

**THE MINUTES OF THE 401st STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
25 January 1996**

**Philadelphia Historical Commission Offices, 1401 Arch, Room 1301
Wayne Spilove, Chairperson**

Present

Wayne Spilove, Chairperson
David Baldinger, Deputy Executive Director, City Planning
Commission
Robert Barnett, Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
David Brownlee
Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Commerce Department
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Arlene Matzkin
Susan Rabinovitch
Scott Wilds, Office of Housing and Community Development

Joshua Grimes, Esq., Law Department

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Jeffrey R. Barr, Historic Preservation Researcher

Also

Bobbie Burke, CCRA
Judith Eden, CCRA
Ellen Emmons, Holy Communion Church
Andrew Phillips, Richard Wesley Architects
Samuel Fadullon, City Planning Commission
Michael Bach, Stephen Kennerly Architects
Gary O'Rourke, 1260 Housing
Austin Gray
Milton Marks, Preservation Coalition
Edward Bruet, VOFP

The 401st Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission was called to order at 10:15 AM by Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, who recognized the presence of a quorum of the Commission.

Mr. Spilove introduced and welcomed Robert Barnett, the new Commissioner of Licenses and Inspections.

THE MINUTES of the 400th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 13 December 1995, Wayne Spilove, Chairperson, were approved by unanimous vote and adopted upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and seconded by Dr. Brownlee.

**ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE REPORT, 26 December 1995, Arlene Matzkin,
Chair**

2037 LOCUST STREET

Myrna and Marvin Galfand, Applicants

PROPOSAL: Rebuild Facade

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The applicant seeks to rebuild this structurally unsound front wall with matching brick and retain all upper floor details and trim. The applicants seek to reduce the height of the transom window.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed by a unanimous vote.

258 S. 4TH STREET

Mary Doran, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Rear side wall garage and new window

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval with details to be reviewed by staff.

The applicant seeks to insert a garage door in a rear addition and to turn a side door into a window.

Mr. Wilds moved to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed by a unanimous vote.

2047 CHESTNUT STREET

Gary O'Rourke, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Vestibule and storefront work

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend denial of the proposal and suggested that staff visit the site to help the owner perfect a revised application.

Before applying to the Commission, the applicant stuccoed the vestibule of the entrance to the upper floor apartments including the side of a storefront that originally had been glazed. The architecture Committee had the impression that the applicant had recently removed the original glass from the side of the storefront. When Mr. Baron visited the site, it became apparent that the storefront glass on the vestibule had been replaced long ago with boards that still exist under the stucco. The applicant offered to remove the stucco and return the storefront to its condition before the violation. The applicant also proposed to paint the blue of the store base a color to match the beige

stone.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the proposal to remove the stucco from the storefront and paint the base beige. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed a by unanimous vote.

2108-14 CHESTNUT STREET

Steven Kennerly, Architect

PROPOSAL: Install wood ramp

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee voted to recommend approval of this proposal.

The applicant seeks to install a wooden ramp on the Sansom Street facade of the building. David Brownlee stated that the impermanence of the wood ramp and its clear distinction from the original fabric helped to make this a better proposal than the concrete ramp.

Bobbie Burke said that she did not wish to speak against this ramp but suggested that the application should go to the Committee on Financial Hardship if hardship forms a basis for the application. She noted that the Commission's Rules and Regulations contain special provisions for non-profit organizations.

Susan Rabinovitch and Judith Eden both spoke in favor of a package of options for ramps but others cautioned that every case is different and needs to be considered separately.

Mr Wilds made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Committee to approve the application. Dr. Brownlee seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

3432-36 SANSOM STREET

Richard Wesley, Architect

PROPOSAL: Greenhouse addition, Rooftop ductwork

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The applicant seeks to build a greenhouse rear side addition, ramp and new rooftop ductwork for a new La Terrace Restaurant.

A stuccoed enclosure will partially screen the new ductwork from the street.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

201 SOUTH 34TH STREET

Stephen McLaughlin, Roofing Consultant

PROPOSAL: New roof

Architectural Committee Recommendation: The Committee Recommended approval of either a gray asphalt slate line shingle or slate or a molded plastic or mineral fiber simulated slate.

Members of the Commission recalled that as part of the request to demolish Smith Hall the University made a commitment to restore the surrounding buildings including the Music building. They expressed disbelief that anyone would put on a 25-40 year shingle roof now, only to remove it in a few years to restore the building. Commission members offered to table the question until next month to give staff a chance to contact the University about their plans and intentions.

Wayne Spilove asked that the decision be postponed for one month and that Mr. Tyler determine and circulate the University's position before the next meeting.

6260 CITY LINE AVENUE

Carl Doebley, Dan Peter Kopple, Architects

PROPOSAL: Extensive restoration with new screen wall windows

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval

The proposal calls for restoring this oldest train station in Philadelphia and includes wood framing, sheathing, windows and decorative woodwork. The roof will also be replaced with metal to match the historic photos. The applicant wishes to cut several new full size openings in the wood wall along the platform and remove the muntins from an adjacent window to create four identical openings. They intend to remove the muntins to prevent their vandalization. Some Commission members expressed concern that children could climb through the muntin-free openings and fall into the stairway on the trackside of this screen wall. Dr. Brownlee argued that the Commission's position in the face of inconclusive evidence should always be the preservation of historic fabric.

Scott Wilds made a motion to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee and approve the application as presented without muntins. Mr. Barnett seconded the motion, which failed by a vote of 4 to 5. Those voting in favor of the motion included Messrs. Wilds, Barnett, Bumb and Baldinger. Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the proposal subject to the retention/addition of muntins to match the historic photo. Ms. Matzkin seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

2901-41 MARKET STREET, 30TH STREET STATION

Carl Doebley, Dan Peter Kopple, Associates

PROPOSAL: Elevators, lighting, signage, platform alterations
Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval except for the lighting which must come back to the Committee.

This proposal involves building elevators for handicapped accessibility, reopening a stair, and installing new signage and lighting on the commuter platforms of 30th Street Station. The Committee approved of everything except the lighting. They thought that the long band of fluorescent light boxes on the exposed structure of the platform hid and modified an important architectural feature.

A motion to accept the recommendation of the Architectural Committee was made by Dr. Brownlee, seconded by Mr. Wilds, and passed by unanimous vote.

Commissioner Barnett explained that the City is currently applying to demolish the Holmesburg Prison. The Film Office has asked that the central rotunda and one cell block be retained, for the space could serve as a location filming and produce some revenue for the City of Philadelphia.

The Report of the Activities of the Historical Commission Staff December 1995, Richard Tyler.

Mr. Tyler commended the work of Jeffrey Barr and Randal Baron during this period of reduced staffing.

Judith Eden of the Center City Residents Association noted the staff 106 review of a PATCO station in the Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District and asked when the Historical Commission will review these plans. Mr. Tyler explained that the plans were in a preliminary stage and will receive Commission review upon the completion of further design development.

Mr. Tyler explained that the Commission is attempting to fill the Executive Secretary vacancy and three preservation planner positions, two funded by the Historical Commission and one by the Department of Streets.

NEW BUSINESS

276 S. 20th Street

Mr. Baron explained that this proposal for storefront rehabilitation arrived after the Architecture Committee meeting. The applicant's ability to start a business depends upon a

Spring opening. In order to facilitate designing the new storefront in a timely fashion, the applicant requests permission to remove the modern wood siding to expose the historic fabric underneath. No historic fabric will be removed.

Dr. Brownlee made a motion to approve the application. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 12:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Randal Baron