

MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

12 March 1987

David Hollenberg, Chairman

- Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee
American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.
Mark MacQueen, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law
Department
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Steno I
- Also: Bernard Dubin, A.I.A., of Medifac to present a proposal
for the demolition of mechanical equipment and selected
portions of the Granary at 411 N. 20th Street
David Amburn of Amburn/Jarosinski to present a proposal for
a garage door replacement for 538-540 Spruce Street
Samuel Attias, owner, to present a proposal for
installation of a second entrance within the existing
ground floor shopfront at 58 S. 2nd Street
Joseph Yocha and Jessica Kaplan to present a proposal for
restoration of 2322 St. Albans Place
Michael Hauptman of Braner & Hauptman, Architects to
present a proposal for a partial restoration of the
front facade of 702 S. Front Street
Jack A. Thalheimer, Architect, to present a proposal for
substantial rehabilitation of the building at 209-211
Chestnut Street
Wayne Mack of the University of Pennsylvania and Fred
Chomowicz of Davis, Brody and Associates to present a
proposal for exterior alterations primarily within the
Courtyard area of the University of Pennsylvania
Quadrangle
Alison J. Towers, Owner, to present a proposal for several
changes to the front facade of 815 S. Hancock Street
Joel Levinson of the Levinson-Zaprawski Associates to
present a proposal for renovations to 25 Summit Street
James Campbell of Campbell of Campbell Thomas and Company
and Pierre Khataar, Owner, to present a proposal for the
substantial rehabilitation of 2301 Green Street
Donald Reiff of Alesker, Reiff and Dundon to present a
proposal for the proposed renovation of 228 and 230 Arch
Street and the proposed new construction adjoining them

Meryle Ostroff and Joseph L. Abriola of Episcopal Hospital to present a proposal for the demolition of the Gill House

Theodore T. Bartley and Barbara Macaulan of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Miranda to present a proposal for restoration of the Pine Garden Wall at Pennsylvania Hospital

Theodore T. Bartley and William Sarnacki of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Miranda to present a proposal for exterior renovations to 242 S. 17th Street

Theodore T. Bartley of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Miranda to present a proposal for replacement of the front dormer window sash at 238 S. 4th Street

And others.

ALTERATIONS

411 N. 20th Street, Bernard Dubin of Medifac. Mr. Dubin appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal which involves demolition of selected portions of the Granary. This proposed demolition includes the removal of the metal grainery equipment and structural steel support located on the north face of the building. Mr. Dubin noted that the grain equipment was not original but was added to the building in 1952 and that the building was constructed in 1925. Ms. Siemiontkowski noted that two greenhouses on the roof will be removed and reconstructed to match the exact same size and design. These proposals have all received preliminary approval from the Bureau for Historic Preservation in Harrisburg.

Mr. Dubin explained to the Architectural Committee that the first two floors of the building will be used as office space along with the top floors of the building that previously were used as an apartment. In addition to the existing elevator, the plans also include, the construction of a new larger elevator. Two new fire tower stairs will also be constructed within two existing silos. Mr. Dubin also requested an approval for the removal of an aluminum window located on the west elevation. This opening will be modified and the window replaced with an emergency exit door.

The Committee recommended an approval for the partial demolition of the Granary. However, drawings for the proposed window replacement on the west elevation and for all other exterior renovations must be presented for a full review and final approval.

538-540 Spruce Street, David Amburn, Amburn/Jarosinski. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported to the Committee that approximately a year ago the Historical Commission reviewed and approved wood garage doors on the 6th Street side of the building at 540 Spruce Street. The owners of 538-540 Spruce Street considered the swinging wood doors a hazard to pedestrians and vehicular traffic on 6th Street. Consequently, the owners have removed the wood gates and have purchased a metal roll-up grille manufactured by Pioneer Gate Company, Inc.

The Committee recommended that Mr. Amburn research alternatives to a roll-up metal gate and informed Mr. Amburn that the installation of metal gates would not be sympathetic to the house's character. Mr. Amburn was requested to resubmit suitable alternatives to the Committee for review and approval.

Note: The installation of exterior storm windows were noted on a recent visit to the site by the staff. The suggestion of removing the storms was presented to Mr. Amburn. He informed the Committee that it was his understanding that the owners planned to remove the exterior storms.

58 S. 2nd Street, Samuel Attias, Owner. Mr. Attia proposes to install a second entrance within the existing ground floor turn of the century shopfront at 58 S. 2nd Street. The new entrance will provide separate access to the apartments on the upper floors.

The Committee recommends that the existing center door, if removed, be replaced with a door identical to that proposed for use as entrance to the apartments. The Committee agrees, in concept, with the proposed alteration. The members did suggest, however, the elimination of the wood panel above the door. The elimination of this panel will require the installation of a taller door which would fill the opening up to the height of the transom bar. The Committee also suggested that the owner use safety glass in the design of the proposed new door.

2322 St. Albans Place, Joe Yoacha and Jessica Kaplan, Applicants. This proposal calls for a restoration of the front facade of 2322 St. Albans Place. A roof deck is also proposed.

The Committee reviewed the specifications and recommended an approval of this project pending receipt of detailed drawings and specifications for the proposed front door and roof deck.

702 S. Front Street, Michael I. Hauptman, Braner & Hauptman, Architects. This proposal calls for a partial restoration of the front facade of 702 S. Front Street.

The Committee reviewed the plans and recommended an approval contingent upon an inspection of the building to determine the

appropriateness of a pent eave between the first and second floors. The Committee also recommended the retention of the existing wood gate.

If it is determined that the building originally had a pent eave, the Committee asked for a revised detailed drawing, to show the elimination of the wood drip course. The Committee recommended instead the use of metal flashing between the pent eave and the brick masonry facade.

209-211 Chestnut Street, Jack A. Thalheimer, Architect. Mr. Thalheimer presented a proposal for substantial rehabilitation to 209-211 Chestnut Street. It is the intention of Mr. Thalheimer to stucco the building facade covering an existing brick veneer. He further intends to recess the proposed new windows to their original depth on the front facade. Original sash on the side elevation will be repaired and the wall restuccoed.

The Committee agreed that these alterations were sympathetic to the building and agreed to recommend an approval of this project.

University of Pennsylvania Quadrangle, Wayne Mack of the University of Pennsylvania and Fred Chomoniwz of Davis, Brody and Associates. Ms. Siemiontkowski informed the Committee that Herb Levy examined the drawings prior to today's meeting and will report his findings to the Committee. Mr. Chomowicz discussed his firm's proposal for exterior alterations. These include:

- 1) New exterior entrance ramps and accompanying alterations to the building to accomodate these ramps.
- 2) Installation of elevators with accompanying roof alterations.
- 3) Installation of new replacement windows and restoration of leaded glass windows.
- 4) Installation of new roof and skylights.

The Committee discussed these alterations and unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this phase of the project.

815 S. Hancock Street, Alison J. Towers, Applicant. Miss Towers presented a proposal for several changes to the front facade of 815 S. Hancock Street. The proposed alterations include the following:

- 1) The addition of an over-sized roof dormer on the Hancock Street elevation.
- 2) The closing of two original basement windows and installation of a new projecting bulkhead.

- 3) The design and installation of new more elaborate cornice and gutter system.
- 4) The addition of a new rubber roof deck at rear of house and the installation of new French doors.

Ms. Siemiontkowski advised the Committee that no evidence of a front dormer exists for this building. She further noted that the installation of a major design feature on a principal facade of an historic building clearly conflicts with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings. These are the Standards prescribed by ordinance for use in the evaluation of proposals for alteration or construction. The addition of a more elaborate cornice rather than replacement of the simple box cornice also presents a conflict with these Standards as does the closing of the original basement masonry openings.

The Committee reviewed the submission and requested revised drawings showing a shed dormer with large lights of glass and new drawings for the installation of a revised bulkhead design. Following considerable discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of this project pending the receipt and approval, by a Committee member, of the revised drawings.

- 25 Summit Street, Joel Levinson of Levinson-Zaprauskis Associates. Mr. Levinson presented a proposal for the removal of an existing modern bay window on the west elevation of 25 Summit Street; the west elevation will also be restuccoed. The architect further proposes to lengthen two existing windows at the rear of the house. These altered openings will contain the existing six-over-six double hung window sash and a new fixed, three light transom above one window and a solid wood panel above other. The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this project.

- 2301 Green Street, Jim Campbell of Campbell Thomas and Company and Pierre Khataar, Owner. Mr. Campbell presented his proposal which calls for the substantial rehabilitation of 2301 Green Street. This property is being renovated into eight apartments. All windows will be replaced. Two basement windows will be enlarged to provide an emergency exit required by Code. The building will be repainted. Roof decks are also proposed.

The Committee requested a site line study for the roof decks and detailed drawings for the proposed new windows. The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this project pending the receipt, review and approval of the requested additional information.

- 218-220 Arch Street, Donald Reiff of Alesker, Reiff and Dundon. Ms. Siemiontkowski informed the Committee that in May of 1985, the Philadelphia Historical Commission agreed to the demolition

of 218 and 220 Arch Street to allow for construction of a new parking garage. This project has now been expanded to include the rehabilitation of the two buildings at 228 and 230 Arch Street.

Mr. Reiff presented his preliminary plans to the Committee for consideration. The proposed rehabilitation of 228 Arch Street will involve the repair and restoration of existing historic fabric. On 230 Arch Street, Mr. Reiff proposed the duplication of the historic storefront at 228 for use at 230 Arch Street. The Committee recommended instead that the architect not reproduce an historic front which never existed at 230 but rather to design a new one compatible with the old in scale, proportion and materials. The architect also proposes the reconstruction of an existing mansard which he intends to face with vertical metal siding.

The Committee asked that a revised submission be presented to the Committee for another review.

Pennsylvania Hospital, Pine Garden Wall, Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., and Barbara Macaulan

of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Mirenda. This proposal calls for the restoration of the historic Pine Garden Wall at Pennsylvania Hospital. Work on the wall and sidewalk will include the rebuilding of brick piers; the restoration and resetting of granite curbs and flagstone pavers, brick pavers and bluestone pavers; the removal of some street poles; the introduction of corner curb cuts; and, the restoration of a horse trough and fountain. The existing iron fence and gates will be removed and restored as will marble caps. An infill masonry panel on 9th Street will be removed and wood gates installed.

The Committee discussed the submission and agreed to recommend an approval of the project. Mr. Bartley abstained from voting.

242 S. 17th Street, Theodore T. Bartley and William Sarnacki of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Mirenda. This proposal calls for the restoration of the building at 242 S. 17th Street and its adaption to serve as a beauty parlor. The proposal includes the restoration of the front facade based on an historical photograph. In particular the first floor which has been covered over in the 1950's with stone and aluminum will be reexposed.

The Committee reviewed the plans for the restoration of this building and recommended to Mr. Bartley that stucco instead of drivit be used in the refacing of the watertable of the building if appropriate iron spot brick cannot be found. The Committee recommended an approval, in concept, of this project and requested detailed drawings and specifications on the proposed work to be done. Mr. Bartley and Mr. Levy abstained from voting.

279 S. 4th Street, Theodore T. Bartley of Bartley, Bronstein, Long, Mirenda. This proposal calls for the replacement of dormer window sash on the front and rear of the property at 238 S. 4th Street.

The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this alteration. Mr. Bartley abstained from voting.

DEMOLITION

Episcopal Hospital, Meryle Ostroff and Joseph L. Abriola of Episcopal Hospital. This application is requesting permission to demolish the Gill house, a small Jacobean Revival building on the grounds of the hospital. Ms. Ostroff explained that the hospital is in the process of planning an expansion and that it would be advantageous to them if they could demolish the Gill House and build an extension to the hospital in its place. Ms. Ostroff also explained that the Hospital explored various alternative uses for the Gill House but that none were economically feasible.

The Committee examined the site plan and requested the submission of floor plans for the existing building to which the addition will attach. The Committee also requested the submission of documentation on the alternative uses for the Gill House considered by the Hospital. A recommendation will be voted on when this information is received and reviewed by the Committee.

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenograph I