

THE MINUTES OF THE 303rd STATED MEETING
OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

30 July 1986

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

Present: Dudley R. Sykes, Acting Chairman, Commissioner, Department
of Public Property
Joan Ferreira
Grace Gary
David Hollenberg
William Thompson
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission
Becky Northrop, Director, Policy and Planning, Office of
Housing
David Wismer, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
Fred Bader, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Sally Elk, City Planner II, Historical Commission
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary

Also: Myles Kelly representing 223 S. Jessup Street
Richard Dretsch of Martin J. Rosenblum, Architect, representing
1701 Arch Street, Robert Morris Hotel
Mark Ueland, Foundation for Architecture
Stephen Bosch, representing Temple University
Patrick Starr, Foundation for Architecture
Sandy Garz, City Planning Commission
Mary Lou McFarland, Preservation Coalition of Greater
Philadelphia
ncy Goldenberg, Councilwoman Joan Specter's Office
Linda Loyd, The Philadelphia Inquirer
And others.

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions
correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the Special Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission
held on 10 July 1986, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., were reviewed and
approved.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 16 July 1986,
David Hollenberg, Chairman. Mr. Hollenberg reported that several
changes should be made to the report of 16 July 1986.

Pennsylvania Hospital Pine Garden Wall. Mr. Hollenberg recommended to the Commission that a letter in support of the proposed repair of the Pennsylvania Hospital Pine Garden Wall be sent to the hospital administration. The staff will prepare such a letter.

223 S. Jessup Street. Mr. Hollenberg reported that revised drawings have been received and are acceptable. Mr. Myles Kelly, applicant for 223 S. Jessup Street, addressed the Commission requesting that photographs of this house showing neighboring properties be examined by the Commission. Mr. Kelly attempted to show that other houses in his neighborhood have transoms above the front entrance door. He suggested that the pictures might help determine if 223 S. Jessup Street should contain a transom. Mr. Kelly was advised that if he wished to revise his drawing, he should resubmit to the Architectural Committee whose recommendations would be considered at the August Stated Meeting. Mr. Kelly withdrew his request to revise the approved elevation which shows no transom. Mr. Hollenberg recommended a final approval of this project.

922 Spruce Street. Mr. Hollenberg stated that a correction should be made in the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 16 July 1986 under the 922 Spruce Street submission. The incorrect sentence appears in the beginning of the second paragraph and reads, "The Committee reviewed the photographs and the drawings presented and unanimously agreed that the building should either retain its Victorian alterations or be restored to the original Greek Revival design." The corrected sentence should read, "The Committee reviewed the photographs and the drawings presented and unanimously agreed that the building should retain its Victorian alterations." Mr. Hollenberg further reported that the revised elevation requested by the Committee has been received and a final approval is now recommended.

1701 Arch Street. Mr. Hollenberg reported that the revisions requested by the Committee have not been received. Mr. Richard Dretsch, Architect representing Martin J. Rosenblum, requested that the Commission review the latest design scheme for the signage in the shopfronts at 1701 Arch Street. This revision basically eliminates the banding along the bottom of the windows and incorporates a stronger coordination of type face and graphics on the wood painted signs. Mr. Dretsch noted that this scheme represents an enormous simplification of design from the original proposal. Mr. Hollenberg stated that the design presented today appears to be a good alternative and is sufficiently close to the desired recommendations to be acceptable. Mr. Hollenberg recommended that the project for 1701 Arch Street be approved.

The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 16 July 1986 including the approval and the correction noted for 922 Spruce Street, the approval of 223 S. Jessup Street and the approval of 1701 Arch Street submissions. The Commission further voted unanimously to approve Mr. Hollenberg's recommendation that a letter of support be prepared regarding the repairs on the Pennsylvania Hospital Pine Garden Wall.

THE REPORT of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation held on 8 July 1986, Grace Gary, Chairman. Ms. Gary presented to the Historical Commission for consideration the proposed designation of Lodge Number Two, Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks, 1320-1322 Arch Street. Ms. Gary noted the architectural merit and historical background of the building. Mr. Baron presented a slide for the Commission's review. Following the presentation, Ms. Gary advised the Commission of her committee's recommendation by a vote of 4-1 in favor of designation. A motion to designate this building at 1320-1322 Arch Street as an historic building was made and seconded. Discussion followed.

Mark Ueland, representing the Foundation for Architecture, voiced support of historic designation for this building at 1320-1322 Arch Street citing its architectural significance as a fine example of Renaissance Revival architecture laced with Georgian detailing.

The Commission voted unanimously to designate the Lodge Number Two, Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks, 1320-1322 Arch Street as an historic building.

Ms. Gary next presented to the Historical Commission for consideration the proposed designation of College Hall, Temple University, 1801-1855 N. Broad Street. Ms. Gary described the historical importance of College Hall as the original building of Temple College and emphasized its outstanding architectural significance in the Romanesque Revival style. Mr. Baron presented a slide for the Commission's review. A motion to designate College Hall as an historic building was made and seconded. Discussion followed.

Stephen Bosch, representing Temple University, requested that consideration to designate College Hall be delayed so that Temple University would have sufficient time to respond. Mr. Bosch stated that Temple University Senior Officials have been out of the country and that they did not receive the official notification letter of the proposed historic designation.

The Commission voted unanimously to grant a continuance on the designation consideration of College Hall, Temple University, until the 27 August 1986 Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Old Business

The Report of the Committee on Historic Designation held on 14 March 1986, Grace Gary, Chairman. Ms. Gary presented to the Commission for consideration the historic designation of the Boyd Theater, 1908-1910 Chestnut Street, a c. 1927 building by Architects Hoffman and Henon. Ms. Gary highlighted the architectural and historical significance of this building and Mr. Baron presented slides for the Commission's review. Ms. Gary stated that her committee recommended designation by a vote of 6-0.

Mr. Tyler reported that he recently received a telephone call from legal counsel for the owners of the Boyd Theater requesting a continuance of the Historical Commission's consideration of historic designation on the Boyd Theater. Mr. Tyler stated that the owner intends to seek a temporary restraining order to inhibit the Commission's designation of this building. In view of the absence of Mark MacQueen, Counsel for the Historical Commission, Mr. Tyler recommended that the Commission grant this continuance.

Patrick Starr, voicing his personal opinion, urged the immediate designation of the Boyd Theater. Mr. Starr also commented on the continuing deterioration of the Boyd Theater and requested that the Historical Commission force the owner to maintain the building. Mr. Tyler stated that he would seek legal advice to determine if the maintenance provision of the historic preservation ordinance applies in this case.

A motion was made and seconded to grant the continuance. The Commission voted unanimously to grant a continuance of the designation consideration for the Boyd Theater until the 24 September 1986 Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

THE REPORT on the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for 15 June - 15 July 1986, Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer. Mr. Tyler requested special commendation for the superior work performed by Ms. Sally Elk during the recent municipal workers' strike. Ms. Elk was officially thanked for her outstanding performance during that period. The Report on the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for 15 June - 15 July 1986 was approved for filing.

OLD BUSINESS

Demolition Request

136-148 N. Delaware Avenue, Lummi's Peanut Butter Factory and Warehouses, Growth Properties. Mr. Tyler reported that Latimer & Buck completed the review of the materials submitted by Growth Properties in relation to their request to demolish the Lummi's Peanut Butter Factory and Warehouses at 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue. As a result of this evaluation, Latimer & Buck concur that the value of the projected cash flows from the rehabilitated uses is less than the cost of rehabilitation, thereby making rehabilitation of the buildings economically infeasible. Mr. Tyler also noted the letter received from Nicholas Gianopoulos of Keast and Hood, retained by the Commission, agreed with the findings of Growth Properties' engineer. Mr. Tyler stated that in view of the results of these analyses, the staff recommends that the demolition request of 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue be approved. A motion to approve this demolition was made and seconded. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the demolition request for 136-148 N. Delaware Avenue.

STATED MEETING

5

30 July 1986

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terri Koob
Executive Secretary