

THE MINUTES OF THE 315th STATED MEETING

OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

28 October 1987

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

Present: Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

David Brownlee

David Hollenberg

Jason Nathan

David Dambly, Commissioner, Department of Public Property

Henry Herling, Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections

Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission

John Street, Esq., Councilman Fifth District

Scott Wilds, Office of Housing

Frederick Bader, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer

Merrie Winston, Historical Architect

Randal Baron, Preservation Planner

Sally Elk, Historical Research Technician

Terri Koob, Executive Secretary

Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I

Also: Edna M. Irving, Councilman Street's Office

Sandra Garz, City Planning Commission

Residents of Pine and Stamper Street:

Duncan Buell and Sally Lou Buell-236 Stamper Street

Gary Haynes - 234 Pine Street

Joan Johnson - 230 Stamper Street

Howard Kelly - SEc 3rd & Stamper Streets

Faith W. Lemmer - 236 Pine Street

Robert Rathsmill - 236 Pine Street

Alfred Spause - 234 Stamper Street

Randy Henkels, Mark B. Thompson Architects

Eleanor Gesensway, Resident, 626 Spruce Street

Cindi Ettinger, 142 Vine Street

Thomas Hine, Reporter with The Philadelphia Inquirer

MaryLou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition
of Greater Philadelphia

Patrick M. Starr, Foundation for Architecture

William A. Kingsley and Roger Prichard, Old City Civic
Association

And others.

Unless otherwise noted, actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 314th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held 26 August 1987, Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman, were reviewed and approved.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 8 October 1987, David Hollenberg, Chairman. Mr. Hollenberg divided the report into four separate sections, discussed each individually, and offered individual motions. These sections are the projects which have been approved as submitted, the projects which required additional information, building permit violations, and St. Augustine's Church.

Mr. Hollenberg informed the Commission that the projects which were approved as submitted are 13 S. 2nd Street, The Reading Terminal Market at 12th & Filbert Streets, Drumm Moir Carriage House, and The Church of the New Jerusalem located at 2129 Chestnut Street.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the recommendations of the Architectural Committee for the above mentioned projects.

Mr. Hollenberg also informed the Commission that the Architectural Committee requested additional information on three proposals; the additional information has not yet been received. These projects include 601-645 Walnut Street, 158 N. 3rd Street and 126 Cuthbert Street.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve this section of the Architectural Committee report.

Mr. Hollenberg informed the Commission that two properties are in violation of Section 14-2007 of the Philadelphia Code. The first violation involves a building located at 2006 Brandywine Street. The applicants did not adhere to the building permit application as amended by Mr. Tyler to read "windows to replicate existing, wooden, double hung two-over-two sash". Instead, the applicant installed on the first floor a one-over-one double hung sash with the upper sash occupying approximately one-third of the opening; moreover, all the replacement windows are smaller than the original ones and do not fit the original masonry opening. Therefore, Mr. Hollenberg stated that it is the recommendation of the Architectural Committee that this violation be corrected and that the windows be made to conform to the approved permit application.

Mr. Hollenberg next explained to the Commission that the work at 230 Pine Street was done without the applicant's obtaining a building permit. This project entails the installation of a rolling steel gate. Since this gate is not in keeping with the character of the property or the neighborhood, the Architectural Committee voted to recommend that this violation be corrected and that a gate be

installed that is sympathetic to the character of the neighborhood and property.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the recommendations of the Architectural Committee for the two properties in violation.

Mr. Hollenberg next discussed the proposal to remove the steeple at St. Augustine's Church located at North 4th & New Streets. The Architectural Committee requested that an evaluation be made by an independent structural engineer. Mr. Hollenberg also stated that the staff of the Historical Commission will work with the Church to find an acceptable alternative to the proposed steeple removal and requested that no action be taken at this time.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the recommendation of the Architectural Committee.

Mr. Hollenberg stated that a correction should be made to the Report of the Architectural Committee meeting, held on 9 April 1987, for the Church of the New Jerusalem submission. The Report erroneously states that David Hollenberg will abstain from voting. The correction should note that "David Hollenberg abstains from voting on the St. Augustine's submission."

This completed the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting which was approved in its entirety.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Historic Designation Meeting held on 2 October 1987, David Brownlee, Chairman.

3306-3320 Arch Street

Mr. Brownlee described the historical significance of these eight buildings and Mr. Baron presented slides of subject properties. Mr. Brownlee explained that the architect for these buildings is not known. Mr. Brownlee also stated that 3306-3320 Arch Street are presently single family dwellings and that they are listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Mr. Baron stated that these buildings are an outstanding example of the Queen Anne style of architecture.

The Commission unanimously voted to designate the eight buildings located at 3306-3320 Arch Street.

2-16 Vine Street - Jayne Estate Building

Mr. Brownlee informed the Commission that at its Meeting of 25 February 1987 the Commission had reviewed this building for National Register listing and at this time commented that it should be listed on the National Register. Mr. Brownlee stated that the architect was John McArthur, Jr. He commented on the significance of this building as a nineteenth-century commercial building and noted that it is the only one of its kind still existing on Delaware Avenue.

The Commission inquired if this building is occupied and if the owners have been notified that this building is being considered for

designation.

The Commission was informed that the property had been recently sold and at this time it is not occupied. The attorney for the new owners has been informed that this building is being considered for designation. No objection to this building's proposed designation was expressed.

The Commission unanimously voted to designate the Jayne Estate building located at 2-16 Vine Street.

Mr. Brownlee stated that the owners of the remaining buildings listed on the Report of the Designation Committee Meeting were not notified in time for consideration at this meeting; therefore, they will be considered at a future meeting.

Mr. Brownlee informed the Commission that a staff member of the Historical Commission is working full time on the Rittenhouse letters and they should be sent out within several weeks.

THE REPORT of the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for 15 August - 15 September 1987 and 15 September - 15 October 1987, Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer.

Mr. Tyler stated that he had a few items to add to the Activity Reports.

First, Mr. Tyler informed the Commission that a letter was received Monday, 26 October 1987, from Robert Hazen of the Redevelopment Authority concerning the results of its efforts to participate in 149 S. Hancock Street to make it economically feasible. This letter was distributed to the Commission. In addition two data sheets which supplement the letter were received on Tuesday, 27 October. Since these materials were received so late it was decided that it would be premature to review them at this meeting. Therefore, Mr. Tyler recommended that the issue of 149 S. Hancock Street be deferred until the November Commission meeting.

Secondly, an economic feasibility study of Laning Hall and the Naval Home has been received from Toll Brothers and has been submitted to a consultant for an analysis.

A copy of the consultant's analysis will be sent out to each of the Commission members. Mr. Tyler suggested that the Naval Home be deferred to the December Commission meeting.

Barbara Kaplan requested that all the materials which have been accumulated since the first demolition request for 149 S. Hancock Street be distributed to the Architectural Committee for its review and then distributed to the Commission members prior to the November Commission meeting for their review. The Commission members should also receive a copy of the final review and recommendation of the Architectural Committee on this demolition request.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Report of the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities including the addenda.

OLD BUSINESS

207-207 1/2 Vine Street

Mr. Tyler informed the Commission that the property located at 207 Vine Street was erected c. 1840 with the hyphen at 207 1/2 erected c. 1900. Mr. Tyler continued that 207 and 209 Vine Street were acquired by the present owner in April 1983 for \$93,000 following the failure of the former owner to make mortgage payments. The current market value for tax purposes is \$360,000 for 207-209 Vine Street. Mr. Tyler then gave a brief summary on the history of this project. In 1983 the applicant submitted plans for the rehabilitation of 207-209 Vine Street and the removal of the hyphen at 207 1/2. The Historical Commission approved the proposal. However, the National Park Service denied the investment tax credit owing to the intended removal of the 1900 hyphen. The Park Service considered this addition an important piece of vernacular crafts architecture. A fire subsequent to this proposal made development plans difficult. The applicant then applied for a demolition permit in June of this year at which time he submitted data as prescribed by the Ordinance in Section 7F .1 -.7. The Architectural Committee recommended the retention of a consultant to evaluate the materials submitted by the owner.

Mr. Tyler stated that the materials were turned over to Reaves C. Lukens Company for evaluation. This study was distributed to the Commission members prior to today's meeting. Mr. Tyler outlined this report and noted that it concluded that the income return would not justify the rehabilitation cost of this structure. Mr. Tyler concurred with this conclusion and recommended that the Commission consent to demolition of 207-207 1/2 Vine Street.

Jason Nathan asked Mr. Tyler why 209 Vine Street is being rehabilitated and why 207-207 1/2 Vine Street is not. Mr. Tyler informed Mr. Nathan that the rear of the building at 209 Vine was in much better condition.

Barbara Kaplan asked what the plans are for this property if demolition is allowed. She further asked if the Department of Licenses and Inspections has inspected this property. Mr. Tyler stated that the property will be used for parking to accommodate the units at 209 Vine Street. Commissioner Herling from the Department of Licenses and Inspections stated that he does not know if this building was inspected by his department. However, Mr. Herling agreed to get this information.

Roger Prichard of the Old City Civic Association commented on the fact sheet for 207 Vine Street that was prepared by his Association. Mr. Prichard spoke to all the points of the fact sheet. The points that caused extensive discussion among the Commission members were the issues of the deterioration of the building by neglect and if there was any insurance money received and, if so, what was done with the proceeds.

The owner's son, Mark Tucker, appeared before the Commission and stated that there were two fires at this property; however, he did not know the exact dates of these two fires. Mr. Tucker also stated that he did not know if there was any insurance money received subsequent to these fires.

Patrick Starr from the Foundation of Architecture addressed the Commission and also questioned whether any insurance money was received and if so what was done with the proceeds. Mr. Starr also stated that he thinks it would be beneficial if in the future the Historical Commission staff would inspect designated buildings that are listed on the Philadelphia Register after a fire.

John Street stated that he would like to know what percent of the deterioration was caused by the fires and what percent of the deterioration was caused by neglect.

Richard Tyler stated that the connecting hyphen and rear ell were completely ruined and the roof of the main building was damaged. The rafters of the roof along with some damage to the second and third floors were all caused by the fire. David Hollenberg also stated that a large part of the deterioration to the front of the house was caused by the fire.

After considerable discussion it was recommended that the following information be obtained before a final decision is made.

1. date property was listed for sale;
2. date of second fire;
3. date of the Part II application;
4. amount, if any, of insurance proceeds, and how they were spent;
5. an inspection of 207-207 1/2 Vine Street by the Department of Licenses and Inspections and a copy of the report of this inspection; and,
6. report from the Fire Department after the second fire.

NEW BUSINESS

National Register Nomination

Richard Tyler requested that David Brownlee give a brief explanation on The Center City West Commercial District. David Brownlee stated that this district is a collection of late 19th and early 20th Century buildings and that some of the buildings were originally residential but have been converted to commercial use. Mr. Brownlee also stated that there are a large number of contributing buildings in this district. Mr. Brownlee reminded the Commission that these nominations are being presented for comment and stated that it is the Committee on Historic Designation's conclusion that this district meets the criteria for National Register listing.

The Commission unanimously concurred with Mr. Brownlee's recommendation.

Pitcairn Building - 1027 Arch Street

Richard Tyler gave a brief summary of the history and architectural significance of this building. Mr. Tyler stated that the building is named after John Pitcairn and was designed by the architectural office of the Hewitt Brothers. Mr. Tyler also noted that this building possesses significance to business, labor, social and

architectural history. Mr. Tyler recommends that this building be listed on the National Register.

The Commission agreed with the recommendation of Mr. Tyler that the Pitcairn Building meets the criteria for listing on the National Register. David Hollenberg abstained.

John Street stated that he had recently attended another meeting where he learned of the proposed rehabilitation of the Philadelphia Housing Authority scattered sites on the 1500 block of Diamond Street and/or other blocks in that area. It was stated that money was not available at this time because they were waiting for the Historical Commission to approve some aspect of the plans. Mr. Street requested to know the status of this project. Mr. Tyler stated that he and Merrie Winston visited the site where they made recommendations and asked Ms. Winston if there had been any response. Ms. Winston stated that she had written general specifications for the project recommending that certain procedures be used in rehabilitating the structures and at that time was awaiting a response for PHA & OHCD. Councilman Street requested that he be informed of the progress of the situation.

Mr. Montgomery requested that the next Commission Meeting start at 10:00 a.m. for an executive session.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Steno I

/mah