

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORIC
COMMISSION

26 September 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

- Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission.
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee of the American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter.
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Other staff members including Richard Tyler, Randall Baron, Sally Elk and Sara Reiter.
- Also: Gregory Solis of ELD Associates to present plans for the introduction of a concourse dining area for T.J. Applebee's in 30th Street Station.
Elliot Rothschild of THE ROTHSCCHILD COMPANY to present his submission for the renovation and reuse of the Wilbur Chocolate Factory.
Frank Mallas of FRIDAY Architects and Jay Scholl of Rouse and Associates to present plans for storefront and interior alterations to the Jacob Reed Store at 1424-1426 Chestnut Street.
John Lawson and Brett Crawford of Mitchell Giurgola Architects, and Reyhan Larimer and Lavon Bair of the University of Pennsylvania to present a proposal for the replacement of the roof of the University Museum and a repair of other roof features.
Joseph Hennessey of the Quoin Partnership and Steven Park and David O'Neil of the Reading Company to present plans for the rehabilitation of the Filbert Street facade of the Reading Terminal Market.
Brian Henning of Oldham and Seltz to present plans for the rehabilitation of the Curtis Building at 6th and Walnut Streets.
Paul Calvert, ARchitect, to present an elevation drawing for alterations to the rear of 328 Spruce Street.
Kathleen Stephenson, Irene Schrank and Charles Petersen regarding Mr. Calvert's proposal for alterations to 328 Spruce Street.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

30th Street Station Applebee's Restaurant, ELD Associates, Greg Solis, Architect. Mr. Solis presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the introduction of a concourse dining area for the T.J. Applebee's Restaurant in 30th Street Station. The dining area will be located within the west concourse. A new iron railing will separate the seating for T. J. Applebee's from the pedestrian traffic in the concourse.

Ms. Siemiontkowski advised the members of the Committee of Amtrak's approval of the proposed concourse seating provided that the 8'-0" width dimension into the concourse measures from the face of the storefront windows and not from the face of the projecting pilasters. Mr. Solis stated that although the plan was drawn correctly to scale to indicate the appropriate 8' width, an incorrect dimension was noted on the drawing. He agreed to rectify the error.

Following some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend a final approval of the proposed concourse dining plan.

Wilbur Chocolate Factory, 231-247 North 3rd Street, The Rothschild Company, Elliot Rothschild, Architect. The members of the Architectural Committee reviewed a full set of final working drawings for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Wilbur Chocolate Factory, a collection of several, relatively intact, 20th century commercial and industrial buildings. A preliminary approval, in concept, was granted by the Commission upon the recommendation of the Committee in July of this year.

The Committee examined carefully the final submission and found it to be acceptable. A final approval of this project is recommended.

Jacob Reed's Sons Building, 1424-1426 Chestnut Street, Frank Mallas of FRIDAY Architects and Jay Scholl of Rouse and Associates. Designed in 1903 by Philadelphia architect William L. Price, the Jacob Reed's Sons building stands as a fine example of commercial architecture influenced by the Arts and Crafts Movement so popular in the early 20th century.

Mr. Mallas presented to the members of the Committee his proposal for the introduction of two new entrance doors within the existing storefront to allow for separate access to the ground floor commercial space and the upper story offices. This division of retail and office space will include also the construction of an interior elevator lobby.

The Committee members examined the architect's plans, as presented, and raised some concern over the proximity of the revolving doors to the two new swinging doors. It was the opinion of the Committee that, functionally, such an arrangement might present a problem by creating congestion in the retail/office entrance area. The Committee suggested that perhaps the existing revolving doors could remain in place and not be moved forward as proposed. Mr. Mallas agreed to study the Committee's suggestion and to report his findings before the meeting of the Commission on 4 August.

The Committee voted to recommend an approval of the proposed alterations subject to the restudy of the placement of the revolving doors.

University Museum, 33rd and Spruce Streets, John Lawson and Brett Crawford of Mitchell/Giurgola Architects and Reyhan Larimer and Lavon Bair of the University of Pennsylvania. Designed and built in 1893-1899, the University Museum stands as the result of a cooperative effort between Wilson Eyre, Frank Miles Day and Cope & Stewardson.

Messrs. Lawson and Crawford presented to the Committee plans for the replacement of a major portion of the museum's roof, for the renewal of the drainage system and for the repair and/or reconstruction of the rotunda and skylights. The Committee examined the plans and inspected a sample pre-weathered Spanish tile which will replace the damaged and deteriorated original tiles.

The Committee complimented Mr. Crawford on the fine quality of the drawings and details and voted to recommend a final approval of this project.

WCAU Building, 1620-1622 Chestnut Street, Stephen Vorenhorst, Architect with Koppel, Sheward and Day. In the absence of Mr. Vorenhorst, the Committee undertook a review of plans for the restoration of the original spandrel ornament on the facade of the WCAU Building, a 1931 Art Deco structure designed by Harry Sternfeld, Architect.

The Committee members examined the drawings and photographs and agreed, in concept, to the restoration of the facade ornament. They questioned, however, the lack of ornament between the first and second floors. The proposal, submitted by Koppel, Sheward and Day, calls for the installation of the ornament within the upper three spandrels only. It was the opinion of the Committee that perhaps a fourth spandrel ornament originally appeared between the first and second floors as shown on an early, assumed to be touched up, photograph. A later 1935 photograph which shows only a portion of the building's facade provides no evidence of the lowest spandrel ornament. The Committee recommended that the architect search for additional photographs of the building. Mr. Levy offered several leads and, by telephone, suggested that Mr. Vorenhorst follow them.

Following considerable discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of this project with the recommendation that if evidence of the fourth spandrel ornament is uncovered that it be restored.

Reading Terminal Market, 12th and Filbert Streets, Quoin Partnership and John Milner Associates, Joseph Hennessey of the Quoin Partnership and Steve Park and David O'Neil of the Reading Company. Messrs. Hennessey, Park and O'Neil presented to the Committee plans for the restoration of the Filbert Street elevation of the Reading Terminal Market, located under the train shed designed by Wilson Brothers & Co. and built in 1891-1893.

The Committee examined the plans prepared by the Quoin Partnership with John Milner Associates as consultants. The restoration proposal, as submitted, follows the original design of the Filbert Street elevation and returns this portion of the structure to its former appearance.

A final approval of this project is recommended.

Curtis Building, 6th and Walnut Streets, Brian Henning, Architect with Oldham & Seltz. The members of the Committee reviewed the final plans for the rehabilitation of the Curtis Building, an 8 story 20th century office building by Edgar Seeler, Architect.

The Committee examined the architect's final submission and agreed to recommend a final approval of this major rehabilitation project.

Boy Scouts of America Building, 22nd and Winter Streets, Livingston/Rosenwinkle Architects. The Committee reviewed the architect's proposal calling for the construction of a ramp for the handicapped at the rear of the building along Winter Street and Van Pelt Street. Built in 1929 from the designs of C. Klauder, the Boy Scouts of America building stands as a fine example of the Renaissance Revival style.

The ramp, as designed, will sit upon an existing set of stairs at the rear of the structure, turn and then run parallel to the building facade. It will be constructed independent of the building facade and will not be anchored into the masonry in any manner.

The Committee found the proposed ramp construction to be a good design solution for an historic building. A final approval of this project is recommended.

Hatfield House, Fairmount Park, Giovanni Petri, Architect, Water Department and John McIlhenny, Historian, Fairmount Park Commission. The Committee examined photographs and reviewed the Water Department's proposal for the construction of new toilet facilities in the first floor rear room of the Hatfield House where there presently exists a sink and small closet. The Water Department intends to use the presently vacant building as a district office. The use of the building on a regular basis,

26 September 1984

it is hoped, will reduce vandalism and aid in the preservation of the building, a frame structure of Greek Revival design.

In addition to the construction of new toilet facilities by the Water Department, the Fairmount Park Commission intends to repaint the building in accordance with the findings of a paint analysis performed by Frank Welsh in 1976. A fence to surround the property is also proposed. Information on the design of the fence will be forwarded for review and comment as soon as it is available.

A final approval of this project is recommended.

University of Pennsylvania Quad, 37th and Spruce Streets, Davis, Brody and Associates. The Committee reviewed plans for security improvements to the University of Pennsylvania Quad built in 1895-1902 from the designs of Cope and Stewardson.

The Committee examined the drawings which included the introduction of a new security gate and window within the 37th and Spruce Street archway.

Following some discussion of the proposed undertaking, the Committee voted to recommend its approval.

Stenton Mansion, 18th and Courtland Streets, John Dickey, Architect. The Committee reviewed Mr. Dickey's plans for masonry repairs to Stenton Mansion, a significant Georgian house constructed for James Logan in 1728.

The Committee recommends an approval of Mr. Dickey's proposed masonry repairs to the existing building.

328 Spruce Street, Paul Calvert, Architect. Mr. Calvert presented to the members of the Committee plans for alterations to the rear (Cypress Street) elevation of 328 Spruce Street, an 1830's townhouse built by Stephen Girard.

The Committee examined the plans, prepared by Mr. Calvert, for alterations to the rear elevation of 328 Spruce Street and offered them for the perusal of Irene Shrank and Charles Peterson, neighbors, and Kathleen Stephenson, counsel for the owner of 326 Spruce Street. The proposed alterations included the replacement, in kind, of a third floor brick wall; the replacement, in kind, of a second floor wall of wood siding; and the construction of a sundeck.

Following some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of the proposed alterations with the recommendation

that the door leading to the sundeck contain small light sash instead of a single sheet of glass. The Committee further reiterated to Mr. Calvert and the others present that it would not review any design proposal for the replacement of the garden wall (with gates) until the parking issue has been resolved. The Committee did agree that if parking is not permitted by the Zoning Board or if the developer chooses not to pursue a zoning variance for parking, the brick wall must be replaced, in kind, as it stood prior to its recent demolition.

PLAQUES

311 Fitzwater Street. The Committee reviewed the owner's request for a Certified Restored plaque for 311 Fitzwater Street and voted to recommend its approval.

It was noted, however, that the restoration plans for the building indicated the replacement of the marble lintel over the entrance door. Since the adjoining building, constructed at the same time as 311, was restored without a marble lintel, the Committee was of the opinion that both building should retain an identical appearance and that, therefore, no marble lintel would be required at 311 Fitzwater Street.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian