

MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

14 December 1971

Present: Mr. Henry J. Magaziner, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Mr. Erling H. Pedersen, A.I.A., Old Philadelphia Development Corporation
Mr. Richmond P. Miller, for the Commission
Mr. Ira Winarsky, for the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority
Dr. Margaret B. Tinkcom, Historian
Mrs. Charles J. Maurer, Executive Assistant to the Chairman
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Secretary

Also: Mr. G. Edwin Brumbaugh, F.A.I.A., Mr. Albert Ruthrauff, and Dr. Gordon Venables, President of Colonial Germantown, Inc., to present to the Architectural Committee their plans for the rehabilitation of 5443-45 Germantown Avenue, and Mr. Charles Squire and Mr. David Boyd, representing the Redevelopment Authority.

RESUBMISSIONS

✓ 5443-45 Germantown Avenue, G. Edwin Brumbaugh, F.A.I.A. Mr. Brumbaugh and his two associates presented to the Architectural Committee their proposal to change the presently existing Italianate building on Market Square to give it the appearance of one from the Greek Revival period. The purpose of this reconstruction, as stated by Mr. Brumbaugh, is to return that area of Germantown to its appearance at the time when it was most important, i. e. c. 1790. It was the architect's opinion that an Italianate building would not be in harmony with the earlier structures on the square and that a Greek Revival facade, with its near Colonial details, would be more in keeping with the atmosphere of Colonial Germantown which Mr. Brumbaugh feels should be recreated.

Mr. Magaziner and the other members of the committee did not agree with Mr. Brumbaugh's philosophy pointing out that history has, and is, continually evolving as do architectural styles. It was stressed that Market Square is important because it shows the growth and development of Germantown and for this reason the Italianate structure should remain to provide continuity from the colonial period to present-day Germantown.

It was the opinion of the Redevelopment Authority that economic success could be achieved with a Victorian building in this area if careful thought and planning were put into its restoration.

After excusing the guests, the Committee unanimously agreed not to allow a pseudo-Colonial structure to be made of the existing Victorian building and strongly urged the restoration of the building to the 1850 period when it was constructed.

RESUBMISSIONS (cont'd)

- ✓ 216 South Delhi Street, Harold Lichtman. The Committee decided that the original window frames must remain and that sash made to fit these frames must be installed - on this basis, approval was given. Meeting rails on all shutters should be lowered to allow them to be operated.
- ✓ 217 Delancey Street, B. J. Kaplan, R. A. The Committee agreed with the recommendations of the Advisory Board of Design and agreed to supply the architect with details of moldings for the door, windows, etc.
- ✓ Belmont Mansion, Frederick Roth, F.A.I.A. The Committee gave its approval of the proposal presented provided that the grand staircase remain intact and that the interiors of the first and second floors be correctly restored.
- ✓ 9 Queen Street, Theodore Bartley, A.I.A. Approval was given with a recommendation that a study be made of the number of window lights needed before any sash is purchased. (It was thought that the first floor window sash would likely have been four lights wide, while those on the second floor were probably three lights wide only.) The staff will supply shutter and door profiles of the proper period.
- ✓ 105 Queen Street, S. Sherwin Rocklis, R. A. Approved.

SUBMISSIONS

- ✓ 112, 114, 116 Carpenter Street and court houses, Nick James Chimes. Approved.
- ✓ 1618 Locust Street, Aaron Kolish, A.I.A. Approved.
- ✓ The Cliffs, R. I. Alotta, President of the Shackamaxon Society. The work outlined in Mr. Alotta's letter of December 2, 1971 was approved. The Committee requested that further information be supplied to the Commission on all other alterations planned for this building in the future.
- ✓ Chamounix, Bruce Millard. Alterations to the interior of the carriage house so that it may be used as an annex to the hostel were approved.
- ✓ Fort Mifflin - the Arsenal, John Dickey, A.I.A. Dr. Tinkcom read Mr. Dickey's justification for installing a zinc roof on this building to the Committee. The Committee concurred with Mr. Dickey's opinion and only requested that it be a standing seam roof not a corrugated one.
- ✓ 8031 Germantown Avenue, Charles Woodward. Permission to repoint the stone work rather than restucco the exterior of this house was granted. The owner was asked to examine the outriggers on the southern most part of this structure to see whether a pent eave should be replaced.
- ✓ 230 Stamper Street, Hugh Zimmers, A.I.A. Approved.

PROBLEMS

1609 West Girard Avenue, John Carter, Contractor. The economic status of the owner was taken into consideration and it was decided that a temporary roof of asphalt shingling could replace the existing one. It was recommended, however, that the contractor salvage as many tiles as possible which could perhaps be reused someday when restoration of the building is economically feasible.

131 North Fourth Street, Owen Fox. Mrs. Maurer reported on her visit to the site and subsequent conclusion that it most probably had a pent eave between the first and second floors. On the basis of Mrs. Maurer's report the Committee approved the installation of a pent eave. A drawing is now requested.

PLAQUES REQUESTED

419-21 South Camac Street. Approved.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski, Secretary