

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

30 June 1988

David Hollenberg, Chairman

- Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence
National Park
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.
- Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Steno I
- Also: George Lovera and Amy Cleave of Agoos Lovera Architects, to
present a proposal for renovations to the South Wing of the
Franklin Institute.
Panos Lidis, owner, to present a proposal for extensive
alterations to 424 Pine Street.
Michael J. Stack, Jr., Alexis Carlin of the Forrest Theatre and
Richard Doran of Constitution Bank to present a proposal for
the installation of a MAC machine to the easternmost bay
of the Theater.
Richard Doran from Constitution Bank, to present a proposal for
the installation of a MAC machine on the Walnut Street
facade of the building located at 1608 Walnut Street.
Carl K. Zucker, Esq., to present a proposal which calls for the
demolition of an existing two-story, brick office building
at the Southwest corner of 20th and Walnut Streets to allow
for the construction of a new, five-story building.
And others.

Franklin Institute. George Lovera and Amy Cleave of Agoos Lovera Architects and John McDevitt from the Franklin Institute appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the following:

1. Renovations to the south wing of the Institute at the first and second floors;
2. Introduction of a new opening on the southeast corner wall of Franklin Hall, and;
3. Replacement of the existing glass transoms within two windows on the 20th Street facade, at the first floor, with louvers for fresh air intake.

Following a discussion of the proposed alterations, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of this project as presented. Herbert Levy abstained from voting on this application.

424 Pine Street, Panos Lidis, owner. Mr. Lidis appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for extensive alterations to the property located at 424 Pine Street. The proposal includes the following proposed work:

1. demolition of a portion (two-bay wide) of an existing back/building to provide rear yard open space;
2. the construction of a two-story (2nd and 3rd floors) projecting bay window faced with wood siding;
3. at the ground floor (rear elevation) the installation of new glass doors, transom and side lights;
4. addition of a new wood roof deck and guard rail atop the three-story back building; and,
5. clean and repoint existing brickwork.

Ms. Siemiontkowski informed the Committee that the east elevation of 424 Pine Street can be seen from the Old Pine Church cemetery and from Pine Street itself.

The members of the Architectural Committee first addressed the proposed demolition at the rear of the property. The Committee found the existing back building to be a significant feature of the historic resource and voted to recommend against allowing its demolition. The Committee next considered construction of the roof deck and agreed that the proposed new deck should be reduced in size and that it should not extend the full length of the back building. The Architect was asked to revise his drawings to show the retention of the entire back building and the reduction in size of the proposed roof deck. He was further asked to submit a rear elevation to show how access from the dormer window to the roof deck would be achieved. The Architect agreed to revise his drawings and to resubmit prior to the July meeting of the Commission.

Forrest Theater, 1114 Walnut Street. Alexis Carlin of the Forrest Theatre along with Michael Stack, Esq., and Richard Doran from Constitution Bank appeared before the Committee to resubmit a proposal for the

installation of a MAC machine and play bills in an existing opening within the easternmost bay of the Theatre now occupied by a shallow shop front. The applicants also proposed the replacement of the existing entrance doors with new solid panel bronze doors.

The Committee recommended that the existing frames and grilles be cleaned and that the replacement doors be fabricated to match the original material and color of the existing fabric.

Finally, the Theatre's resubmission for the installation of a MAC machine and play bill display was determined to be acceptable and its approval is recommended.

Subsequent to the Committee meeting, the Chairman of the Committee and members of the staff met on site with the applicant and agreed to amend the Committee recommendation as follows:

1. Replacement of the existing door frames with new frames as shown in the submitted drawings. A new moulding, designed to duplicate the existing as closely as possible, should be applied to the new frame.
2. Replacement of the existing doors with new bronze doors having glass panels similar in design to the original doors.
3. Reuse of the existing bronze grillwork within the new replacement frames.

1608 Walnut Street, Richard A. Doran, Constitution Bank. Mr. Doran appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the installation of a Money Access Center on the Walnut Street facade of the locally designated building at 1608 Walnut Street.

The Committee recommends an approval, in concept, of this project. However, the Committee requested the submission of a sample of the material that will surround the MAC machine before a final approval can be recommended.

2000-2004 Walnut Street, John Curry, Developer, Don Reiff, Architect, Carl K. Zucker, Attorney. This application calls for the demolition of an existing two-story brick office building at the southwest corner of the 20th and Walnut Streets to allow for the construction of a new five-story parking garage with shops on the ground floor. The present building stands within the proposed Rittenhouse/Fitler Residential Historic District and has been identified as a non-contributing building within that district. The existing structure, built c. 1960, is out of scale and character with its neighboring buildings and is set back from the property lines along the street.

The architect presented for consideration his rendering of the proposed new garage and commercial building which will replace the existing structure. The proposed new, five-story building represents a post-modern interpretation of the Victorian mansion that once stood on the site.

The Committee voted to recommend that demolition of the existing building be allowed. The members further agreed to recommend an approval, in concept, of the replacement building. In scale, proportion, massing and detail the proposed new structure, in concept, appears to be sympathetic to the overall character of the Rittenhouse Fidler district and to the Walnut Street streetscape. The Committee, however, asked for the submission of progress drawings and specifications on this project before a final approval is granted.

- 109 Elfreth's Alley, Adam Booksin, Owner. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that this application calls for the construction of a one-story addition on the east wall of 109 Elfreth's Alley. This addition will be set back to allow for a small garden at the corner of Elfreth's Alley and Front Street. Also proposed is the construction of a garden wall with a wood lattice fence and wood gates for access to a parking area.

The Committee recommended the use of plain, lapped, batten boards for the design of the fence instead of the lattice work that was proposed. The corner garden should remain open and planted. The Committee suggested the removal of the niche from the garden wall and an over-all simplification of the garden wall design. The applicant will be asked to revise the drawings as suggested by the Committee and to resubmit for a final review and approval.

- 713 Walnut Street, Fred Caine, Applicant and Jerry Roller, Architect. This proposal calls for the installation of removable display cases in the ground floor windows of the rowhouse at 713 Walnut Street to create more visible commercial display area. The Committee and Commission reviewed previously several proposals for commercial display area at this location. Previous proposals were rejected since they either destroyed or covered historic fabric of the building. The construction of a free-standing kiosk on the sidewalk was accepted by the Historical Commission but rejected by the Art and Planning Commissions and by the Streets Department. The current proposal was prepared in response to a recommendation made by the Architectural Committee at one of its prior meetings.

The resubmission, as presented, calls for the installation of temporary display cases which roll into place when the lower window sash is raised. These cases will be pulled into the building when the store is closed. Following some discussion of the proposal, the Committee voted to recommend its approval.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney

/mah