

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

9 October 1986

David Hollenberg, Chairman

- Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee,
American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation
Program
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
- Also: Louis J. Orocofsky, Developer, to present a proposal for
repair and rehabilitation of ground floor storefront at
41 N. 2nd Street
Jay Kottoff, Applicant, to present proposal for the
construction of a penthouse and roof deck atop 2220
Wallace Street
Harlan Crider, Architect, to present proposal for
renovations to 2126 Green Street
Robert Kramer, Owner, to request approval of work done
without a permit at 2106 Brandywine Street
Paul Vinicoff, Architect, and Lisa Roberts, Owner, to
present proposal for renovations to 417 S. 8th Street
Linda Skale, Owner, to request the recommendations of the
Committee on restoration of undesignated property at
533 Pine Street
Michael Flitter, Owner, to present a proposal for a replacement
facade at 514 Catharine Street
And others.

ALTERATIONS

715 Walnut Street, Harvey Krasenigor, Architect. Mr. Tyler presented the architect's revised front elevation of 715 Walnut Street as requested by the Committee at its meeting of 14 August 1986. Mr. Tyler noted that the upper windows will be replaced with wooden Marvin windows with true divided lights. Members of the Historical Commission staff inspected the brick that will be used as infill and found it to be acceptable. A marble band will be installed to separate the new ground floor infill from the existing masonry. Awnings will be installed over the storefront window.

The Committee reviewed the revised submission and recommended its approval.

41 N. 2nd Street, Louis J. Orocofsky, Developer. Mr. Orocofsky presented a proposal calling for the repair and rehabilitation of the ground floor storefront at 41 N. 2nd Street. The facade of the building rises three stories in height and is of an 1865 vintage. The existing storefront fabric will be repaired and a new storefront cornice fabricated to match the adjoining building at 43 N. 2nd Street. New upper floor wood window sash containing two-over-two lights of glass have already been installed.

Mr. Orocofsky stated that the trim will be replicated where necessary. Mr. Hollenberg requested that the drawing be revised to include details of the replacement moulding.

The Committee recommended approval of this proposal for 41 N. 2nd Street pending receipt and approval of the revised drawing.

2220 Wallace Street, Jay Kottoff, Applicant. Mr. Kottoff presented a proposal calling for the construction of a penthouse and roof deck atop the building at 2220 Wallace Street, a three-story, twin house built c. 1865. Mr. Kottoff presented photographs in an attempt to demonstrate the visual effect of this addition from the street.

The Committee reviewed the drawings and photographs and indicated that they appeared to be acceptable. However, the Committee requested that a sight line study be submitted.

The Committee recommended an approval of this project pending the receipt and approval of a site line study.

Mr. Bartley noted that 2220 Wallace Street was substantially altered in the past with the application of a permastone veneer on the front facade. Mr. Bartley further noted that the proposed addition of a penthouse and roof deck does not represent a restoration and the building is not eligible for an Historical Commission plaque.

233-235 Market Street, John Goodwin, Growth Properties. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented the architect's revised drawing showing the addition of a sign on the storefront facade of 233-235 Market Street. This design reflects the changes recommended by the Committee at its meeting of 11 September 1986. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation has found the revised design to be acceptable for easement purposes. Mr. DeLong requested further information on the proposed color scheme. Ms. Siemiontkowski agreed to obtain this information.

The Committee agreed to recommend a final approval of this project.

1211 Locust Street, Shelby Fine Arts. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that the information requested by the Committee at its 14 August 1986

meeting has been received and appears to be acceptable. The existing holes will be used for the installation of the sign and the design and dimensions are in keeping with the recommendations of the Art Commission.

The Committee agreed to recommend a final approval of this project.

Society Hill Cafe, 3rd and Chestnut Streets, David Beck Architects.

Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that revised drawings were received for the Society Hill Cafe which reflect the recommendations made by the Architectural Committee at its meeting of 11 September 1986.

The Committee reviewed the revised drawings for the Society Hill Cafe and agreed to recommend a final approval.

2126 Green Street, Harlan, Crider, Architect. Mr. Crider presented a proposal for renovations to the building at 2126 Green Street, a three-story house built c. 1855. All window sash will be replaced with new wood, double-hung sash having two-over-two lights on the first floor and four-over-four lights on the upper levels. The existing stucco facade will be replaced with a new stucco coat scored to resemble stone. The entrance door and transom will be repaired as will the cornice and steps. The brownstone trim will be retained in its existing condition. The Committee reviewed the shop drawing submitted for the new windows and agreed that these details were acceptable.

The Committee recommended approval of this proposal to renovate 2126 Green Street.

Arch Street Methodist Church, Southeast corner of Broad & Arch Streets, David Hollenberg, Architect of John Milner Associates. Mr. Hollenberg presented a revision to a proposal which was approved at the Architectural Committee meeting of 11 September 1986. Mr. Hollenberg reported that the plexiglass proposed for installation over the stained glass windows is not available in a size larger than 98 inches. As a result, Mr. Hollenberg reported that a new joint must be introduced to accommodate that smaller size plexiglass. This additional top support will be fabricated in a translucent material.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this revision. Mr. Hollenberg abstained from voting on this submission.

2106 Brandywine Street, Robert Kramer, Owner. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that the owner of 2106 Brandywine Street was cited by the Department of Licenses and Inspection for work performed on his house without having obtained a building permit or the Historical Commission's review and approval. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented for

the Committee's review a letter from Mr. Kramer explaining that his contractor assured him that a permit was obtained and he first became aware of this submission when he recieved a Licenses and Inspections violation notice. The Committee reviewed the work done on the building and agreed that it was acceptable.

The Committee agreed to recommend that this work be approved.

3204-3206 Powelton Avenue, Earl Buser, Architect. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that the elevations for the rears of these two properties and written specifications that were requested at the 14 August 1986 meeting have been received. The Part II application is not finished and will be submitted later.

The Committee reviewed the additional information submitted and agreed to recommend a final approval

2109 Brandywine Street. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that the owner of 2109 Brandywine Street is interested in obtaining an Historical Commission plaque. This owner would like to install a door and shutters to match those on the plaque awarded building at 2117 Brandywine Street. Ms. Siemiontkowski questioned whether the door and shutters on 2117 Brandywine Street are appropriate and whether they should be replicated at 2109 Brandywine Street. The Committee determined that the door and shutter design at 2117 Brandywine Street was inappropriate.

The Committee reviewed photographs of the property and recommended that drawings be submitted for a three panel shutter and a six panel door. These drawings will be reviewed at a future committee meeting.

417 S. 8th Street, Paul Vinicoff, Architect, and Lisa Roberts, Owner. Mr. Vinicoff presented a proposal calling for substantial renovations to the first floor of this corner building, a three-and-a-half story brick rowhouse built c. 1845. Mr. Vinicoff intends to remove some later brick infill on the 8th Street facade which turns the corner and replace it with the original bricks which were stored in the rear of the property. Two windows are proposed for the 8th Street elevation. A limestone beltcourse is proposed to cover an existing steel lintel on the 8th Street facade which turns the corner. Mr. Vinicoff further proposed the addition of a limestone watertable. The watertable will also turn the corner.

The Committee reviewed the drawings and photographs presented and agreed that more detail was needed. The Committee recommended that the submission be approved in concept. However, Mr. Hollenberg requested that the following revisions be included in the resubmission:

- beltcourse should be header brick not limestone.
- no pilasters at the embellished entrance on Addison Street.
- no muntins in the sidelights or transom of the entrance.
- a contemporary entrance door design.
- information on the six-over-six window sash and window frames.
- notations indicating which openings are existing, which are new and which are being enlarged.

The Committee agreed to recommend approval pending the receipt of a revised submission incorporating into it the above changes and additions.

533 Pine Street, Linda Skale, Applicant. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that this building is currently not a designated building but will be included in the proposed Society Hill Local District. Ms. Siemiontkowski noted that Ms. Skale intends to restore this building to its original design and requested assistance from the Historical Commission so that 533 Pine Street would be eligible for a plaque in the future. Ms. Skale presented a drawing showing the existing and the proposed Pine Street facade. The building currently has a c. 1920 commercial tripartite window on the ground floor. Ms. Skale intends to remove the metal cornice and the metal canopy from above the entrance door. The owners also propose to replace the common bond brick on the lower portion of the facade with flemish bond grapevine joint to match the upper part of the wall. Ms. Skale further stated that although she believes the original entrance door opening was arched, it is her intention to keep the square opening.

The Committee reviewed the photographs and drawings and unanimously agreed that the existing facade has more character than the proposed and strongly recommended that the restoration not be attempted. The Committee noted that all documentation presented is purely speculative and that, without evidence, an accurate restoration would not be possible. The Committee suggested that the facade be repaired and repainted where necessary.

The Committee thanked Ms. Skale for her presentation and the members offered their assistance to the owners if future advise is needed.

514 Catharine Street, Michael Flitter, Owner. Mr. Flitter presented a proposal for a replacement facade necessitated by severe structural instability of the existing front facade. This front wall currently contains an 8" bulge in the center and moves approximately one-half inch per year. Mr. Flitter stated that it is his intention to replicate the existing wall. The Committee reviewed the drawing and noted that the dimensions were incorrect. The openings were not in scale with the existing facade.

The Committee recommended an approval of this facade replacement pending the submission of an elevation showing correct dimensions. The Committee further recommended that brick courses be counted to assure proper size and placement of openings.

313-315 Vine Street, Orianna West, Harry Devoe, Developer, and Cecil Baker and Associates, Architects. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented the architect's drawings and proposal which calls for the substantial rehabilitation of the building at 313-315 Vine Street, a five-story brick commercial loft building, built c. 1899 with a 1910 rear addition. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented a copy of the Part II Tax Act Application describing the work proposed.

The Committee reviewed the proposal and agreed to recommend its approval.

PLAQUES

340 S. 6th Street. The Committee reviewed the photograph and plaque application for 340 S. 6th Street and recommended that a plaque not be awarded owing to the inappropriate shutters, transom and cornice.

115 Rounford Road, The Leamy Home. The Committee reviewed the photograph and plaque application for 115 Rounford Road and recommended that a plaque not be awarded owing to the presence of aluminum storm windows.

8609 Germantown Avenue. The Committee reviewed the photograph and plaque application for 8609 Germantown Avenue and recommended that a plaque not be awarded owing to an inappropriate door, fronticepiece and sign.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned a 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terri Koob, Executive Secretary

The members of the Architectural Committee discussed briefly the Historical Commission's plaque program and the standards applied in determining whether or not a building is eligible for receipt of a plaque.

During the early years of the Historical Commission's operation, plaques were awarded to all designated buildings regardless of the building's condition or state of preservation. Later only buildings restored to their original appearance or renovated to a later era of alteration could qualify for a plaque. This criteria subsequently led to the fabrication

of two plaques - "Certified Restored" and "Certified Altered." At present three different categories of plaques can be found on locally designated buildings. These include the original plaque, "Certified Philadelphia Historical Commission," and the previously mentioned two which distinguish between restored and altered buildings.

Today, many buildings which under current standards would not qualify for a plaque display markers on their facades. Without a program for on-going inspection of buildings with plaques and a process for their removal from buildings which no longer qualify under the present criteria, a plaque signifies little more than the designation of a building.

Following some discussion of this issue, the Committee asked the staff to prepare a report evaluating the plaque program and making recommendations for its improvement or its elimination.