

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

13 February 1986

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee,
American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.
Mark McQueen, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Executive Secretary
Terri Koob, Clerk Steno II

Also: Vince Hauser of Growth Properties to present plans for the second phase of the Lit Brothers rehabilitation.
John Schiavo, Owner; Dan Morris, Desimone Construction; and Van Potteiger, Architect, representing 225 Arch Street.
Michael Lawrence, Developer, representing 2501 Christian Street.
Kimberly Fisher of George T. Manos, Architects, to present a storefront elevation and details for 201-203 S. 12th Street.
John McCarthy and Kenneth Jacobs of John Milner Associates; Harold Finnegan and Nicholas Biddle to present plans for the restoration of the Officers Quarters at Fort Mifflin.
Cynthia Brey, Architect, to present plans for the rehabilitation of 817-819 S. Hancock Street.
Stephen White, Owner and Architect, and Katherine White, Owner, representing 2123 Green Street.
Andrew Moroz and Arlene Matzkin of Friday Architects to present plans for the renovation of 343 S. 12th Street
Ross Baguzy and David Singer to present plans for an addition to First Pennsylvania Bank at Frankford and Girard Avenues.
Eileen Barbash, representing 1907 Brandywine Street.
Tom Scott, TRS Architects, to present a decertification request from the owner of 506 S. 5th Street
Mary Lou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia.
And others.

ALTERATIONS

✓ Lit Brothers, Facade Restoration, David Hollenberg of John Milner Associates, Architects and Vince Hauser of Growth Properties. Messrs. Hollenberg and Hauser presented the second in a series of three construction packages for the Lit Brothers complex. The first phase was presented at the Architectural Committee Meeting of 14 November 1985 and included the installation of a new roof and window replacements. Storefront design will constitute the third phase of this project. At today's meeting Mr. Hollenberg presented

his firm's proposal for facade restoration. All facades will be cleaned, repaired, restored and repainted. These include one marble, one brown-stone, three cast iron and the remaining brick and terra cotta facades. Sheet metal will be either repaired or replaced depending upon the costs involved. The roof sign will be removed. The bridges will also be restored. Some window openings on the Filbert Street elevation will be closed.

The Architectural Committee agreed to recommend that the Commission approve this phase of the Lit Brothers rehabilitation. Mr. Hollenberg abstained from voting on this submission.

- ✓ 225 Arch Street, Van Pottleger, Architect, John Schiavo, Owner, and Dan Morris of Desimone Construction. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that in November 1984 the Historical Commission approved plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the building at 225 Arch Street, a five-story, turn-of-the-century brick structure. The Historical Commission staff became aware that the work actually done at 225 Arch Street differed from that approved when an architect recently presented plans in conjunction with a request for approval of a building permit for interior alterations. These drawings showed that the windows on the Broad Street elevation were partially infilled with wood panels and not totally glazed as approved by the Commission. Ms. Siemiontkowski presented photographs for the Committee's review of the completed work on 225 Arch Street. Ms. Siemiontkowski further stated that canvas awnings and a large sidewalk planter were installed without appropriate approvals along the Arch Street facade. Mr. Schiavo stated that at the time of the November 1984 submission, the architects were mainly concerned with renovations to the upper floors. A schematic ground floor elevation was included only as a part of a general scheme. When actual renovations to the ground floor were undertaken, Mr. Schiavo stated that the approved design proved to be inappropriate owing to the interior floor height being three feet above the exterior grade. Mr. Bartley interjected that at the time of the initial submission, the architect reported this problem. The Committee touched on the possibility of providing a stucco infill within a portion of the openings. Such a treatment would have been more appropriate than the wood panel infill which currently exists.

The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend that a revised submission be presented for its review showing all interior and exterior alterations to the structure at 225 Arch Street. If the revisions prove acceptable, the Committee will recommend its approval to the Commission at its 26 February meeting. If, however, the Committee finds the revised drawings inappropriate, a resubmission to the full Committee will be recommended.

- ✓ 2501 Christian Street, Michael Lawrence, Developer. Mr. Lawrence presented plans for the rehabilitation of the Gray's Road Recreation Center at 2501 Christian Street for residential reuse. This structure, designed by James H. Windrim in 1926 in the Georgian Revival style, stands two-and-a-half stories tall and five bays wide on Christian Street. Mr. Lawrence presented a scale model showing the proposed development planned for this site which is to include

two and three story townhouses constructed of grey stucco with brick trim and a two bedroom brick gate tower house. The rehabilitation plans for the Gray's Road Recreation Center at 2501 Christian Street include the construction of six skylights, the installation of a new grey shingle roof, the addition of three new windows on the Stillman Street facade and the alteration of some window openings on the basement level to accomodate french doors leading to sunken gardens. The plans also include the proposed installation of roof-top air conditioning units. The Committee suggested and the architect agreed that these units would be better positioned on the ground. The facade of the main building will be patch pointed and lightly cleaned. The 1920's wall will be repaired where necessary.

