

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

16 June 1986

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee
American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence
National Historical Park
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation
Program
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.
Mark MacQueen, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary

Also: Hyman Myers of the Vitetta Group/Studio Four and Charles Newman of
Richard I. Rubin & Co., Inc. to present a major renovation pro-
posal for the Bellevue Stratford at Broad and Walnut Streets.
Irv Shapiro, Architect, to present rehabilitation proposals for
2315 Green Street and 260 S. 16th Street.
Richard Cole and William Algie of Richard M. Cole & Associates
to present substantial rehabilitation proposals for the three
properties located at 50-56 N. Front Street.
Patricia Bourne, Director of Development, Academy of the Vocal
Arts, to present a proposal to install a canopy at the Academy
located at 1920 Spruce Street.
Sherry Williamson, Mike Scholnick and Eugene Lefevre of Growth
Properties to present a request for permission to demolish
the buildings located at 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue.
John Taxin of Old Original Bookbinders to present a request for
permission to demolish 149 S. Hancock Street.
Mary Lou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition
of Greater Philadelphia.
And others.

ALTERATIONS

✓ Bellevue Stratford, Broad and Walnut Streets, Hyman Myers of Vittetta Group/
Studio Four and Charles Newman of Richard I. Rubin & Co., Inc. On
27 February 1986 Messrs. Hollenberg and DeLong and two members of the
Historical Commission staff toured the Bellevue Stratford with repre-
sentatives of RTKL Associates and others to discuss plans for major
renovation work to the building. At that time the Committee members

expressed their approval, in concept, of the proposed work but raised several items of concern. A letter specifying those items was sent to RTKL on 6 March 1986. Messrs. Myers and Newman appeared at today's meeting to present drawings which have been revised to adhere to the Committee members' concerns. Three major changes include the retention of the Rose Garden, Lobby and Ballroom. Basically the building will have three uses, i.e., the top of the structure will contain the hotel, the middle will be used for office areas and the bottom will contain retail spaces. Atriums are planned for the lower level and again at the under side of the Rose Garden on the upper level. On the exterior, new construction will both infill the Bellevue Court area and replace the existing Bellevue Court Building at 1418 Walnut Street. The addition of two bridges is also planned to connect the building with the parking garage. At this time, it is the intention of the architect to retain the existing ballroom. Should it become unfeasible to retain the ballroom, this space will be converted into a retail area. This will require, of course, the submission of revised drawings to the Architectural Committee for review. This proposal further calls for the installation of new windows on the upper levels of the building to replicate in form those being replaced. These windows will probably be fabricated in metal. The existing windows on the lower levels below the lower cornice line will remain.

The Architectural Committee unanimously agreed to recommend the approval of this project for the Bellevue. However, if the proposed use of the Ballroom changes, revised drawings should be submitted for review.

- ✓ 2315 Green Street, Irv Shapiro, Architect, of Shapiro Petrauskas Gelber Associates. Mr. Shapiro presented a proposal for the substantial rehabilitation of this two-story, 19th century carriage house located at the rear of the property known as 2315 Green Street. This small building faces an alleyway having access to Wallace Street. Mr. Shapiro stated that he has received approval from the State for his Part II Certification which required that all windows will be retained and repaired where possible. The Victorian bracketed cornice will be replaced with an exact replica. The building will have a garage and storage area on the ground floor with an apartment above.

The Architectural Committee unanimously agreed to recommend approval of this rehabilitation of the carriage house located at the rear of 2315 Green Street.

- ✓ 260 S. 16th Street, Irv Shapiro, Architect, of Shapiro Petrauskas Gelber Associates. Mr. Shapiro presented a proposal which calls for the rehabilitation of 260 S. 16th Street, a three-and-a-half story Greek Revival brick rowhouse built c. 1845. The building's first floor was altered with a shop window for commercial use c. 1920. The brick with stone trim front facade will be cleaned with a low pressure water wash and mild detergent using natural bristle brushes. Where necessary, "Sure Clean" paint remover will be used. Window openings, frames and sash at the

second and third floors will be retained and repaired. The 1920's shop window with three light transom will be repaired and glazing replaced, where necessary. The Committee strongly recommended that the storm windows be installed on the interior. However, if not feasible, the storm windows should have a baked enamel finish in a color to match the wood window frames.

The Committee reviewed the drawings and commented that the entrance doors appear to be incorrectly drawn. Mr. Hollenberg requested the submission of an enlarged drawing comparing the vestibule detail with the proposed doors which will be installed in this opening. These doors were uncovered in the basement of the building.

The proposal also calls for the repair of the existing metal cornice. A new fiberglass shingle roof will be installed. Mr. Hollenberg requested that a sample shingle be submitted for review.

The Architectural Committee unanimously agreed to recommend approval of this project for 260 S. 16th Street pending receipt and approval of the vestibule and door drawings and a review and approval of a sample roof shingle.

✓ 50-56 N. Front Street, Richard Cole and William Algie of Richard M. Cole & Associates. Messrs. Cole and Algie presented a submission which involves three properties on N. Front Street. The building at 50-52 N. Front Street is a five-story, four bay red brick building built c. 1850. A one-story garage structure of no redeeming architectural value occupies the lot at 54 N. Front Street. The building at 56 N. Front Street, built c. 1850, stands four-and-a-half stories tall and four bays wide. The proposed rehabilitation program will convert these warehouse structures for use as a 42 room inn with a restaurant and other amenities.

Work proposed for 50-52 N. Front Street and 56 N. Front Street includes the replacement of all existing one-over-one sash above the first floor with new six-over-six wood, double hung sash. Ground floor windows and doors will be repaired or replaced where necessary. The masonry will be cleaned and the building will be repointed where necessary with new mortar to match the original. A mortar analysis will be done. The roof at 50-52 N. Front Street will be repaired. A new standing seam roof will be installed to replace the deteriorated standing seam metal roof in existence at 56 N. Front Street.

Demolition is proposed for 54 N. Front Street, a one-story red brick garage built c. 1960. This garage will be replaced with a new five-story two bay building which will serve as a link between the two historic structures. This building will have a synthetic stucco finish in a contrasting color and will be contemporary in design.

Awnings over window and door openings are proposed along the ground floor. New window and door openings and new roof decks are planned for the rear of the buildings.

The Architectural Committee unanimously agreed to recommend approval of this project for 50-56 N. Front Street.

✓ 1920 Spruce Street, Academy of Vocal Arts, Patricia Bourne, Director of Development. Ms. Bourne presented a preliminary proposal to install a canopy at the entrance of the Academy of Vocal Arts located at 1920 Spruce Street. The building is a three-story plus mansard brownstone built c. 1868 in the Second Empire style. The design of the canopy as envisioned would extend five feet over the doorway and steps. Ms. Bourne stated that the canopy construction would require no supporting columns and would be attached to the building facade. The Committee rejected this idea and recommended that the canopy be supported by columns so that minimal or no damage will occur to the building fabric. Mr. Bartley, a board member of the Academy of Vocal Arts, volunteered to design the canopy for this project.

The Committee agreed to recommend approval, in concept, of this project. Mr. Bartley abstained from voting on this submission. Mr. Bartley will prepare a resubmission and submit it for a final review.

DEMOLITIONS

✓ 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue, Sherry Williamson, Mike Scholnick and Eugene Lefevre of Growth Properties. At the 10 April 1986 Architectural Committee Meeting, a proposal was presented to convert these buildings known as the Lummi's Peanut Butter Factory buildings at 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue into a moderately priced hotel. Subsequent to that meeting, Growth Properties determined that it was financially impossible for them to proceed with this renovation project and as a result, expressed their wish to demolish the existing buildings and construct a new hotel on the site.

Ms. Williamson and Messrs. Scholnick and Lefevre appeared before the Architectural Committee today to request permission to demolish these buildings at 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue. According to Mr. Scholnick, a 1987 summer tourist season opening is essential for this project to be profitable. After an informative presentation on the many problems encountered in the renovation attempt, Mr. Scholnick stated that it became financially unfeasible to undertake this project as originally planned. Growth Properties submitted a comprehensive report containing economic data relating to the buildings as specified in the historic preservation ordinance.

The Committee reviewed the facts as presented and voted to recommend that the Historical Commission secure the services of an independent consultant to evaluate the economic data contained in the report submitted by Growth Properties. The Committee also recommended that a structural engineer be engaged by the Commission to ascertain the structural conditions at 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue. The Committee added that it would attempt to expedite these reviews as quickly as possible.

149 S. Hancock Street, John Taxin of Old Original Bookbinders. Under the old ordinance, the previous owner of 149 S. Hancock Street applied for a demolition permit. The Commission at that time imposed its six month delay. The six month time period expired, however, without the owner having secured the demolition permit. Subsequently, the property was sold to John Taxin of Old Original Bookbinders. Mr. Tyler reported that the Agreement of Sale for the property did not transfer with it the demolition approval. In September of 1985 the new owner applied for a demolition permit. At that time Mr. Tyler forwarded a copy of the new ordinance to Mr. Albert Taxin to alert him to the procedures required for Commission review of a demolition permit application. Mr. Taxin's request was scheduled for a hearing before the Architectural Committee at least two times. In both instances, the applicant withdrew his submission at the last minute and failed to reschedule.

Mr. John Taxin appeared before the Architectural Committee today to request approval to demolish 149 S. Hancock Street. Mr. Taxin stated his intent to construct a parking facility at some future time. In the meanwhile, Mr. Taxin emphasized his need for additional surface parking on the Hancock Street site.

The Committee members reviewed the issues presented by Mr. Taxin and recommended that he submit economic information as specified in the historic preservation ordinance. This information, when received by the Historical Commission, will be referred to an independent consultant for evaluation. This evaluation will be reviewed by the Historical Commission and a decision rendered.

PLAQUES

2037 Spring Garden Street. The Committee reviewed the photograph and plaque application for 2037 Spring Garden Street and recommended that a Committee member inspect this building to ascertain if the windows are correct. The Committee also recommended that the storm windows be removed. The results of this visit will be reported at a later meeting.

✓ 220 Monroe Street. The Committee reviewed the photograph and plaque application for 220 Monroe Street. The Committee recommended that a member visit this property to inspect the cornice, brick and shutters. The results of this visit will be reported at a later meeting.

✓ 2246 N. 52nd Street. Mr. Hollenberg reported that he visited this building as a result of a recommendation made at the 14 November 1985 Architectural Committee Meeting. Mr. Hollenberg reported that the structure qualifies for an "altered" plaque. The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend that 2246 N. 52nd Street be awarded an "altered" plaque.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terri Koob
Executive Secretary