

THE MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE MEETING
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Herbert W. Levy, Chairman

21 November 1988

Present: Herbert W. Levy, Acting Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect, Independence
National Historical Park
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation Program
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.

Maria Petrillo, Chief Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Carmen A. Weber, Archaeologist

Also: S. Neil Schlosser of Schlosser Rivera Krumholz Architects to
present a proposed development scheme for Front and
Walnut Streets.
Hyman Myers and S.M. Langberg of the Vitetta Group and
representatives from the Pennsylvania Convention Center to
present a conceptual design of the Pennsylvania Convention
Center.
James Straw and Mark Bower of KKFS to present a proposal for
alterations to the Sansom Street and 15th Street entrances to
the Union League.
Hugh Zimmers, Architect and Larry Adams, owner, to present a
proposal for renovation work to the front facade of 412 Queen
Street and the construction of a third floor addition at the
rear of the building.
Robert H. Donaldson, representing Pizzeria Uno, to present a
proposal for the placement of a sign band on the front facade
of 509-11 S. 2nd Street.
Councilman James Tayoun and Barbara Williams to present a
proposal for the replacement of brick infill and non-historic
windows within the two-westernmost bays of the building at
126 Chestnut Street.
Charles Dagit and Craig Kiocach of Dagit Saylor Architects
and Martha Wolf from Bartram's Garden to present a
proposal for the renovation of the existing out buildings at
Bartram's Garden.
Hyman Myers and Associates to present a proposal for renovations
to the Bellevue Stratford Hotel located at Broad and Walnut
Streets.

SUBMISSION FOR ALTERATIONS

140-42 S. Front Street, 107-109 Walnut Street and 103-105 Walnut Street - S. Neil Schlosser, SRK Architects. Mr. Schlosser presented to the Architectural Committee members preliminary plans for development of the property at Front and Walnut Streets for hotel use. The proposed development calls for the rehabilitation of the existing nineteenth century loft buildings at 103-105 and 107-109 Walnut Street and the construction of a new six-story structure at the corner of Front and Walnut Streets.

The Architectural Committee voted to recommend that the Commission grant a conceptual approval of the proposed Front and Walnut development scheme. The members did ask, however, that the architect restudy the glass and steel penthouse design. In particular, the Committee recommended a simplification of the roof treatment on the projecting bays of the penthouse. The members suggested also the addition of brick reveals along the Walnut Street elevation of the new building to continue the rhythm of fenestration along the street.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval in Concept.

Pennsylvania Convention Center (Reading Terminal Market), Hyman Myers, Architect. Mr. Myers presented to the Committee a conceptual design for the new Pennsylvania Convention Center to include the proposed reuse of the Reading Terminal Trainshed - a locally designated structure and a National Historic Landmark.

Mr. Myers addressed primarily the proposed treatment of the nineteenth century train shed. The plans for the train shed include a complete restoration of the exterior of the structure using original materials, where budget permits, or acceptable substitute materials. On the interior, Mr. Myers related the intent to preserve nearly two-thirds of the volume of the original space. The floor of the train shed will be paved and the open space used as an interior public park. A two-story structure housing a ballroom will fill the north end of the train shed and connect across Arch Street to the proposed new construction.

Following considerable discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval, in concept, of the proposed treatment of the train shed with the suggestion that the new construction within the span of the shed be kept free of the roof trusses of the existing structure. The Committee members also asked for some restudy of the materials to be used on south facade of the infill structure. The Committee noted that the adobe-like material shown on the schematic drawing was not compatible with the historic fabric of the trainshed and should be reconsidered. Finally, the Committee suggested that the trees within the shed be potted rather than planted into the floor surface.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval in Concept.

Union League, 140 S. Broad Street. Mark Bower and James Straw, KKFS.

Mr. Bower explained to the Committee that owing to the extremely high construction cost of the original proposal presented to the Committee at an earlier meeting, the client asked for revisions to the previously approved plans calling for renovations to the Sansom Street entrance. These plans called for the addition of an entrance canopy and light fixtures. Also included in today's submission is the proposed addition of planters and the vagrant proofing of the railings on the 15th Street elevation.

The Architectural Committee unanimously recommended an approval of this project.

RECOMMENDATION: Final Approval.

