

**THE MINUTES OF THE 735TH STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 10 NOVEMBER 2023, 9:00 A.M.
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
ROBERT THOMAS, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Thomas, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Robert Thomas, AIA, Chair (Architectural Historian)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq., Vice Chair (Community Development Corporation)	X		
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Erin Kindt (Department of Public Property)	X		
Sara Lepori (Commerce Department)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)		X	
John Mattioni, Esq.	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)	X		
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)	X		
Jessica Sánchez, Esq. (City Council President)	X		
Matthew Treat (Department of Planning and Development)	X		

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Laura DiPasquale, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner II
Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner I
Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner II
Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

Adrian Trevisan, Powers & Co.
Alina Herzberg
Allison Weiss, SoLo/Germantown Civic Association
Brett Feldman, Esq., Klehr Harrison

Brody Hale
Carl Primavera, Esq., Klehr Harrison
Catherine Fazio
Charlotte Johnson
Christopher Daniels
Conor Larkin, Esq.
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission
David Traub, Save Our Sites
Deborah Gary, Society to Preserve Philadelphia African American Assets
Dennis Barnebey
Dennis Carlisle, OCF Realty
Dierdre McKee
Eileen Javers, Chestnut Hill Conservancy
Eloise Young
Eric Leighton, cbp Architects
Fr. Matthew H. Phelan
Glenn Blumenfeld
Greg Voshell
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance
Jack Burns, Jack Burns Architecture
Jacob Moreno
Jay Farrell
Jenn Patrino
Jill Deuel
J.M. Duffin
John Coleman
Karel Kilimnik
Karen Hammel
Kimberly Haas, Hidden City Philadelphia
Krista Brittingham
Larry Bendesky
Leannett Hill
Lili Razi
Lillian Prieto
Lori Salganicoff, Chestnut Hill Conservancy
M. Williams
Martha Griffin
Matthew McClure, Esq., Ballard Spahr
Meeka Outlaw
Meredith Ferleger, Esq.
Meredith Trego, Esq., Ballard Spahr
Mia Hamilton
Michael McIlhinney, Esq.
Monica Goodhart
Morgan
Nancy Pontone
Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Ralph Woerheide
Randy Williams
Rihanat Suarau
Sam Katovitch, Toner Architects

Sara Pochedly, Toner Architects
 Stephanie Boggs Magagna, Esq., Klehr Harrison
 Stephanie Pennypacker
 Steven Peitzman
 Stuart Udis
 Susan Blumenfeld
 Suzanne Ponsen, West Central Germantown Neighbors
 Tim Lux, Tierview Development

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 734TH STATED MEETING, 13 OCTOBER 2023

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:04:35

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Thomas asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any suggested additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 734th Stated Meeting, held 13 October 2023. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to adopt the minutes of the 734th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 13 October 2023. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 734th State Meeting of the PHC					
MOTION: Adopt minutes					
MOVED BY: Thomas					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

ADDRESS: 156 W SCHOOL HOUSE LN

Proposal: Demolish building owing to infeasibility of reuse and necessity in the public interest

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Pennsylvania School for the Deaf

Applicant: Matthew N. McClure, Ballard Spahr LLP

History: 1897; Boxwood; Mantle Fielding Jr., architect

Individual Designation: 3/12/2021

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW:

This application proposes to demolish the house at 156 W. School House Lane, owing to financial hardship and necessity in the public interest. The Pennsylvania School for the Deaf owns the property, which is adjacent to its campus in central Germantown. The application claims that the building cannot be feasibly adapted for use by the school and that demolishing the building and redeveloping the land for the school's use is necessary in the public interest. The Penn Knox Neighborhood Association nominated the property in January 2019, when a different non-profit owner planned to sell the property to a for-profit developer for redevelopment as an apartment complex. After the nomination was submitted, the apartment plan was abandoned and the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf purchased the property in July 2019. The school's campus borders the property on the northeast. In March 2021, the Historical Commission reviewed the nomination and designated the property. During the review, school representatives objected to the designation and explained that the school needed to redevelop the property to redesign the traffic flow on the campus and improve safety for the students. The school's consultants also explained that the house was in very poor condition and could not be feasibly adaptively reused for the students. At the time of designation, the Commission suggested that the school submit a financial hardship application formalizing and demonstrating its claims about the infeasibility of reuse and necessity in the public interest. This application is the result of that advice.

Section 14-1005(6)(d) of the City of Philadelphia's historic preservation ordinance expressly prohibits the Historical Commission from approving demolitions of historic buildings in all but two instances. It may approve a demolition only after determining that:

- the demolition is necessary in the public interest; and/or,
- the building cannot be used for any purpose for which it is or may be reasonably adapted.

In the first instance, the ordinance authorizes the Historical Commission to approve demolitions for public policy reasons, when the public interest advanced by the demolition greatly outweighs the public interest in the preservation of the building. In the second instance, the ordinance authorizes the Commission to approve demolitions when the Commission's regulation of the property denies the owner of all economically viable use of it and thereby inflicts a financial hardship on the owner.

The application consists of an affidavit and supporting documents. The application claims that the configuration and condition of the building prohibit a financially feasible reuse of the property. The application also claims that the demolition is necessary in the public interest because redeveloping the property is the only means of meeting certain needs of the school and its students.

In 2001, the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf sought and received the Historical Commission's approval to demolish the designated house at 143 W. Coulter Street, which was southeast of the property at 156 W. School House Lane and adjacent to the school's campus. The Historical Commission approved the demolition as necessary in the public interest, to clear the site for the construction of a facility for the school.

The Historical Commission's Rules and Regulations indicate that both the Architectural Committee and Committee on Financial Hardship must review financial hardship applications and offer recommendations to the Historical Commission. The Committee on Financial Hardship's role is clear; it must evaluate the claims of financial hardship and necessity in the public interest and determine whether they have merit. The Architectural Committee's role is less clear, but it typically offers a recommendation regarding the claims made in the application related to architecture, planning, and design. The Architectural Committee reviewed the application on 23 August 2022.

After the Architectural Committee's review, the applicants submitted two sets of additional information including materials regarding campus planning as it relates to parking and traffic circulation, existing and proposed facilities, floor plans for the house in question, and information about planning spaces for deaf persons.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the Historical Commission find that issuance of the demolition permit is necessary in the public interest and approve the application for the following reasons and with the following conditions:

- The application demonstrates that adaptively reusing the building in a way that would accommodate deaf and hard-of-hearing persons would be prohibitively expensive.
- The application demonstrates that, even if adapted at great expense, the building would not meet any need of the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf.
- The application demonstrates that incorporating the property into the campus would provide needed space for campus improvements that would increase safety and enhance educational experiences for students.
- While designated as historic, the building is of relatively minor historical and architectural significance. Relative significance can and should be factored into financial hardship and necessity in the public interest decisions.
- The staff advises that the Historical Commission grant final approval of this application but condition it on the review and approval of a campus reorganization plan that includes the relocations of drives, parking lots, and walkways, the location and massing of any new buildings, and the protection of archaeological resources.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend that:

- The Architectural Committee acknowledges that the primary program spaces that the school currently lacks and needs to provide such as dining and assembly spaces cannot be accommodated in the building at 156 W. School House Lane.
- The application has not proven that the demolition of the building and repurposing of the property will achieve the school's parking and circulation goals. More information is needed to show that reuse of the property for parking and circulation will increase the safety and efficiency of the campus.
- The application has not proven that the demolition of the building is necessary in the public interest, but that deficit could be remedied with additional information.

- Additional information should be provided to the Committee on Financial Hardship and the Historical Commission.

SEE BELOW.

ADDRESS: 8835 GERMANTOWN AVE

Name of Resource: Julia Hebard Marsden House

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Chestnut Hill Hospital LLC

Nominator: Chestnut Hill Conservancy

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the former Julia Hebard Marsden residence and stable, two buildings on the Chestnut Hill Hospital campus, at 8835 Germantown Avenue and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the buildings satisfy Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J.

Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the house and stable are representative examples of the Colonial Revival “country houses” that appeared in Chestnut Hill following the 1876 Centennial Exhibition in Philadelphia. Under Criterion E, the nomination contends that the buildings were designed by the nationally significant and Philadelphia-born architect Charles Barton Keen. Under Criterion J, the nomination argues that the residence and stable contributed to the neighborhood’s status as an elite residential enclave at the turn of the twentieth century.

Temple University Health System, Redeemer Health, and Philadelphia College of Osteopathic Medicine have formed a consortium and are attempting to purchase Chestnut Hill Hospital from Tower Health, the current owner. Tower Health and the hospital have faced significant financial challenges in recent years and the sale may prevent the closure of the facility, which provides essential services to the community.

The nominator, the Chestnut Hill Conservancy, and the property owner’s attorney have been discussing a possible compromise that would reduce the extent of the designation, allowing the non-profit hospital to expand in the future with fewer constraints. Correspondence between the nominator and the hospital is included.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the site at 8835 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J. The staff also recommends that the Historical Commission seek a compromise designation that would allow the not-for-profit health care provider, which provides essential services to the community, to reuse the site effectively while protecting and preserving the most important historic resources at the site.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the Julia Hebard Marsden House at 8835 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J and should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with the boundary amended to exclude the large non-historic parking garage structure.

SEE BELOW.

ADDRESS: 1424-26 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Jacob Reed's Sons' Store, Main Sales Floor

Review: Reconsider Designation on Remand

Property Owner: Sunny Spring LLC

Appellant: Michael Phillips, Esq., Klehr Harrison

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the first-floor interior of 1424-26 Chestnut Street historically known as the Main Sales Floor of the Jacob Reed's Sons' Store, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The exterior of the building has been designated since 1966, when it was added to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

The nomination argues under Criterion E that the Main Sales Floor of the Jacob Reed's Sons' Store is the primary public interior space in this landmark building designed by prominent Philadelphia architect William L. Price for Alan H. Reed, successor to one of the leading menswear merchants of the nineteenth century in Philadelphia. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination contends that the store, constructed between 1904 and 1905, was the first commercial building in Philadelphia constructed of reinforced concrete, a structural system which is most expressed by the public interior space of the Main Sales Floor. The Main Sales Floor is also the only major Arts and Crafts-style commercial interior in Philadelphia, serving as a significant early example of Price's influential ideas on the appropriate expression of materials, structure, and labor. Finally, under Criterion F, the nomination asserts that the interior space features craftsmanship and artistry in the form of tilework from Henry Chapman Mercer's Moravian Pottery and murals by local artist Gertrude Monaghan, which reflect Price's thinking on architecture and its relationship with ornamentation.

This Main Sales Floor maintains a high degree of architectural integrity and has undergone few major alterations since its completion in 1905. The proposed period of significance is 1905 to 1983. This date span reflects the period it was operated as a men's clothier by Jacob Reed's Sons'.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the interior main floor of 1424-26 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E and F.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the interior main floor, historically known as the Main Sales Floor, of 1424-26 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E and F.

SEE BELOW.

ADDRESS: 2112 WALNUT ST

Proposal: Demolish rear of building; construct 12-story addition

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Bruce and Lisa Ginsberg

Applicant: Eric Leighton, cbp Architects

History: 1870

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Rittenhouse Fidler Historic District, Contributing, 2/8/1995

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to demolish the majority of the four-story, 53-foot, Second Empire brownstone building at 2112 Walnut Street and to construct a 12-story, 163-foot tall addition behind the remaining front portion of the historic building. The proposal would leave the front façade and portions of the exterior side party walls in place but remove the entirety of the rear as well as the roof and most interior floors. The fourth-floor front mansard of the existing building would become a screen wall to an open patio behind. The application provides little information on the treatment of the historic front façade, with the only notes being “existing masonry to be restored” and “roof shingles.” The addition would be clad in glass curtain walls and vertical metal siding and decks at each floor. Renderings provided in the submission demonstrate that the addition would be highly visible from Walnut Street, and it would also be highly visible from and extremely out of scale with Chancellor Street, a small street with several historic carriage houses that dead ends at this property.

The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standards 9, 10 and the Roofs Guideline, which calls for additions to be inconspicuous from the public right-of-way, and Section 14-1005(6)(d) of the Philadelphia Code, the prohibition against demolition. Following the Architectural Committee, the application was revised to reduce the height of the pilot house, but no changes were made to the overall height or massing of the overbuild. The demolition plans were revised to show less interior demolition, but the roof, rear mansard, and rear bay are still proposed for removal and the full rear would be encapsulated by the 12-story addition.

The application resembles a project on the neighboring properties at 2108 and 2110 Walnut Street that was approved by the Historical Commission in 2016. However, there are notable differences between the projects. The adjacent parcel at 2110 Walnut Street was a vacant lot at the time of designation, and the overbuild on the historic building at 2108 Walnut was shown as being limited to four-stories and being set back to the point of being inconspicuous from the public right-of-way. Renderings in the application materials demonstrate that the proposed addition would be highly visible from multiple rights-of-way.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standards 9, 10, the Roofs Guideline.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standards 9, 10, the Roofs Guideline, and Section 14-1005(6)(d) of the Philadelphia Code, the prohibition against demolition.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:04:55

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Thomas presented the continuance requests to the Historical Commission.
- Attorney Michael McIlhinney and Lori Salganicoff represented the nominators of 8835 Germantown Avenue and opposed the continuance request.
- Attorney Matt McClure represented Chestnut Hill Hospital, owners of 8835 Germantown Avenue, acknowledged that the property remains under the Historical Commission's jurisdiction during the continuance period. He explained the background of the discussions between the owner, nominator, and councilperson. He argued that the owner needs additional time to prepare a presentation to the Historical Commission and will be prepared to do so in January 2024.
- Developer Tim Shabaan and attorney Meredith Ferleger represented the application and continuance request for 2112 Walnut Street, opining that they need additional time to revise following a meeting with neighbors and that the application does not need to be reviewed by the Committee on Financial Hardship.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Glenn Blumenfeld commented on the continuance request for 2112 Walnut, noting that most neighbors remain opposed to any mid-rise development on the block, and that he wants to make sure that the Historical Commission does not think that the continuance period will change the neighbors' minds.
- Attorney Carl Primavera, representing owners at 2110 Walnut Street, explained that he is not opposed to the continuance request for 2112 Walnut Street, but suggested the applicant withdraw and resubmit, or that Historical Commission remand the application to the Committee on Financial Hardship, owing to the amount of demolition.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to continue the reviews as follows: 156 W. School House Lane to the December 2023 meeting of the Historical Commission and remand the application to the Committee on Financial Hardship; 1424-26 Chestnut Street to the January 2024 meeting of the Historical Commission; and 2112 Walnut Street to the December 2023 meeting of the Historical Commission. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Continuances of 156 W. School House Ln, 1424-26 Chestnut St, and 2112 Walnut St. MOTION: Approve continuances MOVED BY: Thomas SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ACTION: Mr. Mattioni moved to continue the review of 8835 Germantown Avenue to the January 2024 meeting of the Historical Commission. Ms. Sanchez seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 11 to 0.

ITEM: Continuance request for 8835 Germantown Ave to January 2024 PHC Mtg MOTION: Approve continuance MOVED BY: Mattioni SECONDED BY: Sanchez					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 24 OCTOBER 2023

ADDRESS: 2030-38 AND 2040 CHRISTIAN ST

Proposal: Add dormers, skylights, and ADA ramp; replace windows

Review Requested: Review In Concept

Owner: 2040 Christian St LLC

Applicant: Ian Toner, Toner Architects

History: 2030-38 Christian Street: 1903; Richard Newton Memorial Building; Duhring, Okie & Ziegler; 2040 Christian Street: 1870; Church of the Holy Apostles, Shiloh Baptist Church; Frazer, Furness & Hewitt; tower added, 1901, G.W. & W.D. Hewitt

Individual Designation: 11/6/1980

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This in-concept application proposes to convert the former Church of the Holy Apostles, later Shiloh Baptist Church, and associated buildings to multi-unit residential use. Of the five buildings on the site, four are designated as historic, having been constructed and altered between 1868 and 1903. Fronting onto Montrose Street at the rear, the Phillips Brooks Memorial Building, to be known as the Boy Scout Building, is not part of the 1980 historic designation.

The proposed exterior scope includes masonry repair and replacement, construction of an ADA ramp, insertion of skylights and dormers, and replacement of windows. New clear glazed aluminum windows are proposed in all locations where apartment units are located, including the church and Richard Newton Memorial Building. The main entryway of the complex adjacent to the Richard Newton Memorial Building is proposed to retain its existing leaded glass, as is the existing rose window at the narthex of the church.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Convert church complex buildings to residential use.
- Replace windows.
- Insert skylights and dormers.
- Replace asphalt shingles with Slateline asphalt shingles.
- Repair and replace masonry.
- Construct ADA ramp.
- Demolish non-historic one-story addition at rear of church.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
 - o The proposed scope retains and preserves the overall historic character of the church complex.
- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

- o The exterior scope proposed to convert the buildings to residential use is minimal. Every effort should be made to retain stained glass windows where feasible. Stained glass windows which must be removed should be salvaged and stored in a safe location, preferably within the building complex.
- *Accessibility Guideline | Recommended: Complying with barrier-free access requirements in such a manner that the historic building's character-defining exterior features, interior spaces, features, and finishes, and features of the site and setting are preserved or impacted as little as possible.*
 - o The proposed ADA ramp allows for retention of and access through historic entrance doors.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval in-concept, provided a plan is developed for stained glass window salvage and storage, pursuant to Standards 2, 9, and the Accessibility Guideline recommendation.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend approval in-concept, provided a plan is developed for the stained-glass window salvage and storage, and the applicant considers the Committee's suggestions for minor design changes, pursuant to Standards 2 and 9, and the Accessibility Guideline Recommendation.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:27:25

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the in-concept application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Sam Katovitch represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert, representing the Keeping Society, supported the application.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The application was submitted in-concept. An application for final review will need to be submitted and approved prior to the issuance of a building permit.
- The application was revised and supplemented to address comments from the Architectural Committee.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The proposed scope retains and preserves the overall historic character of the church complex, satisfying Standard 2.
- The exterior scope proposed to convert the buildings to residential use is minimal. Every effort should be made to retain stained and leaded glass windows where feasible. Stained glass windows which must be removed are proposed to be salvaged and returned to the original property owner per an agreement at the time of sale to the current owner. The in-concept application satisfies Standard 9.
- The proposed ADA ramp allows for retention of and access through historic entrance doors, satisfying the Accessibility Guideline Recommendation.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to approve the application in-concept, pursuant to Standards 2 and 9, and the Accessibility Guideline Recommendation. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 2030-38 and 2040 CHRISTIAN ST MOTION: Approval in-concept MOVED BY: Thomas SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 18 OCTOBER 2022

ADDRESS: 5128 AND 5114 WAYNE AVE

Name of Resource: Sallie Watson House and Barn

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: House – Oscar Beisert; Barn – Little Angels Daycare Center

Nominator: SoLo/Germantown Civic Association

Staff Contact: Heather Hendrickson, heather.hendrickson@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate 5128 and 5114 Wayne Avenue, the Sallie Watson House and Barn, and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the Sallie Watson House and Barn satisfy Criteria for Designation D, E, and J. Under Criteria D and E, the nomination illustrates that the Sallie Watson House is a unique specimen and example of a suburban residence designed by Wilson Eyre, Jr., architect, in the English Arts and Crafts and American Shingle styles. The nomination further demonstrates that the Sallie Watson House and Barn, along with other contributing features, represents an idyllic and highly unique suburban dwelling site and place associated with the old estates of Manheim Street and more generally in the Germantown section of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion for Designation J. Additionally, the nomination articulates that of the twenty-two Manheim Street estates built between 1871 and 1889, only three outbuildings survive, one of which is the Sallie Watson Barn.

The nomination illustrates the second life of the Barn and House repurposed in 1907 as the Church and Parish House of the First United Presbyterian Church of Germantown, representing

the larger development pattern of reuse that emerged in the nineteenth century, an early era of historic preservation, further satisfying Criterion J. The nomination contends that the congregation commissioned George E. Savage, architect, to convert the Barn into their permanent church building, representing the prolific and significant career of a prominent ecclesiastical architect, further satisfying Criterion E.

The Barn is located at the rear of the House, on what is now a separate parcel. The property at 5128 Wayne Avenue, with the Sallie Watson House, was individually designated to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places on June 1, 1972, before the current documentation requirements were in effect. This nomination wishes to designate 5128 and 5114 Wayne Avenue as one historic resource and offers an infinitely more robust and thorough investigation of these properties.

The period of significance for the Sallie Watson House and Barn is proposed as 1886-1907, starting at the construction of the Barn on the lot. The period of significance for the Parish House and the First United Presbyterian Church of Germantown is proposed as 1907 to 1931, ending on the year of the 25th anniversary of the Church's congregation.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 5128 and 5114 Wayne Avenue satisfy Criteria for Designation D, E, and J and should be listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5114 Wayne Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, with the period of significance from 1886 to the date the church sold or vacated the property.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:33:57

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Hendrickson presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Allison Weiss, representing SoLo/Germantown Civic Association, represented the nomination.
- Oscar Beisert, the property owner of 5128 Wayne Avenue, attended the review.
- No one represented the property owner of 5114 Wayne Avenue.

PUBLIC COMMENT FOR 5114 WAYNE AVE:

- David Traub, representing Save Our Sites, spoke in support of the nomination.
- Jim Duffin spoke in support of the nomination and noted it was an important example of adaptive reuse.
- Steven Peitzman spoke in support of the nomination.
- Suzanne Ponsen spoke in support of the nomination.
- Dennis Barnaby, a near neighbor, spoke in support of the nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT FOR 5128 WAYNE AVE:

- Suzanne Ponsen spoke in support of the nomination.
- Jim Duffin spoke in support of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman spoke in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- 5128 Wayne Avenue was designated as historic on June 1, 1972, before the current documentation requirements and the adoption of Criteria for Designation. Therefore, redesignation would add to the property's historical record and attach Criteria for Designation to the property.
- When the Sallie Watson House was designated as historic in 1972, the barn at 5114 Wayne Avenue was not included in the nomination but is an important feature of the house.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- 5114 and 5128 Wayne Avenue satisfy Criterion for Designation D as embodying distinguishing characteristics of the English Arts and Crafts and American Shingle Styles.
- 5114 and 5128 Wayne Avenue satisfy Criterion for Designation E owing to architect Wilson Eyre, Jr., and the Barn being converted by architect George E. Savage into the First United Presbyterian Church of Germantown.
- 5114 and 5128 Wayne Avenue satisfy Criterion for Designation J because the buildings are representative of and associated with the old estates of Manheim Street and nineteenth-century development pattern of reuse.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5114 Wayne Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 5114 WAYNE AVE MOTION: Designate; Criteria D, E, J MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to amend the existing historical designation of 5128 Wayne Avenue to include the addition of Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, as the updated nomination demonstrates their satisfaction, and to include the citation noted by Dr. Jeffery Cohen concerning the beginning date of construction as starting in 1885, to be added to the file of information on the property. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 5128 WAYNE AVE					
MOTION: Amend existing, add Criteria D, E, J; amend POS to 1885 - 1931					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ADDRESS: 6519-25 GERMANTOWN AVE

Name of Resource: The Warren H. Poley Apothecary & George W. Cox House

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Project Learn, Inc.; Pa Realty Advisors, equitable owner

Nominator: East Mt. Airy Neighbors; Oscar Beisert, author

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 6519-25 Germantown Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The property contains two historic buildings linked together in between with an addition dated to 1994. The first building is a two-and-a-half-story masonry store and dwelling known as the Warren H. Poley Apothecary, built in c. 1882-83 in the Second Empire and Queen Anne Revival styles and is located at 6519 Germantown Ave. The second building is a three-story brick dwelling known as the George W. Cox House, built in c. 1875-76 in the Italianate style and is located at 6525 Germantown Ave. The later linking addition is considered non-historic.

The nomination describes the property in two parts with two separate adjacent boundaries. The property has one OPA address, 6519-25 Germantown Ave, and is considered one tax parcel, but there are two deeds, each covering a portion of the tax parcel.

The nomination contends that the property comprising the Warren H. Poley Apothecary and the George W. Cox House satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D. It argues that the Warren H.

Poley Apothecary reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Second Empire and Queen Anne Revival architectural styles as seen on commercial and residential buildings, satisfying Criteria C and D.

The nomination also argues that the George W. Cox House reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Italianate architectural style as seen on commercial and residential buildings, satisfying Criteria C and D.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 6519-25 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D. The staff also recommends editing the boundary description in the nomination to describe the property as one OPA tax parcel with one boundary containing two historic buildings and a non-historic linking addition between them.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 6519-25 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D, with the recommendation that the staff edit the boundary description in the nomination to describe the property as one OPA tax parcel with one boundary containing two historic buildings and a non-historic linking addition between them.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:56:54

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Till presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- Stuart Udis of PA Realty Advisors represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Jim Duffin commented in support of the nomination.
- Suzanne Ponsen, representing West Central Germantown Neighbors, commented in support of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss, representing SoLo/Germantown Civic Association, commented in support of the nomination.
- David Traub, representing Save Our Sites, commented in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property is comprised of two distinct historic buildings, the Warren H. Poley Apothecary and the George W. Cox House, joined together with a non-historic linking building in between them.
- The entire Office of Property Assessment tax parcel should be designated as historic, with the central linking building considered non-contributing.
- Both the Warren H. Poley Apothecary and the George W. Cox house are excellent examples of their respective architectural styles and reflect the development of this area of Germantown Avenue in the latter half of the nineteenth century.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Warren H. Poley Apothecary reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Second Empire and Queen Anne Revival architectural styles as seen on commercial and residential buildings, satisfying Criteria C and D.
- The George W. Cox House reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Italianate architectural style as seen on commercial and residential buildings, satisfying Criteria C and D.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 6519-25 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with staff to edit the boundary description to account for the non-contributing linking addition. Ms. Kindt seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 6519-25 GERMANTOWN AVE MOTION: Designate; Criteria C and D MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Kindt					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ADDRESS: 4700 KINGSESSING AVE

Name of Resource: Protestant Episcopal Church of the Atonement

Review: Designation

Property Owner: 4700 Kingessing Investment LLC; Constellar Corp.

Nominator: Adrian Trevisan, Powers and Co.

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes designating the property at 4700 Kingessing Avenue as historic and listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the parish house, built in 1893, and the church, built in 1901, satisfy Criteria for Designation A and E. The nomination argues that the church's construction is representative of the development of West Philadelphia as a residential suburb, and thus has significant character, interest and value as part of the development of the city, satisfying Criterion A. The nomination further argues that the parish house and church were designed by Frank Furness, a designer

whose work significantly influenced the architectural development of the city, meeting Criterion E.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4700 Kingsessing Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4700 Kingsessing Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:09:50

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Adrian Trevisan of Powers and Company represented the nomination.
- Attorney Brett Feldman, representing the property owner, had technical difficulties and was unable to speak to the nomination, but had spoken in support of designation at the meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation on 18 October 2023.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- Though the design could not be directly attributed to Frank Furness himself, the attribution to Furness, Evans, and Company allows the property to satisfy Criterion for Designation E, owing to significance associated with the architect.
- Because the Committee on Historic Designation has interpreted Criterion A as indicating citywide, rather than neighborhood, importance, Criterion J is more appropriate in this case, given the nomination's evidence of the property's importance to the history of this part of West Philadelphia in particular.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Church of the Atonement and its parish house, designed by Furness, Evans, and Company, satisfies Criterion for Designation E.
- The property exemplifies the cultural, social, and historical heritage of the surrounding community, satisfying Criterion for Designation J.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4700 Kingsessing Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 4700 KINGSESSING AVE MOTION: Designate; Criteria E and J MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ADDRESS: 804-16 N ORIANNA ST (PART OF 801-15 N 4TH ST)

Name of Resource: Saint Agnes Roman Catholic School

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Brown Street OCF LLC; OCF Realty

Nominator: Dennis Carlisle, OCF Realty

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the former Saint Agnes Roman Catholic School building, a portion of what is currently or formerly 801-15 N. 4th Street, and soon to be known as 804-16 N. Orianna Street. The nomination contends that the school, constructed in 1926, is significant under Criteria for Designation E and J. Under Criterion J, the nomination argues that the school is an exemplar of the work of architect Peter F. Getz, whose designs for Catholic institutional buildings in Philadelphia and Southeastern Pennsylvania created a unity of design for the Archdiocese of Philadelphia's institutional buildings in the region. Under Criterion J, the nomination asserts that Saint Agnes was the first and only school in Philadelphia established by a Slovak congregation and that Saint Agnes Hall within the building served as an important meeting place for the Slovak community of Philadelphia, therefore exemplifying the cultural, social, and historical heritage of the Slovak community in Philadelphia.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the Saint Agnes School building at 801-15 N. 4th Street/804-16 N. Orianna Street satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the Saint Agnes School building at 801-15 N. 4th Street/804-16 N. Orianna Street satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:17:05

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Dennis Carlisle of OCF Realty represented the nomination and the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The former Saint Agnes Roman Catholic School building was constructed in 1926.
- The building is currently or formerly part of 801-15 N. 4th Street and will soon be on the subdivided parcel intended to be known as 804-16 N. Orianna Street. If there are any subsequent address changes, the staff is to update the Register listing as appropriate, in keeping with the boundary as defined in the nomination.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the school is an exemplar of the work of architect Peter F. Getz, whose designs for Catholic institutional buildings in Philadelphia and Southeastern Pennsylvania created a unity of design for the Archdiocese of Philadelphia's institutional buildings in the region, satisfying Criterion E.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion J as the first and only school in Philadelphia established by a Slovak congregation and that Saint Agnes Hall within the building served as an important meeting place for the Slovak community of Philadelphia, therefore exemplifying the cultural, social, and historical heritage of the Slovak community in Philadelphia.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the Saint Agnes School building at 801-15 N. 4th Street/804-16 N. Orianna Street satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Mattioni seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 804-16 N ORIANNA ST MOTION: Designate; Criteria E and J MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Mattioni					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

OLD BUSINESS

ADDRESS: 724 LOCUST AVE

Name of Resource: Heartsease

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Kosa Properties Inc.

Nominator: Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Heather Hendrickson, heather.hendrickson@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 724 Locust Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property with its Gothic Revival style cottage, constructed in 1866, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J. This quaint cottage was home to Miss Hannah Ann Zell from its construction in 1866 until her death in 1911. Miss Zell was a “Prominent Germantown Woman,” who devoted her life to charity, civic affairs, historic preservation, libraries, and various advocacy and fundraising efforts of all causes, satisfying Criterion for Designation A. As a single woman, she attained a position of prominence in her community and city, despite the challenges faced by female leaders during the nineteenth century. Miss Zell’s remarkable societal contributions had a direct impact on the cultural, political, economic, social, and historical heritage of the community, satisfying Criterion for Designation J. The nomination also argues for designation of the property under Criterion I, for its potential to contain intact archaeological resources associated with the 1777 Battle of Germantown, which could include sensitive human remains.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 724 Locust Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 724

Locust Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J and should be listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:24:22

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Hendrickson presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- Attorney Stephanie Boggs Magagna represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Jim Duffin spoke in support of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss of SoLo/Germantown Civic Association spoke in support of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman spoke in support of the nomination.
- Deborah Gary spoke in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- It is rare to have a property with its original undeveloped land in Germantown.
- The brother of the original owner of this property owned an adjacent parcel of land and documentation shows that human remains from the Battle of Germantown were found there.
- The current property owner plans to investigate the possibility of human remains on the property and may seek a lot line readjustment in the future for development purposes.
- Preserving the front streetscape along Locust Avenue is important for this building.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The property at 724 Locust Avenue satisfies Criterion for Designation A, owing to its association with Hannah Ann Zell, a “prominent Germantown woman.”
- The property at 724 Locust Avenue satisfies Criterion for Designation I, owing to there being sufficient evidence to indicate it is possible there may be artifacts or burials associated with the Battle of Germantown.
- The property at 724 Locust Avenue satisfies Criterion for Designation J, owing to Hannah Ann Zell’s remarkable contributions which had a direct impact on the cultural, political, economic, social, and historical heritage of the Germantown community and beyond.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 724 Locust Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 724 LOCUST AVE MOTION: Designate; Criteria A, I, J MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ADDRESS: 401-09 N 65TH ST

Name of Resource: St. Donato's Roman Catholic Church

Review: Reconsider Designation on Remand

Property Owner: Our Lady of Lourdes Catholic Parish

Appellant: Conor Larkin, Esq., Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: The Historical Commission designated the property at 401-09 N. 65th Street on 9 April 2021, finding that the St. Donato's church satisfied Criteria for Designation A, E, and J. The property owner did not participate in the Historical Commission's review of the nomination on 9 April 2021 or the Committee on Historic Designation's review of it on 3 March 2021.

In August 2021, the property owner appealed the designation, claiming that it did not receive notice of the reviews. In response to the appeal, in June 2022, the Court of Common Pleas remanded the matter to the Historical Commission for a new review providing the property owner with an opportunity to participate. Attorney Neil Sklaroff filed the appeal on behalf of Our Lady of Lourdes Catholic Parish, the property owner. St. Donato's had merged with Our Lady of Lourdes in 2013. More recently, attorney Conor Larkin has taken over the appeal case on behalf of Our Lady of Lourdes. The property remains under the Historical Commission's jurisdiction during the new review of the nomination.

On 24 October 2022, Celeste Morello, who had submitted the nomination for St. Donato's, sent a message to the Historical Commission's attorney indicating that she wanted to withdraw her nomination. The Historical Commission no longer allows nominators to unilaterally withdraw their nominations but does consider and sometimes accept withdrawal requests. However, in this case, the property has already been designated and is being reconsidered on appeal, and therefore a withdrawal request may have little or no bearing on the proceedings.

The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed the nomination a second time on 30 November 2022 and recommended that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A, E, and J. The matter has been continued since the November 2022 review.

The nomination contends that St. Donato's Roman Catholic Church, completed in 1922, satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E. Criterion J is also checked on the nomination form, but is not discussed in the nomination. Under Criterion A, the nomination contends that St. Donato's Roman Catholic Church is significant for its association with St. Frances Xavier Cabrini, the first Roman Catholic saint in the United States, whose order focused on ministry to Italians in this West Philadelphia neighborhood, resulting in sufficient funds to finish the construction of the church building. Under Criterion E, the nomination argues that the church building is the work of Francis Ferdinand Durang, the son of Edwin Durang, whose firm specialized in the ecclesiastical design of Roman Catholic churches, which significantly influenced the architectural development of the City and Commonwealth.

The staff suggests that the Historical Commission address the nominator's withdrawal request first and then, if the withdrawal request is rejected, the merits of the nomination itself.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:38:45

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the withdrawal request and nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the nomination.
- Attorney Conor Larkin and Father Matthew Phelan represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Larkin requested that the Commission rescind the designation. He claimed that the property has lost the qualities for which it was originally designated, and that designation would result in greater permitting costs and delays.
- Mr. Reuter explained the reason for the remand by the Court of Common Pleas.
- Mr. Farnham clarified that the Court of Common Pleas remand essentially starts the designation process over.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Karen Hammel of the Society of St. Frances Cabrini supported the continued designation of the church and noted her organization's desire to acquire the property and take on the financial responsibility to repair the building.
- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society disagreed with the attorney's assertion that the property had lost the qualities that merited designation and opposed the rescission of the designation or withdrawal of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman opposed the withdrawal/rescission request.
- Christopher Daniels, teacher at St. Frances Cabrini school, supported the designation of the church and opposed the withdrawal/rescission request.
- Leannett Hill, neighbor and neighborhood representative, supported the designation of the church and opposed the withdrawal/rescission request.
- Meeka Outlaw, teacher at St. Frances Cabrini school, supported the designation of the church and opposed the withdrawal/rescission request.

- Eloise Young, a member of the community, supported the designation of the church and opposed the withdrawal/rescission request.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The Court of Common Pleas remanded the nomination to the Historical Commission for further consideration owing to issues of notice to the property owners.
- Designation does not necessarily result in greater building permit costs or delays.
- Alternative roofing and other materials can meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The Commission's staff is available for technical assistance to owners of designated properties.
- Designation does not mean the church will be reopened as a church. Use is separate from designation and not under the Historical Commission's jurisdiction.
- The church retains the qualities and characteristics that qualified it for designation in 2021.
- St. Donato's Roman Catholic Church was founded in 1910 to serve the large Italian immigrant population of West Philadelphia, during a time in which there was a significant effort to convert Italian Catholics to Protestantism.
- Construction began in 1910 on a basement chapel designed by Rowland W. Boyle of Edwin F. Durang's architectural firm.
- St. Frances Xavier Cabrini, herself an Italian immigrant, visited the church in 1911 and was integral to the funding and completion of the church.
- The church was redesigned by F. Ferdinand Durang and completed in 1922.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- St. Donato's Roman Catholic Church is associated with St. Frances Xavier Cabrini, a person significant in the past, and is associated with the cultural, social, and historical heritage of the Italian-American community of West Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion A.
- The church was designed by F. Ferdinand Durang, whose ecclesiastical work significantly influenced the historical, architectural, and cultural development of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to deny the request to withdraw the nomination. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 401-09 N. 65th ST MOTION: Deny withdrawal MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to affirm the designation of 401-09 N. 65th Street, finding that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 401-09 N. 65th ST MOTION: Affirm designation MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:25:20

ACTION: At 11:28 a.m., Mr. Mattioni moved to adjourn. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: ADJOURNMENT MOTION: Adjourn MOVED BY: Mattioni SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Kindt (DPD)	X				
Lepori (Commerce)	X				
Lech (L&I)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Sánchez (Council)	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				1

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;

- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.