

THE MINUTES OF THE 448th STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
8 December 1999

Room 401, City Hall, City Council Caucus Room
Wayne S. Spilove, Chair

Present

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair

David Brownlee, Ph.D.

Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Department of Commerce

Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property

Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission

Carol Lawrence

Michael Sklaroff, Esq.

Robert Thomas

Dennis Ward III

Scott Wilds, Assistant Director, Office of Housing and Community Development

Caroline Wischmann

Stephanie G. Wolf, Ph.D.

Shelly Merhige, Office of City Council President

Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer

Diane M. Hughes, Executive Secretary

Laura M. Spina, Historic Preservation Planner

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Mark Zecca, Esq., Senior Attorney, City of Philadelphia Law Department

Also

Michael Garz, STV Architects

Jerry Roller, JK Roller Architects

Joseph Pongonis, 626 South Front Street

Dale Frens, Frens and Frens

Michael Hauptman, Brawer and Hauptman

Jay G. Falkenstein, Temple University

Marvin J. Gerstein, Temple University

Kevin B. O'Toole, Temple University

Jack Conroy, 8001 Verree Road

Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents Assoc. / Preservation Alliance

Charles Tonetti, National Park Service, INHP

James Piatt, Piatt Associates

Jonathan Weiss, Templetown Realty

Donald F. Nardy, PWI Engineering

Audrey C. Taichman, 261 South 20th Street

Carl Primavera
Christine Romano, Conroy Catering
Anthony Marfia
Charles R. Mottershead, Capital Programs Office
Theresa Stuhlman, Fairmount Park Commission
Claire Donato, Mark B. Thompson Assoc.
Jerrold Adler, Adler/Myers
William Menke, Menke and Menke
Patricia W. Aden, Preservation Alliance

Wayne Spilove, Chair, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 448th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 9:00 A.M.

MINUTES of the 447th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Ms. Merhige noted that her name was omitted from these minutes. Upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the minutes, as corrected, of the 447th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 10 November 1999, Wayne Spilove, Chair.

REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 30 November 1999, Robert Thomas, Chair.

In the absence of Mr. Thomas, Randy Baron presented the first two submissions.

1425 West Diamond Street

Jonathan Weiss, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1875

PROPOSAL: Repair brownstone facade

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial, but send application to Financial Hardship Committee.

The proposal calls for removing the stucco from the façade and repairing the details that remain in brown stucco to mimic brownstone. Other areas will receive the overall form but not the detail of the original. Reading a letter from the applicant, Mr. Baron gave the costs for the detailed vs. plain stucco treatment. Mr. Brownlee questioned the acceptable amount of simplification. He noted that, though the Committee could not approve the simplified design, if a high enough level of detail remains, there will be no need for the Financial Hardship Committee to review the proposal. It was decided that as long as the ornate door surround, voussoirs and window surround details are kept, it would be approvable. Mr. Weiss, the owner, responded that the shape would stay the same and the same masons would perform the work, as on 1423 W. Diamond Street.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the proposal, with staff to monitor the work and approve details. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

2951 Market Street, 30th Street Station

Amtrak, Owner

Matthew Madeira, Applicant

DATE: 1929-30

PROPOSAL: Louvers; garage doors

The Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

The proposal calls for creating a garage for rental cars inside the north end of 30th Street Station, the least visible of the four facades. This involves installing new roll-down grates for two garage openings and louvers cut into several brick panels between piers on the north façade.

Mr. Wolf made a motion to approve the proposal. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion, which carried with 10 votes. Mr. Wilds and Mr. Sklaroff recused themselves.

Mr. Thomas presented the remaining Architectural Committee recommendations.

259-61 South 20th Street, ne corner at Manning Street

Audrey Claire Taichman, Owner

DATE: c. 1850

PROPOSAL: Ground-floor alterations

Architectural Committee Recommendation:

Approval of:

1. *expanding the storefront, without the proposed cornice and simplified transoms;*
2. *replacing the existing storefronts with accordion fold casement doors, with thin wood frames*

Denial of:

1. *The proposal to continue the historic cornice over the extended storefront.*

All with staff to review and approve details.

The Commission reviewed this proposal at its meeting of 10 November 1999. At that time, the Commission approved the replacement of the existing storefronts with accordion fold casement doors with thin wood frames and with the retention of the transoms. The Commission also denied the proposal to extend the store front along Manning Street pending further evidence of the presence of historic fabric beneath the current stucco finish. The Commission authorized two of its members and the staff to visit the site and examine the wall *sans* plaster. If this revealed the absence of original fabric, the Commission determined that the staff could conduct the review and approval. If, however, evidence of historic openings emerged, the proposed alteration should reflect those openings.

Mr. Thomas described the building as a dwelling converted into a store and reported on the evidence of several openings for doors and windows along the Manning Street elevation. These openings, however, do not coincide with those sought by the applicant.

Mr. Thomas also stated that the new windows would not harm the historic character of the building owing to the changes that had occurred to this façade. Carl Primavera, counsel to the applicant, showed photographs of the interior which had undergone several changes over the years.

Mr. Brownlee, who had participated in the inspection, stated that the record of the nineteenth century appears in the fabric, that the historic openings can serve a modern use, and that the Commission should reject the proposal.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to approve the proposal with no cornice on the storefront windows. Mr. Wilds seconded. The motion carried with 11 votes. Mr. Brownlee dissented.

739 Walnut Street, ne corner at South 8th Street

Steven Singer, Owner

Jerry Roller, Architect / Applicant

DATE: 1927

PROPOSAL: New storefronts and window panels

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of the proposal, with the material for the bases changed to dark stone such as black granite or another dark material, and if feasible, the removed sections of the cast stone reappplied to the new pilasters, with staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Baron stated that the Commission had rejected the proposal at its previous meeting. Owing to the absence of the applicant, the Commission members agreed to re-address the application.

Mr. Roller, architect for the project presented his proposal, which included replacing panels above the windows in 2nd and 3rd floors, removing existing stucco panels and the replacing existing stucco panels above the 1st floor windows with metal ones to conceal new window grates; removing stone window bases, and replacing storefront windows. Mr. Roller noted that the windows were not the original ones.

Mr. Singer, owner, explained that angled windows are better for business, drawing customers into the store. Mr. Wilds expressed concern that such a significant change would set a precedent when a majority of the storefronts have flush windows. Ms. Spina noted that removal of original historic fabric, such as the stone window bases, violates the *Standards*. Mr. Tyler stated that the proposal changes about one-third of the building's façade. Ms. Kaplan observed that the owner has invested a lot of money into the building.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to overturn its previous denial and to accept The Committees' recommendation for approval. Ms. Kaplan seconded the motion, which carried with a vote of 10 to 2. Mr. Brownlee and Mr. Wilds dissented.

1900 – 1938 Park Mall, Temple University

Temple University, Owner

Michael Hauptman and James Piatt, Architects / Applicants

DATE: c. 1870s

PROPOSAL: Final approval for rehabilitation of and additions to rowhouses for offices and commercial spaces

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of:

1. *the end pavilion additions;*
2. *the platforms with ramps and kiosks, with brownstone pavers the dimension of the former steps placed in front of the doorways to remember the steps, with iron basement grates to be restored where the bases will be visible*
3. *legalization of the removal of the front steps*
4. *the retention and restoration of the historic front doors on the end buildings, where the steps are still extant and visible, and the proposed new doors in the other locations, with a four light configuration including a split transom, and in the historic frames.*
5. *The revised inn entrance, with a narrower entrance canopy centered over the door.*
6. *The front awnings, stepped to match the elevations of the row houses and in a canvas material;*
7. *The rooftop mechanicals; and*
8. *The rear in-fills, with vinyl windows*

All with staff to review and approve details

Jay Faulkenstein, Facilities management, described the project as a whole. Mr. Faulkenstein noted that Temple, by mistake, removed the historic steps. To mitigate the loss, the proposal now includes wood windows in the rear of the rowhouses instead of the originally proposed vinyl. Mr. Brownlee questioned the design of display cases, railings and terrace paving. Michael Hauptman described the proposal in detail. One change included sign pylons instead of kiosks. Individual signs will come to Committee and Commission.

Mr. Wilds offered a motion to approve the proposal, including the change of doors, rear windows and removal of the steps, with staff to approve details and inspect work. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

136 South 20th Street

Jerold Batoff, Esq., Applicant

DATE: 1928

PROPOSAL: Install ATM in storefront

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial of the proposal.

The owner wishes to install an ATM machine in an historic storefront on 20th Street.

Mr. Wilds moved the rejection of the proposal. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

3900 Woodland Avenue, Woodlands Mansion

Woodlands Cemetery Company, Owner

Dale Frens, Architect/Applicant

DATE: c. 1742 expanded/embellished c. 1785-1810

PROPOSAL: New railing and steps

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with staff to review details.

This proposal for a new staircase on the side of the porch returns to the Committee with some modifications. A center stair would run into an existing driveway, violating the Building Code. The proposal now calls for symmetrical stairs at the sides of the porch and a metal railing between the columns.

Mr. Wilds moved the approval of the proposal. Mr. Ward seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

125 North 11th Street

Robert Weinstein, Owner

Anthony Marinucci, Contractor/Applicant

DATE: 1888

PROPOSAL: Install vinyl windows

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial of the existing vinyl windows and denial of the application to install the other vinyl windows and aluminum panning.

Mr. Baron stated that the owner, without a permit, installed vinyl windows on the 2nd floor. The owner now wishes to legalize those windows and replace the remaining wood two-over-two windows with vinyl windows with snap-in nine-over-nine muntins. Mr. Tyler noted that the application violates Standards 5 and 6.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to approve the Committee's recommendation, and deny the proposal. Mr. Ward seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

8101 Veree Road, Knowlton Estate Caretaker's Cottage

John Conroy, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1880

PROPOSAL: Large addition to caretaker's cottage

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of the building plan, but denial of the roof scheme as proposed. The Committee suggested that the applicant return with a differently scaled roof and a roof material different from slate.

The owner, without a permit or Historical Commission approval, began constructing a large addition to the gatekeeper's house at Knowlton. The Department of Licenses and Inspections issued a stop-work order.

The Applicant has since submitted new drawings that reflect the Committee's request for a lower pitched roof, with material other than slate.

Mr. Ward made motion to approve the revised proposal. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

2100 Green Street

Charles McHugh, Owner/Applicant

DATE: 1885

PROPOSAL: New rear wall, garage and deck

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with staff to review details.

The proposal included the demolition of a cinder block rear wall and construction of a new wall of wood and stucco, a garage with a paneled roll-down door and a deck.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to approve the proposal with staff to review details. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

626 South Front Street

Joseph Pongonis, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1760-75

PROPOSAL: Legalize vinyl window

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial.

Mr. Thomas explained that Mr. Pongonis sold the building, but held the mortgage. The new owners changed the sash and installed aluminum paning on the frames without a permit. The Department of Licenses and Inspections issued a violation. Mr. Pongonis repossessed the building with the violation and wishes to legalize the windows.

Mr. Brownlee concurred that this is a rare building because of its age and form. Ms. Wolf stated that the windows form a significant feature of the building.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to reject the proposal and Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion, which was carried unanimously.

Fairmount Water Works

City of Philadelphia, Owner

Claire Donato and Mark Thompson, Architects/Applicants

DATE: 1820s -1870s- Water Works

1920s and 1998 – Museum and Lloyd Hall sites

PROPOSAL: Site rehabilitation

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval as proposed and voted to recommend approval of moving the recreation trail, using the proposed materials, if the Fairmount Park Commission wishes to do so.

Mr. Thomas explained two proposals, one for landscaping around the Waterworks, Art Museum and Lloyd Hall and one for the Cliffside restoration. The first proposal simply clarifies the materials and details of the parking and path proposal already approved by the Commission. The second proposal reestablishes paths and landscape elements on the

hillside of the former reservoir.

Mr. Bumb moved the approval of the proposal. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

Tomb of the Unknown Soldier, Washington Square

City of Philadelphia, Owner

John Carr, Fairmount Park Preservation Trust, Applicant

DATE: c. 1957

PROPOSAL: Replacement of the monument in granite

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of the stabilization and approval of the partial replacement in limestone, if necessary.

Mr. Wilds questioned a hybrid replacement, because in the long term the monument will look repaired. Ms. Lawrence stated that the Department of Public Art should also review the proposal. Mr. Brownlee noted that the *Standards* do not allow replacement in granite. Mr. Thomas expressed that respect to the monument may outweigh the *Standards* on materials.

Mr. Tonetti, Independence National Historical Park, stated that the Park Services determined that replacement of the monument in granite violates Standards 2 and 6.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation for approval of stabilization or partial replacement in limestone with staff to approve the details. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

27-29 Bank Street

Allen Cohen, Owner

Neil Rosenberg, Applicant

DATE: c. 1830

PROPOSAL: Replace fire escape

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval, with the fire-escape painted black or an appropriate dark color.

The owner wishes to replace the existing fire-escape with a new one. The extant fire-escape does not meet code requirements, and the building must have a second means of egress.

Ms. Merhige moved to accept the Committee's recommendation for approval with black or a dark color paint. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which was carried unanimously.

1900 Walnut Street, Church of the Holy Trinity

Church of the Holy Trinity, Owner

Donald Nardy, Applicant

DATE: c. 1857 - 59, tower - 1868

PROPOSAL: Façade lighting

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The church wishes to light its façade at night. The proposal has two aspects: light fixtures at the top of the tower to highlight the tower's details and light fixtures on poles at the curb to illuminate the rest of the façade.

Mr. Wilds moved to approve the proposal. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

1105 Spruce Street

Leroy Kean and Jerrold Adler, Owners/Applicants

DATE: 1889

PROPOSAL: Legalize windows

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial

The windows of this building had nine-over-three windows on the second floor, unique nine-light upper sash and a single-light lower sash on the third floor, and four-over-four sash in the dormer. An owner replaced these windows with aluminum one-over-one windows, without a permit or Historical Commission approval.

Ms. Merhige moved to accept the Committee's recommendation to reject the proposal. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

- -

THE REPORT on the Activities of the Historical Commission Staff, November 1999

Mr. Brownlee questioned the status of Spruce Hill District. Mr. Tyler replied that districts come before the Commission in the order in which the completed documentation is received.

Mr. Wilds thanked Mr. Spilove and commended the Commission, for their work over the past eight years.

Mr. Zecca proposed to the chairman the creation of a Committee to discuss the issue of Standards.

Mr. Ward made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 12:15 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,
Diane M. Hughes
Executive Secretary