

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA
HISTORICAL COMMISSION

18 November 1981

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

- Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Architect for Independence National Historical Park
Russell Milnor, A.I.A., Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority
Janet Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Sara Reiter, Student Intern, Great Lakes College Association.
- Also: David Beck, Architect, to present his revised elevation drawing for 219-221 Market Street.
Al Perri and Robert Kaplan, Owners, and Larry Gardner to present a revised window design for the ground floor front and the east elevations of Musical Fund Hall.
Eliott Rothschild, Architect, to present revised plans for the rehabilitation of the Rubins Furniture Store at the northwest corner of 3rd and Race Streets and three adjoining buildings at 305, 307 and 309 Race Street.
Ronald Knabb, Architect, to present preliminary plans for the rehabilitation of the Provident Bank building at 6th and Spring Garden Streets and the construction of a two-story addition at the west end of the building.
Joel Maruchek, Owner of 2130 Brandywine Street, to request a change in the approved rehabilitation plan for his building.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

219-221 Market, David Beck, Architect. Mr. Beck appeared before the Architectural Committee to present for consideration a revised treatment of the front facade of 219-221 Market Street. The Historical Commission and its Architectural Committee had reviewed and approved plans at previous meetings calling for the construction of a one and two-story addition to the existing buildings executed in a contemporary manner.

Owing to the owner's interest in granting a facade easement on the buildings to the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation, a change in the treatment of the elevations was made. The Corporation had requested that the new construction above the existing fabric continue the original cast-iron design in scale, proportion and detail.

SUBMISSIONS (Cont'd)

The Architectural Committee reviewed Mr. Beck's revised elevation drawing and expressed considerable concern over the proposed duplication of the buildings' original details on the new additions. Since the buildings both originally stood five stories high, the new, proposed (four-story) treatment cannot be considered a restoration. Indeed, it was the opinion of the Committee that the new additions be clearly contemporary yet suitably compatible with the original character of the building.

The Committee recommended that the architect maintain the scale and proportion of his revised design but that he stylize rather than duplicate the buildings' ornate details. Such a treatment would be in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation and should meet the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation's criteria for acceptance of a facade easement. The staff agreed to discuss the Committee's concerns with the Corporation and to notify Mr. Beck of a final determination on this matter.

Musical Fund Hall, 808 Locust Street, Hugh Zimmers, Architect.
Al Perri and Robert Kaplan, Owners, and Larry Gardner discussed with the Architectural Committee a revised window design for the east elevation and for the ground floor front of Musical Fund Hall.

Owing to the proposed installation of double-glazed sash on the ground floor of the Hutton facade, the Architectural Committee was asked to consider a revised design. Because of the weight of the glass and consequent unmanageability, Mr. Perri proposed the use of a fixed, six-light sash within the ground floor openings of the Hutton front. Following some discussion of the matter, the Committee resolved that the double-hung, wood sash should be restored and that storm sash should be installed on the interior to provide adequate insulation. The applicants agreed to comply with the Committee's recommendation on this matter.

On the east elevation, the Architectural Committee agreed to approve the new design to replace the previously approved, large, double-hung, wood window sash at the ground-floor level if it is acceptable to the National Park Service. The new sash design calls for a casement window with 16 lights of glass. It was agreed that some compromise solution could be reached whereby the original size of the window openings would be preserved and a workable sash design achieved.

At the suggestion of the project architect, a meeting with Russ Milnor, Herbert Levy, a member of the Commission staff and other interested persons was scheduled for 1:30 P. M. on Tuesday, 24 November 1981, at 808 Locust to discuss and resolve additional issues concerning the building's rehabilitation.

SUBMISSIONS (Cont'd)

301-09 Race Street (Northwest corner of 3rd and Race Streets), Elliott Rothschild, Architect. The Architectural Committee again reviewed plans for the rehabilitation of the Rubins Furniture Store at the northwest corner of 3rd and Race Streets and three adjoining buildings at 305, 307 and 309 Race Street.

On the rear elevation of the complex, the Architectural Committee approved the retention and restoration of all existing brick fabric and the use of stucco at the court level and on surfaces previously plastered. Two different shades of stucco will be employed.

On the north elevation, the architect explained his intention to install new, industrial-type sash with operable end panels. Following considerable discussion, the Committee agreed to recommend an approval of the architect's proposed treatment of this elevation, in concept, including the use of blue-glazed sections within the sash. The Committee was concerned, however, with the design of the operable side panels which breaks the rhythm of the muntin pattern. Using a projected sash or a hopper, the Committee asked that the sash be redesigned to retain a consistent, multi-light pattern along the elevation.

Finally, the proposed treatment of the facades of 305, 307 and 309 Race Street was determined to be acceptable.

Mr. Rothschild discussed further with the Committee members a potential change in use on the ground floor of the old Rubins Store. If rehabilitated as residential rather than commercial space, changes to the ground floor elevations would be required. Air and light requirements, as well as security concerns, would need to be addressed. Mr. Rothschild, in studying this possibility, prepared a preliminary elevation and presented it to the Committee for consideration. Rather than using glass block, as proposed by the architect, to achieve security and still allow light into the building, the Committee suggested large, single sheets of tempered, translucent or spandrel glass within the existing openings. If additional air and light requirements are imposed, the Committee suggested either pivoting the side panels of the openings to supplement the operable transoms or installing a grille below the sill level.

The architect agreed to study the Committee's recommendations and to submit a revised drawing for further review.

Provident Bank, 6th and Spring Garden Streets, Ronald Knabb, Architect. Mr. Knabb presented to the Architectural Committee preliminary plans for renovations to the Furness Bank at 600

SUBMISSIONS (Cont'd)

Spring Garden Street. The bank's new owner, Gordon Ferguson, plans on using the first floor and basement for his own business and leasing the second floor as gallery space.

The plans, as presented, call for the stabilization of the south wall and the construction of a two-story addition on the west end of the building. The Committee asked that the treatment of the openings within the new addition be kept simple. The members recommended using a garage door and entrance doorway encased within a simple, modern frame. The entrance may contain double doors with a transom light above.

Following some discussion of the proposed design, the Committee voted to recommend its approval, in concept.

2130 Brandywine Street, Mr. Joel Maruchek, Owner. Mr. Maruchek appeared before the Architectural Committee to request the elimination of a window at the rear of his property.

After reviewing the interior plan of the structure, the Committee agreed to allow the removal of the window and the closing of the opening. The owner agreed to retain a masonry reveal marking the position of the opening on the wall. The Committee also agreed to allow the owner to stucco the rear portion of the building owing to various shades and quality of brickwork.

Stenton, 18th and Courtland Streets, John Dickey, Architect. Mr. Tyler presented Mr. Dickey's proposal to insulate the roof of Stenton mansion and to install new cedar shingles.

In lieu of blown-in insulation, the Committee recommended installing batts or foam board under the original lath. The members expressed some concern regarding the durability of the shingles if they are affixed directly to the solid sheathing and not permitted to breath. They recommended that the architect consider this potential problem. Perhaps the installation of lath on top of the sheathing could resolve this problem. The members also directed the staff to caution the architect concerning the use of excessive pressure on the original lath and plaster when installation takes place.

PLAQUES

44 South 2nd Street. The Committee reviewed the owner's application for a plaque and determined that the building was not eligible for one at this time. The work undertaken on the property does not conform with the approved plan on file in the Commission office. The details of the shop window and doorway, the pent eave, the brickwork and the shutters are incorrect and unacceptable.

18 November 1981

PLAQUES (Cont'd)

2223 Green Street. The Architectural Committee recommended the issuance of a Certified Restored plaque to 2223 Green Street.

241 Montrose Street. The Committee reviewed the owner's application for a plaque and voted to recommend the approval of a Certified Restored marker to 241 Montrose Street.

243 Pine Street. The Committee members agreed that 243 Pine Street would be eligible for receipt of a Certified Restored plaque as soon as the correct two over two light, double-hung, wood window sash are installed and the exterior shutters are removed.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 P. M.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian