

**THE MINUTES OF THE 461ST STATED MEETING OF THE
Philadelphia Historical Commission
10 January 2001
Commission Conference Room, 18th Floor, 1515 Arch Street
Wayne S. Spilove, Chair**

Present

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair
David Brownlee, Ph.D.
Melissa Heller Batzer, Office of City Council President, Director of Economic Development
James Cuorato, City Representative and Director of Commerce
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Michael Sklaroff, Esq.
Robert Thomas
Mjenzi K. Traylor, First Deputy Director of Commerce
Dennis Ward III
Scott Wilds, Assistant Director, Office of Housing and Community Development
Caroline Wischmann
Stephanie G. Wolf, Ph.D.

Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Diane M. Hughes, Executive Secretary
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer

Lewis Rosman, Assistant City Solicitor, Appeals and Legislation

Also

Peter Economou, Front Street Developers
Lewis Rosman, Philadelphia Law Department
Richard Tucker, B'Nai Abraham Congregation
R. David Schaaf, City Planning Commission
Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents' Association/Preservation Alliance
Penelope H. Batcheler, Society Hill
Peter Shaw, P & A Associates
Mark Brodsky, Bower Lewis Thrower Architects
Robert Graves, Bower Lewis Thrower Architects
John Gerbner, Ewing Cole Cherry Brott Architects

Executive Session

Mark Zecca consulted with the Commission to discuss litigation involving 421 Vine Street.

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 461st Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 9:20 A.M.

Minutes of the 460th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Upon a motion made by Mr. James and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the minutes of the 460th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 13 December 2000, Wayne S. Spilove, Chair, as corrected. Mr. Sklaroff asked that the minutes be corrected to read that he had opposed the motion on 1914 Rittenhouse Square Street, not that he had recused himself.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 19 December 2000, Robert Thomas, Chair.

**700-18 Walnut Street, SW corner of South 7th Street, 701-711 St. James Street
201-209 and 211-219 South 8th Street**

St. James, Walnut Associates, Owner

Mark Brodsky, Architect

DATE: 700-10 Walnut Street, 1868-69; altered 1885-86

712-16 Walnut Street, c. 1807

718 Walnut Street, c.1950

211-219 South 8th Street, 1961-69

PROPOSAL: Conceptual review for new materials for building at 8th and Walnut Streets; link structure at courtyard

The Architectural Committee recommended conceptual approval of the link structure and a change to granite for the material of the corner structure. They also recommended a brick facing on the west gable wall of 716 Walnut Street.

This proposal involves the construction of a 41-story tower on the west portion of the block of Walnut Street between 7th and 8th Streets. The proposal received conceptual approval from the Commission in 1999. The Commission also then approved a conditional demolition for the structures on 8th Street and a part of the PSFS building and York Row on Walnut Street. The applicant now seeks conceptual approval for a change of material for the portion of the building at the corner of 8th and Walnut Street from brick to granite and for a link structure in the St. James courtyard.

Mr. Wilds raised concern about the false historical appearance of the brick on the gable end and thought the stucco appropriate as proposed.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation for approval with the change that stucco remain on the gabled wall with the staff to review the color and details. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Ridgeland Mansion, Chamounix Drive, West Fairmount Park, Sheep Barn

City of Philadelphia, Owner

John Carr, Applicant

DATE: c. 1880

PROPOSAL: Renovation of existing building

The Architectural Committee recommended approval with following changes:

- 1. Shingles at the base of the cupola and dormer cheek walls;*
- 2. Lengthening the dormer windows;*

With staff to review all details

The proposal involves alterations to the sheep barn at Ridgeland Mansion in Fairmount Park. The alterations include wood vertical siding applied to the existing cinderblock infill walls and wood siding applied to the sides of the base of the cupola. The plans show alterations to the windows to add muntins, a change in the shape of the dormer casement sash, the removal of an exterior stair, and the installation of a weathervane

Mr. Baron stated that the applicant asked that the minutes reflect that some of the existing window openings in the cinderblock portion will be altered.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Ward seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

401 North Broad Street, SE corner of Noble Street

Gerald S. Kaufman Corporation, Owner

Michael S. Hansen, Applicant

DATE: 1921-31

PROPOSAL: Legalize rooftop HVAC and generator

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the rooftop equipment, but denial of the generator placement.

This proposal involves legalizing the installation of a generator at the track level and mechanical cooling units on the building rooftop. The staff recommended approval of the rooftop units, and denial of the generator placement on the ground.

The applicant requested a one-month continuance in writing.

527-29 Lombard Street, Congregation B'Nai Abraham

B'Nai Abraham Congregation, Owner

Richard E. Tucker, Applicant

DATE: 1884; altered c. 1900

PROPOSAL: Handicapped accessible doors

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of a modified option # 1- a four paneled door with two top panels glazed and flat side panels.

The application calls for the installation of a wider entry door on the Synagogue's Lombard Street façade to provide for handicapped access. The plans show several optional schemes for one large door including two and four panel configurations as well as paneled or fluted surrounds. The staff recommended approval of door option #1-a four paneled door with two top panels glazed and plain surrounds with no paneling or fluting.

Richard Tucker, the applicant, attended the meeting and expressed his acceptance of the Committee's recommendation.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

319-21 South 3rd Street

Lisa Colton, Owner

John Douthwade, Applicant

DATE: 1788-95

PROPOSAL: 2nd and 3rd floor addition

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the submission as proposed but conceptual approval of a redesigned three-story brick building.

This application calls for the construction of a three-story addition utilizing the walls of an existing single story addition. The plan shows the two new entrance doors on the South 3rd Street façade fitted into the existing openings and filled in with the addition of fluted columns. The applicant proposes 6/6 true divided light windows with shutters and a cornice to match 323 South 3rd Street. Plans also include the installation of a black asphalt shingle roof and a beltcourse between the first and second stories. On the north façade, plans show the building stuccoed with the garrett dormers clad in wood. The design as proposed creates a false historical appearance.

After a lengthy discussion about the appropriateness of the addition in relation to the historic appearance, the Commission thought that it needed to see the results of additional research on the history of the site. It further believed that an architect should be present to explain the proposal.

Mr. Ward made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

238 North 2nd Street

Front Street Developers, Owner

Plato A. Marinakos Jr., Applicant

DATE: c.1760, c.1810 addition, c.1905 alterations

PROPOSAL: Rear demolition and new rear façade, rehabilitate front façade

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the design as proposed but approval of a revised design retaining the full extent of the existing old building, adding a redesigned storefront, reconstructing the gabled roof and raising the roof on the rear ell with the staff to work with the applicant and review all aspects of the design.

The proposal involves work on two properties only one of which the Commission has listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The applicant seeks to remove a portion of the rear of the listed property and build a new rear façade visible from New Street. The applicant would like to install vinyl windows at the rear for cost savings. Also shown on the plans, the owner wishes to raise the roof level of the building, although he submitted no side elevation to determine the shape of that roof or its depth from the front façade. The front façade drawing, although too small to show sufficient detail, shows the reopening and restoration of the 2nd and 3rd floor windows and the installation of a new storefront.

Some Commission members stated that the integrity of the façade will be lost and questioned the amount of historic features remaining. Mr. Baron spoke with the applicant, who stated that he would work with the staff on the storefront's design and gable roof.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to approve the Committee's recommendation as amended with staff to review details. Mr. James seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

237 North 2nd Street

Front Street Developers, Owner

Plato A. Marinakos Jr., Applicant

DATE: c. 1815

PROPOSAL: Front and rear façade alterations

The Architectural Committee recommended tabling the front façade issue until further investigation determines what lies underneath the stucco. At that time the applicant should be prepared to bring back options for the front façade to the Committee.

The proposal involves work to two properties, only one of which the Commission has listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The applicant seeks to remove a portion of the rear of the listed property and build a new rear façade not visible to the public. The applicant would like to install vinyl windows on the inner courtyard for cost savings. The front façade drawing, although too small to provide sufficient detail, shows the reopening and restoration of the windows and the installation of new residential ground floor.

Mr. Sklaroff raised the issue of the remaining historic fabric's importance, since the building has undergone extensive alterations; however, the original window shapes still exist. Therefore; the Commission further believed that by setting aside the request of the Committee for a determination of what exists beneath the stucco, the applicant is able to move forward with his proposal.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to reject the Committee's recommendation and to approve the proposal subject to the owner working with the staff on a revised front façade design. Mr. Ward seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

1712 Walnut Street

Two Nuts, L.P. c/o Midwood Management Corporation, Owner

Frank Baratta, Applicant

DATE: c. 1915

PROPOSAL: Front façade, ATM machine installation and relocation

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the proposal as designed.

This application calls for the relocation of one ATM machine and the installation of a third ATM machine in the base of this three-story building. Plans show the removal of a floor-to-ceiling glass window on the Walnut Street façade and the installation of a new exterior ATM machine. In addition, the proposal involves slightly moving the existing ATM and the rebuilding the surrounding wall.

Mr. James made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried with 10 votes. Mr. Thomas recused himself.

1726 Locust Street, Curtis Institute of Music, SE corner of 18th Street

Curtis Institute of Music, Owner

John Shannon, Applicant

DATE: 1893

PROPOSAL: Entrance alteration and stone base repair

The Architectural Committee recommended approval with two colors on the masonry base with the staff to review details.

This application calls for the extension of existing doors and the elimination of two original steps to create a handicapped accessible entrance on Locust Street. Iron and bronze panels added to the base of the double leaf wrought iron doors would provide the extra length. In addition, the proposal involves repair of the building's bluestone base on all facades including repointing, patching and coating with a single color of Thoroseal. The base currently spans two separate buildings and has two different colors.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Traylor seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

1501-1509 Spruce Street, 1506-1508 Latimer Street, at 15th Street

Parkway Corporation, Owner

Mark Brodsky, Applicant

PROPOSAL: Review and comment, New garage

The Architectural Committee recommended approval as submitted.

This proposal calls for the construction of a new parking garage on an existing vacant lot, currently used for parking, in the Rittenhouse Fittler Historic District. Plans show a garage of nine parking levels but appearing as approximately a five-story building from the street. In addition, materials for the garage include a multi-story glass curtain wall, decorative screening over the garage's upper three levels, and concrete ramps and interiors.

Ross Wilson, Parkway Corporation, attended the meeting and presented a sample of the proposed tile which compliments the brick color of the surrounding buildings. He also stated that the proposal includes landscape improvements.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Batzer seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2118 Pine Street, SW corner of Van Pelt Street

Steven Shapiro and Andrew Fielding, Owners

Steven Shapiro, Applicant

DATE: c. 1865

PROPOSAL: Rear wood trellis construction

The Architectural Committee recommended approval.

This application calls for the construction of a trellis on the wood deck of this rowhouse's rear second level. The trellis will be seen from Van Pelt Street. The staff recommended approval per Standards 9 and 10.

Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents' Association, stated that the concerns of the neighbor to the south have been addressed.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2228 Mt. Vernon Street

Mary Cole and Charles Thomson, Owners

Steven Shapiro, Applicant

DATE: c. 1875

PROPOSAL: Rear wood trellis construction

The Architectural Committee recommended approval.

The applicant proposes the installation of a wood trellis over the south portion of the rear roof deck approximately eight and a half feet in height. The staff recommended approval per Standards 9 and 10.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

2000 Benjamin Franklin Parkway, Franklin Institute, SW corner of South 20th Street

Franklin Institute, Owner

John Gerbner, Applicant

DATE: 1932

PROPOSAL: Add two stair towers and exit door

The Architectural Committee recommended denial of the proposal as submitted, but approval of an alternative design, keeping the window in the south elevation, and moving the door. They thought the windows of the stair towers should be longer to relate more to the windows of the existing façade.

This application calls for the addition of two fire stair towers to the building, one on the south and one on the west façade of the courtyard side of the building. Both towers will have visibility. On the west tower's south elevation, plans show a door in an existing window with the rest of the opening in-filled. On the west elevation, the proposal calls for a steel door, railing and egress lighting for access to the west stair tower. Both the south and west towers have small aluminum windows set into recessed brick.

The applicant revised his submission to address the Committee's recommendations. It was also noted that the proposed materials will compliment the existing cream color brick.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation with staff to review samples and details. Mr. Ward seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

1600 Arch Street, SW corner of South 16th Street

Dennis A. Martin, Quinnco-1600 Arch, L.P., Owners

Robert B. Graves, Architect

DATE: 1925

PROPOSAL: Rooftop mechanical equipment

The Architectural Committee recommended approval of the revised submission with the units painted gray in color. They also approved the kitchen and bath exhausts in gray that come up through the roof.

The application calls for the installation of new rooftop mechanical equipment for this building's new residential use. The plans show two location plans for multiple units, located on both the 16th and 17th floor roofs; one shows the units positioned away from the roof edges toward the south to minimize visibility. The staff recommended approval of the revised proposal per Standard 10.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Mr. Spilove passed the gavel to Ms. Wolf, Vice-chair.

135 South 18th Street, NE corner of Walnut Street

Rittenhouse Investment Partners, L.P., Owner

C. Erickson and Sons, Applicant

DATE: 1913

PROPOSAL: Replace exterior stonework with fiberglass

The Architectural Committee recommended approval with staff to review details and shop drawings.

This proposal involves a building that has stonework and cornices with deteriorating stone pediments. The applicant proposes to replace the pediments with fiberglass instead of stone. About seven years ago, mesh was installed to keep pieces from falling after some did fall. The steel that holds the terra cotta is rusting, and the parapet wall needs reinforcing and repointing.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried with 9 votes. Mr. Sklaroff and Mr. Spilove recused themselves.

Mr. Tyler commented on the recent fire at Independence Hall. He said that it was gratifying that the work done by the Commission in its reviews proved successful, confining the fire to one room of the basement area.

New Business

Mr. James stated that the Federal Communications Commission has issued new rules regarding the 106 review of communication equipment. The new rules will not affect the Commission's review of equipment on locally designated property.

Ms. Batzer made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Brownlee seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 10:50 A.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Diane M. Hughes
Executive Secretary