

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

25 June 1979

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman,

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., A.I.A., Preservation Committee,
American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Erling H. Pedersen, A.I.A., Old Philadelphia Development Corporation
Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Patricia Sieniontkowski, Executive Assistant to the Chairman

Also

Present: David Alan Goldstein, Architect, to request an approval
of alterations made to the ground floor of 248-50 Market Street.
A. Dale Wade and Delia Bentivoglio to present the University of
Pennsylvania's proposal for alterations to Houston Hall to provide
access for the handicapped to the building.
J. Edward Mitinger and Jane Quigley of the Philadelphia Redevelopment
Authority, Max Berger, Developer, and Jerry Schwamm of Hassinger
and Schwamm and Dr. George E. Thomas of the Clio Group to request
permission to retain the existing storefront and cornice at
218 South 8th Street rather than restore the facade to its
original appearance.
Carlos Rodriguez, Architect, to present his proposal for the complete
restoration of the buildings situate at 120-22 Market Street.
Hyman Myers of Day and Zimmermann and Bernard Guth, Developer, to present
plans for the rehabilitation of the exterior of the Fairmont Hotel.
John T. Heaton, Owner, to request approval of illegal alterations to
Heaton's Hotel, 301 Chestnut Street.
John Bushnell, Architect to present plans for the construction of a
rear addition and side porch at 1922 Green Street.
Mr. and Mrs. Nick Chimes to request a revision of the approved plan
for 266 South 9th Street.
Leonard Zack, Owner, to ask for reconsideration of his request for a
plaque for 440 Spruce Street.
Victoria Pyle representing Carl Massara's office to present a
preliminary proposal for alterations to the rear of
119 Elfreth's Alley.

SUBMISSIONS

248-50 Market Street, David A. Goldstein, Architect. Mr. Goldstein reported to the Architectural Committee members that because of a termite problem in a section of the ground floor storefront at 248-50 Market Street, the infested wood was removed and replaced with a solid bronze commercial front. The plans approved by the Historical Commission in November of 1978 called for the retention and repair of the existing fabric. Mr. Goldstein supplied the Committee members with photographs

of the completed work and a measured drawing of the new storefront. After some discussion, the Committee agreed to recommend the approval of the work as executed. It was determined that the new ground floor was sympathetic with the character of the old building and not an intrusion upon it.

Houston Hall, University of Pennsylvania. A. Dale Wade and Delia Bentivoglio presented to the members of the Committee the University's proposal for alterations to Houston Hall to provide access to the building for the handicapped. An earlier suggestion to create a bowl effect at the main entrance of Houston Hall proved not to be feasible. The new proposal, explained by Ms. Bentivoglio, calls for the removal of a section of the terrace wall near the new entrance to the elevator. This treatment requires the removal of stairs to an existing entrance and their replacement to allow level entry to the ramp. The Committee found this proposal to be acceptable provided that it is executed as shown on the elevation drawing with a lip separating the ramp from the relocated stairs.

218 South 8th Street, Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. The developer, Max Berger; representatives from the Redevelopment Authority staff, J. Edward Mitinger and Jane Quigley; Jerry Schwamm of Hassinger & Schwamm, and Dr. George Thomas of the Clio Group appeared before the Architectural Committee to request permission to retain the existing storefront and cornice of 218 South 8th Street and renovate the building to its turn-of-the-century commercial character. Redevelopment Authority specifications, approved by the Historical Commission in October of 1976, originally called for the restoration of the house to its original 1795 residential appearance. After some discussion of the matter, the Committee agreed to recommend to the Commission that the request, as presented, be approved. The architect was asked to submit a complete set of drawings for the proposed rehabilitation of 218 South 8th Street for the Committee's review. It was agreed that Mr. Schwamm would present his submission for review at the July meeting.

120-22 Market Street, Carlos Rodriguez, Architect. Mr. Rodriguez presented to the Committee for review a complete set of working drawings and details for the restoration of the buildings situate at 120-22 Market Street. The Committee found the proposal to be acceptable and agreed to recommend its approval.

Fairmont Hotel, Day and Zimmermann. Hyman Myers of Day and Zimmermann and Bernard Guth, Developer, appeared before the Architectural Committee to present the proposal for the rehabilitation of the exterior of the Fairmont Hotel. Mr. Myers explained that a complete and accurate restoration of the exterior of the building could not be undertaken since the cost of such an undertaking would be prohibitive. He noted, however, that all original fabric was being retained and that later

alterations to the structure, if they were found to be unsympathetic, were changed to compliment the original character of the structure.

The Committee expressed some concern over the use of stucco in the replacement of some architectural features which were originally executed in stone. Mr. Myers pointed out that replacement stone would prove to be too costly and that a stucco finish to resemble stone could not be detected if done well. He suggested that the Committee members examine the Warwick where this procedure was used. Both Br. Bartley and Mr. Levy agreed to follow Mr. Myers' suggestion.

After some further discussion of the matter, the Committee members enthusiastically voted to recommend the approval of this project.

301 Chestnut Street, John T. Heaton, Owner. Mr. Heaton appeared before the members of the Architectural Committee to request an approval for illegal alterations made to the building, 301 Chestnut Street, in 1976. A proposal for renovations to the building was reviewed in August of 1974 and found to be unacceptable. Subsequently, the work was undertaken without the proper permits and without Historical Commission approval. Since the alterations are completely out of character with the building and with the Old City Commercial District, the Committee agreed to recommend against legalization of the work.

1922 Green Street, John Bushnell, Architect. Mr. Bushnell presented to the Committee his plans for the construction of a rear addition and side porch to the building situated at 1922 Green Street. The Committee found the design of the rear addition to be acceptable but asked that the architect restudy the design of the side porch particularly the slope of the porch roof and the use of plastic panels to allow for additional light into the kitchen.

Mr. Bushnell agreed to restudy and resubmit his proposal immediately. The Committee agreed that it would not be necessary for Mr. Bushnell to wait until the July meeting. Mr. Levy will review the resubmission as soon as it is prepared.

6505-07 Germantown Avenue, Terry Vaughan, Architect. A letter outlining proposed renovations to the buildings situate at 6505-07 Germantown Avenue was read to the Committee members. After some discussion of the proposed alterations, the Committee asked that a sample of the roofing material and wood shingle be submitted. In addition, it was agreed that horizontal wood siding, rather than shingles, must be installed on the dormer cheeks.

943 Lombard Street, Michael Lawrence, Developer. The Committee reviewed the plans for the rehabilitation of 943 Lombard Street and agreed to recommend their approval provided that double doors are installed within the two storefront entrances at the ground floor.

266 South 9th Street, Mr. and Mrs. Nick Chimes. Mr. and Mrs. Chimes appeared before the Committee to request a revision in the approved plans for the restoration of 266 South 9th Street on file in the Commission office. The drawings, approved by the Commission in 1965, call for the use of three over three sash on the third floor front of the building. Mrs. Chimes asked that the Commission allow the installation of six over six sash already in place in the openings. The Committee pointed out that the three over three light arrangement is most probably correct but that, upon the presentation of a photograph of the existing condition of the house, the Committee members would be more clearly able to determine the appropriateness of the smaller light sash. In addition, Mrs. Chimes requested permission to hang louvered shutters at the third floor window openings since hardware for shutters is evident on these two openings. It was agreed to allow the installation of shutters on the third floor upon the submission and approval of an appropriate shutter design.

119 Elfreh's Alley (preliminary submission), Carl Massara, Architect. Victoria Pyle, representing the architectural office of Carl Massara, presented to the Committee a preliminary proposal for alterations to the rear of 119 Elfreh's Alley. The proposal called for the introduction of a bow window at the rear of the property facing Bladen's Court. After some discussion, the Committee determined that a bow window on this historically significant court would not be acceptable and suggested the use of a wood, double-hung window in keeping with the character of the building. In addition, the members found the proposed iron gate to be incompatible. A restudy is requested.

Both the Chairman and Mr. Bartley will visit the site before a resubmission is made. An attempt to obtain current photographs of the area will be made as well.

PLAQUES

440 Spruce Street. Mr. Zack appeared before the Architectural Committee to appeal the Committee's recommendation that he be denied a plaque for the restoration at 440 Spruce Street because of a noticeable variation in the color and quality of the brickwork. Mr. Zack explained that the brick had been cleaned twice and that every measure was taken to achieve a uniform appearance but that the old brick, salvaged in the restoration, could not be sufficiently cleaned to blend with the new.

After some consideration of the matter, Mr. Levy agreed to meet with Mr. Zack to examine the building and make recommendations concerning further treatment of the walls.

There being no further business the meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Executive Assistant to the Chairman

PS:mk