

**THE MINUTES OF THE 470th MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

12 October 2001

**Duane Bumb, Acting Chair
Commission Conference Room, 1515 Arch Street, 18th floor**

Present

Duane Bumb, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Commerce, Acting Chair
David Fitz, Office of City Council President
Gary Hack, Chair, City Planning Commission
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Public Property
Thomas Kilkenny
David Perri, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and Inspections
Michael Sklaroff, Esquire
Denise Smyler, Esquire
Thomas Sugrue, Ph.D.
Norman Tissian
Scott Wilds, Deputy Director, Office of Housing and Community Development

Julianne L. Brennan, Historic Preservation Planner
Laura M. Spina, Historic Preservation Planner
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Mark Zecca, Senior Attorney, Law Department

Also

Curtis Caldwell, First Tabernacle
John Thrower, Bower Lewis Thrower Architects
Rosemarie Brandt
Ira Kauderer, Ballard Spahr Andrews and Ingersoll, LLP
Charles Datner
John Carr, Fairmount Park Historic Preservation Trust
Jim Dunlap, Hopkinson House
Michael Schaffer
Jeff Cardwell, Department of Recreation
Lenore Millhollen, Preservation Alliance
Deena Parham, City Planning Commission
Carl Primavera, Esquire
Van Potteiger
Eric Shanowski
Brian Estelle, Home Depot
John Bernard, Manayunk Club
Susan Milner, Jefferson Hospital
Jessica Senker, Public Art Office
James Pearl, Law Department
Robert Graves, Bower Lewis Thrower Architects
M. Hunt, Kaiserman Company, Inc.
Anthony De Simone, Manayunk Club
Larry Copeland, Law Department

Duane Bumb called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to designate Duane Bumb the chair for the meeting. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Minutes of the 469th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission *Mr. Tissian made a motion to adopt the minutes of the 469th Stated Meeting held on 12 September 2001. Mr. James seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.*

Minutes of the Special Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission *Mr. Tissian made a motion to adopt the minutes of the Special Meeting held on 26 September 2001. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.*

The Report of the Architectural Committee, 25 September 2001, Julianne Brennan and Richard Tyler, Staff

119 North 20th Street

Michael Schaffer, Owner

Robert Boothroyd, Applicant

Date: c. 1860

Proposal: Panning of windows and door, new vinyl window

Architectural Committee recommendation: Denial of the aluminum/p.v.c. panning; denial of the vinyl window based on Standards 6 and 9.

Ms. Brennan presented the proposal for a single vinyl window on the rear of the property and aluminum/p.v.c. panning on all of the window and door frames. Brian Estelle of Home Depot stated that the application for panning is for only the windows on the rear of the property, not the front windows. Michael Schaffer, owner of the property, stated that the frames on the windows are failing and water penetrates the interior. Also, a tenant broke the window that needs replacement.

Mr. Wilds stated that the panning covers the frame's historic profile, obscuring important details. Mr. Hack questioned the visibility of the rear of the property. Ms. Brennan stated that the property proves highly visible from a parking lot. Mr. Sklaroff noted that the rear of the property may be visible from other buildings as well. The Commission discussed the visibility of the rear.

Lenore Millhollen of the Preservation Alliance stated that lack of maintenance caused the current situation. A good coat of paint and routine maintenance can solve the problem. Mr. James noted that simply covering the damaged window frames may only hide the problem of failing window units. He suggested that all of the windows be inspected and perhaps changed completely.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the vinyl window on the rear of the property and to deny the panning on all of the windows. Mr. James seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Mr. Hack made a motion to have the staff report on the condition of all windows on the rear of the property as well as their visibility from a public right-of-way and other buildings. Mr. James seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

231 South 24th Street

Stella and Nikolaus Mitoulis, Owners/Applicants

Date: c. 1840

Proposal: Storefront alterations

Architectural Committee recommendation: Denial of the submission based on Standards 2 and 9.

Mr. Tyler stated that the attorney for the owner requests a continuance until the next Commission meeting.

Mr. Sugrue made a motion to continue the application until the November meeting of the Historical Commission. Mr. Rivera seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

216-20 West Washington Square, W.B. Saunders Building

West Washington Square Partnership, Owner

Christian Busch, Architect/Applicant

Date: 1911

Proposal: HVAC units

Architectural Committee recommendation: Tabling the proposal until next month. They asked that a mock-up be erected and for Mr. Busch to investigate the rooftop option.

Mr. Tyler described the proposal for HVAC units on the building, explaining the Architectural Committee's request for a mock-up and further investigation of other possible locations for the units.

Mr. James made a motion to table the Commission's vote for a period of one month. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

604-36 South Washington Square, Hopkinson House

Hopkinson House, Owner

Liz Ricciardi, Applicant

Date: 1962 - Oscar Stonorov, Architect

Proposal: Illuminated signage

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval of the signs, based on Standard 9, on the condition that their attachment does not include bolts through the canopy, with staff to review details.

Ms. Brennan described the proposal for new signage on the canopy of the Hopkinson House. The Committee stated that the sign cannot be attached by using bolts through the canopy. Mr. Rivera emphasized the canopy's sculptural nature.

Mr. Sugrue made a motion to approve the signage on the condition that the attachment not include bolting through the canopy, with staff to review details. Mr. Wilds seconded them motion, which passed unanimously.

1107 Spruce Street

John Dahl and Eric Shanoski, Owners/Applicants

Date: 1889 - Brown and Day, Architects

Proposal: Expanded rear dormer and new roof deck

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval of the application based on Standards 9 and 10, with staff to review details.

Ms. Brennan described the proposal for an expanded rear dormer and a roof deck on the rear ell.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the application, with staff to review details. Mr. Sugrue seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Mr. Sklaroff stated that he believed that the visibility of an area of work from other buildings is just as important as visibility from public streets. Mr. Wilds countered that the public interest from a street is different from the public interest of neighboring buildings. Mr. Sklaroff asked the staff to investigate the issue.

563 North 20th Street

Rosemarie Brandt, Owner/Applicant

Date: c. 1873

Proposal: Legalize vinyl windows

Architectural Committee recommendation: Denial of the proposal based on Standard 6 and suggested that the Financial Hardship Committee review the proposal.

Ms. Brennan explained that the owner of the building installed vinyl windows without a permit or Commission approval after the initial notice letters for the historic district were mailed. The owner now wishes to have the windows legalized. She stated that the Spring Garden Civic Association opposed the legalization of the windows.

Mr. Wilds noted that only the owner can initiate an application to the Financial Hardship Committee.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to deny the legalization of the vinyl windows. Mr. James seconded the motion, which passed with 10 votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

Mr. Zecca stated that the issue of enforcement should be one that the Commission discusses at a future meeting.

Ridgeland Mansion Barn

City of Philadelphia/Fairmount Park, Owner

John Carr, Applicant

Date: mid-19th century

Proposal: Canvas awning

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval per Standards 9 and 10, with staff to review attachment details.

Mr. Tyler described the proposal for an awning on the barn of Ridgeland Mansion.

Mr. James made a motion to approve the awning, with staff to review attachment details. Mr. Kilkenny seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1926 Park Mall

Temple University, Owner

Robert F. Tiffany, Sr., Applicant

Date: 1884

Proposal: Exhaust vents

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval per Standard 9.

Mr. Tyler explained the proposal for a kitchen exhaust vent on the side of the building.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to approve the application. Mr. James seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

1600 Arch Street

SAS-1600 Arch Street, Owner

Robert Graves, Architect/Applicant

Date: 1925 - Stewardson and Page, Architects

Proposal: Revised planters and signage

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval based on Standards 9 and 10.

Mr. Tyler described the changes to the planters and signage for the building. These changes were requested by the State's Bureau for Historic Preservation in its review of the tax credit application.

Mr. Tissian made a motion to approve the application. Mr. Sugrue seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Old Business

1723-29 Walnut Street

AIG Baker Enterprises, Owner

Van Potteiger, Architect

Date: c. 1961

Proposal: Three-story addition

Architectural Committee recommendation: Approval of addition with use of limestone to match existing structure, with staff to review details.

Mr. Sklaroff recused himself from the discussion and vote.

Mr. Tyler introduced the proposal for three floors built on a two-story non-contributing building in the Rittenhouse-Fitler Historic District. Carl Primavera, attorney for the applicant, stated that Van Potteiger, the architect for the project, has altered the original proposal in response to the concerns of the owner of the neighboring building at 135 South 18th Street. He said that AIG Baker Enterprises purchased the property with the idea of adding more rental space and the purchase price reflected that investment.

Mr. Potteiger proceeded to explain the changes to the proposal. All of the proposed floors have been dropped one foot, lowering the overall size of the building. Since 135 South 18th Street has apartments with windows facing the subject property, the proposal includes an 18-foot setback from the western property line on the fifth floor. An open pavilion at the front façade on the fifth floor will retain the symmetry of the façade. A small, recessed sixth floor penthouse will house the HVAC systems.

Ira Kauderer, attorney for Wayne Spilove, owner of 135 South 18th Street, stated that his client has concerns about the proposal, as well as the changes. He introduced Jack Thrower of Bower Lewis Thrower Architects to illustrate Mr. Spilove's concerns. Mr. Thrower stated that without a minimum setback of 25 feet on all three floors of the addition, the new construction will eliminate the light and air required for habitation of the units on the east side of the building. He stated that the building code for new construction requires this amount of set-back. Mr. James noted that 135 South 18th Street already exists and, therefore, is exempt from the building code for new construction.

Mr. Primavera stated that a setback of 25 feet on all three floors would make the project infeasible financially. He asked the Commission to postpone its vote for a period of one month while Mr. Potteiger and Mr. Spilove discuss the proposed changes.

Mr. Tissian made a motion to table the application for a period of one month. Mr. Sugrue seconded the motion, which passed with 10 votes.

The Report of the Committee on Historic Designation, 14 September 2001, Julianne Brennan and Laura Spina, Staff

120 South 10th Street, Jefferson's Old Main Hospital

Date: 1903-07

Architect: James and John Windrim

Owner: Jefferson Hospital

Ms. Spina gave a brief presentation on the history and architecture of Jefferson's Old Main Hospital. Mr. Zecca stated that the Committee on Historic Designation looks at the technical aspects of a nomination, while the Commission reviews the broader effects of designation. Susan Milner of Jefferson Hospital stated that with designation, work on the hospital may cost more, but they do not oppose the hospital's designation.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to designate 120 south 10th Street to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Tissian seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

Dickens and Little Nell Statue, Clark Park

Date: 1890-01; installed at current location: 1901

Sculptor: Frank Edwin Elwell

Owner: City of Philadelphia, Department of Recreation

Ms. Brennan described the statue of *Dickens and Little Nell*. Mr. Sklaroff asked if there is a survey of statues in the City. Ms. Spina stated that the staff and Committee on Historic Designation asked the Fairmount Park Art Association to survey and create a list of public statues for a thematic district.

Mr. Tissian made a motion to place Dickens and Little Nell on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion, which passed by a unanimous vote.

Wissahickon Memorial Bridge, 4200 block of Henry Avenue

Date: 1927-32

Architect: Paul Philippe Cret; Engineer: Ralph Modjeski

Owner: Pennsylvania Department of Transportation

Ms. Brennan presented the history and engineering importance of the Wissahickon Memorial Bridge. Mr. Sugrue stated that it is an extraordinary structure that clearly deserves designation. Mr. Hack noted that the bridge demonstrates Cret's departure from the Beaux Arts style and his movement toward the modern style, then becoming popular in Europe.

Mr. Sugrue made a motion to designate the Wissahickon Memorial Bridge to the Philadelphia Register. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which passed by unanimous vote.

602 South Broad Street, Episcopal Church of the Ascension

Date: 1886

Architect: Charles M. Burns

Owner: First Tabernacle Beth El Church of God and Saints of Christ

Ms. Brennan described the church originally known as the Episcopal Church of the Ascension. Rabbi Caldwell, leader of the congregation, stated that the church fully supports its designation and they hired the consultant to write the nomination.

Mr. Sugrue made a motion to place 602 South Broad Street on the Philadelphia Register. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

235-49 Gay Street, Fairview Cottage a.k.a. Manayunk Club

Date: 1857-61

Architect: unknown

Owner: Manayunk Club

Ms. Spina explained the request to rescind the designation of 235-49 Gay Street. Designated in November 1999, the Manayunk Club suffered a severe fire in March 2001. After the Department of Licenses and Inspections declared the property imminently dangerous, the club demolished the building. Staff subsequently legalized the demolition. She noted that the Committee was split on the issue of rescission.

Mr. Tyler argued for the property's de-designation, stating that the building, and therefore the historical significance, no longer exists. Mr. Sugrue argued that the original nomination noted both the building and the site as bases for designation and the fire did not destroy the site. He stated that the physical aspects of the out-cropping embodied the social structure of the mill community itself; the view of the site over the mills and river below symbolized the mill owner managing his workers. Mr. Hack countered that if the site possesses significance, then the entire promontory should be designated; this is simply a part of it. He also stated that control of

development lies with the Zoning Code. Commission members further discussed the significance of the site.

Anthony De Simone, president of the Manayunk Club, stated that the club has no immediate plans for the half-acre site, but it is for sale.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to retain the designation of the site, subject to further research by the staff in a period of six months. Mr. Rivera seconded the motion, which failed to pass with three yeas and five nays. Ms. Smyler abstained because she thought the six-month period was too long.

Mr. Hack made a motion to rescind the designation of 235-49 Gay Street. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion, which passed with five votes. Mr. Sklaroff, Mr. Rivera, Ms. Smyler and Mr. Sugrue dissented.

Report of the Historical Commission Staff, September 2001, Richard Tyler.

Mr. Bumb welcomed Denise Smyler to the Commission.

Mr. Sklaroff praised the restoration of the Fairmount Waterworks and asked if the Commission could have a tour of the site.

Mr. Wilds noted that the awning at the rear of the garden of 925 Chestnut still stands, even though the applicant at the previous meeting promised its removal. He asked staff to investigate.

Mr. Zecca announced that the Historical Commission won a decisive victory in the Court of Common Pleas regarding 421 Vine Street.

The meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m.