The Committee reviewed this proposal and agreed to recommend its approval pending the submission of a partial east elevation showing existing openings and proposed new openings. Since Mr. Lawrence used Windrim's original design drawings for his submission, the existing condition and proposed new work were somewhat unclear.

✓ 201-203 S. 12th Street, Kimberly Fisher of George T. Manos, Architects.

Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that preliminary plans for this building were approved, in concept, at the Architectural Committee Meeting of 8 August 1985. Ms. Fisher stated that the original appearance of the ground floor could not be documented. As a result, a modern approach to the ground floor storefront was employed as recommended by the Committee at its 8 August meeting. Ms. Fisher further stated that the window inserts were changed from metal to glass at the recommendation of the Tax Act reviewers. Mr. Bartley suggested that the storefront sash be lengthened to give a stronger vertical dimension to the ground floor.

The Committee agreed to recommend that the drawings be revised and resubmitted for staff review. If acceptable, approval will be recommended to the Commission.

Fort Mifflin, Officers Quarters, John McCarthy and Kenneth Jacobs of John Milner Associates; Harold Finnegan and Nicholas Biddle. Messrs. Finnegan and Biddle presented background information on the history of Fort Mifflin and the problems and solutions that have been experienced and overcome since its abandonment. The encampment of the Vision Quest group has helped considerably to reduce the vandalism problem. Mr. McCarthy presented plans for the renovation of the Officers Quarters which will be used as office space. These plans call for the removal of a partition in the center of the building and the installation of a movable wall to facilitate changing space requirements. Documentation exists showing two previously demolished rear kitchen wings. Current plans call for the reconstruction of these rear wings. One will be used to house the mechanics of the building and the other will be a kitchen on the first floor and a storage area on the second floor. Door openings will be created on the rear of these additions leading to the outside. Mr. Jacobs will undertake an archeological monitoring during the excavation required for construction of the rear wings.

The Committee agreed to recommend approval of this renovation proposal for the Fort Mifflin, Officers Quarters. Mr. Hollenberg abstained from voting on this submission.

- ✓ 817-819 S. Hancock Street, Cynthia Brey, Architect. Ms. Brey presented a proposal to rehabilitate the two houses at 817-819 S. Hancock Street. 819 appears to be of 1790's vintage; the one at 817, c. 1840. Ms. Brey stated that the rear dormer that is included on the drawings will not be constructed owing to budget constraints. Major work will include cleaning and repairing of existing fabric. Mr. Levy recommended that the light fixtures be eliminated from the front facade and suggested that the exterior lighting could be incorporated into the transom.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this renovation proposal for 817-819 S. Hancock Street.

- 2123 Green Street, Stephen White, Owner and Architect, and Katherine White, Owner. Mr. & Mrs. White appeared before the Architectural Committee as a result of an illegal skylight constructed atop 2123 Green Street without the Historical Commission's approval. The Historical Commission approved a permit application for interior alterations and repair of windows. After leaving the Commission office, Mr. White altered the permit application to include the construction of a skylight atop the roof of the building. Mr. White stated that it was not his intention that the skylight be visible from the street. However, once construction began and various factors were taken into consideration, it became visible. The Committee reviewed photographs of the completed skylight which is clearly visible and intrusive to the streetscape. Mr. White was advised that if he had brought this proposal to the Committee for its review, he would have been required to design and to position the skylight so that it would not be visible from the street.

The Committee, after considerable discussion, agreed to recommend to the Commission that this illegal skylight addition to 2123 Green Street be approved. - *Owner to come back to Committee.*

- ✓ 343 S. 12th Street, Andrew Moroz and Arlene Matzkin of Friday Architects. Mr. Moroz and Ms. Matzkin presented plans for the partial restoration and stabilization of this three-story 1830's house with a Victorian door and cornice. After reviewing plans for this restoration, the Committee recommended that the window sash should contain two-over-two lights of glass. Mr. Moroz explained that the door would remain but would be rehung in order for it to swing out.

The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of this project for 343 S. 12th Street.

- ✓ First Pennsylvania Bank, Frankford and Girard Avenues. Ross Baguzy and David Singer, applicants. Messrs. Baguzy and Singer presented plans for the construction of a one-story MAC Machine addition to the 1877 Furness bank building at Frankford and Girard Avenues. This addition will be constructed away from the corner and treated compatibly with the design of the original building.

The Committee reviewed the plans for this addition and voted to recommend its approval.

- ✓ 1907 Brandywine Street, John Bushnell, Architect, and Eileen Barbash. Ms. Barbash presented plans for the renovation of an existing garage at 1907 Brandywine Street. The design of the garage is in keeping with the Victorian design of the adjacent house. The Committee reviewed the plans and recommended that the nine foot glass transom be divided into six lights.

The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this renovation pending receipt of a revised drawing showing a six light transom.

- ✓ 3426 Sansom Street, Schlosser, Rivera, Krumholz, Architects. The architects presented plans for the renovation to the rear of 3426 Sansom Street, an 1870's house on Sansom Row. The Committee reviewed the plans as presented and considered the fact that the University of Pennsylvania will build behind this property. That new construction will block from view the rears of the Sansom Street properties in the 3400 block.

The Committee agreed to recommend approval to the Commission for this rear alteration to 3426 Sansom Street.

- ✓ 1913 Spring Garden Street, Paul Calvert, Architect. This proposal calls for the substantial rehabilitation of this Victorian house with the addition of several roof decks. The Committee reviewed the plans as presented and noted that should the windows be replaced, shop drawings will be required for review. The Committee further requested that the architect submit cleaning specifications to the Commission staff prior to cleaning the bricks.

The Committee agreed to recommend that this project be approved.

- ✓ 506 S. 5th Street, Tom Scott, TRS Architects. Mr. Scott presented a letter from the owner of 506 S. 5th Street requesting that this property be removed from the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places owing to its loss of architectural and historical integrity as a result of alterations undertaken over the years. The owner wishes to remove the ground floor, turn-of-the-century storefront and stabilize the structurally deficient front facade of this 1790's house.

After considerable discussion, the Committee decided that the Historical Commission should retain some control over alterations to this structure and agreed to recommend that it not be removed from the list of designated buildings. The Committee suggested that elevation drawings be submitted showing all alterations proposed for this structure.

Mr. Scott was advised that should the owner desire to speak to the Commission on behalf of his request, he may attend the next Stated Meeting which will be held on 26 February 1986 in the 14th Floor Conference Room of City Hall Annex at 10:30 a.m.

✓ 736 S. Front Street, James Murphy, Architect/Construction Management.

Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that a permit for the removal of the front facade of this certified building was issued by the Department of Licenses and Inspections without the approval of the Historical Commission owing to the erroneous omission of this property on the Department of Licenses and Inspections list of designated buildings. The Historical Commission staff became aware of this error when an anonymous caller telephoned to ask if this property appeared on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places and, if so, why was the front facade being demolished.

Mr. Murphy submitted for the Committee's review photographs of the building taken during demolition. The ground floor had been constructed of cinder blocks and the roof of the house was collapsed. Only a small portion of the original building had survived underneath the building's 1950's perma-stone front. In addition, the house was completely infested with termites.

After considerable discussion, the Committee agreed to recommend that the property at 736 S. Front Street be removed from the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places owing to its loss of architectural integrity. The Committee examined the owner's elevation drawing for a new facade and withheld comment on its design. The Committee agreed to recommend that the pending permit application for construction be approved. Mr. Murphy was instructed to have the Licenses and Inspections inspector phone Mark McQueen of the Law Department should he have any questions on this situation.

✓ 321 Chestnut Street, C. E. Vallhonrat, Architect. Ms. Siemiontkowski explained that at the 12 December meeting of the Architectural Committee, plans for the renovation of the Philadelphia Maritime Museum at 321 Chestnut Street were reviewed. At that time the Committee recommended that the first window on the Orianna Street elevation be lengthened making it the same size as the windows on the front facade of the building. The architect revised the drawing and resubmitted. After a subsequent review of the photographs and the revised elevation, the Committee reconsidered its original recommendation. The members now agree that all the windows on the east elevation should hold the existing sill line. The Committee further recommended that a consistent glass size be used in the openings as shown in the photograph on file in the Commission office.

The Committee agreed to recommend the approval of the proposed alteration subject to these changes.

PLAQUES

✓ 240 S. Third Street. The Committee reviewed the plaque application and photograph as presented and agreed to recommend that an Historical Commission "Restored" plaque be awarded to 240 S. Third Street.

✓ 1928 Wallace Street. The Committee rejected an application for a plaque for 1928 Wallace Street at its 14 November 1985 meeting owing to inappropriate two part louvered shutters on the second floor. The owner requests that the Committee reconsider its decision owing to the fact that the shutters on the second floor are modeled from shutter details provided by the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation for similar buildings at 2009 Wallace Street and 2010 Mt. Vernon Street. The Committee noted that the owner should have presented the proposal for hanging shutters to the Commission before proceeding with construction and installation.

The Committee reiterated its original recommendation not to award a plaque to 1928 Wallace Street.

✓ 3210 Powelton Street. The Committee reviewed the plaque application and photograph presented for 3210 Powelton Street. It appears that storm windows are installed on the fourth floor. Mr. Hollenberg will inspect this property and report his findings to the Committee at a later date.

✓ 225 S. 42nd Street. The Committee reviewed the plaque application and photograph presented for 225 S. 42nd Street. It appears that this structure has a stucco-faced addition atop the front porch which may make it ineligible for an Historical Commission plaque. Mr. Hollenberg will inspect this building at 225 S. 42nd Street and report his findings at a later date.

✓ 223 S. 42nd Street. The Committee reviewed the request for an Historical Commission plaque and the photographs of 223 S. 42nd Street. Mr. Hollenberg will inspect this structure and report his findings at a later date.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terri Koob
Clerk Steno II