

D R A F T

MINUTES OF THE FORTIETH MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

March 29, 1960

Present were: Mrs. Richardson Dilworth
Dr. Roy Franklin Nichols
Mr. Charles E. Peterson
Mr. George K. Trautwein
Mr. R. Norris Williams, II

Mr. Grant M. Simon, Chairman

Also present: Mr. Clarence G. Alhart, Redevelopment Authority
Mr. John F. Lloyd, Architect, Redevelopment Authority
Mr. George I. Lovatt, City Architect
Mr. Philip Carroll, representing Commissioner Cennetti
Mr. Harry G. McDowell, Deputy Director of Finance
Dr. Margaret B. Tinkcom, Historian
Mrs. Charles J. Maurer, Executive Secretary.

The Chairman extended cordial greetings to Messrs. Alhart and Lloyd from the Redevelopment Authority.

THE MINUTES for February 23, 1960 were approved as corrected.

DR. TINKCOM'S REPORT

Dr. Tinkcom reported that Mrs. Kirkbride has prepared a guide to the records of The Philadelphia Contributionship, noting what types of records - journal books, ledgers, minute books, &c., are available and the dates each covers.

Mr. Fuller and Miss Rudolph are proceeding with their projects - briefs of title in Mr. Fuller's case, and in Miss Rudolph's, a report on Philadelphia in 1773 in the form of a map incorporating the information she has been gathering from newspaper advertisements, the District Survey Office, &c.

Dr. Tinkcom reviewed the area between Market and Vine Street, Delaware River and Sixth Street, and prepared a list of buildings which might be considered for preservation, making a particular study of the property formerly belonging to the University of Pennsylvania in the neighborhood of Fourth and Arch. During the month she also gave a talk about the work of the Commission and reported that four others are scheduled for April.

DR. NICHOLS'S REPORT

The report on Historical Values Committee Meeting, March 21, was approved.

In regard to 306-308 Cherry Street, Christ Church Hospital, it was moved, seconded and carried that this building be certified. The Comly-Rich house, 4276 Orchard Street, was also approved for certification, in the same way.

Dr. Nichols reported that he had discussed the southwest corner of Fourth and Arch Streets, Provost Smith's house, with the President of the University of Pennsylvania.

The German Reformed Church, south side of Race Street between Third and Fourth, was reviewed. No action was taken on this, pending discussion of the area north of Market Street.

DR. NICHOLS'S REPORT continued

Mrs. Lawrence M. C. Smith's recommendation concerning bronze plaques was approved.

MR. TRAUTWEIN'S REPORT

The report on the Architectural Committee Meeting, March 17, was approved in general

260 South Fourth Street. This is now a four story building and although there is no possibility of reducing it to its original three stories at this time, its eventual restoration should be provided for. It was, therefore, recommended that the house be restored to a three story building with a correct cornice and doorway. Mr. Alhart suggested that the restoration be completed within three years. In the interim, the Commission agreed that the owner should install six over six window panes, replace the front door by a solid door of correct design, and hang shutters of proper design at the first and second story windows.

Mr. Alhart said that under no circumstance will the Redevelopment Authority permit the house to be torn down, that the Authority has a number of people waiting to buy the property in this area and that Webb and Knapp or some other firm will finish the restoration if the owner cannot.

514 Cypress Street. After comments from Messrs. Lloyd and Peterson and from Mrs. Dilworth, on the position of the kitchen and the proposed small window, Dr. Nichols moved that the facade be left in its original state; that the kitchen equipment be rearranged to suit the present fenestration, typical of the 1350's; that shutters, window sash and a proper doorway be added. This was approved pending final submission of drawings.

228 Pine Street. The plans were approved as submitted with the recommendation that six over six window panes be used for all windows.

331 South Third Street. Plans were approved with the following modifications: That the fanlight be redesigned, that the possibility of using a belt course above the first story windows be considered and that the lintels be of wood or stone, not of brick.

208 South Fourth Street. Mr. Trautwein reported that he had conferred with the owner's attorney and that a new drawing will be submitted. The matter was deferred until the next meeting.

332 South Fourth Street. The plans as submitted were approved pending the submission of revised drawings, ~~Mr. Trautwein reported that he~~ retaining the original door and glass of the proper size in the window sash. It was recommended that the former be restudied and redesigned in the proper period.

342 South Third Street. This house should ultimately be restored to a one-family dwelling. When this is done, necessary changes to the interior and additional restoration of the exterior will fully restore it to its original dignity. Meanwhile, the Commission agrees that the present doorway may remain. Sashes must have six over six panes of correct size, shutters of authentic design must be added, the Flemish bond in those areas once occupied by bulk windows, should be replaced with old brick, glazed headers alternating with stretchers.

342 South Third Street, continued

If the over-all condition of the brick is poor, the Commission will allow a coat of stucco. It is hoped this will not be necessary.

Mr. Alhart asked that the recommendations on other properties now under review by this Commission be sent to the Redevelopment Authority so that they may be incorporated into the Authority's agreements with the owner. The Commission agreed that this will be done from now on.

Mr. Alhart also asked whether Mr. Lloyd might sit in on future meetings of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Simon replied that he would be most welcome, and upon motion this was agreed to and the Secretary was directed to notify Mr. Lloyd of these meetings. Mr. Alhart will be welcomed too, if he cares to come.

PROCEDURE FOR PRESENTING PROPOSALS FOR RESTORATION OR REHABILITATION OF CERTIFIED BUILDINGS.

See appended sheet on the Commission's letterhead

LIST OF RECOMMENDED ARCHITECTS

Mr. Lloyd reported that he is often asked to recommend an architect, but did not feel able to do this, as many offices are not equipped to handle such a small job. The Commission's list of architects who are willing and able to handle work of this sort will be made available to Mr. Lloyd at once.

PROCEDURE FOR REMOVING BUILDINGS FROM THE COMMISSION'S CERTIFIED LIST.

1. Another visual field survey should be made which would take note of the house under review and the condition of the surrounding neighborhood.
2. The material in our files, particularly the briefs of title and the insurance surveys, should be re-examined and the historical interest of the property be re-assessed.
3. If possible, a report on the state of the interior should be obtained from the Redevelopment Authority.
4. When all this information has been gathered and studied, if it is found that the house has no particularly interesting associations, and if it has no worthwhile interior features, it could be removed from the list.

Before taking this step, the Commission will also want to consider the effect on the street of possible further unsuitable alterations to the house or of its complete demolition.

The Chairman reported that the Commission has hitherto had a policy of including buildings on its certified list even where some doubt as to their historicity exists, but that the time has come when such buildings should be restudied. Mr. Peterson suggested that a copy of the Redevelopment Authority's specifications for such properties would be valuable. Mr. Alhart indicated that this would be available in the next two weeks. No action was taken on the suggested procedure of de-certifying buildings.

March 29, 1960

CONTRACTS

The Chairman reviewed the Minutes of the January Meeting, at which Commissioner Gennetti and Councilman Moore were present, and remarked that the Commission earnestly desires to comply with City regulations regarding its staff, but added that, since it would be difficult to duplicate the present staff, it was hoped that the City could find means to see that the present research staff continues to serve as it is now doing.

Mr. Williams reported that he had received a letter from Mr. Orr, Chief of Personnel for the Department of Public Property, proposing the incorporation of the research staff into the civil service program. This proposal was unsatisfactory in several respects, one of which is the number of hours a graduate student would be required to work each week.

Mr. McDowell stated that there should be no difficulty in putting the Commission's research staff on the Exempt List and asked permission to take this matter up with the Commissioner of Public Property. Mr. McDowell's co-operation is very much appreciated.

FIRE EQUIPMENT FOR THE HEAD HOUSE

Mr. Carroll made no report. The matter was deferred to a later meeting.

PROPOSED ORDINANCE TO PREVENT DEMOLITION BY NEGLECT

Mr. McDowell reports that the Ordinance is still in Cabinet hands. It will probably be discussed in about two weeks.

ORDINANCE FOR BUILDING CONTROL

Mr. Lovatt called the executive secretary's attention to the fact that this is covered in the Memorandum from Mr. Wegner, dated March 3, 1960, which states:

A Building Permit will be required for any alteration which effects the appearance (as well as the structural stability and fire safety) of a building certified as an "historic building" by the Historical Commission. Such requirement is in conformance with Section 14-2003 (1) of the Philadelphia Code.

Before issuing a Building Permit for any historical building, this Department will require full compliance with Section 14-2008 (5) of the Philadelphia Code.

The Ordinance is on Mr. Goldstein's desk, ready for processing.

METROPOLITAN HOSPITAL, THIRD AND SPRUCE STREETS

Although this is not at present a matter coming under the purview of this Commission, nevertheless, since expansion by the hospital would require the demolition of several certified buildings on Cypress Street, the problem was briefly discussed. Mrs. Dilworth reported that it is her belief that the hospital will not be permitted to expand.

March 29, 1960

AREA NORTH OF MARKET STREET AND EAST OF SEVENTH

The Chairman noted that redevelopment of this area will involve the demolition of a number of historic buildings, chief among these, the certified dwellings on Cuthbert Street. It is reported that a motel is intended to replace them. Mr. Peterson suggested that the Cuthbert Street houses be incorporated into the proposed motel; several members of the Commission concurred with this. A motion was asked for; Dr. Nichols made the motion which was seconded by Mrs. Dilworth, that this suggestion be forwarded to the City Planning Commission.

The Historical Commission recommended that all buildings on both sides of the Independence Mall be kept in scale with and at the approximate height of Independence Hall and that any high-rise buildings be kept back from the Mall one hundred feet. It was further recommended that the great vista of this North Mall be broken at four or five hundred feet from the Hall and that the rows of trees and brick walks be kept simple. Upon motion, it was agreed to transmit recommendations to this effect to the City Planning Commission.

HISTORIC AMERICAN BUILDINGS SURVEY FORMS

The Chairman remarked that certification of buildings and the sending of HABS Forms to Washington are among the foremost functions of the Historical Commission. Dr. Tinkcom reported that, to date, the Commission has registered 110 buildings with the National Trust for Historic Preservation and that other reports will be sent as soon as possible.

PLAQUES FOR HISTORIC BUILDINGS

The following applications for plaques were approved

NO. 163 to 4276 Orchard Street, Comly-Rich house,	Mr. Samuel A. Green owner
169 238 Spruce Street	Miss Gretchen Becker
4 104 S. Fifth Street, Philosophical Soc.	Dr. William J. Robbins, Pres.
32 219 S. 6th St., The Athenaeum	Thomas Hart, Esq., Pres.
33 321 S. 4th St. - Hill-Physick house	T. Truxtun Hare, Jr., Esq., Pres
170 320 S. 4th St. "The Maurer house"	Pennsylvania Hospital
127 6514 Germantown Ave. - Christopher Mason	Mrs. Katherine W. Elkinton
34 Bartram House	
35 Bel Air	49 Wakefield
36 Letitia Street house	50 Sedgely guard house (reserved)
37 David Rittenhouse house	51 Lemon Hill
38 Glen Fern	52 Ormiston
39 Cedar Grove	53 Sweetbrier
40 Woodford	54 Chamounix
41 Belmont Mansion	55 Ridgeland
42 The Monastery	56 Fairmount Water Works
43 Laurel Hill	57 The Lilacs
44 The Cliffs	101 Loudoun
45 Strawberry Mansion	
46 Hatfield House	
47 Mount Pleasant	
48 Solitude	

These, for the Fairmount Park Commission, W. H. Noble, Jr.,
Director

March 29, 1960

PLAQUES FOR HISTORIC BUILDINGS continued

No. 58 to	212 South 4th St. Phila. Contributionship	Mr. Walter L. Smith, Jr. Treasurer
59	First Unitarian Church, Chestnut near Twenty-second St.	Dr. Anders S. Lunde, Minister
109	5011 Germantown Ave, the Royal house	Mrs. Sidney M. Mason

NOTE: In the series 1 to 99 59 plaques have been assigned
In the series 100 to 149 39 plaques have been assigned
In the series 150 to --- 20 plaques have been assigned

Total 118 plaques have been assigned to date.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:45 P. M.

Respectfully submitted

Charles E. Peterson
Secretary