

THE MINUTES OF THE 308th STATED MEETING

OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

25 February 1987

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

- Present: Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman
Christine Washington, Vice-Chairman
David Brownlee
Caroline Golab
David Hollenberg
Jason Nathan
William D. Thompson
David Baldinger, Deputy Director, City Planning Commission
Dudley Sykes, Commissioner, Department of Public Property
David Wismer, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses
and Inspections
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Sally Elk, Historic Research Technician
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
Carmen Weber, Archaeologist
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I
- Also: Sandy Garz, City Planning Commission
Astrid M. Caruso and Roger Prichard of the Old City
Civic Association
A. Robert Jaeger, Philadelphia Historic Preservation
Corporation
Mary Lou McFarland and Ellen Miller of the Preservation
Coalition of Greater Philadelphia
Mike Scholnick and Sherry Williamson of Growth Properties
Kent Reichert, South Street Star
Albert Taxin, President of Old Original Bookbinder's
Restaurant
And others

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 307th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 28 January 1987, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman, were reviewed and approved.

THE REPORT of the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for 15 January - 15 February 1987, Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer, was reviewed and approved for filing.

OLD BUSINESS

Boyd Theatre, 1908-1910 Chestnut Street

Mark MacQueen, legal counsel for the Commission, reported to the members that the Temporary Restraining Order granted by the Court of Common Pleas on 27 January 1987 is still in effect. For this reason, the Commission again was prevented from consideration of the proposed designation of this building. Mr. MacQueen further informed the members that the case has been removed to the United States District Court.

149 S. Hancock Street

Mr. Tyler reported that the Jackson-Cross evaluation of the Growth Properties economic feasibility study for 149 S. Hancock Street has been received. This report concurs with the findings of Growth Properties in that there is no reasonable economic reuse for the building at 149 S. Hancock Street.

Mr. Tyler advised the Commission that the Old City Civic Association had also prepared an evaluation of the Growth Properties study. Both reports were only recently received by the Historical Commission. In order to give the Commission members sufficient time to review both evaluations of the Growth Properties Study, Mr. Tyler suggested that action on this application be deferred until the next meeting of the Historical Commission. He further suggested that the Commission hear the testimony of Mr. Michael Scholnick of Growth Properties and Mr. Roger Prichard of the Old City Civic Association, both of whom were present at the meeting.

Mr. Scholnick reviewed for the Commission members the study done by his firm for Albert Taxis, owner of the building at 149 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Scholnick stated that the Growth Properties report was prepared strictly on a basis of economics, i.e. the cost of project weighed against the value of project. Mr. Scholnick admitted that he failed to consider the Rehabilitation Tax Credit in his original analysis. However, Growth Properties subsequently reworked its figures using the tax credits and concluded that the project still proved to be economically infeasible.

Mr. Prichard next addressed the Commission and summarized the report prepared by the Old City Civic Association. Mr. Prichard stated that in his opinion several criteria have not been met which are necessary for securing a demolition permit under the historic preservation ordinance. Mr. Prichard questioned the inflated purchase price paid for 149 S. Hancock Street and further noted that the property was never placed on the real estate market.

Following a lengthy discussion, the Commission requested that both Old City Civic Association and Growth Properties submit additional data to the Commission. The Commission agreed that a decision regarding the request for approval to demolish 149 S. Hancock Street would be made at the March meeting.

NEW BUSINESS

National Register Nomination
Jayne Estate Building-Delaware Avenue & Vine Street

Mr. Tyler informed the members, that as a Certified Local Government, the City has a responsibility through the Commission to comment on seventy-five percent of the nominations to the National Register of Historic Places in Philadelphia.

Mr. Tyler also stated that in the future he will attempt to secure the National Register nominations in time for the Designation Committee to review and comment on nominations prior to their presentation to the Commission.

The Commission considered the nomination and voted to recommend the approval of the Jayne Estate building for entry on the National Register of Historic Buildings.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I