412 Queen Street, Hugh Zimmers, Architect and Larry Adams, owner. This submission involves renovations to the front facade of the building situated at 412 Queen Street and the construction of a third floor addition to the rear of the building.

The Architectural Committee recommends an approval of the proposed facade work only. The Committee further recommends a rejection of the proposed third floor addition at the rear of the building. Shop drawings of window and door details as well as cleaning specifications must be submitted before a final approval of the proposed facade renovation work can be granted.

RECOMMENDATION: Rejection of third floor addition. Approval in concept of facade renovation. Specifications and details required.

511 S. 2nd Street, Robert Donaldson, applicant. This application involves the placement of a sign band across the front facades of 509 and 511 S. 2nd Street. The building at 509 is not a designated historic building; 511 is a designated building. From corner to corner the sign band is 39'7" in length and approximately 1'3" high. The design of the sign follows the standard pattern and color scheme used by all Pizzeria Uno restaurants.

The Architectural Committee requested that the design of the sign be restudied. The sign should not intrude upon the existing window sills. Detailed drawings and the proposed lighting plan must be submitted before a final approval is recommended.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval in Concept. Resubmission required.

126 Chestnut Street, Councilman James Tayoun, owner and Barbara Williams, applicant. This application calls for the replacement of brick infill and non-historic windows within the two westernmost bays of the building at 126 Chestnut Street. The applicant has acquired a pair of divided light wood windows and proposes their installation

within the masonry openings between the original granite piers. These windows do not conform to the original design as described in the 1853 insurance survey on file in the Commission office.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval in concept but questioned whether the new windows would fit properly within the existing openings. It was further agreed that a final approval could not be granted without the submission of detailed drawings assuring the proper installation of the windows.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval in Concept. Submission of drawings required before a final approval can be granted.

Bartram's Garden, 54th & Linberg Avenue, Martha Wolf, John Bartram Association. Members of the Architectural Committee reviewed a feasibility study for the renovation of Bartram's Garden prepared by Dagit Saylor Architects. This study describes the renovation of the existing out-buildings at Bartram's Garden as well as new construction and site improvements. The existing buildings will be rehabilitated to suit the specific needs of The John Bartram Association's programs and activities.

Following considerable discussion of this study, the Committee agreed to recommend its approval in concept. John Dickey abstained from voting on this submission.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval in concept.

Bellvue-Stratford Hotel, Broad and Walnut Streets, Hyman Myers, Architect. Hyman Myers of the Vitteta Group presented a resubmission for the renovation of the Bellvue Stratford Hotel by Richard I. Rubin, Associates. This resubmission includes both changes to the design originally submitted and approved by the Commission and new design related to tenant fitup.

Several changes to the original design were described by Mr. Myers and presented to the Committee for consideration. The number of bridges over Chancellor Street connecting the hotel to the parking garage has been reduced from two to one. Other changes involve the alteration of the original front door scheme from two side doors and one revolver to two revolvers and the elimination of the trees previously proposed along Broad Street.

Other proposed renovation work includes the construction of a one-story entrance arch over Chancellor Street leading back to the hotel entrance, the addition of new entrance canopies on the Walnut and Broad Street elevations, the placement of several planters on both street elevations and the conversion of an existing window opening into an entrance on Walnut Street to provide direct access to a corner retail shop. Several window openings along Broad Street, altered in the 1930's, will be restored to their original size. All window opening restoration will be done in stone. Three window openings on the Walnut Street elevation will be lengthened to offer

visual access to the ground floor retail shop. The proposed new window awnings at the first floor of the Bellevue will be dark blue in color. Those awnings identifying the Ralph Lauren Shop will display the shop's small gold logo.

Interior changes include a new mezzanine level in the Polo Shop and the installation of a large folding screen which will hide the dropped ceiling of the Polo Shop.

The Committee recommends an approval of all of the proposed changes and alterations as described by Mr. Myers. In particular, the Committee supports the idea of the entrance arch remaining as a separate element between the Bellevue and the parking garage across Chancellor Street, even if this means that the arch will encroach upon the Broad Street sidewalk. There was some disagreement among the Committee members concerning the issue of dropping the sill line on the three Walnut Street windows. The Committee voted three to one to recommend approval of this proposed change although they expressed some dismay over the removal of original fabric.

RECOMMENDATION: Final approval.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I