

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

20 June 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute
of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Henry J. Magaziner, F.A.I.A., National Park Service
William Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian

Also: Tom Hughes, Architect, and Paul Potash to present plans for the rehabilitation of 118 Market Street.
Harlan Crider, Architect and Kenneth Bergfeld to present plans for the rehabilitation of 246 North 3rd Street and 312-314 Race Street
Michael McCann of Hans P. Stein Associates to present plans for the rehabilitation of 136-138 North 2nd Street and 2133 Arch Street.
Elizabeth Mintz, Historical Consultant and Peter Von Chamier of the Recreation Department to present plans and specifications for renovations to the Ridgway Library and its surrounding fence and grounds.
Robert Malfara and Craig Mills of Absolute Builders to request permission to install aluminum siding at 8217 Germantown Avenue.
Howard Friedman, Owner, to request an approval of work undertaken at 104 and 106 Arch Street.
Elliott Rothschild of The Rothschild Company, Architects, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Wilbur Chocolate Factory.
Charles Mangan, Owner, to request an approval for illegal work undertaken at 429 Vine Street.
Mrs. Mannherz, Owner, to request a plaque for 624 S. American Street.
Ed Richards of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority to present rehabilitation specifications for 925 Spruce Street, 1125 Spruce Street and 1011 Pine Street.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

118 Market Street, Tom Hughes, Architect and Paul Potash. Mr. Hughes presented for the Committee's consideration plans for the rehabilitation of the building at 118 Market Street, a three-story, turn-of-the-century, commercial structure.

The plans, as presented, call for commercial use on the ground floor and residential in the upper stories. Mr. Hughes intends to repair the existing storefronts. New doors in keeping with the original character of the storefronts will be introduced along the Letitia Street facade. Above the ground floor, the brick masonry will be cleaned and repaired.

Following some further discussion of the project, the Architectural Committee voted to recommend its final approval.

2002 Spring Garden Street, Anthony Forjohn, Architect. The Committee reviewed Mr. Forjohn's proposal for the construction of a fourth floor addition at the rear of 2002 Spring Garden Street, a Victorian townhouse.

The Committee agreed that the proposed design required further study and refinement. Several recommendations were offered. The Committee asked that the windows be enlarged and that they align with the existing fenestration on the main building, if possible. Elimination of the overhang will give the addition more of a Mansard like appearance in keeping with the tradition of the building. Finally, the members recommended that shingles, instead of siding, be used as a facing material for the addition.

The Committee voted to recommend to the Commission that the architect be asked to restudy the design of the proposed addition and resubmit his revised drawings for another review.

Subsequent to the Committee meeting, the architect revised his drawings following the Committee's direction and resubmitted. The Committee found Mr. Forjohn's resubmission to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval. The members also agreed to allow the installation of wood siding rather than asphalt shingles provided the siding is painted to match the color of the existing front Mansard.

246 North 3rd Street, Harlan Crider, Architect, and Kenneth Bergfeld. Mr. Crider presented to the Committee members his proposal for the conversion of 246 North 3rd Street, a five-story, Neo-Georgian commercial structure, into 20 condominium apartments and a first floor commercial unit. Alterations will include repair and/or replacement of window sash, installation of new windows in the two loading docks and on the west party wall, construction of new entrance stairs on New Street, and the addition of a penthouse set back from the four foot high parapet.

The Committee found the proposed rehabilitation program to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval. The Committee members did ask, however, that the architect submit a detail of the proposed new entrance stairs and rail on New Street. The architect agreed to do so.

Subsequent to the meeting, Mr. Crider submitted the additional materials requested by the Committee. The members reviewed the drawings, found them acceptable and voted to recommend a final approval of the total project.

312-314 Race Street, King's Inn, Harlan Crider, Architect, and Kenneth Bergfeld. Mr. Crider described briefly to the Committee his intention to restore the building at 312-314 Race Street and to design new facades for the non-certified structures at 316 and 318 Race Street. Since his plans for the buildings and his research were incomplete, he asked that consideration of his submission be tabled until the July meeting of the Architectural Committee. The Committee agreed and no action was taken.

136-138 North 2nd Street, Town Crier, Michael McCann of Hans P. Stein, Architects. Mr. McCann presented to the members of the Architectural Committee his proposal for the rehabilitation of 136-138 North 2nd Street, a five-story, twentieth century, brick commercial building.

The Committee reviewed the architect's submission and voted to recommend its approval in concept. The members voted, however, to request several changes to the first floor storefront design. Since the existing doors within the two center bays of the building appeared to be later, non-historic fabric, the Committee suggested replacing them with two pairs of double doors. The Committee asked also that the new entrance gate within the southernmost bay be redesigned to follow more closely the scale and rhythm of the existing storefront design.

The architect agreed to restudy the storefront area, revise his drawings and resubmit them for review at a later date.

2133 Arch Street, The Mulberry Atrium, Michael McCann of Hans P. Stein, Architects. Mr. McCann presented to the Committee plans for the rehabilitation of 2133 Arch Street, an early twentieth century Orphan's Court building. The plans, as presented, call for the replacement of all double hung windows and frames with new fixed dark bronze steel frames and dark brown tinted thermal glass. Existing basement window openings will receive granite panel infills to match the adjacent granite. Existing wood and glass entrance doors will be replaced with Herculite doors, transoms and sidelights. The existing basketball pavilion on the roof will be removed and an elevator and existing stair tower on 22nd Street will be extended to the roof.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee voted to require several changes to the proposed rehabilitation work. They asked that the architect attempt to duplicate the appearance of the original, double hung, wood window sash which presently exist in the window openings. The members agreed that thermal sash and dark bronze steel frames would be acceptable provided the windows were double hung and not a single sheet of glass. The Committee also agreed to the closing of the basement window openings with masonry infill. They asked, however, that the infill be set back within the opening to retain the window definition and that the existing iron grilles be replaced in front of the infill. The members further asked for a restudy of the proposed new entrance. They suggested that the architect either reuse the existing frame or follow the existing form of the doorway. To get greater transparency, they agreed to allow the replacement of the original doors with Herculite doors. Finally, they suggested that the at-grade planter be lowered to keep the existing watertable exposed. This can be achieved with either a low curb or an iron railing. The proposed addition on the roof was found to be acceptable.

The Committee recommends an approval in concept of the proposed rehabilitation work. Before a final approval can be granted, a full set of working drawings must be submitted for the Committee's review.

8217 Germantown Avenue, Robert Malfara and Craig Mills of Absolute Builders. Messrs. Malfara and Mills requested the Committee's approval for the installation of aluminum siding over the existing wood fabric on the building 8217 Germantown Avenue for the Chestnut Hill Historical Society. According to Mr. Malfara, the Chestnut Hill Historical Society does not possess sufficient funds to pay for the replacement of all of the wood fabric in kind.

It was the opinion of the Committee that the wood cornices, frames, etc. should not be covered with aluminum. They suggested strongly that the Historical Society undertake a partial restoration and/or replacement of the wood and complete the project when additional funds become available.

The Committee recommends that the Commission not permit the wood trim at 8217 Germantown Avenue to be covered with aluminum.

104-106 Arch Street, Howard Friedman, Owner. Mr. Friedman presented to the members of the Architectural Committee photographs of construction in progress at 104 and 106 Arch Street, two, eighteenth century houses with nineteenth century alterations. Some of the work undertaken by Mr. Friedman exceeds the building permit previously issued for interior alterations.

The Committee advised Mr. Friedman to seek professional assistance in the planning of the rehabilitation of the Arch Street buildings. Drawings must be submitted to the Architectural Committee before any approval for exterior work can be granted.

231-247 North 3rd Street, Wilbur Chocolate Factory, the Rothschild Company, Architects. Elliott Rothschild presented for the Committee's consideration preliminary plans for the renovation and reuse of the Wilbur Chocolate Factory into 135 apartments.

Following an examination of the plans and a model of the project, the Committee voted to recommend an approval in concept of Mr. Rothschild's proposal. A full set of working drawings must be submitted for review before a final approval is granted.

429 Vine Street, Charles Mangan, Owner. Mr. Mangan presented for the Committee's consideration photographs of a projecting bay window recently installed on the exposed, stuccoed party wall at 429 Vine Street. Mr. Mangan explained to the Committee members his contractor's failure to obtain a building permit and his own ignorance of the building's certification by the Historical Commission. As a result, the window was installed

without the proper approvals and in violation of the procedures of the Department of Licenses and Inspections.

Following an examination of the photographs, the Committee concluded that since the installation of the window occurred on a stuccoed party wall and did not destroy any historic fabric, an approval to legalize the alteration would be appropriate. If the window were removed at some future time, the wall could be restuccoed and returned to its former appearance. The house, of course, will not be eligible for the receipt of a plaque in its present condition.

320 Race Street, John Sawyer, Developer. Mr. Sawyer presented to the Architectural Committee his revised drawings for renovations to 320 Race Street. Mr. Sawyer, in revising his drawings, followed the recommendations of the Architectural Committee offered at the May meeting. These included the retention and repair of all fire escapes and original window sash; the redesign of the new entrance stair in iron, rather than in wood; and the restudy of the roof-top addition using a greenhouse type design with sloped walls.

The Committee found the revisions to conform to the suggestions of the members and voted to recommend to the Commission the project's final approval.

53 E. Logan Street, Barbara Williams, Architect. The Committee reviewed and found acceptable Ms. Williams' revised drawings for the construction of an addition to the carriage house at the rear of 53 E. Logan Street. Ms. Williams' restudy of the design addressed the issues raised by the Architectural Committee at a previous meeting. A final approval of this project is recommended.

1223 Pine Street, Dan McCoubrey, Architect. Mr. McCoubrey's proposal for the introduction of a new door along the side elevation of 1223 Pine Street was reviewed. An approval of the proposed work is recommended.

PLAQUES

624 S. American Street. Mrs. Manhurst, owner of 624 S. American Street, appeared before the Architectural Committee to request a plaque for display on her house. The Committee members examined the photograph and decided that an on-site inspection of the building was warranted. Mr. Bartley agreed to visit the property.

Subsequent to the 20 June meeting, Mr. Bartley inspected the house and reported his findings to the staff. The aluminum cover over the pole gutter and the cornice is not acceptable. Mr. Bartley suggested that the aluminum be removed and that, if necessary, the pole gutter and cornice be restored. If restoration work is required, a drawing indicating the proposed work must be submitted for review and approval before construction begins.

Baptist Temple, Temple University. The Committee examined the photographs and materials submitted with Temple University's application for a plaque for the Baptist Temple. The Committee members agreed that the Temple is eligible for receipt of a plaque but not until some needed repairs are undertaken on the building. These should include the replacement of all broken window glass and the removal of the existing lighted sign over the entrance.

2434 Poplar Street. The Committee agreed that the house at 2434 Poplar Street will be eligible for a plaque as soon as the deteriorated brownstone watertable and stairs have been repaired.

2133 Wallace Street. Ms. Siemiontkowski reported that she and the Historian inspected the house at 2133 Wallace Street and found it to be eligible for receipt of a plaque. The Architectural Committee agreed and voted to recommend the approval of a Certified Restored plaque for display on the facade of 2133 Wallace Street.

REHABILITATION SPECIFICATIONS

925 Spruce Street, Ed Richards of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. Mr. Richards presented to the Committee for review the specifications prepared by the Redevelopment Authority for 925 Spruce Street. These specifications were reviewed by the Committee members. An approval is recommended.

1125 Spruce Street, Ed Richards of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. The members reviewed the specifications prepared by the Redevelopment Authority for 1125 Spruce Street and voted to recommend their approval subject to one minor revision. The Committee recommended that the shutters on the first floor contain four solid panels not three.

1011 Pine Street, Ed Richards of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority. The Committee reviewed the specifications for 1011 Pine Street and voted to recommend their approval subject to several minor changes. The members asked that the first floor shutters be required to have four panels; the louvers on the third floor should be divided into two sections instead of three. A four panel Greek Revival door should be installed at the front entrance.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian