

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

17 October 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute
of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Henry J. Magaziner, F.A.I.A., National Park Service
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National Historical
Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
William Blades, Philadelphia Historical Preservation Corporation
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian

Also: Russell Milnor, A.I.A., Architect for the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority
Donna Williams, Chief, Division of Planning and Protection, Bureau for
Historic Preservation
Barry Loveland, Architect, Bureau for Historic Preservation
Tom Daley, Architect and Steven Moore, Owner to present plans for the stabiliza-
tion and rehabilitation of the front wall at 54 N. 2nd Street.
Vincent Houser, Architect to present plans for the enlargement of the front
areaway at 264 South 3rd Street.
William McDowell, Architect, to present his re-design of a previously approved
door hood for 22 Summit Street.
Ivan Blitz, Architect, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of
the Provident Bank building at 6th and Spring Garden Streets.
Faith Baum of Agoos/Lovera, Architects, to present plans for the rehabilitation
of The Colonial at 1100-1102 Spruce Street
Ray Rola, Architect, to present plans for the rehabilitation of 51 N. 2nd
Street and 125 Cuthbert Street.
Peter Bogert, Architect, to present plans for the reconstruction of the front
wall of 51 N. 2nd Street.
David Polk, Architect, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of
the building at 4401 Main Street in Manayunk.
Robert Bayers and M. Schindler to present plans for the rehabilitation of
128-130 Chestnut Street.
Paul Harbeson and Barry Eisworth of H2L2 to present plans for the construction
of infill buildings to connect the old structures and adapt the complex
for use by the School for the Deaf.

At the request of the Historical Commission staff, Donna Williams, Chief of
the Division of Planning and Protection of the Bureau for Historic Preservation
(BHP) and Barry Loveland, Architect for BHP, attended the 17 October meeting
to discuss with the Committee members the role of the Bureau for Historic
Preservation in the tax certification process. Ms. Williams described,
briefly, the review procedure while Barry Loveland elaborated on the more
technical aspects of the Part II certification review process. Following
this general discussion, Ms. Williams and Mr. Loveland remained for the

Committee's review of the various rehabilitation submissions several of which would qualify for receipt of the tax incentives if the work undertaken conforms with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

54 North 2nd Street, Thomas Daley, Architect and Stovan Moore, Owner. Messrs. Daley and Moore presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the reconstruction of a structurally unsound section of the front wall of 54 N. 2nd Street and for the replacement of the ground floor storefront. The building, built c. 1845, stands four stories tall and is representative of the commercial loft buildings which abound in Old City.

Mr. Daley explained to the Committee members that owing to an improperly attached fireescape system, a corner of the front wall of the building pulled out significantly and created a structurally deficient condition in the facade. Mr. Daley intends to needle the facade and to rebuild the problem corner. This will require the destruction and removal of a later, existing, non-historic ground floor storefront which the architect intends to replace with a new storefront of modern design in keeping with the scale and character of the district.

Mrs. Batcheler suggested strongly that the architect examine the building during construction for signs of the original storefront design. Unfortunately no insurance surveys for 54 N. 2nd Street nor the building next door at 52 N. 2nd Street have been found. In addition, a search for early photographs proved fruitless.

Following considerable discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of the plans with the proviso that the architect undertake the investigation suggested by Mrs. Batcheler.

264 South 3rd Street, Vincent Houser, Architect. Mr. Houser presented to the members of the Committee his proposal for the enlargement of the existing areaway at 264 South 3rd Street to accommodate a condenser unit to be placed in the well and covered with an iron grate. Mr. Houser also proposed the construction of a new iron railing across the width of the property. The house at 264 South 3rd Street, constructed between 1813 and 1815, stands three-and-a-half stories tall.

Mr. Houser explained his client's desire to place the condenser unit within the areaway in front of the house rather than place it on the roof of the house. To accomplish this, the areaway must be extended across the front of the house. Mr. Houser explained his intention to move the existing iron railing forward and to continue it the width of the building and to install an entrance gate. Mr. Houser noted precedent for this type of treatment on the street. The design of the iron railing will match the existing.

Following a lengthy discussion, the Committee voted to recommend one of either three courses of action. The Committee's preference was for the owner to do nothing with the existing condition or, secondly, to simply place a gate where the rail presently ends at the top of the stair. If it is necessary to place the condenser unit in the areaway, the Committee agreed to allow the enlargement of the areaway but asked that the iron rail and gate not be moved forward but rather held back to its present position. If the client chooses the latter approach, the house will not be eligible for receipt of a Restored plaque although it may be eligible for an Altered one.

4401 Main Street, David Polk, Architect. Mr. Polk presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation of 4401 Main Street, a three-story, brick Victorian building with a 1940's ground floor alteration.

Mr. Polk discussed with the Committee members his client's desire to restore the ground floor shopfront and the two missing second story bays. The architect proposes to base his restoration of the building on an historic postcard photograph which shows clearly the early appearance of the building.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee voted to recommend its approval, in concept.

22 Summit Street, William McDowell, Architect. Mr. McDowell presented to the members of the Committee a sketch of his revised design of a new door hood proposed for installation over the front entrance to 22 Summit Street. The Committee at a previous meeting reviewed and approved another hood design which the client later determined to be unacceptable. The building, 22 Summit Street, stands as a three story Italianate country house.

The Committee found the revised design for the door hood to be acceptable and in keeping with the Victorian character of the building. A final approval is recommended.

Furness Bank building, 6th and Spring Garden Streets, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Mr. Blitz presented to the members of the Committee his plans for renovations to the Furness Bank to allow for its conversion into offices and a restaurant. The bank remains as an early example of the work of Furness and Hewitt built in 1872 with later additions.

The plans, as presented by Mr. Blitz, call for the construction of a new stair tower at the west end of the building; the finishing of the exposed south and west walls with stucco, scored to match the existing stonework; and the installation of a canopy and new doors on the Spring Garden Street elevation.

The Committee discussed, at length, the proposed treatment of the south and west walls. They suggested that the stucco not duplicate the quoining of the

17 October 1984

original building but rather that it be handled in a different yet sympathetic manner. They recommended further the installation of solid glass, rather than period, entrance doors on Spring Garden Street. They requested also that the architect design a canopy in keeping with that shown on a 1918 photograph on file in the Commission office if one, indeed, is necessary.

On the south elevation, the Committee suggested that the stucco on the two pair of stairs be scored in a manner which allows the rail to be read as one.

Subject to the above required changes, the Committee recommends an approval of this project in concept. A resubmission, including floor plans and details, is required before a final approval can be granted.

1100-1102 Spruce Street, The Colonial, Agoos/Lovera, Architects. Faith Baum of Agoos/Lovera submitted to the Committee for review plans for the rehabilitation of the buildings at 1100 and 1102 Spruce Street. Only one of the two buildings, 1102, falls within the jurisdiction of the Historical Commission. The building at 1100 is not a certified structure. The building at 1102, constructed c. 1838, stands three stories tall and has a later fourth floor Mansard addition.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee voted to recommend the approval of the proposed rehabilitation at 1102 Spruce Street.

51 North 2nd Street and 125 Cuthbert Street, Raymond Rola, Architect. Mr. Rola presented to the Committee his plans for renovations to 51 North 2nd Street, a three-and-a-half story 1820's house with a twentieth century commercial ground floor and a 1920's addition on the area. The plans also call for renovations to 125 Cuthbert Street, a three-story, nineteenth century stable.

The Committee reviewed Mr. Rola's plans for 51 North 2nd Street and made several recommendations. The members suggested that the size of the windows on the gable wall of 51 N. 2nd Street be consistent with the size of the windows on the front facade. They further recommended an increase in the size of the shutter rails at the second floor.

The architect explained to the Committee members his desire to replace the industrial sash on the 1920's rear addition to both meet Building and Fire code regulations and to decrease energy loss. The Committee recommended that the architect use an awning type sash which follows the muntin arrangement of the existing industrial sash and which will allow for the installation of new energy efficient, operable windows.

The Committee found the proposed rehabilitation of 125 Cuthbert Street to be acceptable.

The members asked that the architect revise his drawings and resubmit them for a final review and approval. In addition, the Committee asked for a detail of the proposed new awning. An approval, in concept, is recommended.

17 October 1984

234 Arch Street, Peter Bogert, Architect. Mr. Bogert presented to the members of the Architectural Committee his plans for the reconstruction of the entire front wall at 234 Arch Street. The structurally deficient facade, according to the engineer's report, must be completely rebuilt. The building, constructed c. 1845, is a typical four-story Old City commercial loft building.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee voted to recommend to the Commission that the building be decertified since removal of the original front wall will seriously compromise the historic integrity of the structure.

Germantown Academy, School House Lane and Greene Street, Paul Harbeson, Barry Eiswerth and C. Neubauer of H2L2. Messrs. Harbeson, Eiswerth and Neubauer presented to the Committee plans for the construction of new additions which will link the historic buildings and adapt the complex for use by the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf. The architects also brought with them for discussion purposes a model of the proposed project.

The Committee members considered the relationship of the new buildings with the old and discussed, at length, the compatibility of new design with the Georgian buildings. No consensus of opinion was reached concerning the appropriateness of the new design and it was decided to call a joint meeting of the Commission's Architectural Committee and the Redevelopment Authority's Advisory Board of Design to discuss each group's concerns. Since the School for the Deaf acquired the Germantown Academy property from the Redevelopment Authority, review of the project also falls within the jurisdiction of the Advisory Board. This meeting has been scheduled for Friday, 2 November 1984, at 11 a.m.

Some members of the Committee asked the architects ^{so that the ridge will parallel} to study the possibility of turning the gables of the new link buildings ~~to~~ the street. The architects agreed to study this approach and to prepare drawings and, perhaps, alter the model for review at the joint meeting.

No action is recommended to the Commission at this time.

5443-5445 Germantown Avenue, David Karp, Architect. The Committee reviewed the architect's details for the construction of shutters to be hung on the building 5443-5445 Germantown Avenue.

An approval of the shutter details is recommended.

PLAQUES

235 South 17th Street, a.k.a., 1635-1637 Locust Street. The Committee recommends the approval of a Certified Restored plaque for this building.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian