

**THE MINUTES OF THE 465th STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
9 May 2001**

**Commission Conference Room 18th Floor, 1515 Arch Street
Wayne S. Spilove, Chair**

Present

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair
David Baldinger, Deputy Director, City Planning Commission
David Brownlee, Ph.D.
Melissa Heller Batzer, Office of City Council President, Director of Economic Development
Duane Bumb, Deputy Director, Department of Commerce
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Michael Sklaroff, Esq.
Robert Thomas, AIA
Scott Wilds, Assistant Director, Office of Housing and Community Development
Carolyn Wischmann

Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Diane M. Hughes, Executive Secretary
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Also

Jane Golson, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Ervin Toland, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Joan B. Garrett, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Marilyn P. Burke, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Catherine Hammond, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Maurice Torjman, 1500-02 Mt. Vernon Street
Patricia Freeland, Spring Garden Civic Association
Ivy McCottry, Girard College
Maggie Jones, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
William W. Carney, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Ronald Patterson, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg & Ellers
Larry Dabis, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Birtha F. New, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
William Lewandowski, Irwin & Leighton
Brian Friedman, Northern Liberties Development
Kevin D. Lamb, Office of State Senator Shirley Kitchen, and Office of State Representative
Jewell Williams
Rev. Desiree Lindsay, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
John Myer
Albert Taus, Albert Taus and Associates, Architects
Eric Kuczarski, Empowerment Zone
Dominic Aspite, Re: 1801 Diamond Street
Jannie W. Caviness Re: 2021 Diamond Street
Theodore G. Caviness, 2021 Diamond Street
Paula Zyats, Re: 2226 Green Street
Philip Rutter, Re: 2226 Green Street

Lambrini Barbalios, Re: 2224 Green Street
Michael K. Brannon, 2145 Mt. Vernon Street
Rev. Ellis B. Loudon, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church
Judith Robinson, 2112 Woodstock Street

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 465th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 9:15 a.m.

Minutes of the 464th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Wilds and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the minutes of the 464th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 11 April 2001, as corrected to reflect Duane Bumb's attendance in the absence of James J. Cuorato, Wayne S. Spilove, Chair.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 24 April 2001.

1801 Diamond Street, Church of the Advocate

Church of the Advocate, Owner

Dominic Aspite, Applicant

DATE: 1891-97, Charles M. Burns, Architect

PROPOSAL: Handicapped ramp

The Architectural Committee recommended approval with the staff to review details. Ms. Pentz abstained from the vote.

This proposal involves adding a ramp on the Gratz Street side of the church and its parish hall. The new ramp will require the demolition or encasing of the existing steps. The staff recommended approval; however, encasing the steps is the preferred option.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

5501 Old York Road, Frank Synagogue

Albert Einstein Medical Center, Owner

Michael Hauptman, Architect

DATE: 1901, Arnold W. Brunner with Furness, Evans & Company, Architects

PROPOSAL: Handicapped ramp, façade cleaning and replace porch floor

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the ramp with the staff to review materials and samples.

The proposal involves replacing an existing wood ramp in stone and metal along the front of the building. The staff recommended approval.

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the façade cleaning with the staff to review details.

The applicant proposes a low pressure cleaning with mild detergent for the stone's cleaning.

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the rebuilding of the porch with the staff to review details and shop drawings.

The existing porch is set on wooden joists. The applicant proposes to replace the entire structure and lay in new floor tiles. The proposed tiles will have a broken joint pattern which replicates the original pattern and will be very close in size.

Mr. Sklaroff asked that the original architect's name is place on the line with the date in the minutes. He also questioned the replacement tiles and their appropriateness to such an architecturally significant building. In response, the architect for the project stated that the old tiles and their supporting structure have deteriorated and that the replacement tiles, imported from Italy, match the original very closely.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2145 Mt. Vernon Street

Michael Brannan, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1859

PROPOSAL: Legalize façade window/door alterations

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the legalization and asked the applicant to confer with staff for guidance.

The proposal involves legalization of work completed without a permit. The owner filled in shop windows with wood siding and small vinyl sliding windows and installed a new door within a reduced opening. The staff recommended denial and thought the applicant should reopen the shop windows and use internal shutters for privacy. The historic door design should be reused.

Mr. Baron stated that this property was designated individually before the creation of the district and presented photographs from 1959 showing the existence of a storefront. The Commission thought the replacement door not consistent with an 1859 door, and it recommended restoration of the windows and door appropriate to a Victorian façade. It said that the use of interior shutters would resolve the issue of privacy and the T-111 siding should be removed from the shopfront.

Patricia Freeland, Spring Garden Civic Association, spoke in opposition to the applicant's alterations and stated that restoration would increase the property value. She also viewed the replacement door as unattractive; the Commission reiterated that its recommendations are not based on aesthetics but the *Secretary of Interior Standards*.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2515 South 21st Street

John Migioia, Owner/Applicant

DATE: 1914, John T. Windrim, Architect

PROPOSAL: New porch windows and door

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the windows as submitted and a door with wood a panel at the bottom and glazing at the top with the staff to review details.

The proposal calls for removing jalousie windows from a glazed porch and installing wood 1/1 sash. The staff recommended approval of glazing, subject to the use of large pane glass casements.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation with a fixed center casement window and operable side windows. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

1622 Chestnut Street, Art Institute of Philadelphia

Art Institute of Philadelphia, Owner

William Lewandowski, Applicant

DATE: 1931, Harry Sternfeld, Gabriel Roth and Robert Heller, Architects

PROPOSAL: Exterior painting

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the colors approved tens years ago.

The applicants propose repainting the exterior of the historic WCAU building blue. The applicant's preferred color, the existing grey blue, does not match the deeper blue original crushed glass façade color. In addition they wish to repaint the steel windows powder blue. The staff recommended denial, and thought the building should be painted its original colors.

The applicant stated his intention of using colors of various shades of blue.

It was determined that the prior approval of colors was done at staff level. Mr. Baron said that originally the building had blue glass pressed into the stucco of a gray color.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Baldinger seconded the motion which carried

Mr. Spilove passed the gavel to Mr. Brownlee.

54th and Lindbergh Boulevard, Bartram's Garden

Historic Bartram's Garden, Owner

James Dart, Architect

PROPOSAL: Demolition of modern house; construction of two buildings on site

The Architectural Committee recommended approval subject to receipt of documentation with a copy of the deed for the parcel and clear photographs showing the cinderblock.

The proposal involves demolition of a 20th century building on the grounds of Bartram's Garden and construction of two larger buildings. The staff recommended approval only if the architect demonstrates the recent date of the existing building and its lack of significance, as well as the compatibility of the layout and materials of the proposed buildings with the site.

The Commission received documentation showing that building slated for demolition was not part of the original designation, and it thought the proposed new buildings appropriate. Mr. Thomas noted that the proposed new bathrooms as shown in the plans should comply with ADA.

Ms. Batzer made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Bumb seconded the motion which carried with 9 votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

1500-1502 Mt. Vernon Street

Albert Taus and Maurice Torjman, Owners

Albert Taus, Architect

DATE: c. 1859, c.1905, c.1930

PROPOSAL: Façade rehabilitation

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the proposal as submitted but approved an alternative design, in which the wall remains unstuccoed, the window at 1502 becomes the same size as the masonry opening on the first floor north wall of 1500, removal of the existing door at 1502, using the salvaged brick to complete the masonry opening. The paired first floor windows will have a transom with a single light below with the staff to review details. They also approved the new windows on the south façade above the first floor, the 15th Street doors, and the metal railing at the corner.

This proposal involves rehabilitating this empty building as apartments. The plans call for installing windows in the rear stair-tower openings, and a fence at the corner storefront door. The applicant also seeks to close a taproom door as well. Mr. Taus submitted a revised drawing which removes the glass block above the corner and replace it with brick.

Mr. Brownlee questioned the infill in the storefront window areas; however, this occurred before designation. Some members thought the new sash clearly differentiates the commercial scale of the first floor from the residential scale of the second floor. Mr. Baron clarified the staff and Committee's position on the removal of the glass block.

Patricia Freeland, Spring Garden Civic Association, said that the revised submission does not comply with the agreement between the applicant and the civic association. She also said that the civic association would like to see the removal of the glass block above the door and installation of a double door with a transom above or a full treatment restoration.

The applicant stated that the door's current structural elements will not accommodate a double door. However, the Commission took into consideration the existing conditions, and stated that a compelling case would be needed to justify the removal of this fabric. It also believed that the recommendations by the civic association would give a false sense of that which never existed and that anything short of a total restoration would result in a hodge-podge appearance.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the revised submission of 9 May 2001 with the requirement that the glass block above the door remain. Mr. James seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Mr. Brownlee returned the gavel to Mr. Spilove.

1606 Chestnut Street

Howard Winig, Owner

Albert Taus, Architect

DATE: 1890, Albert W. Dilks, Architect

PROPOSAL: Storefront alterations

The proposal involves removing the existing modern storefront and constructing a new storefront based upon the original architect's rendering. The architect seeks to remove the granite step in order to create handicap accessibility. The staff recommended approval with the modification of a wood panel and glazed side light.

The Architectural Committee recommended staff approval based on a restoration, therefore the Commission need take no action.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 4 May 2001.

2226 Green Street

Alson Alston, Owner

Piero Grimaldi, Architect

DATE: c. 1866 2224 Green Street, 2226 new construction

PROPOSAL: Construct a single-family dwelling

The Architectural Committee recommended approval with the staff to review details. The niche art will be review by staff for dimension details not content.

This proposal involves the construction of a single family home on the historic side yard of 2224 Green Street. The Architectural Committee previously approved plans for a multi-family dwelling at this location on 30 January 2001. The applicants, however, withdrew their application before the Historical Commission reviewed the project on 14 February 2001.

This new application addresses zoning and the neighbors' concerns by decreasing the overall size of the building and creating a single family dwelling. The plans show several changes to the building since its approval in January. They are as follows:

- The width of the front façade has been reduced;
- The front façade's brick edges have been eliminated;
- The pediment and arched windows on the front façade have been removed, reducing the height of the building by over 4 feet, replaced by a flat roof and two niches on the third floor to contain artwork;
- The first and second floor windows on the front façade have been reduced to double windows from triple windows, the front balconies have been shortened and the front door height has been raised to eliminate a rectangular transom; and
- The side balconies on the west elevation have been reduced significantly in size.

The staff recommended approval per Standards 9 and 10 with no staff review of the content of the art placed in the front façade niches.

Mr. Wilds questioned whether the revised proposal addresses the rear massing issue and the building's depth.

Ronald Patterson, Esq., counsel for the applicant, attended the meeting and said that the revised submission has been modified with the depth of the building narrower and shorter.

Patricia Freeland, Spring Garden Civic Association, stated that although the revised construction is shorter, it still consumes a great portion of the lot and asked that the rear of the house be shortened to coincide with 2228 Green Street, the building to which it attaches.

Paula Pzats, the neighbor at 2228, believes the proposed building's length is an issue, because it overwhelms her house.

Lambrini Barbalios, the neighbor at 2224, expressed concern about the obstruction of air and light to the windows to the west.

The Commission thought the revised proposal appropriate and compatible in rhythm and scale.

Mr. James made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried with 8 votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Historic Designation, 4 April 2001.

Schmidt's Brew House

160-68 West Girard Avenue

DATE: 1911-14

ARCHITECT: Otto Wolf

The Commission declined to discuss designation owing to the building's demolition, but Mr. James asked that the address be corrected.

Mr. James made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation for denial of the nomination. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Eighth National Bank

1201-09 North Second Street, a.k.a. 183-87 Girard Avenue

DATE: 1871 with additions

ARCHITECT: Thomas S. Levy

Ms. Brennan presented the nomination for the Eighth National Bank building. She stated that the building meets five of the historic designation criteria provided in the Philadelphia Code: A, C, D, H and J and that the Designation Committee and staff unanimously recommended approval of the nomination. The Eighth National Bank, located at the northeast corner of North 2nd Street and Girard Avenue in the Northern Liberties section of Philadelphia, was originally located on North 2nd Street below Girard Avenue. The bank moved to its present location in 1869 and construction of a new building occurred in 1871. The bank expanded several times during the early part of the century, though these subsequent additions to the 1871 structure retained the architectural styling of the original. The Eighth National bank has significance owing to its association with the history of Philadelphia banking, its neighborhood and the 1863 National Banking Act under which the bank sought its charter. In addition, the building has significance for its architecture. Philadelphia architect Thomas Levy, known for Philadelphia's Greenwood Cemetery, designed the building. Levy utilized components of both the Italianate and Second Empire styles.

The Commission inquired about the owner's notification of the nomination, and Ms. Spina said that the owner was notified but had not replied to any correspondence.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Diamond Street Historic District

At the designation meeting of 4 April 2001, the Committee addressed the issue of boundary changes owing to areas with extensive demolition. However, community and church leaders strongly opposed boundary changes. The Committee chose not to recommend any action to change the boundaries.

Mr. Wilds questioned whether the Commission's review process changes when a site is demolished owing to Imminently Dangerous status and Mr. Tyler responded that the review process remains the same. Mr. James requested a list of city owned properties in the Diamond Street Historic District.

Rev. Ellis Loudon, Jones Tabernacle A.M.E. Church, attended the meeting to support the retention of the present boundaries.

Kevin Lamb, Office of State Senator Shirley Kitchen, thought it important to maintain the integrity of the district, thus contributing to the revitalization of the North Central Area.

Joan Garrett attended the meeting to support the retention of the boundaries.

Removal of Demolished Buildings from the Philadelphia Register

Mr. Tyler addressed the draft policy statement on the question and said that the Law Department has it under review.

The Committee took no action on this matter.

THE REPORT on the Activities of the Historical Commission Staff, April 2001.

Mr. Tyler asked if members of the Commission had any questions about the report. There were none.

Mr. Brownlee made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Wischmann seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 11:25 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Hughes
Executive Secretary