

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

15 May 1985

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute
of Architecture, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National Historic
Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert Levy, A.I.A.
Richard Tyler, Historian
Randal Baron, Executive Secretary
Terry Koob, Clerk-Steno II

Also: Frank Weise, Architect for 225 S. 8th Street
Thomas Farrell, representing 225 S. 8th Street
Richard Cole, Architect for 908-910 Spruce Street
Robert Cotter, owner of 1531 N. 16th Street
Paul Frazee, H2L2, Architects for Germantown Academy Site, Pennsylvania School
for the Deaf
Barry Eisworth, H2L2, Architects for Germantown Academy Site, Pennsylvania
School for the Deaf
John Season, Pennsylvania School for the Deaf
Edward Venzie, Pennsylvania School for the Deaf
Jim Hemmerly, owner of 422 S. Camac Street
James Macallister, Architect for 2238-2240 Mount Vernon Street
and others

ALTERATIONS

225 S. 8th Street, Frank Weise, Architect. Mr. Weise presented plans to the Architectural Committee for alterations to the Reynolds-Morris House at 225 S. 8th Street. Mr. Weise explained that the premises was to be converted to business offices and that the interior would remain largely unchanged. The owners of the building plan to create a new main entrance through an existing courtyard on the north side of the building. The plans called for a two-story columned portico surmounted by a pediment extending to the third floor on the north wall and a one-story bay on the south side of the building. Additionally, plans were presented to rebuild the single story garage at the rear of the property into a three-story office structure.

The Architectural Committee rejected the plans for the elaborate portico on the grounds that it was imitative in style, creating a false idea of the historical look of the house, and that its enormous scale dwarfed the detail on the main facade of the building. Suggestions were made by the Committee that Mr. Weise restudy the problem and come up with a design that is clearly contemporary though respectful of and complimentary to the

original design of the house. Additionally, it was recommended that the south side of the building might be a more gracious entrance way to the building because it faces on the garden. The Committee requested that H.A.B.S. quality photographs and negatives of the areas to be altered be submitted to the Historical Commission before any changes are made to the building. It was also requested that any original windows and frames being removed be stored on the premises.

The Architectural Committee unanimously requested that drawings be resubmitted utilizing its suggestion to come up with a more appropriate design for the proposed entranceway.

908-910 Spruce Street, Richard M. Cole & Associates, Architects. Mr. Cole presented plans for the restoration and rehabilitation of 908-910 Spruce Street. These two buildings, brick with marble trim and twin portico entrances, will be converted into twelve apartment units. The Spruce Street facades will be completely restored to their 1830s appearance and the architect plans to retain the integrity of the front parlors on both properties. The two original interior hallway staircases will be restored to their original condition.

The roof of 908 Spruce Street, which was completely destroyed by fire, will be rebuilt with the exception of removal of an existing chimney which the architect stated was not part of the original construction. New shutters are being modelled on the originals. The collapsed rear wall of 908 Spruce Street will be rebuilt using either brick or concrete block covered with stucco.

The Architectural Committee agreed to request that the plans for the restoration of these two structures be approved by the Historical Commission with the exception of the chimney removal for which they would give their recommendation after an inspection of the buildings to ascertain if the chimney in fact was part of the original construction.

Subsequent to the meeting, Mr. Levy inspected the property and reported that the chimney on the party wall between 908 and 910 Spruce Street should be rebuilt to match in size and height the chimneys that exist on all party walls of that row and should be built of brick and not stucco.

1531 N. 16th Street, Robert Cotter, Owner. Mr. Cotter presented plans for the restoration of the structure at 1531 N. 16th Street. Mr. Cotter explained that the front exterior facade required only painting of the windows since the entire facade including the original doors are still intact.

Mr. Cotter explained that the only changes would be made to the rear of the building where he planned to construct balconies on the second and third floor levels. He planned to enlarge several window openings into doors to lead onto the balconies.

The Architectural Committee unanimously agreed to advise the approval of these plans.

Germantown Academy Site, School House Lane and Greene Street, Barry Eisworth and Paul Frazee of H2L2 Architects. Mr. Eisworth submitted plans to the Architectural Committee for their review for the conversion of the Germantown Academy Site explaining that the north side would remain as previously submitted with the exception of the elimination of three windows because the link got smaller and the windows appeared to be "crowding." Window designs were presented and a sample window was examined by the Committee which they found acceptable.

The plans submitted showed the inclusion of trellises between sections of the windows. Mr. Eisworth explained that the architects would prefer not to have the trellises included in the design but added them because he was under the impression that the Historical Commission wanted them. A vote was taken among the members of the Committee and it was decided by a vote of three to two that the trellises were unnecessary.

The Architectural Committee agreed to ask that the Historical Commission approve the plans for this phase of the restoration of the Germantown Academy Site for use by the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf.

- 422 S. Camac Street, Jim Hemmerly, Owner. Mr. Hemmerly presented his plans to construct an addition on the rear of his c. 1832 house at 422 S. Camac Street and to replace the windows located on the front of the house. The dormer window, which was added approximately twenty years ago, he planned to replace with an arched window of his own design. The window on the first floor Mr. Hemmerly was restoring in wood to its original eight-over-twelve sash configuration.

The Architectural Committee agreed to request that the Commission approve Mr. Hemmerly's plans for the rear addition and window replacements.

- 2238-2240 Mount Vernon Street, James Macallister, Jr., Architect. Mr. Baron presented Mr. Macallister's plans for renovating the property at 2238-2240 Mount Vernon Street which called for rebuilding the storefront on this building that originally included a corner store. The plans also specified that the windows would be replaced with new aluminum frames and sash. Aluminum was also to be used for the capping at the roof line. The building is to be repointed.

The Architectural Committee rejected the design for the shopfront asking that it be resubmitted following either the design of the original shopfront or else coming up with a clearly modern though sympathetic composition. The Committee asked that the windows be replaced as two-over-two wooden sash with real muntins and that the capping also be replaced in wood. Any repointing of the building is to be done using a mortar that matches the original in composition and color. Grey Portland cement should not be used for repointing this building.

- 1922 Spruce Street, David Hollenberg, John Milner Architects. Mr. Hollenberg presented to the Architectural Committee plans for the partial restoration of this nineteenth century house designed by Philadelphia architect, Frank Miles Day. The plans include the rebuilding and restoration of a front bay

which collapsed in late 1983. The restoration includes the rebuilding of the front steps which were destroyed when the stone bay fell on them. The bay and steps are to be rebuilt in cast stone which matches the original exactly in color and design.

The Architectural Committee agreed to approve this restoration plan. Mr. Hollenberg abstained from voting on this matter.

DEMOLITIONS

1220-1222 St. James Street, Sharp's Court, Nicholas L. Gianopulos, Keast & Hood Co., Structural Engineers. Mr. Tyler presented to the Architectural Committee a request from Mr. Gianopulos for permission for partial demolition of four northerly units of Sharp's Court because they have reached a state of deterioration where they are in imminent danger of collapsing. The owner of the property plans to have contemporary units built as replacements.

The Architectural Committee was unanimous in its request to have photographs submitted for their review of the structural condition prior to making a recommendation to the Commission.

PLAQUES

517 Spruce Street, Paul McMahon, Owner. The Committee reviewed the owner's request for a plaque for 517 Spruce Street. Following review of the photograph submitted, the Committee decided that Mr. Bartley would make an on-site inspection of this property to determine its integrity. Subsequent to this meeting, Mr. Bartley visited the building and recommended that it should be given an Altered Plaque if the exterior storm windows are removed. Because of the grillwork door which is of a later period, Mr. Bartley said that the building would be eligible for the Altered Plaque after the removal of the storm windows.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Koob
Clerk-Steno II