

MINUTES OF THE 271st STATED MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

2 June 1983

F. Otto Haas, Chairman

Present: Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman (Acting Chairman in Mr. Haas' absence)
Edward Pinkowski
Paul Deegan, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Val C. Mogensen, Executive Assistant Director of Finance
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Kenneth Cooper, Deputy City Solicitor, Law Department
Gilda Kremer, Deputy City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Jefferson M. Moak, Executive Secretary

Also: Gardner Cadwalader, architect, to appeal the recommendation of the Architectural Committee concerning 922 Spruce Street.

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 270th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, 5 May 1983, were reviewed and amended to include the list of properties referred by the Commission to the Committee on Certification for its review and a recommendation. This list included those properties whose owners either objected to the certification of their buildings or requested that certification be postponed. They are as follows:

123 S. 22nd Street - Robert Lewis House
125 S. 22nd Street - John C. Bullitt House
127 S. 22nd Street - Stephen Farrelly House
129-131 S. 22nd Street - Travis Cochran House
1707-1709 Arch Street - Philadelphia Tract Society,
Methodist Church Building
2600 N. Lawrence Street - St. Christopher's Hospital
for Children
8238-8240 Ridge Avenue - Sheppard-Griffith House
1917 Walnut Street - Wanamaker-Foerderer House
1701 Walnut Street - Allman Building

Subject to the addition of this list, the Minutes of the 270th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission for 5 May 1983 were approved and directed to be filed.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee for 18 May 1983, Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission. The Report of the Architectural Committee for 18 May 1983 was reviewed and amended. On page 3, the minute concerning 922 Spruce Street was amended to read: "The first, an 1830's restoration, 'removes' the Victorian cornice and dormer and 'restores' six-over-six sash, shutters and a period door. The second alternative calls for the complete restoration of the Victorian alterations, 'keeping the Victorian cornice and dormer, installing' the missing metal window hoods and a turn-of-the-century door."

Subject to these amendments, the Historical Commission approved the Report of the Architectural Committee for 18 May 1983 excluding 922 Spruce Street. The Commission deferred action on 922 Spruce Street until after hearing Mr. Gardner Cadwalader's appeal of the Architectural Committee's recommendation concerning this property.

The Architectural Committee, after a lengthy discussion at its 18 May meeting, recommended that the Historical Commission approve one of two facade treatments for 922 Spruce Street. The first, an 1830's restoration, would require the removal of the Victorian cornice and dormer and the restoration of six-over-six light sash, shutters and a period door. Alternatively, the Committee recommended the complete restoration of the Victorian alterations to the building calling for the retention of the Victorian cornice and dormer, the reproduction of the missing metal window hoods and sills and the installation of a turn-of-the-century door. Mr. Levy explained to the Commission members that the Architectural Committee had previously recommended the approval of a Victorian restoration without requiring replacement of the metal hoods and sills. Since that time, however, a photograph of the building showing the window hoods and sills in place on the facade was found. As a result, the Architectural Committee voted to require the restoration of these Victorian components of the house as shown in the early photograph.

In an appeal to the Commission, Mr. Cadwalader asked that the Historical Commission stand by its previous approval of the rehabilitation specifications and plans for the house which allowed a Victorian rehabilitation sans the hoods and sills. He argued that the replacement of these components would be a costly rehabilitation item.

The Commission members discussed this matter at length and asked Mr. Tyler for his recommendation. The Historian urged

the Commission to accept the recommendation of its Architectural Committee which requires a full Victorian restoration of 922 Spruce Street. Following Mr. Tyler's recommendation, a motion was made, seconded and carried calling for a complete restoration of the facade of 922 Spruce Street to its Victorian character. This shall include the retention of the existing roof dormer, the reproduction of the window hoods and sills, the use of one-over-one window sash and the installation of a proper Victorian door.

The Commission members thanked Mr. Cadwalader for appearing before them to present his case and informed him that he would be notified in writing of the Commission's decision on this matter.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Certification for 17 May 1983,
Edward Pinkowski, Chairman.

Upon the recommendation of the staff, the Historical Commission voted to table each of nine properties listed under Old Business in the Committee's Report for 17 May 1983 where the owners had either objected to the certification of their buildings or requested that certification be postponed. The tabled properties are as follows:

- 123 S. 22nd Street - Robert Lewis House
- 125 S. 22nd Street - John C. Bullitt House
- 127 S. 22nd Street - Stephen Farrelly House
- 129-131 S. 22nd Street - Travis Cochran House
- 1707-1709 Arch Street - Philadelphia Tract Society,
Methodist Church Building
- 2600 N. Lawrence Street - St. Christopher's Hospital
for Children
- 8238-8240 Ridge Avenue - Sheppard-Griffith House
- 1917 Walnut Street - Wanamaker-Foerderer House
- 1701 Walnut Street - Allman Building

The Historical Commission, under Old Business, further considered the ratification of three buildings which presently appear on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places but for which no formal record of certification could be found. A motion to ratify each of the following buildings for certification was made, seconded and carried:

- 2034-2050 Walnut Street: Second (now First) Presbyterian
Church
- 3812 Walnut Street: Otto Eisenlohr Residence
- 3818 Walnut Street: The Samuel S. Fels Residence

The Historical Commission took no action on the issue regarding the recent installation of exterior lighting on the Trinity Church situate at Disston Street and Oxford Avenue. This matter was tabled by the Commission pending the conduct of a site visit, the receipt of photographs and the submission of a staff report. Mr. Levy offered to provide the Commission office with a complete history of Trinity Church which he has in his possession.

Under New Business, the Historical Commission reviewed and approved for certification each of the following buildings:

814 N. Broad Street: The Matthew Baird Mansion
Krewston Road above Pennypack Creek: The Eaton-Henderson House
Susquehanna Road, east of Verree Road: The Hall-Wiley House
5446 Wayne Avenue: The William C. Sharpless House
1417-1429 N. 2nd Street: St. Michael's School Building
1431-1439 N. 2nd Street: St. Michael's Church
1441-1445 N. 2nd Street: St. Michael's Rectory
1432-1436 N. 2nd Street: St. Michael's Convent
1504-1508 N. 2nd Street: St. Michael's Literary Institute

Mr. Mogensen voted in opposition to the certification of each of the St. Michael's Roman Catholic Parish Buildings on N. 2nd Street.

Action on each of the following buildings was tabled pending the receipt of additional information:

1006 Bainbridge Street: Frances Ellen Watkins Harper House
310-312 Catharine Street: The Hebrew Literature Society Building
4908 Germantown Avenue: The Wachsmuth-Henry House
928 E. Moyamensing Avenue: Lithuanian National Hall
615 Pine Street: The Morris Weinstein Residence

NEW BUSINESS

Harry A. Batten Fund Expenditure. The Historical Commission approved the reimbursement of \$42.66 to Ms. Siemiontkowski to cover the cost of two rolls of photocopy paper purchased from the American Duplicating Company. This purchase was made with money (\$75.00) contributed to the Harry A. Batten Memorial Fund by the Group for Environmental Education to cover the cost of photocopy paper used by researchers gathering information for the publication of an A.I.A. architectural guidebook to Philadelphia.

STATED MEETING

5

2 June 1983

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian