

THE MINUTES OF THE 301st STATED MEETING
OF THE

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

30 April 1986

Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman

Present: Edward A. Montgomery, Jr., Chairman
Christine Washington, Vice Chairman
Joan Ferreira
Grace Gary
Caroline Golab
David Hollenberg
Jason Nathan
William Thompson
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission
Dudley Sykes, Commissioner, Department of Public Property
David Wismer, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and
Inspections
Mark MacQueen, Esq., Assistant City Solicitor, Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Terri Koob, Clerk Steno II

Also: Sandy Garz, City Planning Commission
Marlyn Wright, Office of Housing
Mary Lou McFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition
of Greater Philadelphia
Alan Kauffman, Esq., Attorney representing owner of 19 Christian
Street
Jennifer Smith and Jean DiGrazio of the Queen Village Neighborhood
Association, Inc., for 19 Christian Street
Richard Knight, member of the Board of Trustees of the Alumni
Association of Roman Catholic High School
Carolyn March and The Reverend Paul Brown for 1705-1713 N. 7th
Street
David Beshler and Richard Vernick for the John Stafford Mansion
and Carriage House, 2000 N. Broad Street
Mervyn Tuckman, Vice President of Spring Garden College, 7500
Germantown Avenue
And others

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein are the results of motions
correctly made, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the 300th Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 26 March 1986, F. Otto Haas, Chairman, were reviewed and unanimously approved.

THE REPORT of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 10 April 1986, David Hollenberg, Chairman. Mr. Hollenberg reported that the staff received the revised drawings requested for 215 Church Street and a final approval is now recommended. Mr. Hollenberg further reported that the revisions requested for 239 Race Street have not been received and that the project is still pending. Special attention was brought by Mr. Hollenberg to the Committee's recommendation for 2123 Green Street. According to Mr. Hollenberg, the members of the Committee believe firmly that the owner of 2123 Green Street did not attempt to deceive the Commission. Through an unfortunate circumstance of events, the skylight was constructed without prior approval of the Historical Commission. The Committee suggested that a modest approach to mitigation be undertaken initially rather than an extensive reconstruction solution. Mr. Hollenberg stated that members of the Committee will inspect the skylight after the corrective measures are completed.

The Commission unanimously approved the Report of the Architectural Committee Meeting held on 10 April 1986 including the approval for 215 Church Street.

Old Business

19 Christian Street. In July of 1985 the Philadelphia Historical Commission received from the owners of 19 Christian Street, Swanson Enterprises, Inc., a request for permission to demolish 19 Christian Street and an affidavit containing economic data relating to the building. Reeves Lukens, an independent consultant, volunteered to undertake an evaluation of the data and forward his findings to the Historical Commission.

Mr. Tyler reported to the Commission members that the staff received the results of this review which indicate no feasible economic reuse of 19 Christian Street. Mr. Hollenberg, Chairman of the Architectural Committee, concurred in this opinion.

Mary Lou McFarland, Executive Director of the Preservation Coalition of Greater Philadelphia, addressed the Commission and urged the denial of the demolition request for 19 Christian Street. Ms. McFarland cited specific provisions of the historic preservation ordinance which the owner failed to follow, namely: Section 7 (f), (.4), (.5), (.6) and (.7).

Jean DiGrazio and Jennifer Smith of the Queen Village Neighborhood Association, Inc. appeared before the Commission in support of the preservation of 19 Christian Street. Ms. DiGrazio stated that 19 Christian Street is the only remaining historic house in that section

of the Queen Village neighborhood that was not demolished for the construction of I-95. Ms. Smith distributed photographs of similar structures in the area which have been successfully rehabilitated to illustrate a possible reuse of 19 Christian Street. Letters from two local contractors stated that rehabilitation costs in Queen Village commonly ranged from \$40 to \$50 per square foot. Two letters from local government officials were also presented supporting the preservation of this structure.

Mr. Alan Kauffman, attorney representing the owner of 19 Christian Street, addressed the Commission to request approval of the demolition owing to the results of the economic feasibility review. Mr. Kauffman stated that although there are no immediate reuse plans for this site, the owner does not wish to maintain a public nuisance. Mr. Kauffman apologized for the owner's failure to supply the financial data required for a complete evaluation. This information ultimately was secured through the efforts of the Historical Commission staff. Mr. Kauffman offered to reimburse the Commission for costs expended in securing the review of the economic data. Mr. Tyler declined to accept this offer.

The Commission voted unanimously to approve the demolition request for 19 Christian Street owing to the lack of an economically feasible reuse. However, the Commission emphasized that the owner's lack of cooperation by not supplying information as stipulated in the ordinance was inappropriate and shall not be construed as a precedent for future cases.

THE MINUTES of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation held 14 March 1986, Grace Gary, Chairman.

Owing to several people in attendance concerned with the proposed historic designation of Roman Catholic High School, Mr. Tyler stated that this issue has been postponed until the 28 May 1986 Stated Meeting at the request of the Archdiocese of Philadelphia. Richard Knight, a member of the Board of Trustees of the Alumni Association of Roman Catholic High School, requested permission to address the Commission. Mr. Knight stated that it is the intention of the Cahill Estate, owners of Roman Catholic High School, to pursue the historic designation. He expressed his concern that the Archdiocese could have this designation hearing postponed without the concurrence of the Cahill Estate. Ms. Gary requested that the nomination form reflect a clarification on ownership. Mr. Montgomery acknowledged the position of the Board of Trustees of the Cahill Estate and assured Mr. Knight that the Trustees will be notified of any developments in the Roman Catholic High School issue.

Ms. Gary presented the Report of the Committee on Historic Designation held on 14 March 1986 and Mr. Baron gave a slide presentation on the buildings to be considered for designation.

The Commission unanimously approved for historic designation, each of the following buildings:

Adath Jeshurun Synagogue, 1705 N. 7th Street
Burk Brothers Leather Factory, 913-957 N. 3rd Street
Doctor Scholls Foot Comfort Shoes, 1106 Chestnut Street
Deborah Gay Mansion, 2002 N. Broad Street
Horn and Hardart Automat, 818-820 Chestnut Street
Regent Rennoc Court, 5100 block of Regent Street and
1311-1327 S. 52nd Street
John Stafford Mansion and Carriage House, 2000 N. Broad Street

The Commission agreed with the recommendation made by the Committee and voted not to designate the Aldine Theater at 1826 Chestnut Street.

The Commission voted to accept the Minutes of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation held 14 March 1986 with the exclusion of the following buildings which were postponed for future consideration:

Boyd Theater, 1908-1910 Chestnut Street
Jewish Foster Home and Orphanage - Buildings and Grounds,
700 E. Church Lane
Our Lady of Mercy Roman Catholic Church, 2135-2159 N. Broad
Street
Roman Catholic High School, 301-311 N. Broad Street

Old Business

The Report of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation held 2 August 1985, Grace Gary, Chairman. Ms. Gary presented two items remaining from the Report of the Meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation held 2 August 1985: The Pennsylvania School for the Deaf and Dumb at 7500 Germantown Avenue and the William B. Stevens Memorial Library at 146-148 Krams Avenue - including grounds.

Mervyn Tuckman, Vice President of Spring Garden College, 7500 Germantown Avenue, addressed the Commission and stated that he would like to go on record that the Commission understands that future needs of the college will require that new buildings be erected on the campus. In addition Mr. Tuckman requested that the Commission "...exercise its options pursuant to Section 14-2007, APP. NO. 566-7, Section (e) which allows you to recommend to the Mayor and City Council that they grant a sum sufficient to allow the exterior painting of three major buildings on our site."

The Commission voted to approve for historic designation, each of the following:

The Pennsylvania School for the Deaf and Dumb, 7500 Germantown
Avenue
The William B. Stevens Memorial Library at 146-148 Krams Avenue -
including grounds

THE MINUTES of the Meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on Rules of Procedure held on 4 April 1986, David Wismer, Chairman. In the absence of David Wismer, Mr. Tyler presented the Minutes of the Meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee on Rules of Procedure held on 4 April 1986. Mr. Tyler requested that the Commission vote on the adoption of the Rules of Procedure drafted by this Committee.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Rules of Procedure for use by the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

THE REPORT on the Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff Activities for 15 March - 15 April 1986, Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer, was reviewed and approved for filing.

NEW BUSINESS

Bill #871 - Victory Building

Mr. Tyler reported that Bill #871 is before City Council. It would allow the owner of the Victory Building, located on the northwest corner of 10th and Chestnut Streets, to encroach on the sidewalk. Mr. Tyler stated that various City agencies are opposed to this bill and requested authorization from the Commission to join in that opposition. The Commission agreed that the Historical Commission should forward a letter to City Council opposing Bill #871 in that it is contrary to the provisions set forth in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines which are specifically cited in the historic preservation ordinance passed by City Council last year.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:49 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Terri Koob
Clerk Steno II