

**THE MINUTES OF THE 398th STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
11 October 1995**

**Wayne Spilove, Chairperson
City Council Caucus Chamber, Room 401 City Hall**

Present _____ Wayne Spilove,

Chairperson

David Brownlee

Duane Bumb, Commerce Department

Joseph James, Department of Public Property

Barbara Kaplan, City Planning Commission

Arlene Matzkin

Susan Rabinovitch

Scott Wilds, Office of Housing and Community Development

Joshua Grimes, City Solicitor's Office

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Lori Plavin Salganicoff, Historic Preservation Specialist

Jeffrey R. Barr, Historic Preservation Researcher

Also _____ Marion Ruth Rogel,

2127 St. James Street

Elizabeth Appleby, University of Pennsylvania Historic Preservation Program

Robin Weidlich, University of Pennsylvania Historic Preservation Program

Evan Kopelson, University of Pennsylvania Historic Preservation Program

William Isenberg, 1424 Chestnut Street

Stuart Rosenberg, 1424 Chestnut Street

Bobbie Burke, Center City Residents Association (CCRA)

George Brodie, CCRA

David Feldman, 2137 St. James Street

Milton Marks, Preservation Coalition

Terry Kennedy, 325 South 18th Street

Judith Eden, 335 South 16th Street

The 398th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission was called to order at 10:15am by Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, who recognized the presence of a quorum of the Commission.

Mr. Spilove introduced Joshua Grimes as the Historical Commission's new representative from the City Solicitor's Office.

THE MINUTES of the 397th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 16 September 1995, Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, were approved by unanimous vote and adopted upon a motion made by Dr. Brownlee and seconded by Mr. Wilds.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE REPORT, 26 September 1995, Arlene Matzkin, Chair1424 CHESTNUT STREET, JACOB REED STORE BUILDING

Stuart G. Rosenberg, Architect

PROPOSAL: Conceptual Approval, Alterations

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend conceptual approval of signage, with the elimination of the word "Pharmacy," and perhaps also of "CVS" from the three dimensional mortar and pestle sign. The drawings should be corrected to describe the locations of signage and methods of attachment.

The Applicant, an architect for CVS Pharmacy, seeks approval in concept for the installation of new metal signage and canvas banners on the former Jacob Reed store. Although other City agencies may reject the proposal for projecting signage owing to Zoning Code and other restrictions, the reviews of the Historical Commission and its Architectural Committee address on considerations of impact on historic fabric visible from a public right-of-way.

The signage as proposed would consist of bronze wall plaques, bronze lettering at the lintel of the entrance, a three dimensional bronze or bronze-like mortar and pestle sign with backlit lettering, and banners reading "CVS Pharmacy" hanging from the building's existing flagpoles. The mortar and pestle would hang from the grand Mercer tile-clad entrance arch. The details of the graphics remain under consideration.

Ms. Matzkin mentioned that the Architectural Committee had approved a banner for the previous tenant, a Barnes and Noble Bookstore. The bracket for the banner remains projecting from the top of the arch. She added that this block of Chestnut Street suffers from a high vacancy rate and that the dramatic signage proposed would be beneficial if rendered in a compatible and sophisticated way.

Dr. Brownlee noted that the design of the mortar and pestle differs from the silhouette of the traditional pharmacy sign. Mr. Rosenberg reiterated that the design has yet to be finalized.

A motion to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee was made by Dr. Brownlee and seconded by Mr. Wilds. The motion passed by unanimous vote.

325 SOUTH 18TH STREET (AT DELANCEY STREET)

Teresa Kennedy, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Partial Reconstruction and Restoration

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend conceptual approval of moving windows to allow for the construction of interior brick piers subject to staff review.

The Applicant sought approval of drawings to rebuild the north and east walls of the rear ell. A schematic design for this work was approved at the 13 September Historical Commission meeting. The areas to be rebuilt include two wood frame bays, brick walls, windows, soffits and gutters. The Architect proposes to move several windows in order to give more structural support to the bays. The rebuilt bays would be cantilevered from the facade using steel and their current columns retained for historical appearance.

Ms. Matzkin reported that the drawings submitted to the Architectural Committee included the addition of a second story to the Delancey Street bay and were not drawn to scale. Evaluation by the Committee of the bay addition was postponed until correctly scaled drawings could be reviewed.

Dr. Brownlee moved to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. This was seconded by Mr. Wilds and passed by unanimous vote.

Ms. Kennedy described that owing to time constraints, the proposal has yet to be drawn to scale. Mr. Tyler restated that the Commission had voted to approve in concept to move windows slightly to allow for the structural stability of the rebuilt Delancey Street bay.

Ms. Kaplan asked about the status of legal action on this property. Mr. Tyler replied that the Department of Licenses and Inspections (L & I) took the matter to court, and that an order by Judge O'Keefe states that the applicant must submit construction documents to L & I by 28 October. Mr. Tyler offered that they would likely be submitted for review at the next Architectural Committee meeting.

1210 SPRUCE STREET

Roy Fuiman, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Windows

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Architectural Committee recommended that Mr. Tyler contact the Law Department to find out whether there is a legal way to require appropriate replacement windows when the building is rehabilitated.

The proposal comes as a result of a violation issued for the installation of windows without a permit. The building has been vacant for several years following a fire. Mr. Fuiman, a real estate broker whose office is across the street, bought the building and installed vinyl windows with snap-in muntins to replace a temporary covering of the openings. He claims that closing up a building after a fire does not require a building permit.

Mr. Grimes explained that as the new counsel to the Historical Commission he has not been able to consider fully the ability of the Commission to require subsequent owners to perform work. He requested that the matter be deferred to the next Commission meeting.

The Commission took no vote on this matter. Mr. Grimes will make a recommendation at the next meeting.

621-A SOUTH AMERICAN STREET

Robert Borzotta

PROPOSAL: North Facade Bay Addition

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend approval of the addition with staff review of details.

The Applicant seeks to build a second story bay, with a third story featuring a solid railing inset balcony, onto the building's stuccoed north wall. This wall connects to the front facades of an integral row of buildings constructed at the same time to form a rear court. A bulkhead with windows would also be added at the basement level. A parking lot adjacent to the alley allows for the facade to be fully visible from American Street. It is likely that the wall was always blank.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee and permit the addition, with staff review of details. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion, which was passed by unanimous vote.

2127 ST. JAMES STREET

Marion Rogel, Applicant; David Feldman, Architect

PROPOSAL: Alterations

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend approval of the reduction of the Van Pelt Street addition to an 8' wall with a second floor french balcony. Secondly, they voted to recommend denial of the french doors installed on the south facade without a permit and to require that the new doors should fit the historic opening. The Architect is to work with Commission staff to find the proper south facade door.

Ms. Matzkin reported on the compromise reached between the applicant and the Zoning Committee of the Center City Resident's Association (CCRA). The CCRA Zoning Committee voted not to oppose the application for a zoning variance for partial demolition of a rear addition with retention of all walls as 8' walls subject to the six conditions reported in the minutes of the 26 September 1995 Architectural Committee meeting. The owner, through her architect, agreed to adhere to this list.

Subsequent to the Architectural Committee meeting, Commission staff visited the site at the request of the applicant and determined that the south facade door, which had been a window previously, may well have contained a french door prior to that. The head of the current door is lower than the window had been, although the opening's historic soldier course remains and brick infill was roughly added. An air conditioner is located on the inside wall of this infilled area. Ms. Matzkin described that the Architectural Committee had discussed replacing the infill with a false transom so as to allow the a/c to remain but also address the infill & the incongruous placement of the soldier course.

Mr. Tyler suggested that the Commission consider the removal of the infill and the soldier course and its replacement with toothed-in brick salvaged from the demolition of the Van Pelt Street addition complete with a new soldier course directly above the current doors. The doors would be retained.

Mr. Feldman noted that the windows that had been removed for the french doors had not been original to the opening, and that no record of this original opening has been found. Mr. Feldman also distributed photographs of other English Village houses that showed doors and windows without transoms and neighbors' window openings lower than the head of the french doors.

Dr. Brownlee noted that although the exact door or window which filled this opening is not known, the height and width of the opening is known. Mr. Feldman commented that this height may not be original but perhaps the result of raising the opening almost sixty years ago. Ms. Matzkin noted that while it may have been raised, it had been artfully raised. She added that if it is to be lowered, it should be done in the manner described by Mr. Tyler. Dr. Brownlee stated that, owing to the lack of historical information, he would be in favor of any of the solutions posed.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Committee with the additional approval of the proposal to remove the infill and the soldier course, fill the area with toothed-in brick salvaged from the demolition of the Van Pelt Street addition, and install a new soldier course directly above the current doors, which would be retained. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which was approved by unanimous vote.

The meeting adjourned at 11:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lori Plavin Salganicoff