

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

20 February 1985

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

- Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Henry J. Magaziner, F.A.I.A., Historical Architect, National Park Service
Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Sally Elk, City Planner I
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
- Also: Bill Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
MaryLou MacFarland, Executive Director, Preservation Coalition
Gray Smith and Judy Moroz, Architects, to present plans for renovations to 232 South 3rd Street and 2019 Brandywine Street.
Harlan Crider and Kenneth Bergfeld, Architects, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of 306 New Street.
Larry Gilbert, Architect, Ronald Lavin, Owner, and Robert Shusterman, Attorney to present plans for renovations to the front facade of 333 South Street.
William Reinl, Applicant, to request an approval of illegal work performed on the facade of 1022 Race Street.
David Brauer, Architect with The Rothschild Company, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of 130 Arch Street and 61-67 North 2nd Street.
Russ Milnor, Architect with the Redevelopment Authority, to request a review of rehabilitation specifications for 1024 Spruce Street.
Paul Hirshorn, Architect, to present plans for the construction of a deck at the rear of 1812 Delancey Street.
Larry Goldfarb and Richard Craig, Architects, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of buildings at 128-130-132 and 134 Market Street and 8 N. 2nd Street.
Martin J. Rosenblum, Architect, to present plans for the restoration of 423 Vine Street.
Michael Roberto, Owner, and Mark Fox, Architect, to present plans for the reconstruction of the front wall of 615 S. Hancock Street.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

- 232 South 3rd Street, Gray Smith, Architect and Judy Moroz, Architect.
Mr. Smith and Ms. Moroz presented to the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation of 232 South 3rd Street, a four-and-a-

half story Greek Revival townhouse built c. 1840. The plans, as submitted, call for the conversion of this building into law offices and include the construction of an elevator tower on the rear of the structure along with other various exterior alterations.

The Committee examined the drawings submitted by Mr. Smith and voted to recommend their approval subject to several changes. On the front elevation, the Committee asked that the architect correct the meeting rail of the shutters at the fourth floor level. The shutter rail should fall below the center rail of the window sash. On the gable wall, the Committee members agreed to recommend an approval of the new casement window sash as designed but asked that the new windows be aligned evenly and not placed in a random fashion on this elevation.

Since this will be a Tax Act project which requires the review of the Bureau for Historic Preservation and the National Park Service, any changes to the exterior demanded by the state and federal preservation offices must be referred back to this office for further review and final approval.

2019 Brandywine Street, Gray Smith and Judy Moroz, Architects. Mr. Smith and Ms. Moroz submitted for the Committee's consideration plans for the rehabilitation of 2018 Brandywine Street, a three story brick house built c. 1865.

The Committee examined the elevation drawing prepared by the architects and voted to recommend its approval subject to the removal of both the exterior light fixture and the unused electrical conduit. The Committee also noted that although the basement windows are not included in the contract, the owner should consider the repair and repainting of the existing screens.

Subject to the minor revisions outlined above, the Committee recommends the approval of this submission.

306 New Street, Harlan Crider and Ken Bergfeld, Architects. Messrs. Crider and Bergfeld presented for the Committee's review plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Tilge Building, a four story, late nineteenth century, brick loft building in Old City.

The Committee examined the architects' plans for this non-certified building and found them to be acceptable. Mr. Crider presented his plans for a courtesy review since this building has not as yet been certified by this office.

333 South Street, Larry Gilbert, Architect, Ronald Lavin, Owner and Robert Shusterman, Attorney. Messrs. Gilbert, Lavin and Shusterman presented to the Architectural Committee for consideration plans for renovations to the facade of 333 South Street, a three-and-a-half story building, c. 1800, altered at the turn-of-the-century

for commercial use.

This submission calls for the removal and replacement of a twentieth century ground floor shopfront with a fully glazed, modern storefront flush with the building line and for the destruction of the original masonry fabric at the second floor level and the installation of a large, four-part window.

The applicants expressed a desire to obtain additional merchandizing space on the interior by removing the recessed storefront and replacing it with a flush storefront. The recessed historic shopfront extends 12 feet into the building at the ground floor level. Mr. Shusterman pointed to examples of inappropriate renovations which exist along South Street where this type of treatment was permitted. The Committee noted that in many cases the buildings were not certified and no controls over renovations existed. The Committee members stressed the significance of those many twentieth century shopfronts which have survived intact and which give South Street its unique quality and human scale. Indeed, many owners have recognized the architectural integrity of these designs and have capitalized on them whether or not the buildings happened to be historically certified.

Following considerable discussion, the Committee agreed to recommend that the Historical Commission require the retention and preservation of the existing storefront with some minor changes. These modifications may include the removal of the interior window shelf to gain additional floor area and the shortening of the recess from 12 feet to approximately six feet. Instead of restoring the missing storefront cornice, an appropriate sign or canvas awning would be permitted. The Committee also recommends that the Commission insist upon the retention and preservation of the existing, original masonry fabric and openings at the second floor level.

The architect was asked to restudy his design based on the Committee's recommendations. Mr. Shusterman asked to be scheduled on the agenda for the Historical Commission's 7 March Stated Meeting should his client choose to appeal to the Commission concerning the Committee's recommendations.

1022 Race Street, William Reinl, Applicant. Mr. Reinl appeared before the Architectural Committee to request an approval of work undertaken on the facade of 1022 Race Street without benefit of a building permit and the Historical Commission's approval.

Mr. Reinl explained to the Committee members that both he and the owner were unaware of the building's certification. The work, as performed, consisted of covering over existing transom lights and shop windows with vinyl siding. The original fabric remains intact under the siding.

Since no original fabric was destroyed as a result of the vinyl siding installation, the Committee agreed to recommend the approval of the completed work. The Committee further recommended that the Commission, in its letter to the owner, encourage the rehabilitation of this fine nineteenth century commercial building.

130 Arch Street and 61-67 North 2nd Street, Chancery Place, The Rothschild Company, David Brauer, Architect. Mr. Brauer presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the buildings at 130 Arch Street and 61-67 North 2nd Street, a collection of nineteenth century commercial loft buildings in Old City.

The Committee examined Mr. Brauer's plans and voted to recommend their approval to the Historical Commission. If the Bureau for Historic Preservation or the National Park Service require any changes that will affect the exterior of the buildings in order to receive Tax Act certification, revised drawings must be submitted for further review by this office.

1024 Spruce Street, Russ Milnor, Architect, Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. Mr. Milnor presented for review a set of rehabilitation specifications for the building at 1024 Spruce Street, a three-story, brownstone house, c. 1870, with a fourth story Mansard.

The Committee recommends that the rehabilitation specifications be accepted as written. Since the proposed rehabilitation must conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Rehabilitation and meet with the approval of the Bureau for Historic Preservation and the National Park Service in order to receive certification for the 25% ITC, any attempt by us to assure that conformity could be conjectural.

1812 Delancey Street (rear deck), Paul Hirshorn, Architect. Mr. Hirshorn presented to the Committee his proposal for the construction of a deck at the rear of 1812 Delancey Street.

The Committee reviewed the proposal and asked that the architect reduce the height of the deck rail to 3'6". This revision, in the opinion of the Committee, will maintain a consistent proportion with the remainder of the building. Subject to this change, an approval of this submission is recommended.

128, 130, 132, 134 Market Street and 8 North 2nd Street, Larry Goldfarb and Richard Craig, Architects. Messrs. Goldfarb and Craig presented for the Committee's review plans for the rehabilitation of the buildings at 128, 130, 132 and 134 Market Street and 8 N. 2nd Street, a collection of nineteenth and twentieth century commercial buildings.

The Committee examined the plans submitted by the architects and voted to recommend their approval. Since the owner intends to take advantage of the 25% ITC on three of the Market Street buildings and the 2nd Street building, review by the and the National Park Service will be required. If revisions to the elevations are made following state and federal consideration, all revised drawings must be submitted to this office for further consideration.

423 Vine Street, Martin J. Rosenblum, Architect. Mr. Rosenblum submitted for the Committee's consideration plans for the rehabilitation of 423 Vine Street, a three-and-a-half story 1790's townhouse in Old City.

The Committee voted to recommend an approval of Mr. Rosenblum's plans subject to two revisions. On the front elevation, the Committee recommended an eight panel entrance door. If shutters are hung, they should be solid panel on all three floors. The Committee further agreed to allow the construction of a new cellar bulkhead. On the side elevation, the Committee asked that the architect redesign the new window openings. The members suggested installing five separate windows consistent in size and aligned evenly. Since this, too, is a Tax Act project, the architect was advised that any changes to the exterior required by the Bureau for Historic Preservation or the National Park Service would need to be resubmitted for further review by this office.

615 S. Hancock Street, Mark Fox, Architect. Mr. Fox submitted to the Committee for review plans for the reconstruction of the structurally deficient front facade of 615 S. Hancock Street, a two-and-a-half story house built c. 1800.

The Committee reviewed the architect's plans and voted to recommend their approval subject to two minor revisions. The Committee asked that the drawing be revised to show small light sash in the basement window openings having glass consistent with and in proportion to that in the other window openings. The Committee also asked the architect to correct his drawing of the front dormer window and to note on the drawing that the existing dormer will be retained and repaired.

Subject to these changes, a final approval of this project is recommended. Mr. Levy abstained from voting on this submission.

30th Street Station Snack Bar, ELD Associates. The members of the Architectural Committee reviewed plans for the installation of a Snack Bar at the west end of the main concourse in 30th Street Station.

The Committee found the design of the Snack Bar to be in harmony with the overall character of the Station and voted to recommend its approval.

Provident Bank, 6th and Spring Garden Streets, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Subsequent to the 20 February meeting of the Architectural Committee, Ivan Blitz submitted to the Commission staff revised drawings for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Provident Bank at Sixth and Spring Garden Streets, a Frank Furness designed building.

The drawings, submitted by the architect, have incorporated into them all the changes recommended by the Architectural Committee at its meeting of 17 October 1984. A final approval of this project is recommended.

PLAQUES

506 Spruce Street. The Committee reviewed the owner's request for a plaque for 506 Spruce Street. Following some discussion, it was agreed that Mr. Bartley would inspect the building and report his findings to the staff.

Subsequent to the 20 February meeting, Mr. Bartley visited the building and found that it was not eligible for a plaque in its present condition. Mr. Bartley reported that the house could be eligible for receipt of an Altered Plaque if the following changes were made:

1. removal of the exterior storm windows;
2. removal of the light fixture from the front wall;
3. repair and patching of the marble; and
4. repair of the 2nd floor louvered shutters.

48 E. Haines Street. The Committee members examined the photographs submitted by the owner of 48 E. Haines St. along with the plaque application. The Committee agreed that Mr. Levy would inspect the building and report back to the staff concerning the building's eligibility for a plaque.

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 5:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian