

THE MINUTES OF THE 309th STATED MEETING

OF THE

25 March 1987

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

- Present: Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman
Christine Washington, Vice-Chairman
David Brownlee
Joan Ferreira
Caroline Golab
David Hollenberg
William Thompson
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning
Commission
Rebecca Northrop, Office of Housing
Dudley Sykes, Commissioner, Department of Public Property
John Street, Esq., Councilman Fifth District
David Wisner, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses
and Inspections
Mark MacQueen, Esq., Chief Assistant City Solicitor, Law
Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
Carmen Weber, Archaeologist
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Steno I
- Also: Fredrick Bader, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law
Department
J. Shane Creamer, Hugh J. Bracken and William W. Doal,
Attorneys representing the Sameric Corporation
S. Michael Scholnick of Growth Properties
William Kingsley and Roger Prichard and other represent-
atives of Old City Civic Association
Meg Sowell of Lavenoth and Horwath
Mary Lou McFarland, Gray Smith and Ellen Miller of the
Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia
Anthony DiBona of the Sameric Corporation
Donna Ann Harris, Philadelphia Historic Preservation
Corporation
Thomas Hine and Roger Cohn, reporters with The Philadelphia
Inquirer
Kent Reichert, South Street Star
Alison Towers, Owner, 815 S. Hancock Street
Albert Taxin, President of Old Original Bookbinders
Restaurant

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 308th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 25 February 1987, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman, were reviewed and approved.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee meeting held on 12 March 1987, David Hollenberg, Chairman. Mr. Hollenberg reported that the additional information requested for 702 S. Front Street has been received and an approval is now recommended for this project. Mr. Hollenberg further reported that the information requested for 411 N. 20th Street, 538-540 Spruce Street and 2301 Green Street has not been received and these three projects are still pending. Mr. Hollenberg continued that the Committee recommended approvals in concept for preliminary submissions for 218-230 Arch Street and 242 S. 17th Street. More detailed information will be reviewed by the Architectural Committee prior to a final recommendation. Mr. Hollenberg noted that although it is not stated in the minutes, a revised sketch for the proposed door for 58 S. 2nd Street was requested and has not yet been received.

Mr. Hollenberg requested that the Commission consider the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting of 12 March 1987 with the exception of the submission for 815 S. Hancock Street. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting of 12 March 1987 including the approval of 702 S. Front Street. The proposal for 815 S. Hancock Street is not included in this approval and will be considered separately.

Mr. Hollenberg next introduced the submission for 815 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Hollenberg informed the Commission that the Committee agreed in concept with the proposal for a roof dormer. Mr. Hollenberg also informed the Commission that the Committee and the staff disagree over the proposal for this project.

Ms. Siemiontkowski addressed the Commission and noted that the staff disagrees with the recommendations of the Architectural Committee. The proposed alterations to 815 S. Hancock Street are not in compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation which, as prescribed by Section 14-2007 of the Philadelphia Code, is the guide to be used in evaluating proposals for alterations or construction. Ms. Siemiontkowski suggested that other alternatives be explored.

Alison Towers, owner of 815 S. Hancock Street, addressed the Commission and agreed that there are other alternatives; however, they are alternatives she can neither afford nor desires to have in her house.

After considerable discussion, the Commission voted to allow the construction of a dormer on the Hancock Street facade. The final decision of design will be determined by the Architectural Committee

at a future review. The Commission also voted to reject the proposals for the closing of two basement windows, the construction of a new bulkhead, and the replacement of a wood box cornice with a new more elaborate cornice.

OLD BUSINESS

149 S. Hancock Street

Mr. Tyler reviewed the background of the submission for 149 S. Hancock Street, summarized in the minutes of the meeting of 24 September 1986. Mr. Tyler requested that S. Michael Scholnick of Growth Properties and Roger Prichard of the Old City Civic Association make brief presentations of their respective studies.

Mr. Scholnick reported that Growth Properties was retained by Bookbinder's Restaurant to do an economic analysis of the property at 149 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Scholnick also informed the Commission that after the last Historical Commission meeting, held on 25 February 1987, Growth Properties revised the study to include the investor analysis as requested by the Commission. Mr. Scholnick stated that both Growth Properties and the Old City Civic Association arrived at the same conclusion that the building is not economically feasible and that the rehabilitation cost is extremely high.

Mr. Taxin stated that his only intention in purchasing the property was to protect himself owing to the fact that Bookbinder's Restaurant is adjacent to 149 S. Hancock Street. He also stated that if someone were willing to purchase this property from him, he would consider selling it.

William Kingsley, President of the Old City Civic Association, stated that he and other members of the Old City Civic Association were present at today's meeting to oppose the demolition of 149 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Kingsley introduced Meg Sowell of Lavenoth and Horwath who spoke in support of rehabilitation of 149 S. Hancock Street.

After considerable discussion, by a vote of seven to three, the Commission agreed to defer a decision on the demolition request until the staff could explore the utilization of the Redevelopment Authority's rental rehabilitation program as suggested by Councilman John F. Street and Barbara J. Kaplan, Commission members. The seven Commission members in favor of the utilization of the Redevelopment Authority rehabilitation program were Barbara Kaplan, John Street, David Hollenberg, Christine Washington, Rebecca Northrop, David Brownlee, and Joan Ferreira. The three opposing votes were cast by Edward Montgomery, David Wisner and William Thompson. It was also decided that a final decision on demolition of 149 S. Hancock Street will be made at the next Commission meeting.

Boyd Theatre

Richard Tyler made a brief presentation on the Boyd Theatre.

J. Shane Creamer, counsel for Sameric Corporation addressed the Committee requesting that a continuance be granted to the Sameric Corporation owing to the fact that they had insufficient time to prepare a presentation. This request was denied by the Commission.

Mark MacQueen reviewed the documentation on the numerous requests for continuances that were all granted within the last year. Copies of this documentation are attached to the official copy of these minutes.

Mr. Creamer requested that the Commission give a partial continuance on this case and let the Sameric Corporation present their case at a later date. This request was also denied by the Commission.

Dr. David Brownlee commented on the significance of the Boyd Theatre and Randal Baron showed several slides of the building. After the slide presentation, Mr. Creamer questioned Dr. Brownlee on several points on the significance statement in the nomination report.

After extensive questioning by Mr. Creamer of Dr. Brownlee, Mr. Creamer then requested that the Commission wait until 2:30 p.m. to vote on the designation of the Boyd Theatre. Mr. Creamer explained to the Commission that he was awaiting a temporary restraining order by the court. This request was denied. The Commission then voted to designate the Boyd Theatre by a vote of nine to one. Councilman John Street voted nay.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah