

**THE MINUTES OF THE 747TH STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 2024, 9:00 A.M.
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
ZACHARY FRANKEL, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:00:00

Mr. Frankel, the Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

Commissioner	Present	Absent	Comment
Zachary Frankel, Chair (Real Estate Developer)	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq., Vice Chair (Community Development Corporation)	X		
Kareema Abu Saab (Commerce Department)			
Donna Carney (Philadelphia City Planning Commission)	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair (Historian)	X		
Thomas Holloman (City Council)		X	
Erin Kindt (Department of Public Property)	X		
John P. Lech (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair (Architect)	X		
Stephanie Michel (Community Organization)	X		Arrived 9:38
Franz Rabauer	X		
Robert Thomas, AIA (Architectural Historian)	X		
Matthew Treat (Department of Planning and Development)	X		

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
Kristin Hankins, Historic Preservation Planner I
Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
Izzy Korostoff, Community Initiatives Specialist
Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner III
Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown Civic Association
Aaron Moselle

Abbey Lewis
Allee Davis, DOCOMOMO-Philadelphia
Andy Molholt
Brendan Sculley
Bruce Bohri, Department of Planning and Development
Dan Macey
Dan O'Connell
Daniel Trubman
David Brownlee
David Gest, SquareSpace
Elizabeth Knudsen
Evonne Tisdale
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission
Tony Bracali
Jack Pyburn
Jake Blumgart
Jan L. Singer
Jay Farrell
Jonathan Wallace, AVL Architecture & Development
Julia Hayman
Katherine Liss, Philadelphia City Planning Commission
Kimberly Haas, Hidden City Philadelphia
Krista Gebbia, Chestnut Hill Conservancy
Leah Silverstein
Linda Bell, East Mt. Airy Neighbors
Liz Fuselier
Lori Arnold
Lori Salganicoff, Chestnut Hill Conservancy
Lynn Alpert
Marissa Zhao
Mary Costello, Esq., Philadelphia Law Department
Mary Meloscia
Michael McIlhinney, Esq.
Michael Phillips, Esq., Klehr Harrison
Neil Sklaroff, Esq., Dilworth Paxson
Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Patrick Grossi, Preservation Chicago
Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance
Rosemarie Fabien
Ryan N. Boland
Sam DiGenova
Sandra Guillory
Sarah Bryant
Sherman Aronson
Stephanie Pennypacker
Steven Peitzman
Suzanna Barucco
Suzanne Ponsen, West Central Germantown Neighbors
Sydney Conaway
Tina Marie Hartnett

Tom Normile, Keast & Hood
Zach Winters

ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 746TH STATED MEETING, 11 OCTOBER 2024

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:02:53

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Frankel asked the Commissioners, staff, and members of the public if they had any suggested additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting of the Historical Commission, the 746th Stated Meeting, held 11 October 2024. No comments were offered.

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to adopt the minutes of the 746th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 11 October 2024. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adoption of the Minutes of the 746th Stated Meeting of the PHC					
MOTION: Adopt minutes					
MOVED BY: Frankel					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Kindt (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				2

REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

ADDRESS: 775 S CHRISTOPHER COLUMBUS BLVD

Name of Resource: Piers 38 and 40 South

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Pier 38-40 LLC

Nominator: Keeping Society

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Southwark Municipal Piers 38 and 40, located at 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard, as historic and list the property on the

Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the piers, constructed between 1914 and 1915, satisfy Criteria for Designation A, C, D, H, and J. Under Criteria A and J, the nomination argues that the piers represent the establishment and enlargement of the Port of Philadelphia as a municipal program to spur commercial activity through the creation of a system of municipal piers along the Delaware River waterfront. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination contends that the piers represent an era of civic architecture inspired by the World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago and possess distinguishing characteristics of the Beaux Arts style of architecture. Under Criterion H, the nomination states that the massive piers form an established and familiar visual feature of the Southwark neighborhood, the City of Philadelphia, and the Delaware River. The staff notes that the nomination would benefit from some editing and fact checking. The staff corrected some obvious errors, for example revising the name of Mayor Blankenburg's director of the Department of Public Works, who was Morris Cooke, not Frederick Winslow Taylor, on page 34. Other errors remain; for example, the statement on page 26 that the Benjamin Franklin Parkway was planned as early as 1906 and the groundbreaking took place in 1917 is incorrect. Planning, in fact, began in the nineteenth century and the official groundbreaking, the demolition of some houses in the boulevard's path, occurred in 1907.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, H, and J.

ACTION: See Below.

ADDRESS: 1330-36 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: F.W. Woolworth Co. Store

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Treeco/Manor Limited Partnership

Nominator: Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Woolworth Building, 1330-36 Chestnut Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the Woolworth Store, built in 1949, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the purpose-built Woolworth Store was part of a comprehensive effort by the company to develop large flagship stores in downtowns across the United States and Canada. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the store's design is based in the Modernist, International Style, with some references to the Art Deco/Streamline Moderne styles. Under Criterion H the nomination maintains that the Woolworth Store's horizontality, minimal aesthetic, and stark white color sets it apart from surrounding structures making it a distinctive feature in Center City generally and the 1300 block of Chestnut Street in particular. The period of significance spans from 1949 when the building was constructed, to 1960 when the character-defining original WOOLWORTH sign was replaced.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street, the Woolworth Store, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H.

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:03:35

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance requests to the Historical Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to continue the review of the nomination for 775 S. Christopher Columbus Boulevard to the January 2025 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation, and the review of the nomination for 1330-36 Chestnut Street to the December 2024 meeting of the Historical Commission. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Continuances					
MOTION: Approve continuances for 775 S. Christopher Columbus Blvd and 1330-36 Chestnut St					
MOVED BY: Frankel					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Kindt (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				2

ADDRESS: 700-34 RACE ST

Name of Resource: Roundhouse, Philadelphia Police Headquarters

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: City of Philadelphia

Nominator: Preservation Alliance/Docomomo Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property known as the Roundhouse, the former Philadelphia Police Headquarters at 700-34 Race Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Philadelphia architectural firm Geddes Brecher Qualls & Cunningham (GBQC) and engineer August Komendant designed the Roundhouse in 1959 and its construction was completed in 1962. The building is composed of approximately 1,000

precast concrete units. The nomination argues that the Roundhouse reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style, the Expressionist style, satisfying Criterion for Designation C, and embodies distinguishing characteristics of that style, satisfying Criterion D. The nomination contends that the Roundhouse embodies distinguishing characteristics of an engineering specimen with its architectural precast concrete and state of the art post tensioning, also satisfying Criterion D. The nomination highlights the collaboration between the prominent Philadelphia architectural firm GBQC, engineer August Komendant, and general contractor Sovereign Construction Company and asserts that they were designers and builders whose work significantly influenced the development of the city, state, and nation, satisfying Criterion E. The nomination claims that the Roundhouse contains elements of design, detail, materials, and craftsmanship that represent significant innovations, satisfying Criterion F. The nomination asserts that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion H, owing to its unique siting and location. Finally, the nomination contends that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion J because it exemplifies the progressive period in Philadelphia under Mayors Clark and Dilworth.

The proposed boundary for the designation includes the northern portion of the site with the building but not the surface parking lot to the south. The boundary also excludes a small parcel at the northwest corner of the site that is owned by the Delaware River Port Authority, not the City of Philadelphia. The nomination identifies the concrete perimeter wall as a non-contributing feature, owing to the expectation that any redevelopment of the site will require its demolition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

START TIME IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:05:40

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the continuance request to the Historical Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Hanna Stark of the Preservation Alliance advocated for a continuance.
- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance advocated for a continuance.
- Dan Macey of DOCOMOMO-Philadelphia advocated for a continuance.

ACTION: Ms. Carney moved to deny the request to continue the review of the nomination for 700-34 Race Street. Mr. Frankel seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Continuance MOTION: Deny continuance for 700-34 Race St. MOVED BY: Carney SECONDED BY: Frankel					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Kindt (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				2

REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 22 OCTOBER 2024

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 11 SHURS LN

Proposal: Demolish structures; construct mixed-use building

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Boyding Smith

Applicant: Ryan Boland, Offit Kurman

History: C.O. Struse and Sons Coal Company

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Main Street Manayunk Historic District, 12/14/1983

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to demolish the structures at 11 Shurs Lane and construct a four-story mixed-use building on the property. The existing structures, remnants of the former C.O. Struse and Sons Coal complex, lie on the northern edge of the Main Street Manayunk Historic District. This district was designated by City Council by ordinance in 1983, before the Historical Commission itself had the authority to create historic districts. The properties in the Main Street Manayunk Historic District are subject to the provisions set forth in Section PM-804 of the Property Maintenance Code, which provides a concise set of design review criteria for permit applications but does not directly address demolition. Supplementing the limited nature of the provisions in the Property Maintenance Code for the Main Street Manayunk Historic District, Section 18 of the Historical Commission's Rules and Regulations authorizes the Historical Commission to apply the provisions of the historic preservation ordinance, Section 14-1000 of the Philadelphia Code, to properties in the Main Street Manayunk Historic District, provided those provisions do not conflict with the Property Maintenance Code. In this instance, the Historical Commission should apply the demolition provisions and the review criteria for new

construction in the historic preservation ordinance.

The Main Street Manayunk Historic District was designated without a nomination and inventory. The nomination and inventory for the Main Street Manayunk National Register Historic District have been traditionally used in place of the missing nomination and inventory. The National Register inventory classifies this site as contributing to the district, but the inventory listing (under the incorrect address of 111-113 Shurs Lane) describes buildings or parts of buildings which are largely gone from the site:

SHURS LANE - NORTH OF MAIN

- B. 111-113 Shurs Lane. Industrial building company. Struse & Sons. C. 1875; original structure 3 story rubble construction with gable roof; structure butts up against Pennsy Railroad line; 111 is a later addition, a handsome 2 story yellow brick structure with decorative quoining; segmentally arched window openings with splayed brick lintels and hipped roof.

A major fire at the site in 1959 resulted in a condemnation and subsequent demolition of parts of structures over the years. The Historical Commission's staff recommends that the Commission consider the property as non-contributing to the district, which will allow the staff to administratively approve the removal of the structures on the site.

The application includes architectural drawings, a structural engineering report, zoning plans, renderings, current photographs of the property, and the entire application that was reviewed earlier in 2024 and approved by the Historical Commission for the adjacent property at 4045-61 Main Street.

The proposed building would be four stories tall and include 42 residential units, 37 parking spaces on the ground floor, and first-floor commercial space with entrance on Shurs Lane. While the drawings call out retention of the existing stone wall fronting Shurs Lane and incorporation of it into the new facade, a structural engineer has recently said this is not feasible, and that the structure including front wall must be taken down. The applicant has offered to attempt to salvage and reuse the stone where possible on the new façade. This proposed building will be seen within the context of the recently approved seven-story new construction project proposed on the adjacent property at 4045-61 Main Street.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Demolish structures on site.
- Construct four-story mixed-use building.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
 - o The materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing of the proposed building will be compatible with the historic district.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the Historical Commission find that the

property at 11 Shurs Lane is non-contributing to the Main Street Manayunk Historic District owing to the complete loss of historic character-defining features. The staff recommends approval, pursuant to Standard 9, because the proposed building is compatible in size, scale, materials, and massing with the historic district.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial as submitted owing to the front stone wall details, but approval of the overall design of the new construction, provided the existing openings in the wall are maintained and any new construction sits behind the stone wall at least 12 inches or the thickness of the wall, pursuant to Standard 9.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:15:00

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the revised application to the Historical Commission.
- Attorney Ryan Boland, owner's representative Andrew Langsam, and structural engineer Sam DiGenova represented the revised application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society commented that the property should not be considered non-contributing.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property at 11 Shurs Lane should be classified as non-contributing to the Main Street Manayunk Historic District, owing to the complete loss of historic character-defining features.
- The design of the front stone wall has been revised to reflect comments of the Architectural Committee.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing of the proposed building will be compatible with the historic district, satisfying Standard 9.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the revised application, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 11 Shurs Ln MOTION: Approval MOVED BY: McCoubrey SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel					X
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	11				2

ADDRESS: 252 QUINCE ST

Proposal: Legalize as-built roof and dormers

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Danielle Harvey

Applicant: Jonathan Wallace, AVLV Architecture & Development

History: 1806, William Smith

Individual Designation: 2/28/1961

District Designation: Washington Square West Historic District, Contributing, 9/13/2024

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This application proposes to legalize the as-built roof and dormers at 252 Quince Street, which deviate from the plans approved by the Historical Commission in December 2023. Deviations from the approved plans include the removal of original roof and framing, removal of front and rear cornices, construction of a roof above the location of the original roof, and installation of new dormers that differ in proportions from the approved dormers. This application for legalization was prompted by a staff site visit and subsequent issuance of a violation by the Department of Licenses and Inspections for construction that exceeded the approved plans.

SCOPE OF WORK:

- Legalize aspects of as-built roof and dormers

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

- o The gable roof, which was constructed above the location of the historic roof, and dormers, which were constructed taller than approved, are incompatible with the historic property and environment and fail to satisfy Standard 9.
- *Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*
 - o The historic integrity of the original 1806 roof and cornices was permanently altered with full removal, failing to satisfy this Standard 10.
- *Roofs Guideline | Recommended: Designing rooftop additions, elevator or stair towers, decks or terraces, dormers, or skylights when required by a new or continuing use so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure character-defining historic features.*
 - o Front and rear dormers were constructed 10 inches taller than approved plans and the dormer cornices are oversized. As currently constructed, the dormers are highly visible from the public right-of-way and fail to satisfy the roof guideline.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10 and the Roofs Guideline.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standards 9 and 10 and the Roofs Guideline.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:30:10

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Jonathan Wallace and contractor Zach Winters represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance thanked the staff for identifying the deviations between the new construction and approved building permit plans.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- During demolition, the contractor discovered the original roof rafters were undersized at 3" x 6" and were warped and rotted. Since the original rafters were pocketed directly into the front and rear walls, removal caused the front brick cornice to collapse. To meet building code, original rafters were replaced with new 2" x 10" rafters to meet building code. The installation of new building materials raised the roof by approximately five inches.
- The Department of Licenses and Inspections and Historical Commission were not notified of the structural issues or the deviations from the approved plans.
- On the interior, demolition uncovered a fourth floor (third-floor ceiling) with undersized 2" x 4" floor joists. As a result, the full floor was removed and rebuilt it with 2" x 10" joists. The planned height originally for the fourth floor was 7.5 feet but it is now less than 7 feet. This reduced the planned dormer ceiling height by six inches.
- The applicant contends that the building code for minimum head height and insulation would not have allowed them to replace the roof joists in kind while meeting the requirements.
- Custom-made brick has been ordered to rebuild the front cornice in kind.
- The current amended drawings do not sufficiently document the solutions proposed

by the applicant. The application should be revised to bring project back into compliance.

- Revised drawings and documentation must be submitted that address the Historical Commission's key concerns. The concerns include reconstruction of the cornice, reconstruction of roof profiles at the front and rear to match the historic row, and a reconfiguration of the dormers to a more historically compatible appearance. The revised application should be remanded to the Architectural Committee for review.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The current application fails to satisfy Standard 9, owing to the construction of a new roof and dormers that are incompatible with the historic property and environment.
- The current application fails to satisfy Standard 10 because the original 1806 roof and cornices were removed.
- The current application fails to satisfy the Roofs Guideline because the front and rear dormers were constructed 10 inches taller than approved plans and the dormer cornices are oversized. As currently constructed, the dormers are highly visible from the public right-of-way.

ACTION: Mr. McCoubrey moved to remand the application to the Architectural Committee at its meeting on 26 November 2024. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 252 Quince St MOTION: Remand to Architectural Committee MOVED BY: McCoubrey SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 16 OCTOBER 2024

ADDRESS: 8001 VERREE RD

Name of Resource: Knowlton Mansion

Proposed Action: Amendment

Property Owner: 8001 Verree CRCP LLC

Applicant: Michael McIlhenney, Esq.

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: The owner of the designated property at 8001 Verree Road requests that the Historical Commission define the boundary of the designation, which was not defined when the property was designated without a nomination in 1973. The proposed boundary would exclude a small section of the current parcel from the designated area. The owner plans to reconfigure the lot lines of the current parcel and four abutting parcels to create new parcels for the development of single-family homes.

Knowlton Mansion, a 12-acre property, was the former residence of William H. Rhawn and includes a house, carriage house, and caretaker cottage. Designed by Frank Furness in 1879 and completed in 1881, the historic buildings continue to reflect the architect's original design despite additions and alterations. The property at 8001 Verree Road was added to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places in 1973 and the National Register of Historic Places in 1974. The Historical Commission's meeting minutes of 7 May 1973 record the designation of the property by address and do not indicate that a boundary for the designated area was established. The designation predates the Historical Commission's use of nominations and the establishment of criteria for designation. The National Register nomination for the property was prepared in 1973 and was likely the basis and catalyst for the local designation. Although the National Register nomination recognized legal boundary of the 8001 Verree Road parcel, the nomination's statement of significance focused solely on the architect Furness and the buildings' architecture. It did not call out the landscape or any landscape features.

The proposed boundary for the designation largely follows the lot lines for the property that were in place in 1973 but would remove a small section of the historic lot at the northwest corner. The section proposed for removal is open land more than 100 feet from the nearest historic building. It includes a small segment of a driveway that would be protected by an easement.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends approval of the proposed boundary as this change would not alter or negatively impact the interpretation of the property's historical significance.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend approval of the proposed designation boundary for 8001 Verree Road.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:56:37

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the proposed boundary to the Historical Commission.
- Attorney Michael McIlhinney represented the application.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The proposed amendment would define a boundary for the designation of 8001 Verree Road.
- The proposed houses would be constructed more than 100 feet away from the closest historic building.
- The Historical Commission has approved numerous boundary amendments. An approval of this request would not set a precedent.
- New construction at the northwest corner of the property would not adversely impact the main viewsheds of the property from points near the intersection of Verree Road and Rhawn Street.
- Additional trees will be planted on the north side of the Caretaker Cottage driveway to create a natural buffer along Verree Road between the new construction and historic property.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- Limiting the Historical Commission's jurisdiction at the site with the proposed boundary would ensure the protection and preservation of all historic resources at the property.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved to approve the request to amend the boundary of the designation of 8001 Verree Road. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 8001 Verree Rd MOTION: Approve amendment to boundary MOVED BY: Lech SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 2117-23 GERMANTOWN AVE

Name of Resource: Diamond Theatre, Iglesia Ministerio Maranatha Pentecostal

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Iglesia Ministerio Maranatha Pentecostal Inc.

Nominator: Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 2117-23 Germantown Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A two-story brick building with terracotta ornamentation, known during various periods as the Diamond Theatre, the Diamante, the Teatro Puerto Rico, and Iglesia Ministerio Maranatha Pentecostal stands on the property. The nomination contends that the former theater satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J. The nomination argues that the building's Classical Revival style with Palladian influences embodies an architectural style and reflects the environment in an era characterized by that architectural style. The author further contends that the property exemplifies the cultural, economic, and social heritage of the community in its history as a Spanish-language theater from roughly 1950 to 1975.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 2117-23 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2117-23 Germantown Ave satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:06:45

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society of Philadelphia represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Andy Moholt, a neighbor who brought the building to the attention of the Keeping Society, commented in support of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss of the SoLo Germantown Civic Association commented in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The building provides an excellent example of the ornamentation used on neighborhood theaters of the early twentieth century, few of which survive.
- The property's association with the surrounding Puerto Rican community is worthy of commemoration and the nomination contributes to the scholarly record of Puerto Rican Philadelphians.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building is a good example of Classical Revival architecture and therefore satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D.
- The property's association with the surrounding community, including during its time

as a Spanish-language theater, makes it worthy of designation under Criterion for Designation J.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2117-23 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 2117-23 Germantown Ave					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, D, and J					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 6633 ARDLEIGH ST

Name of Resource: Convent of St. Therese of the Child Jesus

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Vincents Homes Inc.

Nominator: David Gest, SquareSide LLC

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes designating the Convent of St. Therese of the Child Jesus, also known as the Convent at the Shrine of the Little Flower, at 6633 Ardleigh Street in East Mt. Airy and listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The Archdiocese of Philadelphia commissioned the convent for the Sisters of St. Joseph, which ran the parish's parochial school, from the architectural firm of Gleeson & Mulrooney in 1941. The firm designed many buildings for the Archdiocese in the mid-twentieth century, while it was rapidly expanding in the outer neighborhoods of the city and the suburbs. The nomination argues that the convent satisfies Criterion for Designation D; it embodies distinguishing characteristics the Jacobean Revival architectural style. The nomination also argues that the convent satisfies Criterion for Designation J because it exemplifies the heritage of the community known as Little Flower Parish.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the

Convent of St. Therese of the Child Jesus at 6633 Ardleigh satisfies Criteria for Designation D and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 6633 Ardleigh Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and J and that the period of significance should be amended to 1941 to 1960.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:16:46

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Consultant David Gest represented the nomination and the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property owner supports the designation of 6633 Ardleigh Street.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The Convent of St. Therese of the Child Jesus embodies distinguishing characteristics the Jacobean Revival architectural style and thereby satisfies Criterion for Designation D.
- The Convent of St. Therese of the Child Jesus exemplifies the heritage of the community known as Little Flower Parish and thereby satisfies Criterion for Designation J.
- The Period of Significance should be set to 1941-1960.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 6633 Ardleigh Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and J, with a Period of Significance of 1941-1960, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Conard seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 6633 Ardleigh St MOTION: Designate, Criteria D and J, Period of Significance 1941-1960 MOVED BY: Cooperman SECONDED BY: Conard					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 34-36 E SHARPNACK ST

Name of Resource: Grace Baptist Church of Germantown, Sanctuary Church of God in Christ

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Sanctuary Church of God in Christ

Nominator: East Mt. Airy Neighbors

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 34-36 E. Sharpnack Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property at 34-36 E Sharpnack Street, the historic location of Grace Baptist Church, satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination highlights three significant people associated with this former location of Grace Baptist Church: Rev. Dr. Jeremiah Alvesta Wright, Sr. (1909-2001), his wife, Dr. Mary Elizabeth Henderson Wright (1916-2005), and their son, Rev. Dr. Jeremiah Alvesta Wright, Jr. (1941-present). Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the subject building represents a significant period of African American community history in Germantown and Mt. Airy, when Grace Baptist Church grew from a small congregation worshipping in a tent to a powerful force with local, state, and national influence.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 34-36 E. Sharpnack Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 34-36 E. Sharpnack Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:23:25

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Shachar-Krasnoff presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Evonne Tisdale and Linda Bell of East Mt. Airy Neighbors and Oscar Beisert, the nomination's author, represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Allyson Weiss of the SoLo Germantown Civic Association spoke in favor of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The nomination highlights three significant people associated with this former location of Grace Baptist Church: Rev. Dr. Jeremiah Alvesta Wright, Sr., his wife, Dr. Mary Elizabeth Henderson Wright, and their son, Rev. Dr. Jeremiah Alvesta Wright, Jr.
- The building represents a significant period of African American community history in Germantown and Mt. Airy, when Grace Baptist Church grew from a small congregation worshipping in a tent to a powerful force with local, state, and national influence

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion A, owing to its association with members of the Wright family.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion J because it illuminates African American community history in the Germantown and Mt. Airy neighborhoods.

ACTION: Mr. Thomas moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 34-36 E. Sharpnack Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Carney seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 34-36 E Sharpnack St MOTION: Designate, Criteria A and J MOVED BY: Thomas SECONDED BY: Carney					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 40 W TULPEHOCKEN ST

Name of Resource: G. Harry and Mary E. Davis House

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Mary A. Meloscia

Nominator: Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff, Alex Till

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 40 W. Tulpehocken Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A two-and-a-half-story masonry residential building known as the G. Harry and Mary E. Davis House, designed by the architect Charles F. Collom in the Queen Anne style and built in 1887, stands on the property.

The nomination contends that the G. Harry and Mary E. Davis House satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D. It argues that the building reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Queen architectural style, satisfying Criteria C & D.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 40 W. Tulpehocken Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 40 W Tulpehocken St satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:33:31

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Till presented the nomination to the Historical Commission and represented the

- nomination
- Mary Meloscia represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The building at 40 W Tulpehocken St was designed by architect Charles F. Collom and was built in 1887.
- The building exemplifies the Queen Anne Style.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building exemplifies the Queen Anne Style, satisfying Criteria C and D

ACTION: Mr. Frankel moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 40 W Tulpehocken St satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Cooperman seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 40 W Tulpehocken St MOTION: Designate, Criteria C and D MOVED BY: Frankel SECONDED BY: Cooperman					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

OLD BUSINESS

ADDRESS: 1039 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Union Republican Club

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Samson Asset Management

Nominator: Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1039 Chestnut Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building, constructed in 1878 and significantly modified in 1918, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J. The property was the headquarters of the Union Republican Club from 1878 to 1901 and of the Republican City Committee until 1934. The property has a long history of commerce at the first-floor level, and from 1949 through the 1970s, the whole building was used by Tappin's Jewelers for retail sales. The nomination argues that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J, exemplifying the political and commercial history of the city. The nomination further argues that the distinctive architectural elements of both the original structure, exhibiting trademarks of nineteenth-century eclectic design, and the renovated façade along Chestnut Street, in the Commercial Style, satisfy Criteria for Designation C and D.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1039 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1039 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:40:00

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Historical Commission and represented the nominator.
- Attorney Neil Sklaroff, property owner Jan Singer, and preservation consultant George Thomas represented the property. They opposed the designation of the property.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society of Philadelphia commented in support of the nomination.
- Allison Weiss of the SoLo Germantown Civic Association commented in support of the nomination.
- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance of Greater Philadelphia commented in support of the nomination.
- Lori Arnold commented in support of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman commented in support of the nomination.
- Julia Hayman commented in support of the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The nineteenth-century facade along 11th Street is architecturally distinctive even though it has been modified.
- The twentieth-century facade along Chestnut Street is architecturally distinctive even though it has been modified.
- As the headquarters of the Union Republican Club from 1878 to 1901 and of the Republican City Committee until 1934, the building at 1039 Chestnut Street is significant for its role in Philadelphia's political history.
- As the site of Tappin's Jewelers, the building at 1039 Chestnut Street is significant for its role in Philadelphia's commercial history.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The site's association with the political activities of the Union Republican Club and the commercial history of a variety of vendors make it worthy of designation under Criteria A and J.
- The building's architecture, both the nineteenth-century section and the twentieth-century section, satisfies Criteria for Designation C and D.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1039 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Robert Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by a vote of 9 to 3.

ITEM: 1039 Chestnut St					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, C, D, and J					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair		X			
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)		X			
Lech (L&I)		X			
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	9	3			1

ADDRESS: 8527-29 GERMANTOWN AVE

Name of Resource: The Chestnut Hill Office of the Germantown Trust Company

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: PTBK LLC

Nominator: Chestnut Hill Conservancy

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes designating the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue as historic and listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Chestnut Hill Office of the Germantown Trust Company building, constructed in 1927, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. Under Criterion C, the nomination contends that the property reflects the environment of Chestnut Hill and the larger German Township in the second and third quarters of the twentieth century, and embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Colonial Revival style, satisfying Criterion D. Under Criterion E, the nomination asserts that the property is significant as the work of Arthur H. Brockie, a prominent local architect of the first and second quarters of the twentieth century.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:40:42

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Oscar Beisert and Lori Salganicoff represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Allison Weiss of the SoLo Germantown Civic Association commented in support of the designation.
- Steven Peitzman commented in support of the designation.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The former Chestnut Hill Office of the Germantown Trust Company building was constructed in 1927.
- A representative of the property owner is aware of this review but is not participating in it.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building reflects the environment of Chestnut Hill and the larger German Township in the second and third quarters of the twentieth century, satisfying Criterion C.
- The building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Colonial Revival style, satisfying Criterion D.
- The building is significant as the work of Arthur H. Brockie, a prominent local

architect of the first and second quarters of the twentieth century, satisfying Criterion E.

ACTION: Mr. Lech moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: 8527-29 Germantown Ave					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Lech					
SECONDED BY: Washington					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

ADDRESS: 700-34 RACE ST

Name of Resource: Roundhouse, Philadelphia Police Headquarters

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: City of Philadelphia

Nominator: Preservation Alliance/Docomomo Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property known as the Roundhouse, the former Philadelphia Police Headquarters at 700-34 Race Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Philadelphia architectural firm Geddes Brecher Qualls & Cunningham (GBQC) and engineer August Komendant designed the Roundhouse in 1959 and its construction was completed in 1962. The building is composed of approximately 1,000 precast concrete units. The nomination argues that the Roundhouse reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style, the Expressionist style, satisfying Criterion for Designation C, and embodies distinguishing characteristics of that style, satisfying Criterion D. The nomination contends that the Roundhouse embodies distinguishing characteristics of an engineering specimen with its architectural precast concrete and state of the art post tensioning, also satisfying Criterion D. The nomination highlights the collaboration between the prominent Philadelphia architectural firm GBQC, engineer August Komendant, and general contractor Sovereign Construction Company and asserts that they were designers and

builders whose work significantly influenced the development of the city, state, and nation, satisfying Criterion E. The nomination claims that the Roundhouse contains elements of design, detail, materials, and craftsmanship that represent significant innovations, satisfying Criterion F. The nomination asserts that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion H, owing to its unique siting and location. Finally, the nomination contends that the Roundhouse satisfies Criterion J because it exemplifies the progressive period in Philadelphia under Mayors Clark and Dilworth.

The proposed boundary for the designation includes the northern portion of the site with the building but not the surface parking lot to the south. The boundary also excludes a small parcel at the northwest corner of the site that is owned by the Delaware River Port Authority, not the City of Philadelphia. The nomination identifies the concrete perimeter wall as a non-contributing feature, owing to the expectation that any redevelopment of the site will require its demolition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street, the Roundhouse, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:48:00

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Hanna Stark and Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance and Allee Davis of DOCOMOMO-Philadelphia represented the nomination.
- Ian Litwin of the Philadelphia City Planning Commission provided an overview of his agency's public engagement efforts related to the property at 700-34 Race Street.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert supported the nomination.
- Allison Weiss supported the nomination.
- Lori Arnold supported the nomination.
- David Brownlee supported the nomination.
- Tom Normile supported the nomination.
- Dan Macey supported the nomination.
- Julia Hayman supported the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman supported the nomination.
- Jack Pyburn supported the nomination.
- Suzanna Barucco supported the nomination.
- Lori Salganicoff supported the nomination.
- Tony Bracali supported the nomination.

HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:

The Historical Commission found that:

- The property at 700-34 Race Street is nearly three acres in size and is situated at a critical location on Franklin Square, at the base of the Benjamin Franklin Bridge, and adjacent to the Independence Square area and Chinatown.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- It is not in the public interest to designate the property at 700-34 Race Street as historic at this time.

ACTION: Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 700-34 Race Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, E, F, H, and J and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which failed by a vote of 6 to 6.

ITEM: 700-34 Race St					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria C, D, E, F, H, and J					
MOVED BY: Cooperman					
SECONDED BY: McCoubrey					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair		X			
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)		X			
Carney (PCPC)		X			
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)		X			
Lech (L&I)		X			
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)		X			
Total	6	6			1

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 04:00:26

ACTION: At 1:18 p.m., Mr. McCoubrey moved to adjourn. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion, which was adopted by unanimous consent.

ITEM: Adjournment					
MOTION: Adjourn					
MOVED BY: McCoubrey					
SECONDED BY: Thomas					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Frankel, Chair	X				
Washington, Vice Chair	X				
Abu Saab (Commerce)	X				
Carney (PCPC)	X				
Cooperman	X				
Holloman (City Council)					X
Conard (DPP)	X				
Lech (L&I)	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Michel	X				
Rabauer	X				
Thomas	X				
Treat (DPD)	X				
Total	12				1

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional

engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;

(f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;

(g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;

(h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;

(i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or

(j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.