

THE MINUTES OF THE 282nd STATED MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

5 July 1984

F. Otto Haas, Chairman

Present: F. Otto Haas, Chairman of the Commission
Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Allen J. Beckman, Esq.
Reverend William Thompson
Commissioner Dudley Sykes, Department of Public Property
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Kenneth Cooper, Esq., Deputy City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Randal Baron, Executive Secretary

Also: Jefferson Moak
Anthony Longo, Treasurer, V.F.W., Frank Hendrie, Trustee, V.F.W. and
Gary Miller, Commandor, V.F.W., to appeal the recommendation of the
Architectural Committee concerning 8217 Germantown Avenue.

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 281st Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, 7 June 1984, were reviewed, approved and directed to be filed.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee for 20 June 1984, Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission. Mr. Levy presented to the Commission his Committee's Report for 20 June 1984 with the recommendation that it be approved, as written, subject to the exclusion of two items. Mr. Levy asked that the two items removed from the report, i.e., 8217 Germantown Avenue and 2133-2141 Arch Street, be considered, discussed and acted upon separately. A motion to approve the Report of the Architectural Committee for 20 June 1984, excluding 8217 Germantown Avenue and 2133-2141 Arch Street, was made, seconded and carried.

Owing to the presence of Messrs. Long, Hendrie and Miller of the V.F.W. Post housed in the building at 8217 Germantown Avenue, the Chairman asked that the Commission next address the Architectural Committee's recommendation regarding this building.

Mr. Levy reported to the Commission his Committee's review of a request, presented by Robert Malfara and Craig Mills of Absolute Builders, for permission to install aluminum over the existing wood fabric on the building at 8217 Germantown Avenue. It was the opinion of the Committee that the wood cornice, window heads, etc. should not be covered with aluminum. Approval of such a request, in the judgment of the Committee, would

establish a bad precedent. The members recommended, instead, that a partial restoration and/or replacement of the deteriorated wood be undertaken at this time.

Following Mr. Levy's review of the Committee's recommendation regarding 8217 Germantown Avenue, Messrs. Longo, Hendrie and Miller presented their position. The V.F.W. Post which currently occupies the building has found the cost of maintaining the structure to be a significant financial burden. Scaffolding and repainting of the building costs approximately \$2000 to \$3000 and must be undertaken every two or three years. To eliminate this recurring expense, the V.F.W. decided to replace the deteriorated wood with aluminum. Mr. Miller pointed out that his organization intends to remove all existing wood fabric, not cover it, and replace it in aluminum to match in form and detail the original design as shown in an early photograph of the building on file in the Commission office. The contractors, who appeared before the Architectural Committee on 20 June, led the Committee members to believe that the wood would remain in place on the building and be covered with aluminum.

Following some discussion, the Commission agreed, in concept, to the proposed replacement of the wood fabric in aluminum but asked for the submission of drawings and/or sample extrusions of the fabric to be used. These materials, drawings and/or samples, must be submitted to the members of the Architectural Committee for review before a final approval can be granted. The V.F.W. representatives agreed to forward the necessary documents and materials to the Commission staff. Mr. Beckman abstained from voting on this matter.

Action on the Architectural Committee's recommendation concerning 2133-2141 Arch Street was tabled pending the Commission's decision on the proposed certification of that building.

THE REPORT of the Committee on Certification for 22 May 1984, Edward Pinkowski, Chairman.

The Commission first considered the proposed certification of the Juvenile Court and Detention Center at 2133-2141 Arch Street. The Committee on Certification recommended in favor of certification by a split vote of 2 to 1 with two abstentions.

Following some discussion of the building's marginal historical and architectural merit, Mr. Pinkowski presented a motion to certify 2133-2141 Arch Street as recommended by his Committee. Mr. Beckman seconded the motion and a vote was called. Four of the six members present voted against the certification of the Juvenile Court and Detention Center.

As a result of the Commission's decision not to certify 2133-2141 Arch Street, no action on the Architectural Committee's recommendation regarding the building's proposed rehabilitation was necessary. No jurisdiction exists.

In agreement with the recommendation of its Committee on Certification, the Historical Commission reviewed and approved, individually, for certification each of the following buildings:

2136-2142 E. Dauphin Street: 26th District Police & Patrol Station
3839 Hamilton Street
3841 Hamilton Street
3843 Hamilton Street
3845 Hamilton Street
3847 Hamilton Street
3849 Lancaster Avenue
3851 Lancaster Avenue
3853 Lancaster Avenue
3855 Lancaster Avenue
3857 Lancaster Avenue
3859 Lancaster Avenue
3861 Lancaster Avenue
431 North 39th Street
433 North 39th Street
435 North 39th Street
437 North 39th Street
1213-1215 Locust Street
1217-1219 Locust Street
115 Roumfort Road: The Leamy House
1249-1253 South 19th Street: Memorial Church of the Holy Comforter

The Commission also voted to reaffirm thn certification of 301-303 Race Street, also known as 200-214 North 3rd Street.

Action on 1400 North 26th Street, Athletic Recreation Park, was tabled pending the receipt of interior photographs, additional information and a reevaluation by the Committee on Certification.

THE REPORT on Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for the month of June, 1984, Richard Tyler, Historian. The Historian presented his report to the Commission and offered to answer questions. He discussed briefly the present status of the Provident Bank building at Sixth and Spring Garden Streets and the Naval Home on Gray's Ferry Avenue. A motion to approve the Historian's report was made, seconded and carried.

At this time, Mr. Tyler introduced to the Commission members Randal Baron. Mr. Baron, recently appointed to replace Jefferson Moak as the Commission's Executive Secretary, was welcomed by the Commission members.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:50 p.m.

Respectfully submittted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian