

THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE  
OF THE  
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMITTEE

27 October 1988

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman  
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect, Independence  
National Park  
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.  
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.

Maria Petrillo, Chief Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department  
Patricia A. Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation  
Officer  
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner  
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I

Also: Mark Reinberger and Martin Jay Rosenblum, R.A., to present  
a proposal for interior and exterior alterations  
to the Fifth Church of Christ, Scientist at 1915-23 Pine  
Street.  
Ronald Knabb, architect and Feldon Stolteus to present a  
proposal for the construction of a toilet room addition and  
handicapped access ramp within the courtyard of the Cathedral  
of Saints Peter and Paul located at 18th and Race Streets.  
Walter and Susan Max, owners and Lawrence Gilbert, Architect,  
to present a proposal for the reconstruction of this small,  
two-and-a-half story, frame house on the vacant lot at 123  
Queen Street.  
James S. Collins, Architect, to present working drawings and  
details for a complete rehabilitation of the Henry George  
Birthplace at 413 S. 10th Street.  
Timothy Lisle, Alison Towers and Charles E. Dagit, Jr. of  
Dagit - Saylor Architects to present a preliminary proposal  
for proposed development of the property located at  
700-18 Walnut Street.  
Steven Crane and Hugh Zimmers to present a preliminary  
submission which involves the replacement of an existing  
one-story addition on the rear of 516 Spruce Street with  
a three-story addition and the restoration of the Spruce  
Street entrance.  
Richard B. Moore, owner, Bill Keyes and Alonzo Syed, Contractor  
to present a proposal for the reconstruction of the entrance  
stairs at 406-08 S. 16th Street.  
Victor Arencibia and Zion Bachshi to present a preliminary  
proposal for the complete rehabilitation of 104-06 Arch  
Street.

## ALTERATIONS

✓ 1915-23 Pine Street, Fifth Church of Christ Scientist. Mark Reinberger and Martin Jay Rosenblum, R.A. Messrs. Reinberger and Rosenblum appeared before the Architectural Committee to present a proposal for interior and exterior alterations to the building at 1915-23 Pine Street.

On the front facade, work includes closing an existing, but long unused, doorway and replacing it with a window identical to the existing one on the left. The original doors to this doorway were replaced some years ago with the present flush metal doors. The intent is to provide a compatible window for the new restroom inside, and produce a balanced composition on the exterior. A planter and iron railing matching the existing one will screen the infilled portion of the facade.

In the rear courtyard the double window unit will be converted into a pair of doors and transom, matching the existing doorway in detailing. This change will provide direct access from the narthex to the garden.

Inside the building all areas will receive millwork that will replicate the present trim. The high ceiling is being left open so that the arched wooden trusses and beaded board ceiling remain exposed.

The Committee recommended an approval for the rear alterations and the work inside the building. However, the Committee requested that the existing doorway on the front facade be retained. The flush doors should be replaced with new wood doors which replicate as closely as possible, the original design. The Committee requested revised drawings illustrating the new replacement doors. A photograph of the original doors can be found in the Historical Commission files.

✓ 18th and Race Streets, Cathedral of Saints Peter and Paul. Feldon Stolteus and Ronald Knabb, Architect to present a proposal for the construction of a toilet room addition and handicapped access ramp within the courtyard bounded by the cathedral on the north, the rectory on the south, and the rectory chapel on the east. The addition will be executed in brick with reveal courses to match the existing rectory. Existing doors, stairs and railings will be salvaged and reused in the new entrance design.

The Committee recommended an approval in concept for this project. However, the Committee requested that the railing on the handicapped access ramp be made to match the existing railing on the stair and that a concrete cheek wall be built to screen the ramp. The cheek wall material should match as closely as possible in color and texture the granite base of the cathedral.

123 Queen Street, Lawrence Gilbert, architect and Walter and Susan Max, owners. This application calls for the reconstruction of this small, two-and-a-half story, frame house on the vacant lot at 123 Queen Street. The original building was demolished by a previous owner of the property in violation of Commission's ordinance. An order to rebuild was issued by the Department of Licenses and Inspections as requested by the Commission.

The proposed reconstruction is based on an 1896 photograph on file in the Commission office. The new owner has chosen to install a cedar shingle roof rather than a standing seam metal roof as shown in the 1896 photograph. The owner also proposes to build a simulated brick stucco chimney rather than a masonry structure.

The Committee stated that the chimney should be constructed of real brick (not simulated) with a corbelled brick capping on the top. The Committee also agreed that the owner can have either one or two basement windows. However, each window sash should be divided vertically into two lights of glass. The Committee requested that revised drawings be submitted to the staff for a final review and approval.

✓ 413 S. 10th Street, Henry George House, James S. Collins, architect. On 25 August 1988 the Architectural Committee reviewed and approved, in concept, a proposal for a complete rehabilitation of the Henry George Birthplace at 413 S. 10th Street.

Today, Mr. Collins presented final working drawings to the Committee for a final approval for this project.

The Committee requested that the drawings be revised to show a more steeply pitched gable on the dormer roof. In addition, the Committee asked that the position of the dormer on the roof be lowered. The Committee recommends an approval for the remainder of this project and requested that revised drawings be submitted to the staff for a final review and approval.

✓ 700-18 Walnut Street, former PSFS Property. Timothy Lisle, Alison Towers and Charles E. Dagit, Jr. from Dagit - Saylor Architects.

This proposal was being presented to the Committee for approval in concept. The architect discussed with the Committee both interior and exterior alterations. Mr. Dagit presented to the Committee a cardboard model of the entire building and explained in particular his desire for a conceptual approval of a one-story roof top addition atop the portion of the building extending along 7th Street. The mostly glass and steel addition would be set back substantially from the 7th Street elevation partly overhanging the interior light court so that it could not be seen from 7th Street. It would, however, be visible from some parts of Washington Square.

The Committee also examined a proposed reconfiguration of the existing storefront at 716 Walnut Street.

The Committee recommends a conceptual approval for this project. The members also expressed a desire for a restudy of the shop front window at 716 Walnut Street. They suggested the development of a design more in keeping with the scale and proportion of the adjoining building. Detailed drawings must be submitted to the Committee before a final approval can be recommended. David Hollenberg abstained.

- ✓ 516 Spruce Street, Steven Crane and Hugh Zimmers. This preliminary submission involves the replacement of an existing one-story addition on the rear of 516 Spruce Street with a new three-story addition. On the front facade, the architect proposes to restore the front entrance to its earlier appearance. This involves restoring the entrance steps, handrail, basement entrance and entrance door.

The Committee voted to recommend an approval in concept for this project. The Committee requested construction details for the stoop and railing be reviewed by the staff for a final approval. The Committee also stated that if the shutters are to be replaced the shutter design must come back to the Committee.

- ✓ 406-08 S. 16th Street, Richard B. Moore, Esq., owner, Bill Keyes and Alonzo Syed, contractor. This application calls for the reconstruction of the entrance stairs at 406-08 S. 16th Street. The original stairs were severely damaged when struck by a car this past summer. At its last meeting, the Committee recommended that the stairs be reconstructed in either brownstone or cast stone to resemble brownstone. The Committee also requested that drawings be submitted before work on the stoop was begun.

Without submitting drawings or receiving approval, the contractor began to rebuild the steps out of concrete. At the meeting, the contractor asserted that he could recreate the look of the original brownstone steps using tinted concrete and chamfer strips.

The Committee stated that before any additional work is done on the steps, the Committee would like to visit the site to view a sample of this molded concrete for appropriateness of color and texture. The contractor agreed to prepare a sample for review by the Committee.

- 104-06 Arch Street, Victor Arencibia and Zion Bachshi, applicants. Ms. Siemiontkowski stated that this is a preliminary submission which involves the restoration of the buildings located at 104-06 Arch Street to their original 18th century appearance.

After a lengthy discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval in concept for this project. However, the Committee agreed that a site visit must be made before the plans for this project can be discussed further.

It was agreed that the staff and Committee members would meet on 2 November to inspect the building and make recommendations.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney  
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah