

**THE MINUTES OF THE 430th STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
10 June 1998**

**City Council Caucus, Room 401, City Hall
Wayne S. Spilove, Chair**

Present

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair
David Brownlee, Ph.D.
Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Department of Commerce
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission
Carol Lawrence
Shelly Merhige, Office of the City Council President
David Perri, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
Michael Sklaroff, Esq.
Robert Thomas
Scott Wilds, Assistant Director for Housing, Office of Housing
and Community Development
Stephanie Wolf, Ph.D.

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
R. Scott Jacob, Executive Secretary
Elizabeth Harvey, Historic Preservation Planner
Kristin Fetzer, Historic Preservation Planner

Mark Zecca, Esq., Deputy City Solicitor

Also

Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents Association (CCRA)
Judith Eden, CCRA
Mary Anne Hunter, Fair Hill Burial Ground Committee
Craig Klofach, Ueland, Junker and McCauley Architects
Marvin J. Gerstein, Temple University
George Schmidheiser, Temple University
Carl K. Zucker, Esq.
Martin Dorph, Temple University
Patricia Wilson Aden, Preservation Alliance
Kristl Wiernicki, Temple University
Susan Feenan, George Yu Architects
Eric Trainer, George Yu Architects
Patrick O'Bannon, Kise, Straw and Kolodner Architects
Thomas Anderson, Temple University
Dan Peter Kopple, D. P. Kopple and Associates
George Ingram, Temple University
Guillaume Tinlot, Department of Commerce
Valaida Walker, Temple University

Patricia Clifford, Temple University
Edward Arendt, Perks Reutter Architects
George Moore, Temple University
Joanne Phillips, Esq., Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll
Adam Chust, Temple University
Francis Odyniec
Donald Maginley, Preservation Alliance
Gerald Wilkinson
Gerhart Klein
Allison Kelsey, Preservation Alliance
Edward Cunningham
Katherine Wiehagen, Preservation Alliance
Harry Wolf
Robert Cerillo
Randy Coh, Preservation Alliance

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 430th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 10:00 A.M.

Mr. Spilove introduced David Perri, a Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and Inspections, as the new designee for Commissioner Egan.

MINUTES of the 429th Stated of the Philadelphia Historical Commission. Upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the Minutes of the 429th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 13 May 1998, Wayne S. Spilove, Chair.

REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 26 May 1998,
Robert Thomas, Chair.

Mr. Thomas read the Committee's recommendations before discussion of each proposal.

800 Spruce Street, Pennsylvania Hospital
Pennsylvania Hospital, Owner
J. David Grace, Applicant
DATE: c. 1870 - Gate house
PROPOSAL: Door in 8th Street gatehouse

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Sklaroff recused himself owing to his professional association with Pennsylvania Hospital.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal entails replacing an existing paneled door on the east gatehouse of the hospital with a glazed door to match other doors on that building. The hospital plans to use the gatehouse as a valet office. A sheet of plywood currently covers a glass panel in the top half of the door. The hospital does not want to restore this door because the new use of the gatehouse requires a dutch door. Mr. Thomas explained that new use warrants the placement and thickness of the shelf on the bottom leaf of the dutch door. The narrow shelf will jut outward to provide a surface for patrons using the valet service to drop off car keys.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried with nine votes. Mr. Sklaroff recused himself.

1320-1322 Arch Street

Peter Antenucci, Owner

L. Dietrich Adonis, Applicant

DATE: 1904

PROPOSAL: Mural

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of a mural on the stuccoed portion of the wall.

Mr. Thomas explained that the applicant requests permission to paint a mural on the party wall of the former Elks Lodge. The wall faces a parking lot. The theme of the mural will honor the Horticultural Society. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members requested that the applicant limit the mural to the stuccoed portion of the wall in order to retain the "ghost" of the former neighboring building that exists above the stucco line.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2901 Germantown Avenue, Fair Hill Cemetery

Fair Hill Burial Ground Corporation, Owner

Craig Klofach, Architect/Applicant

DATE: c. 1875 - Fence

PROPOSAL: Fence renovation

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal involves rehabilitating portions of the fence around this historic cemetery. Because the management cannot afford to remake the stolen historic portions, they propose to consolidate the surviving historic sections on three sides, and build a new, simplified but sympathetic fence on the fourth side of the block.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

1423 Diamond Street

Jonathan Weiss, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1885

PROPOSAL: Windows in turret

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas described the owner's proposal to install flat windows in the corner turret rather than exceed his budget to purchase curved windows. Although the turret windows do not currently exist, the designation photo shows flat windows.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

225 South 3rd Street, Old St. Paul's Church

Episcopal Community Services, Owner

J. William Cornell, Contractor/Applicant

DATE: 1746

PROPOSAL: Handicap accessible door

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of the single door, centered, with raised trim panels.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for converting a pair of double doors on the side of the church to a single door to provide handicap accessibility. A wall partially hides this entrance from the street. The existing doors date from 1987. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members asked the applicant to install raised trim panels on the centered door.

Mr. Thomas made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation, with staff to review and approve details. Mr.

Wilds seconded the motion which carried with eight votes.

161 North 3rd Street

Linda Hwang, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1840

PROPOSAL: Painted wall sign and rail

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of a painted sign on the side of the building, a ramp with a simple pipe-style or rectangular rail without inner balusters, and a board sign to replace the existing sign at the first-floor cornice, with staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Thomas explained that the applicant seeks approval to paint a sign on the side facade and to install a railing on a handicap ramp. He stated that Committee members asked the applicant to install a simple pipe-style or square section rail without inner balusters. Mr. Baron stated that the owner repainted the side wall without the Historical Commission's approval. Commission members asked that the applicant return to the Commission to legalize that work.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

858 South Front Street

Albert and Judy Plasket, Owners

Lawrence Gilbert, Architect/Applicant

DATE: c. 1850

PROPOSAL: Rear dormer

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas stated that the Committee and Commission reviewed an earlier proposal for this property, which was denied. The applicant has returned with a new proposal that reflects the Commission's recommendations. This proposal entails installing a dormer in the rear roof to provide access to a new rear deck.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

220 West Rittenhouse Square Street

220 West Rittenhouse Square Association, Owner
Terry Graboyes and Suzanne Myers, Applicants
DATE: 1958
PROPOSAL: New aluminum windows throughout building

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval, with staff to approve details, stipulating that all future window replacements on this building match the pattern of this submission.

Mr. Thomas described the proposal to replace all of the remaining original windows in this eighteen-story building. A previous renovation replaced about one third of the windows with aluminum with much wider sight lines. The applicant designed the proposed windows to resemble the existing, original windows in color and basic design, but the sight lines fall in between the originals and the older replacements.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion which carried with nine votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

1700-1708 Spruce Street, Tenth Street Presbyterian Church

Tenth Presbyterian Church, Owner
Matthew White, Applicant
DATE: 1859
PROPOSAL: Rooftop HVAC and vents

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval, with staff to review and approve the color of the units and vents.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for the installation of HVAC units and ducts on the roof of the church and ancillary buildings. He stated that Committee members did not object to the proposal, but requested that staff approve the color of the units and vents.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

315 South 16th Street

Stephen Mione, Owner/Applicant
DATE: c. 1840
PROPOSAL: Door replacement

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of a new door with six raised panels, with staff to approve details.

Mr. Thomas explained that the applicant would like to replace his front door. The existing, perhaps original, door has two lower panels and an upper pane of glass covered with an ironwork grill dating from a late nineteenth century alteration.

Mr. Thomas stated that the Committee recommended approval of the proposed door owing to lack of definitive documentation. Mr. Brownlee objected to removing a possibly original front door.

Mr. Bumb made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion which carried with nine votes. Mr. Brownlee dissented.

220 West Rittenhouse Square Street

220 West Rittenhouse Square Association, Owner

Edward Arendt, Architect/Applicant

DATE: 1958

PROPOSAL: Cut louver into wall

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas described the proposal to cut a vent in the secondary west facade. This will allow the library to have its own HVAC system, as requested by the building's condominium association.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Temple University

1820-1830 Park Mall

1938-1948 Park Mall, Park Avenue M. E. Church/Thomas Hall

Temple University, Owner

George Schmidheiser, Applicant

DATE: 1872 - Rowhouses; 1886 - Thomas Hall

PROPOSAL: Demolition of seven buildings

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approve the demolition proposal in the public interest, conditioned upon HABS photographic recordation, certification by the Chief Financial Officer of Temple University that Temple has the funds to build the new structure, and the issuance of a building permit for the new construction. Mr. Levy seconded the motion which carried

with four votes. Mr. McCoubrey dissented. Ms. Pentz recused herself.

Mr. Sklaroff recused himself from the discussion and vote owing to his law firm's association with the University.

Mr. Thomas read the report of the Architectural Committee regarding the proposed demolition of Thomas Hall and six Rowhouses in the 1800 block of Park Mall. Ms. Kaplan requested more information regarding the history of Thomas Hall. Mr. Brownlee explained that Hazelhurst and Huckel designed the earlier part of the building in 1886 for the Park Avenue Methodist Episcopal Church, and cited it as an important example of Gothic Revival architecture. He added that the church constitutes an integral part of the Park Avenue Historic District, in that the intent of that district was to preserve the mixture of residential and religious structures that developed in that section of the city.

Martin Dorph, Vice President, Chief Financial Officer and Treasurer of Temple University, explained that the University now seeks permission to demolish Thomas Hall and the rowhouses at 1820-1830 Park Mall owing to financial hardship considerations, not in the public interest as recorded in the Architectural Committee report: however, the University preserves its right to seek demolition in the public interest. Mr. Tyler recommended the Commission send the issue to the Financial Hardship Committee and to schedule a special meeting of the Historical Commission.

Donald Maginley, President of the Preservation Alliance, stated that the Alliance has worked with Temple University in the interest of preserving the Baptist Temple. He stated that the Preservation Alliance supports the demolition of Thomas Hall if it will help facilitate the rehabilitation and reuse of the Baptist Temple. Patricia Wilson Aden of the Preservation Alliance asked the Commission to approve demolition only under financial hardship considerations, and not in the public interest. She also asked for a firm commitment by Temple to seek the preservation of the Baptist Temple.

Gerhart Klein, Gerald Wilkinson, Francis Odyniec, Edward Cunningham and Robert Cirillo urged the Commission not to approve the demolition of Thomas Hall, and asked Temple University to examine new uses for the historic church. Mr. Wilkinson informed the Commission of several aspects of the building's history, including its importance as the long-time home of WRTI, one of the nation's first University/student-run radio stations. Mr. Odyniec suggested that Thomas Hall could house a communications museum. Mr. Cunningham asked Temple to follow the model of

universities like Oxford and Cambridge and find new uses for old buildings.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to refer the matter to the Financial Hardship Committee, and to schedule a special meeting of the Historical Commission. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried with nine votes. Mr. Sklaroff recused himself.

140 South Broad Street, Union League, rear building

Union League, Owner
Dan Peter Kopple, Architect/Applicant
DATE: 1910 - Rear addition
PROPOSAL: Cut down window into door

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal entails converting a large ground-floor window into a door to provide a necessary second means of egress. The new door will follow the panel pattern of a door further east on this facade.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried with nine votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

1829 Pine Street

Michael Carosella, Owner/Contractor/Applicant
DATE: c. 1850
PROPOSAL: Brick veneer on first floor facade

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas described the proposal to reinforce the first floor facade with a four-inch thick brick veneer. He explained that removing such a large amount of damaged facing material on the first floor to restore the facade may cause structural weakness and jeopardize the rest of the newly restored facade. The specially made bricks will match the rest of the restored facade.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The Report of the Historical Commission Staff

May 1998, Richard Tyler

Mr. Tyler stated that the offices of the Commission staff will move on 15 June 1998 to One Parkway, 13th Floor, 1515 Arch Street. He acknowledged the staff for their hard work in preparing for the move, and thanked Laura Spina in particular for her efforts as move coordinator.

Mr. Spilove suggested the Commission form a special Committee and appoint a Chair at the July Commission Meeting to deal with the issue of improving the system of notifying property owners of their building's historically designated status.

Old Business

University Avenue Bridge

Pennsylvania Department of Transportation, Owner

Michael Cuddy, Applicant

DATE: 1927-1929

PROPOSAL: Non-functional pin plates

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

The Committee reviewed details of the non-functional pin plates it recommended the applicant install at the April Committee meeting to evoke the appearance of the historic configuration. Commission members did not object to the proposal.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Mr. Wilds moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Lawrence seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 11:50 A.M.

Respectfully submitted,

R. Scott Jacob
Executive Secretary