

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

13 August 1987

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect,
Independence National Historical Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.

Mark MacQueen, Chief Assistant City Solicitor,
Law Department
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic
Preservation Officer
Merrie Winston, Historical Architect
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I

Also: William Morris, Architect, and Paul Riddle to
present a proposal for construction of a two-
story stair tower on the northeast elevation
of the Hygeia Building of Friends Hospital.
Sabrina Soong, Architect, to present proposals
for modifications to 313 Market Street and
1010 Race Street.
Steve Pinto and Larry Kaplowitz, Applicants, to
present a proposal for extensive alterations
to a garage on the grounds of 999 E. Haines
Street.
Charles Obey, Harold Ash, Pernell Jackson,
Spencer Coxe, Russell Brown and Mark Reinberger,
representing the Awbury Arboretum Neighbors
Association, to express opposition to the
proposal for 999 E. Haines Street.
John Rosenthal, Owner, to present a proposal to
construct an addition atop the mansard roof at
2030 Race Street.
Martin Jay Rosenblum, Architect, to present a
proposal for a complete restoration to a porch
and repairs to the building's porte-corchere at
the Francis Cope House, Awbury Arboretum.
Tony James and Larry Goldfarb of Goldner, Goldfarb,
Kline & Associates to present a preliminary
proposal for substantial rehabilitation to
1113-1125 Pine Street.
J.D. and P.J. Reily, Owners, to present a proposal
for restoration at 227 Fitzwater Street.

Ervin Davis, Edward McGoochan and John Murphy to present a proposal for window replacement on all principal facades of the Family Court Building at 1801 Vine Street.

Will Agate and David Snyder to present a proposal for alterations and cleaing to the Land Title Building located at 100 S. Broad Street.

Donna Harris, Phialdelphia Historic Preservation Corporation, for the Land Title Building submission.

George Thomas of the Clio Group and David Marohn of Venturi, Rauch and Scott Brown, Inc. to present a proposal for interior renovations to the Furness Library at the University of Pennsylvania.

Mary Lou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia.

And others.

ALTERATIONS

Friends Hospital, William Morris, Architect, and Paul Riddle of Friends Hospital. The applicants appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the construction of a two-story stair tower on the northeast elevation of the Hygeia Building of Friends Hospital. This proposal will require the closing of several existing masonry openings.

The Committee reviewed the photographs and drawings presented and unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this proposal. Penelope Batcheler abstained.

313 Market Street, Sabrina Soong, Architect. Ms. Soong appeared before the Committee to present a proposal which includes:

1. replacement of an existing modern storefront on the ground floor with a wooden storefront which replicates, with some modification, an early shopfront shown in a 1901 photograph of this building;
2. introduction of a second entrance within the westernmost bay of the new ground floor shopfront;
3. installation of new wooden double-hung window sash on upper floors;
4. repairing and repainting cornice and dormer;
5. replacing existing roof with new asphalt shingle roof; and,

6. repairing existing fire escape doors and transoms.

The Committee reviewed the drawings presented and suggested the following changes:

1. ceramic tile should be used in the storefront transom instead of the stained glass;
2. a standing seam metal roof should be used in keeping with the period of the building instead of the proposed shingle; and,
3. the windows on the upper stories above the ground floor should be two-over-two lights.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this proposal upon submission of a revised elevation containing the suggestions listed above.

1010 Race Street, Sabrina Soong, Architect. Ms. Soong appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for modifications to two existing ground floor entrances and new signage for an existing restaurant use. The proposal includes:

1. modification of two smaller entrances flanking the large central entrance by elimination of the transoms below the spring of each arch;
2. lengthening the height of entrance doors and side lights up to the original transom bar;
3. providing new signage on glass using silver metallic stick-on letters; and,
4. replacement of an existing canvas banner with a new larger canvas banner set in a silver metallic color frame.

The Committee reviewed the proposal and recommended the following changes:

1. the design of the banner should be revised to eliminate the rigid frame to allow movement of the banner; and,
2. the storefront color should be red to match the color scheme of the rest of the building.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this proposal for 1010 Race Street pending receipt of a revised elevation which reflects the changes outlined above.

999 E. Haines Street, Steve Pinto and Larry Kaplowitz, Applicants. Messrs. Pinto and Kaplowitz appeared before the Committee as a result of receiving a "stop work order" from the Department of Licenses and Inspections for work being done without a permit at 999 E. Haines Street. This completed work includes the removal of a hipped roof from a garage on the grounds of 999 E. Haines Street. The applicants propose the installation of a large gable roof structure containing a large Palladian-style window on each gable end. The need for extra storage space was the reason given for this change in roof design. The proposal also includes the enclosure of an existing porte-cochere on the north elevation and the relocation of existing garage doors and the addition of a door and window on the east elevation.

Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that the staff received several letters expressing concern over these proposed alterations with requests that the original design be kept. Members of the Awbury Arboretum Neighbors Association appeared at the meeting to object to the proposed alterations to the building. The neighborhood group also voiced concern over the alleged use of the building. The Committee informed the group that the Historical Commission had no jurisdiction over use and could consider the architectural design of the building only.

The Committee reviewed the proposal as presented and agreed that more information was needed. The Committee requested that photographs be submitted showing the garage prior to the roof being removed. The Committee also requested better photographs of the port-cochere.

Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that David Hollenberg reviewed this proposal prior to the Committee Meeting. He indicated that he would agree to the enclosure of the port-cochere but would object to any alteration of the original hipped roof design.

The Committee agreed to defer its recommendation on this proposal until after a site visit and a review of photographs prior to the start of the illegal work.

2030 Race Street, John Rosenthal, Owner. Mr. Rosenthal appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for the construction of a one-story roof top addition with a new wood and iron railing atop the mansard roof at 2030 Race Street. The proposal also includes high pressure masonry cleaning and patching air-conditioner wall cuts with brick. Mr. Rosenthal stated that bricks from the rear of the building would be used to infill holes cut in the wall for air conditioners.

Mr. Baron explained that this proposal previously was rejected by the Committee owing to the fact that the addition was too large and highly visible. Mr. Baron continued that the present proposal is even larger than the original one.

The Committee reviewed the proposal and recommended that the roof top addition including the railing be placed further to the rear of the building. The HVAC should be placed in front of the stairtower but directly on the roof rather than on the deck. This will allow the HVAC to be lower and less visible. The Committee further asked that more complete drawings be prepared. These should include chimneys and contain a cleaning specification for a low pressure method of cleaning.

Francis Cope House, Awbury Arboretum, Martin Jay Rosenblum, Architect. Mr. Rosenblum appeared before the Committee with a proposal for a complete restoration of an existing and badly deteriorated porch and repairs to the porte-cochere at the Francis Cope House in the Awbury Arboretum. Included in the proposal are the following:

1. repair or replace, where necessary, porch floor and framing members, porch columns and all other porch trim. All replacements shall match existing;
2. install new flat seam terne-coated stainless steel roof; install Velux Model skylights in porch roof;
3. rebuild stone foundations on porch as necessary;
4. rebuild northeast stone pier on porte-cochere and set plumb on new foundations;
5. patch repoint where necessary;
6. paint all wood surfaces; and,
7. repair structural damage on rear wing by installing tie rods and filling and pointing crack in masonry wall.

The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of the proposal for the Francis Cope House as presented.

1113-1125 Pine Street, Tony James and Larry Goldfarb of Goldner, Goldfarb, Kline & Associates appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a preliminary proposal which involves the conversion of an existing building from warehouse to residential use. The plan, as presented, calls for:

1. demolition of an existing three-story 1860's rear addition to the original 1820's building;
2. construction of a new larger Post-Modern addition with under-ground parking;
3. restoration of the 1820's main building and 1860's fire tower;

4. enlargement of the basement window openings in the original building; and,
5. construction of a brick fence with stone capping along the Pine Street elevation.

The Committee reviewed the proposal as presented and agreed to recommend an approval in concept. The architect was advised to consult with the Commission staff concerning the design of the new addition and the preparation of working drawings and details.

227 Fitzwater Street, P.D. and P.J. Reily, Owners. Mr. & Mrs. Reily appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for 227 Fitzwater Street which includes the following:

1. removing existing one-over-one aluminum double-hung windows and installing new six-over-six wooden double hung replacement windows;
2. installing new wooden paneled shutters at the first and second floor window openings and, louvered shutters flanking the third floor windows;
3. removing an existing entrance door and installing a new six paneled wooden door;
4. removing existing brick sills on the third floor and installing new wooden sills; and,
5. pointing, cleaning and restoring all brickwork and scraping and painting cornice, window and door frames to match the original condition of the building.

The Committee reviewed the drawings presented and noted that the proportion of the opening for the entrance door was incorrect. The Committee agreed to recommend approval of this restoration proposal for 227 Fitzwater Street pending receipt of a revised drawing showing the correct proportion for the door opening.

Family Court Building, 1801 Vine Street, John Murphy, Ervin Davis and Edward McGoochan, City of Philadelphia. Messrs. Murphy, Davis and McGoochan appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal to remove existing wooden casement windows on all principal facades and install double-hung aluminum replacement windows with fixed transoms. The proposal also includes repairing existing and, where necessary, installing new security grates to match the existing condition. Also, new double-hung rolled steel windows to match the existing condition will be installed in the inner courtyard of the subject premises only.

The Committee reviewed the proposal and agreed that wooden windows would be preferable to the proposed aluminum replacement windows. The staff will forward to the applicants information on the availability and price of the wooden replacement windows.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval for the proposal for the Family Court Building at 1801 Vine Street pending receipt and approval of a proposal for wood replacement windows. However, the Committee stated that it would allow the replacement with aluminum windows if the wooden replacement windows proved to be too expensive.

Land Title Building, 100 S. Broad Street, Will Agate and David Snyder. Messrs. Agate and Snyder appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for alterations and cleaning of the Land Title Building at 100 S. Broad Street. The Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation holds a facade easement on the Land Title Building and was represented at today's meeting by Donna Harris. The proposal and recommendations on this submission are as follows:

1. Clean building. The Historical Commission staff will inspect the test patch and make a recommendation.
2. Installation of four sconces adjacent to the doors. Historical Commission and Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation staff will inspect. However, the Historical Commission will defer to the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation's decision.
3. Installation of a strip light fixture above the main entrance. The Committee recommended that the light be pulled back away from the edge of the building. The members further recommended that the fixtures be painted out to make it less noticeable.
4. Painting of brass revolving doors with a dark bronze color. The Committee found this to be acceptable.
5. The removal of terrazo tile from the entrance floor and replacement with a metal grate flooring. The Committee found this to be an acceptable alteration.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this proposal for The Land Title Building with the inclusion of the recommendations listed above.

Furness Library, University of Pennsylvania, George Thomas of Clio Group and David Marohn of Venturi, Rauch and Scott Brown,

Architects. Messrs. Thomas and Marohn appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for conceptual approval of Furness Library's Bookstack Renovation. This proposal includes the removal of the existing metal bookstacks and the glass floor. These alterations which will result in a more fire safe building.

The architects presented the findings of a study of similiar libraries with metal stacks and concluded that none of these libraries had found a solution to allow for fire safety and an open bookstack system. The architects also presented photographs of the metal stack structures at the Furness Library and the Committee determined that there was no architectural ornament on these utilitarian stacks.

The Committee agreed to recommend a conceptual approval for removal of the stacks and replacing them with new fire safe and excessible Library floors with shelving. This recommendation was reached owing to the fire safety issue and the lack of architectural interest on these stacks. The Committee also requested a copy of the Section 106, Environmental Impact Statement with accompanying photographs which was prepared for state and federal review.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah