluestone court with a small step-down amphitheater. The large elm tree will be retained;

2. College house B will have crisscrossed paths for circulation and an oval ellipse in lower B;
3. College house C will have paths with flush lawns.

The Committee voted to recommend approval with staff to review details.

12 South 12th Street, Loews Hotel at PSFS

Loews Hotel, Owner
Robert Powers, Applicant
DATE: 1930-32
PROPOSAL: Signage

This proposal involves signage for the restaurant, garage and hotel entrances along both 12th and Market Streets. Some of the individual metal letters have exposed red or white neon lighting. Some items in this proposal have been approved, with others approved in concept only. Robert Powers, William Becker and Ed Franz gave a presentation which included the following items:

1. Replace glass in existing backlit sign box next to the Market street entrance;
2. Open channel letters and white neon on the previously approved canopy;
3. New restaurant signage with stainless steel letters with red halo neon illumination;
4. 12 South 12th Street sign to remain;
5. 12th Street plaque with black granite surface to remain;
6. A new interpretive plaque at the 12th Street entrance;
7. Alteration of wrap-around sign from Philadelphia Saving Fund Society to Loews Philadelphia Hotel and holes to be patched, and
8. Parking sign with stainless steel letters.

The Committee voted to recommend approval.

44 West Coulter Street, Germantown Friends School

Germantown Friends School, Owner
Nicholas Dubrowolski, Applicant
DATE: c. 1870
PROPOSAL: Rehabilitation/demolition rear bay

This proposal involves renovations to this house which will become faculty housing. The applicant proposes to remove a late 19th century bay addition at the rear of the house and replace it with windows and stonework. The building's previous owner had the rear addition supporting the bay removed without a permit and the bay now rests on temporary wood supports. The public has some view of the bay across a field from streets half a block away. The cost issue is the primary reason for removing the bay.

Jennifer Parker, architect for the project explained the proposal:

1. Remove rear second floor bay whose structural integrity had been seriously compromised by the demolition of the first floor bay;
2. Replace bay with three windows to eliminate as much patching as possible;
3. Restore slate mansard, and
4. Restore dormer and cornice.

The Committee voted to recommend approval with staff to review details.

1512 Spruce Street, The Drake

Forest City Residential, Owner

George Guzzie, Applicant

DATE: 1928

PROPOSAL: Renovate marquee

This proposal involves modifying an existing marquee at the front entrance by removing a cloth skirt and installing metal letters to the sides.

Mr. Guzzie discussed his proposal, which included:

1. Stainless steel letters on the marquee;
2. Removal of the canvas;
3. Letters mounted to thin grid on top of marquee;
4. Metal ceiling with down lights, and
5. Re-roofing.

The Committee suggested mounting the letters directly to the canopy instead of the thin grid. The applicant agreed to this.

The Committee voted to recommend approval with letters mounted directly on the canopy.

264 South Van Pelt Street

Caroline Macmoran, Owner

Charles Capoldi, Architect

DATE: 1880

PROPOSAL: 4th story addition with roof deck

This proposal involves adding a fourth floor addition and deck set back from the front. The addition will have visibility because the building already rises higher than the adjoining properties. Mr. Capoldi, architect for the project, noted that this building has been substantially modified. The Committee noted that the issue of decks is very controversial, and does not want to set a precedent by approving a deck at the front of a building. Judith Eden spoke on behalf of the Center City Residents Association to express its approval of the addition and opposition to the roof deck. The Committee discussed this submission at length and determined that the addition should have a setback of ten feet from the façade. The addition will have brick colored stucco walls and railings at its windows.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of addition and denial of deck as submitted.

505 Addison Court

Christopher Carey, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c.1965

PROPOSAL: Rooftop addition

This proposal revisits the roof top addition discussed in greater detail last month. Mr. Carey has now followed the Committee's advice to not exceed the height of the side parapet walls. Mr. Carey presented his revised proposal with a slanted roof enclosure, following the lines of the side wall as recommended by Committee and Commission.

The Committee voted to recommend approval.

2345 St Albans Place

Raymond Johnson, Owner/Applicant

DATE: 1868

PROPOSAL: Legalize renovations: windows, door, cornice and mansard

This proposal involves the contractor, Francis Kilson, who applied to the Historical Commission for a building permit on June 15, 1998 to renovate this row house. The permit allowed for no work on the exterior, Mr. Kilson promised to return to seek approval for the exterior based on the Committee's comments as acceptable alterations. Mr. Kilson did not return for a second permit and installed new aluminum windows, a new door and frame, a new cornice without the dentils, and a new brown asphalt shingle roof in place of the slate mansard. The Historical Commission asked for a violation for the work. Mr. Kilson sold the house to the current applicant, Raymond Johnson, who has now applied to legalize the work.

Mr. Johnson, the owner presented documentation, which showed that he purchased the house in October of 1998 in good faith. He also showed a copy of the violation issued in May 1998. Mr. Thomas stated the work does not meet *Standards*. The Committee agreed to recommend tabling this matter for a period not to exceed six months to enable Mr. Johnson to meet with staff to review his settlement documents and to devise a solution to this situation.

2106 Shunk Street

Reginald DeCarlo, Owner/Applicant

DATE: 1914

PROPOSAL: Re-roof in substitute material

The proposal involves replacement of a slate roof in bad condition with asphalt shingles. Mr. DeCarlo, the owner, explained his urgent need for replacement, owing to water penetration into his house. He said that the existing slate is beyond repair and proposed to replace it with asphalt shingles. He showed pictures of the existing condition.

After looking at these photographs, The Committee noted that the flashing and fasteners may have failed, but the slate appeared in good condition. The Committee asked the applicant to consider the possibility of repairing the slate roof reusing the existing slate which did not seem to be in poor condition. This would prove less costly for the owner and would last longer.

Jody Della Barba, president of Girard Estate Area Residents, was unable to attend the meeting, but faxed a letter asking that the roof be in compliance with the Commission's guidelines. The Committee recommended repairing the highly visible two north facing slopes with the existing slate and replacing the slate on the two secondary south facing slopes with asphalt shingles that match in color if necessary.

The Committee recommended approval of repairing the existing slate on north slopes and replacing the slate on the south slopes with asphalt shingles that match in color.

3142 Market Street, Centennial National Bank

Drexel University, Owner

John Cluver, Voith & Mactavish Architects, Applicant

DATE: 1876

PROPOSAL: Sign

Mr. Baron described this proposal, which revisits the signage for the new Paul Peck Alumni Center in the restored Centennial National Bank by Frank Furness. The new proposal calls for installing individual bronze letters in the original sign band.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the proposal as submitted with shop drawing details to be reviewed by staff.

The meeting adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Diane M. Hughes