

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

8 / October 1987

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect
Independence National Historic Park
David DeLong, University of Pennsylvania, Preservation
Program
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.

Frederick Bader, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law
Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I

Also: David Singer, Architect, to present a proposal for the
rehabilitation of an existing ground floor storefront at 12 S.
2nd Street.
Brian Henning of Oldham and Seltz, to present a proposal for the
enlarging of two existing masonry openings to install new wood
and glass doors with fixed divided-lite transoms at 601-645
Walnut Street.
Nathan Schwartzberg and Sandra Bell, owners. This submission
involves the review of non-conforming alterations undertaken
at 2006 Brandywine Street.
George Chou and Maryann Chou, owners, along with David A.
Schultz and Dan Reyes of SchultzEagan Associates, Inc., to
present a proposal for extensive renovations to 158 N. 3rd
Street.
James Kise of KKFS, to present a proposal for the construction
of a two-story addition to the existing Druim Moir carriage
house and the rehabilitation of the carriage house itself.
Louise Cruzvizcaino, owner, and Robert H. Rathsmill of Caruso
Security Gate Company. This submission involves the recent
illegal erection of a new rolling steel door at the rear of
230 Pine Street.
Duncan W. Buell, Sally Lou Buell, Joan Johnson, Faith W.
Lemmer and Alfred J. Spause residents of Stamper Street and
Pine Street to express opposition to the metal rolling steel
door at the rear of 230 Pine Street.

Richard J. Rowland, Bill Freas and Roger L. Carlton to present a proposal for the construction of an addition atop 126 Cuthbert and the rehabilitation of the subject premises. The Reverend Fr. Krupa of St. Augustine's Church, Kevin Boyle, Esq., and Francis Atkinson of Francis J. Atkinson & Sons to present a proposal for the removal of the church steeple to the brick masonry portion of the building. Mark B. Thompson and Francis Henkels of Mark B. Thompson, Architects, to present a proposal which involves the first phase of a major rehabilitation and reuse plan for the Church of the New Jerusalem located at 2129 Chestnut Street. Bert Creswell, William Becker and David O'Neil of the Reading Company with Steven Wiesenthal of Venturi, Rauch and Scott Brown Architects to present a proposal for the expansion of the Reading Terminal Market operation to the south side of Filbert Street. Roger Prichard, Old City Civic Association. Arthur Plaxton, President, Spring Garden Civic Association William J.D. Jordan, Center City Residents Association And others.

ALTERATIONS

13 S. 2nd Street, David Singer, Architect. Mr. Singer appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the rehabilitation of an existing ground floor storefront at 12 S. 2nd Street. Specifically, the proposed work involves:

1. the retention and cleaning of an existing storefront window and door;
2. the addition of a new slate storefront base;
3. the addition of a new aluminum storefront frame surrounding the existing window and door, and,
4. the stuccoing of the party wall and tuck pointing of the front wall where needed.

The Committee suggested that the cornice be examined. If water damage has occurred, the metal and wood trim should be repaired. The Committee agreed to recommend an approval of the plans as submitted.

601-645 Walnut Street, Curtis Center, Brian Henning of Oldham and Seltz. Mr. Henning appeared before the Committee to present a proposal calling for the enlargement of two existing masonry openings to accommodate new wood and glass doors with fixed divided lite transoms, at the fifth and eleventh bays of the 7th Street facade.

The Committee stated that the proposed doors were too short for such a grand facade. They suggested that the doors should be increased in height to agree in scale with the existing facade.

The Committee agreed that an approval from the National Park Service should be obtained before the Architectural Committee makes its recommendations. The Committee requested after Park Service approval is received, the revised proposal be resubmitted for review.

- 2006 Brandywine Street, Nathan Schwartzberg and Sandra Bell, owners. This submission involves the review of non-conforming alterations undertaken at 2006 Brandywine Street. A building permit application allowing the replacement of "windows to replicate existing, wooden, double-hung two-over-two sash" was approved by the Historical Commission staff on 21 July 1987. A recent inspection of the building showed the installation of new window sash and frames which do not replicate the original design. The new frames do not fit the brick masonry openings. The top and bottom window sash on the ground floor are unequal in size; all window sash contain one-over-one lights and not the original two-over-two configuration.

The owners stated that they did not know their property was historically designated until they applied for a building permit. After applying for the building permit, they were referred to the Historical Commission office where Mr. Tyler amended the building permit application before approving it. The owners claimed that they did not examine the building permit after Mr. Tyler amended it, and therefore, were unaware that they were in violation of the building permit.

Arthur Plaxton, president of the Spring Garden Civic Association, stated that he and his Association feel very strongly that the ordinance should be enforced and that the owners of 2006 Brandywine Street should be required to replace the existing windows with new windows that will duplicate the original window sash design as indicated on the building permit.

The Committee stated that the present windows are totally unacceptable. Before a final recommendation can be made, however, the staff Architect will visit the property, examine the existing window sash and frame to determine if any portion of fabric can be salvaged and reused.

The Committee deferred a recommendation on this project until this inspection can be made. The members assured the owners that they will work with them to find a solution to this problem. The Chairman informed the owners that they can appear before the Historical Commission and appeal whatever final recommendation is made by the Architectural Committee.

- 158 N. 3rd Street, George Chou and Maryann Chou, owners, along with David A. Schultz and Dan Reyes of SchultzEagan Associates, Inc. Ms. Siemiontkowski informed the Committee that this building is a commercial/industrial building which is being rehabilitated for residential use.

Mr. Schultz presented photographs and drawings to the Committee and explained the proposal which includes the following:

1. Installing a new curb cut and granite pavers;
2. Removing four deteriorated original wood and glass paneled doors at the first floor to install new wood and glass paneled sliding doors to match the original design;
3. Removing existing industrial windows on the second through fourth floors to install new wood casement windows;
4. Installing new recessed wooden panels between the second and third and, third and fourth floors;
5. Constructing a new roof deck with boxed planters on the roof;
6. Repairing, scraping and painting existing cornice and other wood trim;
7. Pointing and cleaning deteriorated masonry, and;
8. Interior alterations throughout the subject premises.

Ms. Siemiontkowski informed the Committee that this building stands within the boundaries of the Old City National Register Historic District. This district's significance rests on its mid-nineteenth and early-twentieth century commercial and industrial character. The subject building exists as a very good example of its architectural style and contributes to the historic character of the district. Ms. Siemiontkowski also reminded the Committee the Commission's ordinance refers to The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings for use in evaluating rehabilitation proposals.

The Committee recommended the following changes to the proposal:

1. the boxed planters on the roof deck should be set back on the roof so that they are not visible from the street;
2. new windows to duplicate the small-lite industrial sash should be installed; and,
3. the brick directly below windows should not be removed or covered with wood panels.

The Committee agreed to allow the replacement of the existing garage doors as proposed. The architect was directed to revise the drawings as recommended by the Committee and to resubmit for another review.

Druim Moir Carriage House, James Kise of KKFS. Mr. Kise appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the rehabilitation of the carriage house and the construction of a two-story addition. Specifically, the proposed work includes:

1. Replacement of existing carriage house roof shingles with new shingles to match those used for all new construction on the property;
2. restuccoing of the existing carriage house chimney;
3. repair of all existing windows, doors and trim;

4. restuccoing of an existing stuccoed facade on the south elevation;
5. reconstruct original wood sliding garage doors;
6. repair existing wood trim, eave, pent eave and casement windows; and,
7. construction of a new addition which connects with the carriage house through means of a second floor bridge on the north elevation. The design of the proposed new addition is in keeping with that of the new construction previously reviewed and approved by this office for the Druim Moir development.

The Committee unanimously agreed to recommend an approval of this proposal for the Druim Moir carriage house as presented.

230 Pine Street, a.k.a. 227 Stamper Street, Louise Cruzvizcaino, owner, and Robert H. Rathsmill, Caruso Security Gate Company. This submission involves the recent erection of a new rolling steel door at the rear of 230 Pine Street. This work was done without the benefit of a building permit or the Historical Commission's review. The new steel door fronts on Stamper Street and faces a row of historically designated houses on the south side of Stamper Street.

Residents from Stamper Street and Pine Street appeared before the Committee to voice their concern over the illegally installed, inappropriate steel door on Stamper Street.

The door was determined by the Committee to be totally inappropriate. It was agreed that it should be removed. The Committee recommended that the applicant present a gate design to the Committee that is in keeping with the historic character of the neighborhood. The Chairman explained to the applicants, that the Committee is advisory to the Commission and the Committee's recommendation can be appealed if the applicants wish to appear before the Commission at its 28 October 1987 meeting.

126 Cuthbert, Richard J. Rowland, Bill Freas and Roger L. Carlton of Richard J. Rowland Architects. Mr. Rowland described to the Committee his proposal for the rehabilitation of the building located at 126 Cuthbert Street. Specifically the proposed work consists of the following:

1. pointing, cleaning and restoring deteriorated masonry;
2. installing new six-over-six wooden double-hung windows;
3. installing a new wooden paneled entrance door;
4. installing new wood and glass sliding doors with iron grates; and,
5. constructing an addition on the roof of the subject premises.

The Committee suggested that the iron railings within the center bay on the upper floors be kept within the space of the masonry opening. The Committee also asked for a revision to the basement window opening. A brick or stucco reveal should be maintained within the arch and a rectangular window installed. The Committee recommended an approval of this project pending the receipt and review of revised drawings which incorporate into them the above revisions.

12th & Filbert Streets, Reading Terminal Market, Bert Creswell, William Becker and David O'Neil of the Reading Company along with Steven Weisenthal of Venturi, Rauch and Scott Brown Architects. This proposal calls for the extension of the Reading Terminal Market operation into a portion of the area on the south side of Filbert Street. New storefronts and loading bays will occur on the 12th Street and Filbert Street elevations. The design of the new storefronts will match the design of those on the north side of Filbert Street - a storefront treatment previously approved by the Historical Commission. Also included in this proposal is the addition of a neon sign hung under the train shed over Filbert Street. Drawings and photographs were presented to the Committee.

The Committee recommended an approval of this project as presented. David Hollenberg abstained from voting.

4th & New Streets, St. Augustine's Church, The Reverend Fr. Krupa of St. Augustine's Church, Kevin Boyle, Esq., and Francis Atkinson, of Francis Atkinson & Sons. This proposal calls for the removal of the Church steeple down to the brick masonry portion of the building. Recently much of the fabric covering the wooden beams of the steeple was removed leaving the structure open to the weather.

Kevin Boyle, attorney for St. Augustine's Church, provided the Committee with copies of work estimates that have been received from James J. Clearkin, Building Contractor, and from Francis J. Atkinson & Sons, steeple-jack, along with a letter from Paul W. Setz & Associates, Architects, and a letter from Institutional Insurance Services, Inc. Copies of these letters are attached to the official copy of this report. Mr. Boyle emphasized the Church's concern for the liability problem that this open structure presents.

Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that a structural engineer from the Department of Licenses and Inspections inspected the steeple two days prior to this meeting. Although no written report has been received, the engineer expressed to the staff his opinion that the structure at present is structurally sound. However, he cautioned that if the structure remains open to the weather, deterioration of the steeple will accelerate.

The staff of the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation has offered to provide funding for architectural and engineering studies aimed at the preservation and restoration of this steeple. In addition, PHPC has agreed to assist in the development of a fund-raising program for the Church.

The Committee requested that the Church hire an independent structural engineer to evaluate the steeple and that a copy of this report be sent to the Committee for review. The Committee also suggested that the structural engineer from the Department of Licenses and Inspections be asked to provide a written report on his evaluation of the steeple. The Committee agreed to defer making a recommendation until the above information is received for the Committee's evaluation.

- 2129 Chestnut Street, Church of the New Jerusalem, Mark B. Thompson and Francis Henkels of Mark B. Thompson Associates. Messrs. Thompson and Henkels appeared before the Committee to present a proposal for the first phase of a major rehabilitation and adaptive reuse plan for the Church of the New Jerusalem. Plans call for the conversion of the Church sanctuary and its adjacent parish house into an office complex.

The applicants expressed their desire to seek approval for an interior demolition permit along with an approval, in concept, of the total project. The applicants stated that the exterior of the Church will be maintained intact and restored.

The Committee agreed that a site-visit would be necessary to make a recommendation on this project. A site visit was scheduled for Wednesday, October 21, at 2:00 p.m.. David Hollenberg will abstain from voting.

Subsequent to the meeting of the Architectural Committee meeting, several members met on site with the architect to review the proposed interior demolition plans and to discuss the total project. Following a tour of the building, the Committee agreed to recommend an approval of the proposed interior demolition and an approval, in concept, of the plans for conversion to office use. Of course, a full set of working drawings will be required for review before a final approval is granted. The Committee did express special concern over the proposed removal of several stained glass windows. At this time, all stained glass must remain in place until a plan has been developed by the architect for its treatment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Stenographer I

/mah