

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Arlene Matzkin, Chairperson
Commission Conference Room
Suite 1301, 1401 Arch Street
26 March 1996

Present

Arlene Matzkin, Chairperson
J. William Cornell
Suzanne Pentz

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Jeffrey Barr, Historical Research Technician

Also, with affiliation and/or project

Bernard Nearey, Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District
David McGrath, Contractor, 1929 Manning Street
Nan Gutterman, R.A., Vitetta Group, Academy of Music
Lynn R. Axelroth, Esq., Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll,
Academy of Music
Joanne Phillips, Esq., Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll,
Academy of Music
George Schaeffer, Philadelphia Orchestra Association, Academy of
Music
Debora Russo, Accessibility Compliance Office, Academy of Music
S. N. Wilson, Accessibility Compliance Office, Academy of Music
Robert Thomas, R.R., Accessibility Advisory Board, Academy of
Music
Robert Morrone, Philadelphia Museum of Art
Judith Eden, Center City Residents Association (CCRA)
George Brodie, CCRA
Bobbie Burke, Rittenhouse/Fitler District
William Burke, Art Commission
Joel Zeigler, Wesley Wei Architects, 2413 Panama Street
Michael Webb, 22nd and Walnut Streets
Carmen LaRosa, R.A., 1719 Rittenhouse Square Street
Walter F. Spiegel, P.E., Rittenhouse Square Pool
Nancy Heinzen, Rittenhouse Square Pool
Bernard Heinzen, Rittenhouse Square Pool
Robert Hanna, Rittenhouse Square Pool
Henry Magaziner, R.A., Rittenhouse Square Pool
Wayne Spilove, Friends of Rittenhouse Square, Rittenhouse Square
Pool
Lenore Millhollen, Rittenhouse Square Pool
David Polatnick, R.A., 1811 Walnut Street
Hal Wheeler, 1811 Walnut Street
Cirel Magen, CCRA
G. Laren, Owner, 3204 Powelton Avenue
Milton Marks, Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia
Philip Scott, R.A., John Milner Associates, Reading Terminal
Headhouse
Eric Rahe, R.A., Bower, Lewis, Thrower, Reading Terminal
Headhouse

William McDowell, Redevelopment Authority, Reading Terminal
Headhouse
Sabrina Soong, R.A., Soong Associates, 325 South 18th Street
Terry Kennedy, Owner, 325 South 18th Street

Ms. Matzkin called the meeting to order at 2:15 p.m.

Philadelphia Museum of Art

Robert Morrone, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Temporary waiting and ticketing tents

As a courtesy to the Commission, the Philadelphia Museum of Art submitted its proposal to erect two additional tents in the east forecourt if necessary to accommodate persons attending the Cezanne exhibition this summer.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this project so long as it will disturb neither the trees nor paving of the forecourt.

1929 Manning Street

David McGrath, Contractor

PROPOSAL: Rehabilitation of carriage house

The applicant proposes to convert this carriage house into a residence with an additional roof structure and deck not visible from the street, and to install new doors at grade and the hayloft. The design of these doors evokes the form of the existing diagonally braced doors with glazed triangles. The space behind the doors at grade will be used for parking; the living room will be on the second floor. Committee members questioned this design and urged either retention of the existing doors or the installation of new doors with glazing in a different pattern.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the proposal with either retention of the door at grade or its redesign and the retention of the hayloft sliding door with the addition of glazing in that opening.

13 South 21st Street

Ivor Moore, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Legalization of existing sign

The applicant seeks the legalization of projecting sign that has existed at this location for some twenty years before the creation of the Rittenhouse/Fitler Historic District. The Art Commission has approved this sign subject to its removal upon application to change or reface it.

The Committee voted to recommend the legalization of this sign subject to its removal upon any application to change or reface it.

232-246 South Broad Street, The Academy of Music

Nan Gutterman, Vitetta Group

George Schaeffer, Philadelphia Orchestra Association

Lynn Axelroth, Esq., Counsel, Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll

Joanne Phillips, Esq., Counsel, Ballard, Spahr, Andrews & Ingersoll

PROPOSAL: Exterior ramp to comply with the Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA)

Ms Axelroth introduced the subject and Nan Gutterman of the Vitetta Group.

Ms. Gutterman described the Orchestra Association's goal of complying with ADA, of providing a front entrance for everyone, of preserving the institution as well as the building fabric, and of offering all persons the full experience of the interior spaces.

Ms. Gutterman presented the enclosed table of options that evaluates the many factors considered in the selection of the location for the ramp. Scheme 1 has a ramp at the front of the Academy with the entrance at the southernmost Broad Street door. Scheme 2 places the ADA entrance at the far end of the side alley. Scheme 3 utilizes the side door nearest Broad Street with a switch-back ramp beginning in the alley. Scheme 4 cuts the southernmost window of the Broad Street facade into a door and employs a lift rather than a ramp for access. Scheme 4a converts a small window in the alley into a door; Scheme 4b, a variant of 4a, uses a larger alley window. The Committee readily agreed on the unacceptability of Schemes 2, 4, 4a and 4b. Scheme 2 does not satisfy considerations of dignity, directness and circulation. Schemes 4, 4a and 4b reduce the square footage of the existing box office, compromises the plan and function of the lower level, and involves much greater costs. This discussion left Schemes 1 and 3 for further deliberation.

The consideration of the two remaining options addressed questions of interior circulation, security, dignity, safety, building function, service to the Academy, ramp slope, balancing of issues, and design. Ms. Matzkin suggested a variant on Scheme 3. It would begin the ramp on Broad Street from behind the subway headhouse, turn into the alley, and enter the alley door nearest Broad Street. Debra Russo of the Accessibility Compliance Office and Robert Thomas of the Accessibility Advisory Board noted that this solution, with the ramp beginning on Broad Street, meets the dignity standard. Indeed, in anticipation of the Architectural Committee's review of the current submission, the Accessibility Advisory Board discussed it at a meeting the prior week; three of the six members of the Board attended the Architectural Committee meeting. It also emerged during the Committee's deliberations that a side entrance ramp better satisfies the slope criterion of ADA. Both Scheme 1 and Ms. Matzkin's modification of Scheme 3 will require ADA ramp width variances for the section behind the subway headhouse. For

ACADEMY OF MUSIC - 21st CENTURY						
VITETTA GROUP - Architect						
ISSUES	SCHEME 1	SCHEME 2	SCHEME 3	SCHEME 4	SCHEME 4a	SCHEME 4b
	Proposed Broad Street Entry	Existing Alley Ramp	Alley Entrance	Broad Street Box Office	Alley Box Office	Alley Box Office
Independent access	Yes	No, must have someone unlock door	No, must have someone unlock door	Yes	Yes	Yes
Discriminatory setting	No, primary public entrance	Yes, existing alley	Yes, existing alley	No, adjacent to primary public entrance	Yes, existing alley	Yes, existing alley
Access to social space	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Must travel through ambulatory	Must travel through corridor and ambulatory	Must travel through box office	Must travel through box office	Must travel through box office
Access to Box Office	Excellent, existing box office configuration is maintained	Not direct	Not direct	Direct access, but reduces existing box office square footage by 33%	Direct access, but reduces existing box office square footage by 33%	Direct access, but reduces existing box office configuration by 60%
Access to Ballroom	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Very circuitous	Very circuitous	Good	Good	Good
Access to Handicap elevator	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Very circuitous	Very circuitous	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Excellent, same as rest of patrons
Access to Performance	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Not very good	Not very good	Good, but conflict with box office traffic	Good, but conflict with box office traffic	Good, but conflict with box office traffic
Traffic flow	Excellent, same as rest of patrons	Poor, against flow of traffic	Poor, against flow of traffic	Good, but conflict with box office traffic	Good, but conflict with box office traffic	Good, but conflict with box office traffic
Impact on primary facade	Minor	None	None	Minimal	None	None
Impact of original exterior fabric	Minor	None	Minor	Major	Major	Major
Impact on original interior fabric	None	None	None	Yes	Yes	Yes
Impact on building function	None	None	Enter through a fire exit	Significant, eliminate basement use in this area	Significant, eliminate basement use in this area	Significant, eliminate basement use in this area
Historical use	Excellent, this is the location of the original entrance	Not historical entrance	Not historical entrance	Not historical entrance	Not historical entrance	Not historical entrance
Security	Excellent	Poor	Poor	Fair	Fair	Fair
Cost	\$90,000	\$70,000	\$110,000	Very expensive	Very expensive	Very expensive

Scheme 1, the Committee suggested restudy of the design and vocabulary of the ramp, including its materials and its relationship to the existing steps and building.

The Committee recommended a restudy of the Scheme 3 side entrance with a ramp that begins on Broad Street and of the design of the Scheme 1 ramp for reevaluation by the Committee.

Ms. Axelroth inquired into the permit status of the remaining scope of work on this application as reviewed and approved by the Committee and Commission previously. Mr. Tyler informed her that the staff would stamp the application and drawings with the exception of the ramp.

2423 Panama Street

Joel Ziegler, Wesley Wei Associates

PROPOSAL: New doors and windows; repair masonry

This proposal involves the removal of modern windows, the installation of six over six double hung wooden sash, replacement of the door and transom, elimination of a kitchen exhaust, and masonry repair.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this submission.

1719 Rittenhouse Square Street

Carmen LaRosa, Architect

PROPOSAL: Erect exterior rear stair with new deck railing and conversion of a rear window into a door

The Commission tabled a version of this submission previously pending zoning approval and consideration of an interior egress alternative. The present proposal redesigns the exterior stair treatment not intrude visually on the principal facades or streets.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this proposal.

22nd and Walnut Streets

Michael Webb, Artist

PROPOSAL: Wall murals

Mr. Webb submitted revised drawings for the mural which portrays reflections and a shadow of the buildings that once stood on and next to this site now occupied by a gasoline service station.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this project.

1811 Walnut Street, The Rittenhouse Club

1805-1809 Walnut Street
Mario Zacharjasz, Architect
Hal Wheeler, Owner

PROPOSAL for 1811 Walnut Street: Remove front steps to provide
ADA access; schematic design of Sansom Street facade; awnings
PROPOSAL for 1805-1809 Walnut Street: awnings; banners

This proposal calls for the removal of the front steps to provide ADA access to the former Rittenhouse Club which will have a commercial use. In view of the projection of the entrance from the plane of the building and the width of the door opening, a ramp does not afford a feasible alternative.

The applicant also seeks a conceptual review of a schematic drawing of the facade of a building to replace the existing rear structures facing Sansom Street.

For 1805-1809 Walnut Street, the applicant submitted a proposal for awnings.

The Committee suggested that the applicant work with the staff to develop awning designs for both buildings based on historic precedents.

During the discussion of the Sansom Street facade treatment, Committee members posed a variety of questions concerning the need to recess the building line approximately fifteen feet behind the property line, the feasibility of truck access for deliveries, and the character of this block of Sansom Street. The Committee concluded that the architect was on the right course and should develop the plan and elevation more fully.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the removal of the front steps to provide ADA access subject to the storage of steps for possible later use. The Committee also agreed that the applicant should study photographs for an historic predicate for the awnings. The Committee encouraged the architect to proceed with the design development of the Sansom Street component of this project.

1115-1141 Market Street, Reading Terminal Headhouse

Philip Scott, John Milner Associates

Eric Rehe, Bower, Lewis, Thrower

William McDowell, Redevelopment Authority

PROPOSAL: Interior rehabilitation of public access zone and
review in concept of limited exterior work at the Reading
Terminal House

This submission involves the interior public improvements needed to connect the Pennsylvania Convention Center with Market Street through the Reading Terminal Headhouse. Most of the work will occur in the link building between the Shed and the Headhouse.

The exterior work includes Convention Center identification pylons in the Market Street sidewalk and flags. It also calls for another entrance on the south side of Filbert Street.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the submission.

Rittenhouse Square Pool

Walter F. Spiegel, P.E., Applicant

PROPOSAL: Refurbish Rittenhouse Square Pool

The Friends of Rittenhouse Square propose to refurbish the pool in Rittenhouse Square. The project entails:

1. new piping under the basin with four new vertical jets and new mechanical equipment in an existing pit vault;
2. new overhead lighting fixtures on the existing lamp posts to illuminate "The Duck Girl";
3. new low voltage under water lighting to illuminate the Roman mask, the tile panel and the four jets;
4. new electric and water supply from the utility service at the Square's boundaries, and
5. masonry cleaning.

The Pool forms a part of the plan of 1913 for the improvement of Rittenhouse Square by Paul P. Cret. Originally, the Pool was a reflecting pool with a small stream of water discharging from the Roman Mask embedded in a panel into a basin. The tile of the panel had a floral design. The present tile work replaced Cret's very early. "The Duck Girl" was placed in the pool in 1960. Although drawings of 1953 indicate a plan for ten water jets in the Pool, the only evidence for the execution of this project is a surge tank and one pipe stub in the center of the Pool.

Several attendees, including Nancy Heinzen, Lenore Millhollen, George Brodie, Robert Hanna and Henry Magaziner, spoke in opposition to the proposal. They stated that the introduction of water jets would further compromise the integrity of Cret's reflecting pool which he conceived of as a reflecting pool, not as a pool with fountains or movement. Mrs. Heinzen also raised the question of maintenance. No one took exception to the other elements of the proposal. Bernard Nearey thought the project as submitted would affect no significant change in the character of the Pool.

Mr. Tyler noted that some changes to Cret's Pool had already occurred, including the color of the floor of the basin which should be black in a reflecting pool. For reasons of safety, the Fairmount Park Commission declines to restore the black finish. Mr. Tyler repeated the staff recommendation to the Committee:

approval owing to the de minimis effect on the Pool and the ability to vary the height of the jets and to turn them on and off, thus the Pool may serve both as a still pool or as a pool with movement as occasion warrants.

Following further discussion, the Committee voted as follows:

Ms. Matzkin: nay

Mr. Cornell: aye

Ms. Pentz: abstention.

3204 Powelton Avenue

Guy Laren, Owner

PROPOSAL: Porch post and railing

As a result of porch work performed by the previous owner, the applicant received a violation. The present owner proposes to reinstall the original newel post and to construct a new railing dividing the porch of 3204 Powelton Avenue from abutting porch.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of the submission.

325 South 18th Street

Sabrina Soong, Architect

Terry Kennedy, Owner

PROPOSAL: Restoration and partial reconstruction

The Commission previously reviewed and approved plans for this project. The present submission, prepared by a different architect, deviates from the earlier one in that it calls for less new construction and seeks to retain more of the existing windows. This proposal, like its predecessor, conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this submission.

318-322 South 19th Street

Sol Weiss, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Replace missing roof tiles; install security light

The applicant proposes to replace missing roof tiles and to install a security light on the Delancey Street parapet.

The Committee voted to recommend approval of this submission.

Respectfully submitted,

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer