

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
COMMITTEE ON CERTIFICATION
MINUTES

6 October 1980

Present: Edward Pinkowski, Chairman of the Committee on Certification and
Member, Philadelphia Historical Commission
Janet S. Klein, Vice-Chairman, Philadelphia Historical Commission
John O. Higgins, Chief, Area Planning Division, City Planning
Commission
James E. McNay, Director, Historical Society of Pennsylvania

Richard Tyler, Historian
Jefferson M. Monk, Research Historian

Although he did not attend the 6 October meeting, Mr. Hyman Myers
reported to Mr. Monk his votes and comments on each nomination.

The sixth meeting of the Committee on Certification met at 2:30 p.m.
on Monday, 6 October 1980, in Room 1313 City Hall Annex.

OLD BUSINESS

1115-1111 Market Street - Reading Terminal

On 30 June 1980, the Commission received a reply to its letter
to the Reading Company dated 28 May 1980 informing them that the
Terminal had been considered for certification. The Reading Company
refused the designation stating that "the modest benefits bestowed
by the Philadelphia Historical Commission's certification are not
justified by the accompanying restrictions and limitations on use
and rehabilitation of the complex". The Commission, at its October
meeting, referred the letter to the Committee on Certification which
voted unanimously to authorize the Historian to begin negotiations
with Market Street East Corporation and others enlisting their
support in persuading the Reading Company to accept certification
of the Terminal.

313 Chestnut Street

At the 14 July meeting of the Committee on Certification, the
members voted unanimously to decertify this 1953 structure standing
in the Old City National Historical District. When the matter came
to the Commission in August, the Architectural Advisor pointed out
that this building actually stood not as a separate building but as
an addition to 315 Chestnut Street, the First National Bank Building.
Alterations to the latter building resulted in 313 Chestnut serving
as the entrance to both buildings. The Committee voted 4 - 1, with
Mr. Myers opposed, to reverse its previous vote and recommend ratifi-
cation of this Old City structure as a means of preserving the First
National Bank.

NEW BUSINESS

1222-1226 Arch Street - A. J. Holman & Company Building

A. J. Holman & Company, founded in 1872, traces its heritage back to the publishing firm of Solomon Conrad in 1801. Founded principally for Bible publishing, the company won an award at the Centennial Exhibition. In 1881, increasing business loads dictated a larger facility and, to this end, the firm hired Wilson Brothers & Company to design the five story brick building presently occupying the lot at 1222-1226 Arch Street. Although the building has passed through several owners, it stands basically unaltered except for the store fronts within the original ground floor framework.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 1222-1226 Arch Street - the A. J. Holman & Company Building.

1420-1422 Chestnut Street - American Baptist Publication Society Building (Cruzer Building)

Designed by Frank Miles Day & Brother and constructed in 1896-1897, the nine-story Cruzer Building stands as one of the chief surviving examples of Day's center-city work. It illustrated the development of the tall building in Philadelphia. It is the facade, particularly the top, which attracts attention, setting in motion the course of Philadelphia skyscraper design that relied on rich historical embellishment at the base and top which prevailed for the ensuing thirty years. The original base arcade was replaced by a single marble revestment more in keeping with post-World War II tastes but the principal elements of the Chestnut Street facade remain intact.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 1420-1422 Chestnut Street - the American Baptist Publication Society Building.

2030-2050 Christian Street - Church of the Holy Apostles

Church Building; Sunday School Building; Phillips Brooks Memorial Guild House, George C. Thomas Tower & Richard Newton Memorial Sunday School Building.

The Church of the Holy Apostles began in 1867 with a meeting between church leaders of the Church of the Holy Redeemer and the Church of the Mediator to discuss the possibility of locating a parish in what then represented the southwesterly part of the city. The new vestry commissioned Fraser, Furness & Hewitt to design the structure. The church building, as altered later by the tower designed by G. W. & W. D. Hewitt, represents the only known surviving work of the firm of Fraser, Furness & Hewitt. The Parish of the Holy Apostles remains a strong force in the Episcopal community and now occupies an edifice at 51st & Spruce Streets. While located at 21st & Christian Streets, their complex grew to include the original Sunday School Building (Furness & Hewitt; 1871-1872), the Phillips Brooks Memorial Guild House (probably G. W. & W. D. Hewitt; 1893) and the Richard Newton Memorial Sunday School Building (Dahring, Orie & Ziegler; 1902-1903).

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 2030-2050 Christian Street - the Church of the Holy Apostles complex which includes the church building, the Sunday School Building, the Phillips Brooks Memorial Guild House and the Richard Newton Memorial Sunday School Building.

Civic Center Boulevard & 34th Street - Museum of the Philadelphia Civic Center
 Built specifically as a permanent home for the Commercial Museum of Philadelphia, this 1899 structure designed by G.W. & W.D. Hewitt originally served as the north pavilion of the National Export Exposition of 1899, considered by many to be the major impetus for foreign trade in the United States. Many alterations have befallen it, including exterior work on its north, east and west elevations designed by Wilson Brothers & Company and interior work by Edward Stone and Thalheimer & Wertz. Although the latter alterations in 1956 thoroughly destroyed the original interior space, the building does remain the sole surviving building of the 1899 Exposition in its basic design.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of the Museum of the Philadelphia Civic Center located at Civic Center Boulevard and 34th Street.

2019 Diamond Street - Union Methodist Episcopal Church
 Union Methodist Church records the northward move of 19th Century Philadelphia. It served as the home of a Methodist parish, formerly located near 4th and Arch Streets, in the midst of the new residential sections of the city. Harkness & Harkness designed the building in 1888-1889 which forms part of the Victorian streetscape along Diamond Street which also boasts such architectural treasures as the row of houses designed by Furness in the 1400 block and the Church of the Advocate at 18th Street.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 2019 Diamond Street - Union Methodist Episcopal Church.

1221-1223 Locust Street - Princeton Club
 Furness, Brown & Company designed 1219-1221 Locust Street in 1891 as part of a unique streetscape developed by the Real Estate Investment Corporation. This corporation replaced the earlier 19th Century brick and frame structures with "an eye to better improvement of that locality". Other structures on the block were designed by Furness, Day, Landley Johnson and other architects of the First rank in Philadelphia. Johnson designed the building at 1223 Locust Street. Although many of the structures along the 1200 and 1300 blocks of Locust Street are gone, 1221-1223 does reflect the idea proposed by the development group. The Princeton Club acquired 1223 in 1915 and 1221 in 1919 and commissioned William W. Fetter to combine the properties and make the suitable interior changes.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 1221-1223 Locust Street - the Princeton Club.

627 St. Georges' Road - Violet Oakley Studio
 The Violet Oakley Studio, built c. 1811 and remodeled extensively by Frank Miles Day and Charles E. Klauder in 1905, served as the location from which Violet Oakley did some of her most notable work including a frieze in the Governor's Reception Room in the Pennsylvania State Capitol and the painting "The Constitutional Convention". It presently serves as a memorial to Violet Oakley. It was placed on the National Register on 13 September 1977.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 627 St. Georges' Road - the Violet Oakley Studio.

621-622 Kingshickon Avenue - Alfred Grease Public School

This one-story stone schoolhouse remains one of the few surviving school buildings in Philadelphia of its vintage. Built in 1871-1875 from the designs of James C. Sidney as modified by Louis Scholer, this building served the residents surrounding the old Rittenhouse mill on Kingshickon Creek. The School District of Philadelphia utilized the building until 1958 when they sold it to the Christian School Association of Germantown, now the Philadelphia Association of Christian Schools, under whose auspices the building remains in use as a school.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 621-622 Kingshickon Avenue - the Alfred Grease Public School.

251 S. 22nd Street - Bishop Mackay-Smith House

Constructed in 1903-1904, from the designs of Theophilus Parsons Chandler, this 3½ story brick dwelling served as the home of the Right Reverend Alexander Mackay-Smith, Bishop Co-adjutor of the Diocese of the Protestant Episcopal Church of Pennsylvania. It stands as an integral part of the Rittenhouse neighborhood. It remains as one of Chandler's few townhouses. Inclusion on the National Register occurred in the early part of 1980.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 251 S. 22nd Street - the Bishop Mackay-Smith House. Mr. Myers suggested that the form be rewritten to tone down many of the superlatives used by the authors.

OLD CITY NATIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT

In its continuing effort to certify buildings in the Old City National Historical District legally, the staff presented several structures for the Committee's review. These buildings, added to the list in 1972 as part of a district designation, were not certified as prescribed by the Commission's ordinance. As a result, the staff continues to review these buildings entered on the list in 1972 and prepare individual nominations for the Committee's consideration.

27-29 N. 3rd Street

Erected for the use of the Manufacturers National Bank, this Renaissance Revival structure with a stone facade sits on a partially raised basement. Little alteration to the facade has occurred with the exception of the south. The name of the bank is engraved into the wall beneath the cornice. The Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS) recorded this building in 1975.

The Committee unanimously recommended the ratification of 27-29 N. 3rd Street.

33 N. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1850, this five-story, three-bay structure originally contained a brownstone front which has been covered with stucco. In 1852, the building, then numbered 29 N. 3rd Street, served as the home of Fritz, Williams & Hendry, carriage manufacturers and carriers. The basic building openings remain unchanged including the four-part transoms over all ground floor bays. HABS record was created in 1975.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 33 N. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

41 E. 3rd Street

Erected 1853, this Italianate four-story, three-bay commercial building clearly represents the character of the Old City. It boasts a full cast-iron front with decorative panels above the 2nd, 3rd & 4th floors and corbel tables above the 2nd and 4th levels. The ground floor openings have been extensively altered but the cast-iron piers & entablature remain. An HABS record exists for this building.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 41 E. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

43 E. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1850, this four-story, three-bay brick structure contains four brownstone piers with capitals supporting a plain entablature on the ground and 2nd floor. Alterations to the ground floor have not changed the overall integrity of the structure. The original lintels have been removed. Earlier uses of the building include a grocery store and a paper and paper box retail outlet. An HABS record exists for 43 E. 3rd Street.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 43 E. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

45 E. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1852, marble piers and entablature appear on the first story of this four-story, three-bay, brick building. Clustered columns, highlighting the 2nd story, support entablature. A decorated bracketed cornice appears on top. Early uses of the building include a china store (1866), book store (1866), and a carpet and oil cloth store in 1941. It has been recorded by HABS and stands as a good example of 19th-Century commercial vernacular architecture.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 45 E. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

47 E. 3rd Street

Originally paired with 49 E. 3rd Street, this surviving five-story, three-bay, brick with full cast-iron front, commercial building was erected c. 1854, probably from the designs of Joseph C. Horne. Exhibiting many of the characteristics of cast-iron architecture, 47 E. 3rd Street has been recorded by HABS and constitutes a significant example of cast-iron architecture in Philadelphia.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 47 E. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

51 E. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1850, this five-story, four-bay building contains granite piers on the ground floor and clustered piers on the second level. Filbert Street (now an alleyway) runs through the left bay of the ground floor. This building comprises part of the North 3rd Street streetscape and as such has been recorded by HABS.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 51 E. 3rd Street. Mr. Myers abstained.

53 N. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1850, this five-story, three-bay building, originally similar to 51 N. 3rd Street, underwent alterations by Sauer & Hahn about 1914. The ground floor alterations include a penthouse and removal of the original store front. Alterations on the second floor include an entablature of the type popular in the early 20th Century. Although altered, NARS records exist on this building on account of its significance to the entire streetscape. Early uses of the building included an hardware store in 1873 and A.G. Lippincott & Company, Auctioneers, in 1907.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 53 N. 3rd Street.
Mr. Myers abstained.

55 N. 3rd Street

Erected in the late 1830s, this five-story, three-bay commercial building is one of the oldest buildings on the block. It served as the retail outlet for Wm. H. Horstmann & Sons, manufacturers and importers of military goods and regalia, for over 55 years. The building underwent alterations similar to 53 N. 3rd Street by Sauer & Hahn in 1913-1914. The sash on the upper floors was also changed from 2/2 double-hung to multi-light over one double-hung. NARS has recorded this building.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 55 N. 3rd Street.
Mr. Myers abstained.

57 N. 3rd Street

Erected c. 1855, this five-story, three-bay brick building contains a Gothic brownstone front, keeping in character with the Old City District. The ground floor has been altered with a modern shopfront, otherwise the building stands as originally constructed. A fire escape adorned the facade. Architecturally significant, NARS records exist for this building.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 57 N. 3rd Street.
Mr. Myers abstained.

61-63 N. 3rd Street

Designed by John Riddell in 1852 as the Johnson-Ely Store, this five-story, six-bay building has undergone alterations to the openings but the east-iron facade on the Third Street elevation remains intact. The decorative lintels on the Arch Street elevation also remain. A good 19th-Century commercial corner building and representative of the Old City National Historical District, NARS records exist for 61-63 N. 3rd Street.

The Committee voted 4 - 0 to recommend ratification of 61-63 N. 3rd Street.
Mr. Myers abstained.

Before adjourning the Committee on Certification agreed to schedule its next meeting for Monday, 19 January 1981 at 2:30 p.m. in the Historical Commission office.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jefferson M. Mack
Research Historian